

The Politics of Institutional Weakness in Latin America

Analysts and policymakers often decry the failure of institutions to accomplish their stated purpose. Bringing together leading scholars of Latin American politics, this volume helps us understand why. The volume offers a conceptual and theoretical framework for studying weak institutions. It introduces different dimensions of institutional weakness and explores the origins and consequences of that weakness. Drawing on recent research on constitutional and electoral reform, executive–legislative relations, property rights, environmental and labor regulation, indigenous rights, squatters and street vendors, and anti–domestic violence laws in Latin America, the volume’s chapters show us that politicians often design institutions that they cannot or do not want to enforce or comply with. Challenging existing theories of institutional design, the volume helps us understand the logic that drives the creation of weak institutions, as well as the conditions under which they may be transformed into institutions that matter.

Daniel M. Brinks is Professor of Government and of Law and Chair of the Government Department at the University of Texas at Austin. Dan’s research focuses on the role of the law and courts in supporting democracy and human rights. His most recent book (with Abby Blass) is *The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 2018), winner of the Corwin Award for Best Book on Law and Courts awarded by the Law and Courts Section of the American Political Science Association.

Steven Levitsky is the David Rockefeller Professor of Latin American Studies at Harvard University. He is coauthor (with Daniel Ziblatt) of *How Democracies Die* (Crown, 2018), a *New York Times* best seller published in twenty-two languages. His other books include *Transforming Labor-Based Parties in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 2003) and (with Lucan Way) *Competitive Authoritarianism* (Cambridge University Press, 2010). He is currently writing a book on the durability of revolutionary regimes.

María Victoria Murillo is Professor in the Department of Political Science and the School of International Affairs and the Director of the Institute of Latin American Studies (ILAS) at Columbia University. She is the author of *Labor Unions, Partisan Coalitions, and Market Reforms in Latin America* (2001); *Political Competition, Partisanship, and Policymaking in the Reform of Latin American Public Utilities* (2009); and (with Ernesto Calvo) *Non-Policy Politics* (2019), all published with Cambridge University Press.

The Politics of Institutional Weakness in Latin America

Edited by

DANIEL M. BRINKS

The University of Texas at Austin

STEVEN LEVITSKY

Harvard University

MARÍA VICTORIA MURILLO

Columbia University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-108-70233-1 — The Politics of Institutional Weakness in Latin America
 Edited by Daniel M. Brinks, Steven Levitsky, María Victoria Murillo
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108702331

DOI: 10.1017/9781108776608

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Brinks, Daniel M., 1961- editor. | Levitsky, Steven, editor. |

Murillo, María Victoria, 1967- editor.

Title: The politics of institutional weakness in Latin America / edited by Daniel M. Brinks, Steven Levitsky, María Victoria Murillo.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom : New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019058907 | ISBN 9781108489331 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108702331 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Political culture--Latin America. | Government accountability--Latin America. | Administrative agencies--Latin America. | Latin America--Politics and government--21st century.

Classification: LCC JL966 .P636 2020 | DDC 306.2098--dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019058907>

ISBN 978-1-108-48933-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-70233-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

| | |
|--|-----------------|
| <i>List of Figures</i> | <i>page</i> vii |
| <i>List of Maps</i> | ix |
| <i>List of Tables</i> | xi |
| <i>List of Contributors</i> | xiii |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | xvii |
| | |
| 1 The Political Origins of Institutional Weakness <i>Daniel M. Brinks, Steven Levitsky, and María Victoria Murillo</i> | I |
| | |
| 2 When (Electoral) Opportunity Knocks: Weak Institutions, Political Shocks, and Electoral Reforms in Latin America <i>Ernesto Calvo and Gabriel Negretto</i> | 41 |
| | |
| 3 The Stickiness of “Bad” Institutions: Constitutional Continuity and Change under Democracy <i>Michael Albertus and Victor Menaldo</i> | 61 |
| | |
| 4 Presidential Crises in Latin America <i>Gretchen Helmke</i> | 98 |
| | |
| 5 Coercion Gaps <i>Alisha C. Holland</i> | 119 |
| | |
| 6 Aspirational Laws as Weak Institutions: Legislation to Combat Violence against Women in Mexico <i>Mala Htun and Francesca R. Jensenius</i> | 141 |
| | |
| | v |

| | |
|----|--|
| vi | <i>Contents</i> |
| 7 | The Social Determinants of Enforcement: Integrating Politics with Limited State Capacity <i>Matthew Amengual and Eduardo Dargent</i> 161 |
| 8 | A Multilevel Approach to Enforcement: Forest Protection in the Argentine Chaco <i>Belén Fernández Milmanda and Candelaria Garay</i> 183 |
| 9 | What/Whose Property Rights?: The Selective Enforcement of Land Rights under Mexican Liberalism <i>María Paula Saffon and Juan F. González Bertomeu</i> 208 |
| 10 | Imported Institutions: Boon or Bane in the Developing World? <i>Andrew Schrank</i> 235 |
| 11 | Social Origins of Institutional Strength: Prior Consultation over Extraction of Hydrocarbons in Bolivia <i>Tulia G. Falletti</i> 253 |
| 12 | Conclusion <i>Daniel M. Brinks, Steven Levitsky, and María Victoria Murillo</i> 277 |
| | <i>Bibliography</i> 299 |
| | <i>Index</i> 333 |

