



## *Leaving Zion*

The story of Israel's foundation has often been told from the perspective of Jewish immigration to the Land of Israel. *Leaving Zion* turns this historical narrative on its head, focusing on Jewish out-migration from Palestine and Israel between 1945 and the late 1950s. Based on previously unexamined primary sources collected from twenty-two archives in six countries, Ori Yehudai demonstrates that despite the dominant view that displaced Jews should settle in the Jewish homeland, many Jews saw the country as a site of displacement or a way station to more desirable lands. Weaving together the perspectives of governments, aid organizations, Jewish communities, and the personal stories of individual migrants, Yehudai brings to light the ideological, political, and social tensions surrounding emigration. Covering events in the Middle East, Europe, and the Americas, this study provides a fresh transnational perspective on the critical period surrounding the birth of Israel and the post-Holocaust reconstruction of the Jewish world.

ORI YEHUDAI is currently the Saul and Sonia Schottenstein Chair in Israel Studies and Assistant Professor in the Department of History at the Ohio State University. His research focuses on modern Jewish and Israeli history. Raised in Kibbutz Shamir in northern Israel, he earned his BA from Tel Aviv University and PhD from the University of Chicago. He has held positions at NYU, McGill, and the University of Toronto.

# Leaving Zion

Jewish Emigration from Palestine  
and Israel after World War II

ORI YEHUDAI  
*Ohio State University*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-70230-0 — Leaving Zion  
Ori Yehudai  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108702300](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108702300)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108777490

© Ori Yehudai 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

First paperback edition 2022

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Names: Yehudai, Ori, 1973– author.

Title: Leaving Zion : Jewish emigration from Palestine and Israel after World War II / Ori Yehudai.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019049515 (print) | LCCN 2019049516 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108478342 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108702300 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108777490 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Return migration–Europe–History–20th century. | Return migration–Middle East–History–20th century. | Jews–Migrations–History–20th century. | Zionism. | Palestine–Emigration and immigration–History–20th century. | Israel–Emigration and immigration–History–20th century. | United States–Emigration and immigration–History–20th century.

Classification: LCC JV8749 .Y44 2020 (print) | LCC JV8749 (ebook) | DDC 304.8095694–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019049515>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019049516>

ISBN 978-1-108-47834-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-70230-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

*To Ayala*

## Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xiii
Introduction: Into and Out of the Promised Land	1
1 Displaced in the National Home	36
2 Against the Grain	66
3 “An International Scandal”	98
4 Debating and Restricting Emigration	138
5 A New Home in America	181
Conclusion: “Jews with Suitcases”	218
<i>Bibliography</i>	240
<i>Index</i>	259

## *Figures*

1 “Wandering Israelis”	<i>page</i> 27
2 Marc Chagall, <i>Over Vitebsk</i> (1914)	28
3 Tents at the Nusseirat Camp, Gaza Strip	40
4 “Parallel Action”	55
5 Tin huts at the Talpiot Transit Camp, 1954	69
6 The Palenbaum family leaves Germany	92
7 The Kasier family rejected	92
8 Street scene in the Foehrenwald DP camp	112
9 “The Lost Son”	164
10 “Gandhi’s teaching in immigration and emigration”	221
11 “Come to the Luna Park, Daddy”	222

## *Tables*

1 Jewish emigration from Palestine and Israel by year, 1945–67	<i>page</i> 17
2 Ratio of emigrants to immigrants by year, 1945–67	18
3 Jewish emigration from Israel by country of destination, 1948–67	19
4 Country of birth vs. country of destination, 1948–52	154

## *Acknowledgments*

While working on this book, I have benefited from the support of many people and institutions. It is a pleasure to be able to acknowledge them here.

I began this project as a doctoral student at the University of Chicago, where I came to study with Bernard Wasserstein. I am deeply grateful to Bernard for his invaluable intellectual and moral support, and for being a model of historical scholarship. I hope his influence is reflected in the pages that follow. The two other members of my dissertation committee at Chicago provided inspiring guidance, both during and after my doctoral studies. Orit Bashkin has been closely involved in all stages of my graduate work and offered numerous insights into the history of the Middle East and Israel. Tara Zahra introduced me to new ways of thinking about nationalism and migration, and has contributed important input to this project from its very inception.

Completing this book would not have been possible without the financial assistance of grants and fellowships from the National Endowment for the Humanities; the American Council of Learned Societies; the YIVO Institute for Jewish Research; the Israel Institute in Washington, DC; and the Department of History, the Division of Social Sciences and the Center for Jewish Studies at the University of Chicago.

After finishing my doctorate, I was fortunate to receive a number of postdoctoral fellowships that enabled me to dedicate myself to revising the dissertation into this book. During 2013–14 I was a postdoctoral fellow at the Center for Jewish History in New York. I thank my colleagues in the fellowship program, and the program directors Judy Siegel and Christopher Barthel, for a stimulating year. During the following academic year I held a Schusterman–Taub Postdoctoral Fellowship at NYU’s Taub Center for Israel Studies. I am grateful to Ronald Zweig, the Center’s academic director, for offering me the



*Acknowledgments*

xi

fellowship, and for his support and interest in my work during the fellowship year and beyond. I also wish to thank Shayne Leslie Figueroa, who facilitated my stay at NYU. I then spent a year as a Simon and Ethel Flegg Postdoctoral Fellow in the Department of Jewish Studies at McGill University. I thank Carlos Fraenkel and his colleagues for inviting and welcoming me to Montreal. It was at McGill that I met my friend and colleague Dan Heller, who has read several chapters of this book and offered his thoughtful and generous advice. I also wrote large parts of this book while teaching for several years at the University of Toronto, where I especially enjoyed working with Doris Bergen, Anna Shternshis, and Pieter Wróbel.

