

INDEX

accountability, combatants Article 35(2), 5, 17, 100 administrative law and, 167-8 Article 35(3), 99 challenges due to AWS, 164-5 Article 36, 70, 116 collective, 165 Article 48, 5 command responsibility, 162-4 Article 49, 143 gap, 128-30, 134, 164 Article 51(2), 141 individual. See International Article 51(4), 17 Criminal Court; Rome Statute Article 51(4)(a), 83, 97-8, 125, 145 prospective, 168-74 Article 51(4)(b), 5, 17, 90, 93, 95, retrospective, 166-8 125, 145 system criminality, 165 Article 51(4)(c), 6, 17, 99 war torts, 166-7 Article 51(5)(b), 99 accountability, States Article 52(2), 6, 83 human judgement and, 135-6 Article 55, 99 limitations of, 137 Article 56, 99 accountability, weapon developers Article 57, 6, 18, 73, 116-17, 146 aiding and abetting, 157-60 Article 57(1), 83, 125 attribution of responsibility, 161 Article 57(2)(a), 99, 117, 120 commission through another person, Article 57(2)(a)(i), 83, 115, 121 157, 160-1Article 57(2)(a)(ii), 122, 148 common criminal purpose, 156 Article 57(2)(a)(iii), 123, 125 ex ante conduct, 157-8 Article 57(2)(b), 118, 125 mens rea, 159-61 Article 58, 6, 18 physical perpetration, 155-6 Article 85(3)(a), 142 role of weapon developers, 152 Article 91, 133 threshold requirements for, 152-5 customary status of, 5-6 parties to, 5 accuracy circular error probable, 94 Preamble, 70 minimum acceptable degree of, 91 administrative law, 167-8 of autonomous weapons, 93-6 African Commission on Human and of weapons generally, 91-2 Peoples' Rights, 110 actus reus, 142 Alston, Philip, 22-3 Additional Protocol 1 to the Geneva analogical reasoning in law, 71 Conventions attacks cancelling or suspending, 118-19, Article 1, 102, 105 Article 35, 16-17, 70 125 - 6Article 35(1), 5 constant care in, 125



182

INDEX

attacks (cont.) software in. See software precautions in. See precautions in swarms of, 54 attack systems qualifying as weapons, 78-9 autonomous weapon systems uncertainty and, 172-3 accuracy of, 93-6 autonomous weapon sytems anthropomorphic images of, 75-6, examples of. See weapon systems 93, 177 autonomy applicability of existing law to, continuous nature of, 30, 43-7 definitions of, 29-30, 76 129 - 30as agents of the State, 136 effects on decision-making processes, as combatants. See autonomous weapon systems, legal effects on task performance, 48-9 categorisation of effects on weapon-specific laws, 89-90 as methods of warfare, 78 independence from humans. See autonomous weapon systems, basic definition of, 8, See also autonomy, definitions of independence of basis of legal concerns about, 57, taxonomies of. See taxonomies of 79-84 machine autonomy civilian harm caused by, 97-9, See also distinction, principle of Boothby, William, 17, 49-50, 86, 88, collaboration between, 54-6 100, 117 common vulnerabilities among, 66 control of, 32-40, See also control Campaign to Stop Killer Robots, 2, 111 systems early examples of, 21 Gabčíkovo-Nagyamaros Project emotionlessness of, 68 (Hungary/Slovakia), 131 human as failsafe, 66 International Criminal Court. human interaction with, 114-19 See International Criminal Court independence of, 33-5, 40, 49-50, International Criminal Tribunal for 176 the former Yugoslavia. See law relating specifically to, International Criminal Tribunal 84 - 5for the former Yugoslavia legal categorisation of, 66-79 Katz v United States, 72-3 moratoria on, 24, 89, 109 Nuclear Weapons Advisory Opinion, nature and consequences of failure 104-5, 109, 145 of, 64-6 Olmstead v United States, 71-2 persistence of, 60-1 Prosecutor v Taylor, 158, 160 predictability of behaviour of, 59-62, Zyklon B, 159 See also risk causality recommendations for defining, and accountability gaps, 129 176 - 7and autonomous ISR systems, 79 of AWS actions, 59 recommendations for regulating, 177 - 80collateral damage regulatory debate about, 21-7 definition of, 98 responsibility for actions of. in targeting processes, 122-3 See accountability Commission on Responsibility of the Authors of the War and on runaway failures of, 65-6 Enforcement of Penalties, 137 self-governing nature of, 31