Figures

| | |
|---|---------------|
| 1.1 Strong institution – io-po>>o | <i>page</i> 8 |
| 2.1 Kaplan–Meier survival plot by electoral category | 53 |
| 2.2 Time to reform, judicial constraints, and economic shocks | 58 |
| 3.1 Proportion of democracies with autocratic constitutions since 1800 | 67 |
| 4.1 Bargaining in the shadow of a presidential crisis | 103 |
| 5.1 The coercion gap | 122 |
| 6.1 Percentage of women interviewed for the ENDIREH 2011 reporting physical abuse at the hand of their husband or partner in the previous year | 154 |
| 6.2 Percentage of women interviewed for the ENDIREH 2011 reporting physical domestic abuse, by education level and place of residence | 154 |
| 6.3 Social norms and attitudes toward violence among women interviewed for the ENDIREH 2011 (percentages of women responding affirmatively to the statements) | 155 |
| 6.4 Reasons for not reporting physical domestic abuse to the authorities | 158 |
| 8.1 Authorized, nonauthorized, and total deforestation, Salta, 2008–2014 (hectares) | 204 |
| 8.2 Annual deforestation, Salta, 2001–2015 (hectares) | 205 |
| 9.1 <i>Amparo</i> petitions (1871–1877, 1881–1910) and population (1895) | 224 |
| 10.1 Inspector survival by origins, 2005–2016 | 245 |
| 11.1 Compliance: Societal side of institutional strengthening | 261 |
| 11.2 Enforcement: State side of institutional strengthening | 262 |

Maps

| | | |
|------|--|-----|
| 4.1 | A map of presidential crises in Latin America, 1985–2008 | 107 |
| 9.1 | Judicial cases on land conflicts by type of case (1871–1877, 1881–1910) (Georeferenced using data coded from <i>Semanario Judicial</i>) | 224 |
| 11.1 | Countries that have ratified ILO Convention 169 | 255 |
| 11.2 | Municipalities with prior consultations since 2007, Bolivia | 271 |

Tables

| | | |
|-----|--|----------------|
| 1.1 | Types of institutional weakness | <i>page</i> 22 |
| 2.1 | Number of electoral reforms by country and category | 47 |
| 2.2 | Number of electoral reforms by year | 52 |
| 2.3 | Correlation between judicial constraints, legislative constraints, and liberal component | 55 |
| 2.4 | Time to reform the electoral rules, Weibull models, Latin American countries, 1978–2015 | 56 |
| 3.1 | Elites’ constitutional strategies for retaining influence | 71 |
| 3.2 | Annulments and amendments of autocratic constitutions under democracy | 82 |
| 4.1 | Ousters and inference | 100 |
| 4.2 | Illustrative cases of the power gap | 108 |
| 4.3 | Presidential crises and succession, 1985–2018 | 110 |
| 6.1 | Multilevel logistic regression models of individual characteristics of women who experienced physical domestic abuse by their partner, 2010–2011 | 156 |
| 6.2 | Multilevel logistic regression models of individual characteristics of women who said they had reported violence they experienced, 2010–2011 | 159 |
| 8.1 | Implementation of the NFPR: Consistency of design and enforcement, core Chaco provinces, 2007–2016 | 191 |
| 8.2 | Large producers, core Chaco provinces, 2002 | 194 |
| 8.3 | Governors’ choices: Design of provincial regulations and NFPR enforcement | 196 |
| 9.1 | Writs of <i>amparo</i> concerning land rights conflicts (type 1) per decade by type of conflict and petitioner | 225 |

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-70233-1 — The Politics of Institutional Weakness in Latin America
Edited by Daniel M. Brinks , Steven Levitsky , María Victoria Murillo
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

| | |
|------|---|
| xii | <i>List of Tables</i> |
| 9.2 | <i>Amparo</i> petitioners from four states at the Supreme Court 226 |
| 9.3 | Authorities challenged by <i>amparo</i> petitions, by courts' outcomes 232 |
| 10.1 | Labor law enforcement resources in the Dominican Republic 242 |
| 12.1 | Categories of institutional weakness described in chapters 279 |

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-108-70233-1 — The Politics of Institutional Weakness in Latin America

Edited by Daniel M. Brinks, Steven Levitsky, María Victoria Murillo

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

Contributors

Michael Albertus is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Chicago. His research interests include political regimes, redistribution, clientelism, and civil conflict. He has published two books, *Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform* (Cambridge University Press, 2015) and *Authoritarianism and the Elite Origins of Democracy* (Cambridge University Press, 2018), and a host of articles in outlets such as the *American Journal of Political Science*, *World Politics*, the *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, and *Comparative Political Studies*.