A number of scholars have graciously shared their time and expertise with me. Some of them may not even remember this, but their advice, questions, collaboration, and encouragement have helped to shape this book in various ways. I thank Emanuel Adler, Gur Alroey, Susan Armstrong-Reid, Micheal Brenner, Tobias Brinkmann, Jennifer Brown, Kierra Crago-Schneider, Hasia Diner, David Engel, Atina Grossmann, Liora Halperin, Shira Klein, Kenneth Moss, Moshe Mossek, Ari Paltiel, Avinoam Patt, Orit Rozin, and Tom Segev. I am also thankful to the anonymous readers of Cambridge University Press for their helpful suggestions. It goes without saying that none of the individuals mentioned here bears responsibility for any shortcomings found in my work.

Special thanks are due to the many archivists whose help was essential to my research. In particular, I would like to acknowledge the efforts of Gunnar Berg of the YIVO Archives and the other staff at the reading room of the Center for Jewish History in New York; Misha Mitsel and Shelly Helfand of the American Jewish Joint Distribution Committee Archives in New York; Helena Vilensky of the Israel State Archives; Batia Leshem of the Central Zionist Archives; Janice Rosen of the Canadian Jewish Congress National Archives; Diane Simard of the Library and Archives of Canada; and Valery Bazarov of the HIAS archives in New York.

An earlier version of Chapter 1 was previously published as “Displaced in the National Home: Jewish Reparation from Palestine to Europe, 1945–1948” in *Jewish Social Studies* 20/2 (Winter 2014). I thank Indiana University Press, the journal’s publisher, for allowing me to use this material here. My thanks also go to Shimrit Ron of the Hanoach Levin Institute of Israeli Drama for granting me a permission

to cite a poem by Hanoch Levin. David Navon and Daniella Gardosh-Santo generously allowed me to use cartoons by Arie Navon and Kariel Gardosh (Dosh), respectively. Vasina Gold expertly improved the visual quality of some of those cartoons.

It has been a pleasure working with Cambridge University Press. Maria Marsh, Daniel Brown, Atifa Jiwa, and the rest of the team guided me through the publication process with effectiveness and patience. I am also thankful to Eric Christianson for his careful copy-editing, and to Caroline Diepeveen for her thorough indexing of the book.

At the very final stages of this project, I accepted a new position at The Ohio State University. I feel grateful to my new colleagues in the Department of History and the Melton Center for Jewish Studies for warmly welcoming me to the OSU campus and to Columbus.

My deepest thanks go to my family. My father, Nir Yehudai, inspired me to enter the world of scholarship and continues to be a constant source of intellectual stimulation. My mother, Rivka Yehudai, has always encouraged me with her keen interest in my work. I greatly appreciate all they have done for me. The presence of Avital and of Gilad and his family has made my research trips and other visits to Israel and Kibbutz Shamir all the more pleasant and rewarding. Gilad and Avital are not only brothers but also great friends. I am grateful to my parents-in-law, Ester and Adar Solter and Yossi Kremer and Mira Steinberg, for their boundless generosity and support over the years.

Almah was born shortly after I finished my PhD and grew with this book. At some point she started to ask when I would finish my “story” (and what would happen if “your friends think it’s stupid”). Ellah joined us in Toronto and became a daycare “student” as we moved to Ohio. I am ever so grateful to both of them for the love and laughter they bring to my life.

Finally, I dedicate this book to my wife, Ayala Kremer. Throughout the years Ayala has commented on numerous texts related to this project and left her imprint on it. Thank you for living with me through the ups and downs of my career and life. My gratitude is beyond words.

## *Abbreviations*

AIVG	Aide aux Israélites Victimes de la Guerre (Aid to Jewish War Victims)
AN	Archives Nationales (France)
CBS	Israeli Central Bureau of Statistics
CJC	Canadian Jewish Congress
CJCCCNA	Canadian Jewish Congress Charities Committee National Archives
CZA	Central Zionist Archives
FAM	Free Austrian Movement
HIAS	Hebrew Sheltering and Immigrant Aid Society
HIASA	Hebrew Immigrant Aid Society Archives
IDF	Israel Defense Forces
IDFA	Israel Defense Forces Archives
IGCR	Intergovernmental Committee on Refugees
IRC	International Rescue Committee
IRO	International Refugee Organization
ISA	Israel State Archives
JA	Jewish Agency
JDC, Joint	American Jewish Joint Distribution Committee
JDCA	American Jewish Joint Distribution Committee Archives
JDCANY	American Jewish Joint Distribution Committee Archives, New York
JIAS	Jewish Immigrant Aid Services of Canada
JLC	Jewish Labor Committee
JTA	Jewish Telegraphic Agency
LAC	Library and Archives of Canada
LBIA	Leo Baeck Institute Archives
MEO	Middle East Office of the United Nations Relief and Rehabilitation Administration

MFA	Israeli Ministry of Foreign Affairs
NARA	National Archives and Record Administration (USA)
PCIRO	Preparatory Commission for the International Refugee Organization
RCMP	Royal Canadian Mounted Police
TNA	The National Archives (UK)
UGRE	Union of German Returning Emigrants (Palestine)
UHS	United HIAS Services
UNA	United Nations Archives
UNRRA	United Nations Relief and Rehabilitation Administration
USHMMA	United States Holocaust Memorial Museum Archives
USNA	United Service for New Americans
WJC	World Jewish Congress
YA	YIVO Archives