

## American Transitional Justice

Natalie R. Davidson offers an alternative account of Alien Tort Statute litigation by revisiting the field's two seminal cases, *Filartiga* (filed 1979) and *Marcos* (filed 1986), lawsuits ostensibly concerned with torture in Paraguay and the Philippines, respectively. Combining legal analysis, archival research, and ethnographic methods, this book reveals how these cases operated as transitional justice mechanisms, performing the transition of the United States and its allies out of the Cold War order. It shows that US courts produced a whitewashed history of US involvement in repression in the Western bloc, while in Paraguay and the Philippines the distance from US courts allowed for a more critical narration of the lawsuits and their underlying violence as symptomatic of structural injustice. By exposing the political meanings of these legal landmarks for three societies, Davidson sheds light on the blend of hegemonic and emancipatory implications of international human rights litigation in US courts.

NATALIE R. DAVIDSON is a lecturer in the Faculty of Law at Tel Aviv University. She has published about Alien Tort Statute litigation, feminist interventions in international law, the prohibition of torture, and interdisciplinary methodology.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-108-70255-3 — American Transitional Justice  
Natalie R. Davidson  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*Human Rights in History*

Edited by

Stefan-Ludwig Hoffmann, University of California, Berkeley

Samuel Moyn, Yale University, Connecticut

This series showcases new scholarship exploring the backgrounds of human rights today. With an open-ended chronology and international perspective, the series seeks works attentive to the surprises and contingencies in the historical origins and legacies of human rights ideals and interventions. Books in the series will focus not only on the intellectual antecedents and foundations of human rights, but also on the incorporation of the concept by movements, nation-states, international governance, and transnational law.

A full list of titles in the series can be found at:  
[www.cambridge.org/human-rights-history](http://www.cambridge.org/human-rights-history)

# American Transitional Justice

*Writing Cold War History in Human  
Rights Litigation*

---

Natalie R. Davidson

*Tel Aviv University*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-108-70255-3 — American Transitional Justice  
Natalie R. Davidson  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108702553](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108702553)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108774529

© Natalie R. Davidson 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

First paperback edition 2022

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Names: Davidson, Natalie R, 1975– author.

Title: American transitional justice : writing cold war history in human rights litigation / Natalie R Davidson, Tel-Aviv University.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Series: Human rights in history | Based on her thesis (doctoral–Universitat Tel-Aviv, 2016) issued under title: Assessing transnational tort human rights litigation. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019056228 (print) | LCCN 2019056229 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108477703 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108702553 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108774529 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Government liability–United States–Cases. | Immunities of foreign states–United States–Cases. | Transitional justice–United States–Cases. | Cold War–Law and legislation–United States–Cases. | United States. Alien Tort Claims Act.

Classification: LCC KF1309.5 .D378 2020 (print) | LCC KF1309.5 (ebook) | DDC 342.7308/8–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019056228>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019056229>

ISBN 978-1-108-47770-3 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-70255-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

---

<i>List of Figures</i>	page vi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	vii
1 Introduction: Revisiting the Gilded Age of Transnational Human Rights Litigation in US Courts	1
2 Alien Tort Statute Litigation in Legal Practice and the Legal Imagination	20
3 “Foreign Torture, American Justice”: <i>Filártiga</i> in the United States	38
4 <i>Filártiga</i> in Paraguay	78
5 Narrating the Marcos Regime in US Courts	106
6 The <i>Marcos</i> Case and Transitional Justice in the Philippines	144
7 Conclusion	180
<i>Appendix 1: Key Dates in Filártiga</i>	191
<i>Appendix 2: Key Dates in Marcos</i>	192
<i>Bibliography</i>	193
<i>Index</i>	201

## Figures

---

3.1 “Crime of Passion in Sajonia” Joel Filártiga, 1978, courtesy of Joel Filártiga	<i>page 57</i>
4.1 “Peña will talk about sports ... And what will Filártiga talk about?” <i>Ultima Hora</i> , May 9, 1979, p. 1	85
4.2 “Today begin the celebrations of the ‘Day of the Americas’ ... The guest of honor will certainly be Americo Peña!” <i>Ultima Hora</i> , April 16, 1979, p. 1	93
4.3 “Olimpia wants the ‘libertadores de America’ ... And Gorostiaga wants to be Americo’s liberator” <i>Ultima Hora</i> , April 24, 1979, p. 1	93
4.4 “In New York, Peña had problems with a Cuban ... But not [with his] concubine!” <i>Ultima Hora</i> , April 28, 1979, p. 1	94
4.5 “This is how they delivered my son’s body to me, the mother of deceased Joelito told <i>Ultima Hora</i> today. Dr. Joel Filártiga gave extensive declarations to this newspaper” <i>Ultima Hora</i> , April 9, 1979, p. 31	95
6.1 <i>Philippine Daily Inquirer</i> , September 28, 1992, p. 4	149
6.2 <i>Philippine Daily Inquirer</i> , February 15, 1986, p. 4	150
6.3 <i>Philippine Daily Inquirer</i> , September 9, 1992, p. 4	153