Matthew Amengual is Associate Professor of International Business at the University of Oxford. A political scientist by training, he specializes in regulation and labor politics. His first book, *Politicized Enforcement in Argentina: Labor and Environmental Regulation*, was published by Cambridge University Press in 2016.

Daniel M. Brinks is Professor of Government and of Law and Chair of the Government Department at the University of Texas at Austin. He has a PhD in political science from the University of Notre Dame and a JD from the University of Michigan Law School. Dan's research focuses on the role of the law and courts in supporting and deepening democracy and human rights, with a primary regional interest in Latin America. His most recent book, *The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America* (with Abby Blass), is on the politics of constitutional and judicial design. His other books address the experience with uneven democracies in Latin America, the judicial response to police violence, and the enforcement of social and economic rights in the developing world. He has published articles in the *International Journal of Constitutional Law*, *Perspectives on Politics*, *Comparative Politics*, *Comparative Political Studies*, and the *Texas Law Review*, among other journals.

Ernesto Calvo is Professor of Government and Politics at the University of Maryland, Director of the Interdisciplinary Lab for Computational Social Science (iLCSS), and Comparative Institutions Field Editor of the *Journal of Politics*. He holds a PhD from Northwestern University (2001). His work uses big data to study comparative political institutions, political representation, and social networks. He is the co-author of *Non-Policy Politics* “(with María Victoria Murillo)” (Cambridge University Press, 2019), *Legislator Success in Fragmented Congresses in Argentina* (Cambridge University Press, 2014), and over fifty publications in Latin American, European, and US journals. The American Political Science Association has recognized his research with the Lawrence Longley Award, the Gregory Luebbert Best Article Award, and the Michael Wallerstein Award. He is currently working on a book project on the activation of political content in social media.

Eduardo Dargent is Associate Professor of Political Science at Pontifical Catholic University of Peru. His main teaching and research interests are comparative public policy and democratization and the state in the developing world. He has published in *Comparative Politics*, the *Journal of Latin American Studies*, and the *Journal of Politics in Latin America*. His book *Technocracy and Democracy in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press) was published in 2015.

Tulia G. Falleti is the Class of 1965 Endowed Term Professor of Political Science, Director of the Latin American and Latino Studies Program, and Senior Fellow of the Leonard Davis Institute for Health Economics at the University of Pennsylvania. Falleti is the author of *Decentralization and Subnational Politics in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 2010), coauthor of *Participation in Social Policy: Public Health in Comparative Perspective* (Cambridge University Press, 2018), and co-editor of *The Oxford Handbook of Historical Institutionalism* (Oxford University Press, 2016) and *Latin America since the Left Turn* (University of Pennsylvania, 2018), among other volumes.

Belén Fernández Milmanda is Assistant Professor of Political Science and International Studies at Trinity College. She holds a PhD in political science from Harvard University. Her work focuses on how agrarian elites influence politics in Latin America.

Candelaria Garay is the Ford Foundation Associate Professor of Democracy at the Harvard Kennedy School. She is the author of *Social Policy Expansion in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 2016). Her current research focuses on labor and social movement coalitions, environmental institutions, and subnational health services and outcomes.

Juan F. González Bertomeu is Assistant Professor of Law at Instituto Tecnológico Autónomo de México (ITAM) (Mexico Autonomous Institute of Technology). He specializes in Latin American constitutional law, legal

List of Contributors

xv

empirical studies, and legal theory. He received his first law degree from the National University of La Plata (1999) and obtained an LLM degree (2003) and a JSD degree (2012) at New York University.

Gretchen Helmke is Professor of Political Science at the University of Rochester. Her research focuses on political institutions, democratic consolidation and erosion, rule of law, and Latin American politics. Her most recent book is *Institutions on the Edge: The Origins and Consequences of Institutional Instability in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 2017).

Alisha C. Holland is Associate Professor of Government at Harvard University. She is the author of *Forbearance as Redistribution: The Politics of Informal Welfare in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 2017) and is currently writing a book on the politics of infrastructure provision in Latin America.

