

## Islanders and Empire

*Islanders and Empire* examines the role smuggling played in the cultural, economic, and sociopolitical transformation of Hispaniola from the late sixteenth to seventeenth centuries. With a rare focus on local peoples and communities, the book analyzes how residents of Hispaniola actively negotiated and transformed the meaning and reach of imperial bureaucracies and institutions for their own benefit. By co-opting the governing and judicial powers of local and imperial institutions on the island, residents could take advantage of, and even dominate, the contraband trade that reached the island's shores. In doing so, they altered the course of the European interimperial struggles in the Caribbean by limiting, redirecting, or suppressing the Spanish crown's policies, thus taking control of their destinies and that of their neighbors in Hispaniola, other Spanish Caribbean territories, and the Spanish empire in the region.

Juan José Ponce Vázquez is Assistant Professor of History at the University of Alabama.

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-108-70248-5 — Islanders and Empire  
 Juan José Ponce Vázquez  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE LATIN AMERICAN STUDIES

*General Editors*

KRIS LANE, Tulane University  
 MATTHEW RESTALL, Pennsylvania State University

*Editor Emeritus*

HERBERT S. KLEIN  
 Gouverneur Morris Emeritus Professor of History, Columbia University and Hoover  
 Research Fellow, Stanford University

*Other Books in the Series*

121. *Islanders and Empire: Smuggling and Political Defiance in Hispaniola, 1580–1690*, Juan José Ponce Vázquez
120. *Our Time is Now: Race and Modernity in Postcolonial Guatemala*, Julie Gibbings
119. *The Sexual Question: A History of Prostitution in Peru, 1850s–1950s*, Paulo Drinot
118. *A Silver River in a Silver World: Dutch Trade in the Rio de la Plata, 1648–1678*, David Freeman
117. *Laboring for the State: Women, Family, and Work in Revolutionary Cuba, 1959–1971*, Rachel Hynson
116. *Violence and The Caste War of Yucatán*, Wolfgang Gabbert
115. *For Christ and Country: Militant Catholic Youth in Post-Revolutionary Mexico*, Robert Weis
114. *The Mexican Mission: Indigenous Reconstruction and Mendicant Enterprise in New Spain, 1521–1600*, Ryan Dominic Crewe
113. *Corruption and Justice in Colonial Mexico, 1650–1755*, Christoph Rosenmüller
112. *Blacks of the Land: Indian Slavery, Settler Society, and the Portuguese Colonial Enterprise in South America*, Weinstein/Woodard/Montiero
111. *The Street Is Ours: Community, the Car, and the Nature of Public Space in Rio de Janeiro*, Shawn William Miller
110. *Laywomen and the Making of Colonial Catholicism in New Spain, 1630–1790*, Jessica L. Delgado
109. *Urban Slavery in Colonial Mexico: Puebla de los Angeles, 1531–1706*, Pablo Miguel Sierra Silva

(Continued after the Index)

# Islanders and Empire

*Smuggling and Political Defiance in Hispaniola,  
1580–1690*

JUAN JOSÉ PONCE VÁZQUEZ

*University of Alabama, Tuscaloosa*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-108-70248-5 — Islanders and Empire  
 Juan José Ponce Vázquez  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India  
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
 Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108702485](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108702485)  
 DOI: 10.1017/9781108477659

© Juan José Ponce Vázquez 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020  
 First paperback edition 2021

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

### *Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

NAMES: Ponce Vázquez, Juan José, 1978– author.

TITLE: Islanders and empire : smuggling and political defiance in Hispaniola, 1580–1690 / Juan José Ponce Vázquez, University of Alabama, Tuscaloosa.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Series: Cambridge Latin American studies | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020018691 | ISBN 9781108477659 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108477659 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Smuggling – Hispaniola – History – 16th century. | Smuggling – Hispaniola – History – 17th century. | Hispaniola – Commerce – History – 16th century. | Hispaniola – Politics and government – 16th century. | Spain – Colonies – America – Administration – History – 16th century. | Hispaniola – History – 16th century. | Hispaniola – Commerce – History – 17th century. | Hispaniola – Politics and government – 17th century. | Spain – Colonies – America – Administration – History – 17th century. | Hispaniola – History – 17th century.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC HF3312 .P66 2020 | DDC 364.1/33609729309032–dc23  
 LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020018691>