## Acknowledgments

---

This book is based on the doctoral dissertation I wrote at the Zvi Meitar Center for Advanced Legal Studies at Tel Aviv University's (TAU) Buchmann Faculty of Law, and it was completed in my first two years as a lecturer in the same Faculty. I was privileged to research and write this book in the most supportive and collaborative environment possible.

I thank my PhD supervisors, Leora Bilsky and Avihay Dorfman, for their dedication, patience, support, and open-mindedness. Each managed to be very demanding all the while refraining from imposing his or her views. I learned many precious research and writing skills as a research assistant to Leora Bilsky, with whom I held endless discussions on transnational human rights litigation. In addition, during the early stages as I struggled to delineate the contours of this project, I benefited immensely from consultations with Yishai Blank, Hanoch Dagan, Aeyal Gross, Ron Harris, Shai Lavi, Ariel Porat, and Yofi Tirosh, as well as visiting professors Chimène Keitner and Ernest Weinrib. I thank Eyal Benvenisti, José Brunner, Talia Fisher, Daphna Hacker, and Doreen Lustig who offered in-depth commentary on drafts of the chapters, as well as the participants to the Global Trust Seminar; the International Law Workshop; the doctoral colloquium and the Minerva Center Forum on Law, Globalization and the Transnational Sphere; as well as TAU's Wiener Forum. The administrators at TAU's law faculty, and in particular Tali Chen, Michal Gordon-Keret, Zohara Holtzblat, Michal Locker-Eshed, Dana Magen, and Seffi Weintraub offered reassurance, professionalism, and guidance as I navigated the stages of the doctorate. The entire staff of librarians, and in particular Ina Dorossiev, was always willing to go the extra mile to help locate hard-to-find materials. Last but not least among the TAU law school community, I thank my fellow LLM and doctoral students Nasreen Alemy-Kabha, Smadar Ben-Natan, Avinoam Cohen, Olga Frishman, Maytal Gilboa, Suha Jubran Ballan, Roni Liberson, Masua Sagiv, Tomer Shadmy, Keren Yelin-Mor, and Adi Yucht for their companionship, humor, constant encouragement, and patience listening to my ramblings and hesitations.

viii Acknowledgments

I thank the Zvi Meitar Center for Advanced Legal Studies and the Global Trust Project headed by Eyal Benvenisti for funding my doctorate and allowing me to devote my time entirely to research. Trips to the United States, Paraguay, and the Philippines to gather data, search archives, and conduct interviews would have been impossible without the financial support of the Minerva Center for Human Rights and the David Berg Foundation for Law and History at TAU. The Cegla Center for Interdisciplinary Research of the Law at TAU contributed to my participation in a conference at Stanford Law School where I presented a chapter.

This book also benefited immensely from the support, comments, and encouragement of researchers outside TAU. The Minerva Center for the Rule of Law under Extreme Conditions at Haifa University generously funded part of my travels in the Philippines, and the members of that Center offered helpful comments on an early draft of the chapter analyzing the findings from that trip. My research proposal and various chapters benefited from comments by participants at a writing workshop at Harvard Law School's Institute for Law and Global Policy, the annual conference of the Stanford Program on Law and Society, the Oxford Transitional Justice Biennial conference, the Annual Sciences Po-Tel-Aviv University Collaborative Workshop, the Israeli Law and Society Association annual conference, the Israeli Private Law Association Annual Conference, the Israeli Law and History Association Annual Conference, the 2nd Annual TAU Workshop for Junior Scholars, two annual conferences of the Rapoport Center for Human Rights and Justice at the University of Texas School of Law, and the departmental seminars at the faculties of law of TAU and Hebrew University Jerusalem, with in-depth commentary by Dennis Davis, Karen Engle, Yukiko Koga, Zinaida Miller, Sarah Nouwen, Ronen Shamir, and Beth Van Schaack. I finalized my dissertation while a research fellow at the Rapoport Center for Human Rights at the University of Texas, Austin School of Law, and thank Dan Brinks, Billy Chandler, Julia Dehm, Sarah Eliason, Karen Engle, and the late, wonderful Barbara Harlow for including me in the Rapoport Center team and allowing me to further develop the analysis in this book. I thank Moshe Hirsch and Roy Kreitner for encouraging me to publish this book, and Sam Moyn, Stefan-Ludwig Hoffman, and Michael Watson of Cambridge University Press, as well as the anonymous reviewers, for a fruitful review process and making this book's publication possible. I thank Adi Dubson and Noam Morris for excellent editing assistance. Many thanks to Sergey Lobachev for indexing, and to Kevin Hugues for copyediting.