Mala Htun is Professor of Political Science at the University of New Mexico, where she is also Co-Principal Investigator and Deputy Director of ADVANCE and special advisor for inclusion and climate in the School of Engineering. She works on women's rights and the politics of inequality and is the author of three books, most recently *The Logics of Gender Justice: State Action on Women's Rights around the World*, coauthored with Laurel Weldon (Cambridge University Press, 2018). She serves as Chair of the Committee on the Status of Women in the Profession of the American Political Science Association and cochaired the Presidential Task Force on Women's Advancement in the Profession. She has been an Andrew Carnegie Fellow and a Fellow at the Kellogg Institute for International Studies at the University of Notre Dame and the Radcliffe Institute for Advanced Study at Harvard University, and she has held the Council on Foreign Relations International Affairs Fellowship in Japan. She holds a PhD in political science from Harvard University and an AB in international relations from Stanford University. She was an Assistant and then Associate Professor at the New School for Social Research from 2000 to 2011.

Francesca R. Jensenius is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Oslo and Senior Research Fellow at the Norwegian Institute of International Affairs (NUPI), specializing in comparative politics, comparative political economy, and research methods. She holds a PhD from the University of California, Berkeley (2013).

Steven Levitsky is the David Rockefeller Professor of Latin American Studies and Professor of Government at Harvard University. His areas of research include democratization and authoritarianism, political parties, and weak and informal institutions. He is the author of *Transforming Labor-Based Parties in Latin America: Argentine Peronism in Comparative Perspective* (Cambridge University Press, 2003), coauthor (with Lucan Way) of *Competitive Authoritarianism: Hybrid Regimes after the Cold War*

(Cambridge University Press, 2010), and coauthor (with Daniel Ziblatt) of *How Democracies Die* (Crown, 2018). He is currently writing a book on the durability of revolutionary regimes.

Victor Menaldo is Professor of Political Science at the University of Washington and affiliated with the Center for Statistics and the Social Sciences, Near and Middle Eastern Studies, and the Center for Environmental Politics. His books, *The Institutions Curse* and *Authoritarianism and the Elite Origins of Democracy* (with Michael Albertus), are published with Cambridge University Press.

María Victoria Murillo is Professor in the Department of Political Science and the School of International Affairs at Columbia University, as well as Director of the Institute of Latin American Studies (ILAS). She is the author of *Labor Unions, Partisan Coalitions, and Market Reforms in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 2001); of *Political Competition, Partisanship, and Policymaking in the Reform of Latin American Public Utilities* (Cambridge University Press, 2009); coauthor (with Ernesto Calvo) of *Non-Policy Politics: Richer Voter, Poorer Voter and the Diversification of Electoral Strategies* (Cambridge University Press, 2019); and coauthor (with Daniel M. Brinks and Steven Levitsky) of *Understanding Institutional Weakness: Power and Design in Latin American Institutions* (Cambridge University Press, Elements in Latin American Politics and Society, 2019). She received her BA from the University of Buenos Aires and her MA and PhD from Harvard University.

Gabriel Negretto is Professor of Political Science at the Institute of Political Science of the Catholic University of Santiago de Chile. He specializes in comparative constitutional politics, institutional change, and democratization. His most recent books are *Redrafting Constitutions in Democratic Orders: Theoretical and Comparative Perspectives* (Cambridge University Press, 2020) and *Making Constitutions: Presidents, Parties, and Institutional Choice in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 2013).

María Paula Saffon is Principal Researcher of the Institute for Legal Research at the National Autonomous University of Mexico (UNAM), a position she has held since 2016. She holds a PhD in political science from Columbia University (2015). She was the Race and Ethnicity Fellow at the Princeton University Society of Fellows in the Liberal Arts (2015–2017).

Andrew Schrank is the Olive C. Watson Professor of Sociology and International and Public Affairs at Brown University and a CIFAR Fellow in the Innovation, Equity, and the Future of Prosperity program.

Acknowledgments

This book is the outcome of a truly collective effort. We cannot overstate the value of working with a talented group of scholars of Latin America who are deeply knowledgeable about the region but who work on very different institutions and draw on very different literatures. The conceptual framework, the basic theoretical approach, and the internal chapters all were enriched by the collective insight of all the contributors to this volume. The volume also benefited from the suggestions and input of many discussants in successive conferences at Harvard (2015) and the University of Texas at Austin (2017), and in seminars in the Universidad de San Andrés and the National University of San Martín. In particular, we would like to thank Peter Hall, Ira Katznelson, Marcelo Leiras, Juan Pablo Luna, Jim Mahoney, Dan Slater, Kathleen Thelen, and the anonymous reviewers at Cambridge University Press. We are also thankful for the financial support of the David Rockefeller Center for Latin American Studies and the Weatherhead Center for International Affairs at Harvard University; the Bernard and Audre Rapoport Center for Human Rights and Justice at the University of Texas at Austin; and the Institute of Latin American Studies at Columbia University. Finally, we would like to recognize the excellent research assistance provided by Alexander Claycomb at the University of Texas at Austin.