ISBN 978-1-108-47765-9 Hardback  
 ISBN 978-1-108-70248-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-70248-5 — Islanders and Empire  
Juan José Ponce Vázquez  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*Para Julie, Santiago y Alejandro.*

Contents

<i>List of Figures and Tables</i>	<i>page viii</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>x</i>
Introduction	i
1 Colonial Origins: Hispaniola in the Sixteenth Century	22
2 Smuggling, Sin, and Survival, 1580–1600	56
3 Repressing Smugglers: The Depopulations of Hispaniola, 1604–1606	98
4 Tools of Colonial Power: Officeholders, Violence, and Exploitation of Enslaved Africans in Santo Domingo’s <i>Cabildo</i>	134
5 “Prime Mover of All Machinations”: Rodrigo Pimentel, Smuggling, and the Artifice of Power	172
6 Neighbors, Rivals, and Partners: Non-Spaniards and the Rise of Saint-Domingue	223
Conclusion	263
<i>Glossary of Spanish Terms</i>	269
<i>Bibliography</i>	273
<i>Index</i>	289

Figures and Tables

FIGURES

0.1	Main Spanish Caribbean ports in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth century (Alexander Fries, University of Alabama Cartographic Research Laboratory).	page xvi
1.1	Francis Drake’s attack on Santo Domingo, in Baptista Boazio, <i>Map and views illustrating Sir Francis Drake’s West Indian voyage, 1585–6</i> . [London?: s.n., 1585]. Library of Congress, Rare Book and Special Collections Division.	24
1.2	Map of Santo Domingo defenses, 1619 (detail). Ministerio de Cultura y Deportes, AGI, Mapas y Planos, Santo Domingo, 29.	48
1.3a	<i>Casa del Cordón</i> (Cord House). Photo by the author.	51
1.3b	Main facade of the cathedral of Santa María de la Encarnación, Santo Domingo. Photo courtesy of Getty Images.	51
1.3c	Church of the Dominican order. Photo by the author.	51
1.3d	Church of Regina Angelorum. Photo by the author.	51
2.1	Map of the fields between Santo Domingo and the mouth of River Haina, 1679. Ministerio de Cultura y Deportes, AGI, Mapas y Planos, Santo Domingo, 77B.	57
2.2	Main towns and villages of Hispaniola by the end of the sixteenth century (Alexander Fries, University of Alabama Cartographic Research Laboratory).	62
2.3	Building of the <i>Audiencia</i> of Santo Domingo. Photo courtesy of Getty Images.	76

*List of Figures and Tables* ix

3.1	Main towns and villages of Hispaniola after the 1604–6 Depopulations (Alexander Fries, University of Alabama Cartographic Research Laboratory).	111
4.1	Ruins of the monastery of San Francisco in Santo Domingo. Photo by the author.	135
5.1a	<i>Puerta de Atarazanas</i> (Shipyard Gate) seen from outside the city walls. Photo by the author.	189
5.1b	<i>Puerta del Río</i> (River Gate), also known as San Diego, seen from within the city walls. Photo by the author.	189
5.2	Rodrigo Pimentel’s self-aggrandizing plaque. Convent of Santa Clara, Santo Domingo. Photo by the author.	220
6.1	Main Spanish and French towns and villages of Hispaniola in the 1680s (Alexander Fries, University of Alabama Cartographic Research Laboratory).	233

TABLES

4.1	Rural properties in Hispaniola divided by type, 1606 (Osorio’s census).	143
4.2	Distribution of enslaved African laborers by occupation in Hispaniola, 1606 (Osorio’s census).	143
5.1	Provenance of <i>Audiencia</i> cases received in Santo Domingo with powers of attorney addressed to Rodrigo Pimentel before 1652, by city of origin. Source: AGI, Escribanía, 23 C.	187



## Acknowledgments

Thanking people in the front matter of academic books is a genre in itself, one that could be considered invariably and unavoidably performative. At the same time, it can also be a powerful act in which you gather your own band of friends and dear ones who have supported you along the way, so this is what I plan to do here.<sup>1</sup> I do not see myself capable of avoiding all (or most of) the clichés, so please allow me at least to embrace those that are dearest to me and try to make them mine as I assemble my super team.