I wish to thank the individuals who helped me gain access to interview subjects, archives, and data. Richard Alan White, who sadly passed away



a few months after I completed my dissertation, introduced me to Joel Filártiga and to Peter Weiss. Renée Frégosi kindly met with me to discuss her book on Paraguay, and advise and introduce me to political scientists in the country. I am deeply grateful to Yeny Villalba and Alberto Manuel Poletti Adorno for warmly welcoming me to Paraguay. Andres Soto Sanchez provided helpful research assistance locating and photocopying Paraguayan congressional records. Guillaume and Patty at the Nomada Hostel together with Raul Gonzalez Allen and Helga Buss Gonzalez offered me a surrogate family in Asunción in addition to introducing me to former political prisoners. Alfred McCoy and Mark Thompson kindly provided advice through email. Ruben Carranza of the International Center for Transitional Justice warmly opened doors for me in the Philippines, introducing me to numerous interviewees, and enthusiastically encouraged me to pursue this project over the years. Karen Dumpit of the Philippine Commission on Human Rights also introduced me to key interviewees and provided valuable information. I thank Ton Rivera for research assistance locating and copying court documents in the Philippines, as well as for including me in the team of the Human Rights Victims Claims Board Baguio City intake together with Aurora Parong, Attorney Dexter, Charlene Crisostomo de Villa, and Jen Serna. I thank Attorney Peter Weiss for kindly sharing his experience of the Filártiga case with me, and I thank Attorney Robert Swift for generously taking time to talk to me as well as sending me large documents that were otherwise expensive to obtain from public archives. I also thank Laila Geronimo of the Hawaii District Court for making the process of ordering court documents simple and pleasant thanks to her humor and friendliness. Librarians at the New York Public Library and the Library of Congress provided extraordinary services and advice.

I thank from the bottom of my heart Nidia, Analy, and the late Joel Filártiga, as well as the many other survivors of abuses under Stroessner and Marcos who shared their stories and analyses with me. They and their lawyers remain great sources of inspiration to me.

I embarked on this project after working as a lawyer. In abandoning a stable legal career and engaging in the research that fascinated me, I was fortunate to be able to draw on the examples of my younger sisters Stephanie and Sylvia, who have uncompromisingly pursued the search for their professional and nonprofessional passions, as well as on decades of encouragement by our parents to find our own path. Words of encouragement voiced over the years by Véronique Peyrot, Jimena Demougin, and Emilie Reinhold did more to help me “keep the faith” than these friends probably realize. My daughters Yarden and Sarah provided much comic relief over the years. I thank my spouse, Roei, for holding

x Acknowledgments

countless discussions with me regarding methodology and writing, taking care of the household while I traveled for long periods, and unequivocally supporting me in this project – and now in others.

I dedicate this book to my parents, humanitarians in the best sense of the word.

\*\*\*

Portions of this book reproduce, expand, and revise materials that have appeared elsewhere. I thank the editors and publishers of the following texts for permission to include these materials:

- “From Political Repression to Torturer Impunity: The Narrowing of *Filártiga v. Peña-Irala*,” *Anti-Impunity and the Human Rights Agenda*, ed. Karen Engle, Zinaida Miller, and D. M. Davis (Cambridge University Press, 2016), 255–87.
- “Alien Tort Statute Litigation and Transitional Justice: Bringing the Marcos Case Back to the Philippines,” *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 11 (2017), 257–75.
- “Shifting the Lens on Alien Tort Statute Litigation: Narrating US Hegemony in *Filártiga* and Marcos,” *European Journal of International Law* 28 (2017), 147–72.
- “Toward a Self-Reflexive Law? Narrating Torture’s Legality in Human Rights Litigation,” *Law, Text, Culture* 21 (2017), 100–22.