I have been terrified about writing this section for a long time, in part because I know that even though I have tried to keep track of all the people who have come to my aid, I know that I will forget some of them and that I will forever regret it. If that is your case, I am really sorry. Some of you have contributed in multiple ways. Please forgive me if, for the sake of brevity, you are only mentioned once.

The only reason I was able to write this book is that I have received assistance and kindness from an endless number of people. Since this book came out of my doctoral dissertation, I feel a moral obligation to start by showing my gratitude and affection to my dissertation advisor, Kathleen Brown. She trusted me and gave this intellectual orphan a chance when others thought I should have left graduate school. She has unwaveringly supported my professional career ever since, a career I would not have without her. Along with Kathy, my dream team of advisors, mentors, and now friends, includes Antonio Feros and

<sup>1</sup> Emily Callaci, “On Acknowledgments.” *The American Historical Review*, vol. 125, n. 1 (February 2020): 126–31.

## *Acknowledgments*

xi

Tamara J. Walker. Their thoughtful guidance and advice through the years has been invaluable to me.

I would be remiss if I did not acknowledge the mentoring role that other faculty at the University of Pennsylvania had, especially Professors Ann Farnsworth-Alvear, Sheldon Hackney, Yolanda Martínez-San Miguel, Daniel K. Richter, and Barbara Savage. They all had a profound impression on me, and their teachings and support have stayed with me in one way or another.

Despite the talent and kindness of these professors, the rigors of graduate school would have been too much to bear without a strong cohort of friends that made the hard work we did tolerable. Friends like Sarah Van Beurden, Francesca Bregoli, D'Maris Coffman, Jo Cohen, Tina Collins, Nicholas DiLiberto, Andrew Heath, Matt Karp, Laura Keenan-Spero, Larissa Kopytoff, William Kuby, Andrew Lipman, Sarah Manekin, Agnieszka Marczyk, Erik Mathisen, Ben Mercer, Vanessa Mongey, Catalina Muñoz, Adrian O'Connor, Brian Rouleau, Alison Scheiderer, and Patrick Spero, among others. A very special thanks to Clemmie Harris, my brother in arms, for being always there, a phone call away, after all these years.

A few institutions trusted me and supported this project, and they have my endless gratitude. The University of Pennsylvania first made available funds to do some reconnaissance in the Dominican Republic in the conceptualization phase of this project. Many thanks to the John Carter Brown Library for their José Amor y Vázquez Fellowship, which allowed me to spend the first and only resident fellowship of my career to date. The late Pepe Amor himself was extraordinarily kind to me. My time at the JCB was not only productive, but enchanting, especially thanks to the skillful guidance of their staff, and the company and comradeship of fellows like Marie Arana, Adrian Finucane, Jason Sharples, and Natalia Sobrevilla. I also owe a debt of gratitude to the Dominican Studies Institute at the City University of New York, where I spent two weeks reading and writing thanks to the 2017 Archives and Library Research Awards Program. Special thanks to Sarah Aponte, Ramona Hernández, Anthony Stevens-Acevedo, and the fantastic group of student workers that they train and employ at the center. The startup funds of the University of Alabama allowed me to spend two weeks at the Archivo General de Simancas, following the elusive trace of Hispaniola in such an incredible repository. Archivist Isabel Aguirre Landa was very generous with her time, expertly guiding me through such a massive collection. A semester-long ASPIRE fellowship at the University of Alabama allowed me to focus on writing

without other academic distractions. I must also thank the publishers who allowed me to use some materials published elsewhere.<sup>2</sup>

I was able to formally workshop a couple of chapters thanks to the generosity of some institutions and academics. My thanks to Cecile Accilien, Santa Arias, and Robert Schwaller at the University of Kansas for their invitation to share Chapter 2, as well as their wonderful suggestions to improve this chapter and the project as a whole. Special thanks to Marie G. Brown, whose insights during this visit helped me reconceptualize this whole project at a crucial stage of its development. Attendees of the 2018 Southwest Seminar also provided invaluable feedback: Ryan Crewe, Jessica Ciales, Max Deardorff, Kevin Gosner, Mark Hanna, Jay Harrison, Ryan Kashanipour, Kittiya Lee, Mark Lentz, Bianca Premo, Joaquín Rivaya-Martínez, Christoph Rosenmüller, and Dana Velasco-Murillo, provided thoughtful commentary which had quite an impact on Chapter 3.

Not all institutions are able to support financially researchers, but I will never forget the kindness of those who opened their doors and resources to me. In my hometown of Sevilla, the *Archivo General de Indias* became my second home in the city during the almost two years I spent there doing research for this book. Their archivists and staff were always extraordinarily helpful and courteous in that special Sevillian way. In the Dominican Republic, I must thank the staff of the Archivo General de la Nación, as well as its director, Roberto Cassá, for their invitation to give a talk about part of this book, their generous gifts of books, and the availability to answer my research questions. I owe a special debt of gratitude to Genaro Rodríguez Morel, a great specialist in the early history of the Hispaniola, and someone who has aided me and encouraged me to carry on with this project since we first met as students in the *Universidad de Sevilla*.

Writing a book would be impossible without the heroic (and often unrecognized) work that librarians do curating collections and

<sup>2</sup> A few passages and ideas from Chapter 3 were previously published in “Casting Traitors and Villains: The Historiographical Memory of the 1605 Depopulations of Hispaniola,” in Marina Llorente, Marcella Salvi, Aida Díaz de León, eds., *Sites of Memory in Spain and Latin America: Trauma, Politics, and Resistance*. Lanham: Lexington Books, 2015, 151–66. Parts of Chapter 4 draw on the article “Unequal Partners in Crime: Masters, Slaves and Free People of Color in Santo Domingo, c.1600–1650,” *Slavery & Abolition*, 37:4 (2016), 704–23. Also, sections of Chapter 6 were previously published as “Atlantic Peripheries: Diplomacy, War, and Spanish French Interactions in Hispaniola, 1660–1690,” in D’Maris Coffman, Adrian Leonard, and William O’Reilly, eds., *The Atlantic World*. Routledge, 2014, 300–18.

*Acknowledgments*

xiii

providing us with the resources we need to conduct our research. At Penn I had the incredible help of Joe Holub (who also employed me when all other sources of funding had been exhausted); at St. Lawrence University, Paul Doty often paddled his way to my rescue; and at the University of Alabama, Alex Boucher exercised unlimited patience with my constant stream of emails asking him to purchase books for the library and my own research. Their work made mine possible.

Books cannot exist without an editor to nurture them in their early stages and make them the best piece of material culture they can be. I was fortunate enough to work with two. First, my appreciation to Deborah Gershenowitz for believing in this project and giving it such a great home. Second, thank you to Cecelia Cancellaro for making this project her own with such enthusiasm and turning it into something I am very proud of. Rachel Blaifeder was also crucial to make me understand the subtleties of the editing process. Many thanks to Kris Lane and Matthew Restall, who were the best faculty editors one can dream of.

I have been extraordinarily lucky in every academic job I have had. I have always been surrounded by incredible teachers and superb scholars who have made me feel like a valuable part of the team, and despite the distance, they have become friends for life. From Rutgers University, I must thank Aldo Lauria Santiago, who has never stopped mentoring me and pushing me to be a better historian. At St. Lawrence University, Donna Alvah, Matthew Carotenuto, Anne Csete, Judith DeGroat, Elun Gabriel, Howard Eissenstat, Evelyn Jennings, Liz Regosin, Melissane Schrems, and Mary Jane Smith were a formidable team and role models of what teachers and scholars should be. Special thanks to Mindy Pitre for being such an incredible friend and academic rockstar.

Work is always labor even when it is pleasurable, but going to work every day at the University of Alabama to be alongside many colleagues and friends who also represent the best in each of their fields is a rare privilege that I have never taken for granted. Scholars like John F. Beeler, Steven Bunker, Charles Clark, Teresa Cribelli, Kari Frederickson, Andrew Huebner, Lesley Gordon, Sharony Green, Holly Grout, Heather Miyano Kopelson, Margaret Peacock, Erik L. Peterson, Joshua D. Rothman, Sarah Steinbock-Pratt, and Janek Wasserman. My conversations with them and their support of me and my family have shaped this project in multiple ways. I cannot thank them enough.

I would also like to show my appreciation to the graduate students I have had the privilege to teach and spend time with. They are still the reason most universities with graduate programs function, since they

teach the majority of the classes, and yet they are one of the most unprotected and poorly paid groups in academia. Their daily work as teaching assistants, research assistants, and graders, as well as their struggles to keep up with their own work, are a constant reminder of my own experience as a graduate student. Their enthusiasm and dedication has always been an inspiration to me, and our classes together have given me the chance to reread and relearn many classic and new works that have left their mark on these pages. I would like to thank two of them by name: Logan James' work as a grader gave me some extra time to dedicate to writing these pages, and Chase McCarter was a fantastic and enthusiastic grader and suggested some sources for this book.

Doing research on this book has been an infallible way to meet amazing scholars and make long-lasting friendships. Friends like Fernanda Bretones Lane, Frances Ramos, Stuart B. Schwartz, Erin Stone, and Robert D. Taber made their own works available to me. Karen Graubart generously shared with me the draft of two chapters of her unfinished manuscript, as well as a lot of bibliographical suggestions. Many others helped me with their support, advice, suggestions, and friendship, like José Luis Belmonte Postigo, John Belzis-Selfa, Bradley Benton, Kristen Block, Asmaá Bouhrass, Clarisa Carmona, Caroline P. Cook, Caroline Cunill, Gregory Cushman, James Dator, Magdalena Díaz Hernández, Julia Gaffield, Ignacio Gallup-Díaz, Natalia González, Alexander Keese, Katy Kole de Peralta, David Lafavor, Xochitl Marsilli-Vargas, Juan Negrón Ayala, Esteban Mira Caballos, Francisco Moscoso, Isabel María Povea Moreno, Meliza Reynoso Montás (and her entire family), Elena A. Schneider, John F. Schwaller, Beatriz Valverde Contreras, William Van Norman, David Wheat, and Bárbara Zepeda Cortés. There are some whom I have never met in person, but via Twitter they selflessly aided me when I asked for help. People like Manuel Barcia, Chad Black, Lisa Krissoff Boehm, Sara J. Brenneis, Adriana Chira, William F. Connell, Lisa Covert, Pol Dalmau, Julia López Fuentes, Jorge L. Giovannetti, Mary Lewis, Juan Andrés Suárez, and many others.

In editing this book, I also had great assistance from colleagues and friends who carefully questioned my choices and my English, improving them both in the process. Carrie Gibson went through many of the early versions of this book, correcting my English and making questions about my narrative in all the right places. Her dedication and skill as a writer and historian are unparalleled. Anne Eller also read some chapters and the Introduction and spent a lot of time pushing me to go deeper and to be

### *Acknowledgments*

xv

a better historian. Someday, I will be half the scholar she is today. I met both of them in the archives in Sevilla, and they have been constant companions in the process of researching and writing this book. A lifetime of thanks will not be enough to repay them.

But many others helped, too. Rebecca Goetz read an early version of Chapter 2. William Booth, Jesse Cromwell, Casey Schmitt, and others mentioned elsewhere read the Introduction and gave me numerous ideas on how to improve it. Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra read an early version of the introduction and the six chapters of this book twice and gave very insightful feedback on how to sharpen my arguments. Special thanks to Marc Eagle and an anonymous reader, who acted as Cambridge University reviewers and gave me much food for thought on how to improve the manuscript as a whole. Apart from being a wonderful friend, Esther González helped me with the paperwork to get some of the images included within. Kristin Cahn von Seelen generously edited Chapter 3, and all she asked in return was a copy of this book. Sarah Moore kindly proofread the whole thing, again, one more time. She has a sixth sense for editing, and I am delighted she accepted to help me with her superpowers.

I will end with a word of sorrow and a word of happiness. My biggest lament surrounding this project is that my father, José Ponce Camacho, passed well before he was able to see this book published. I grieve his absence every day. He and my mother, Elvira Vázquez Rodríguez, have always been phenomenally supportive of all my choices, even if they led me to live half a world away. I could have never initiated this project without their unconditional love. My sister Elvira, *mis padrinos* Pepín and Luisa, and my extended Sevillian family have been a great source of comfort to me. I miss them terribly. Finally, finishing this book would not have any meaning without my American family. My parents-in-law Roger and Jane Bannerman are the kindest and most generous people I have ever known. My best friend and partner Julie is the better person and scholar in our family, and I am thankful every day for having her in my life. She makes me want to be a little better every day. Our sons Santiago and Alejandro were born while I wrote this book, and they have given new meaning to everything I do. This book is dedicated to the three of them.