INDEX 183

Greenwood, Christopher, 6

control systems adaptive, 37-8 artificial intelligence and, 40 autonomous, 33, 33-5 control theory and, 31 intelligent, 38-9 learning, 39-40 manual, 32 overview of, 31 software in. See software Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (CCW) Martens Clause in, 105 meetings about AWS, 23, 25-7, 109-11, 170, 173, 176 origins of, 19 criminal liability. See International Criminal Court; Rome Statute

Defense Science Board, 51, 61, 66 deliberate targeting, 119 Directive 3000.09 as US policy, 23 definition of autonomy, 30 definition of AWS, 8 taxonomy of autonomy in, 42 distinction, principle of accuracy of weapons and, 92-6 as a limitation on use of AWS, 118 customary status of, 18 early application of, 10 in Additional Protocol 1 to the Geneva Conventions. See Additional Protocol 1 to the Geneva Conventions, Article 51(4) relationship to military necessity, 9 weapons law aspects of, 90 dynamic targeting, 119

European Parliament Resolution 2018/2752(RSP), 109

Fourth Hague Convention of 1907 Regulations to, 5 scope of, 15 Franco-Prussian War, 127 friendly fire incidents, 64–5, 167 Hague Peace Conference of 1899 conventions negotiated at, 14 motivations for, 13-14 Hague Peace Conference of 1907 conventions negotiated at, 15 fourth convention. See Fourth Hague Convention of 1907 motivations for, 14 Heyns, Christof, 23-4, 67, 109 hors de combat detection of, 96, 119 military necessity and, 100 human judgement. See judgement, human human rights AWS and, 3 Martens Clause and, 107-8 right to an effective remedy, 108

right to freedom of assembly, 108 right to life, 108 weapons law and, 88 human-machine interaction Autonomous Systems Reference Framework, 51 changeable nature of, 51 effects of machine autonomy on, 48

human roles in, 45–6 independence and. *See* autonomous weapon systems, independence of mixed-initiative interaction, 46

IHL 6-step targeting process
(Henderson, Ian)
application to AWS, 47
autonomy at each step, 120–6
International Committee of the Red Cross
Conferences of Governmental
Experts on the Use of
Conventional Weapons, 19
customary law study, 6, 13, 48, 91, 138
guidance on weapons reviews, 169
International Criminal Court
establishment of, 19
foundational document. See Rome
Statute
Prosecutor v Katanga, 143–4, 146–7



184 INDEX

International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
Prosecutor v Blaškić, 157, 159
Prosecutor v Furundžija, 159
Prosecutor v Kupreškić, 6
Prosecutor v Mucić, 163
Prosecutor v Tadić, 153
international humanitarian law codification of, 10
provision of legal advisers, 169
States' obligation to disseminate, 168–9
strands of, 10, 16
weapons reviews under. See weapons reviews

judgement, human and distinction, 122 and proportionality, 123–4 and State responsibility, 135–6 and weapon status, 78–9

liability. See accountability

Martens Clause
appearances of, 102
as interpretive tool, 104
as source of law, 104
customary status of, 102
dictates of public conscience and, 108–11
human rights and, 107–8
interpretations of, 103–5
narrow interpretation, 103
origin of, 102
principles of humanity and, 106–8
mens rea, 146
military necessity, 9, 12

Network Centric Warfare, 55-6

Observe, Orient, Decide, Act (OODA) loop, 35–6

precautions in attack AWS targeting software and, 96 obligations in API, 18 under Additional Protocol 1 to the Geneva Conventions. *See* Additional Protocol 1 to the Geneva Conventions, Article 57 proportionality, principle of as a limitation on use of AWS, 118–19 assessments by AWS, 98, 123 definition of, 9 probabilistic reasoning and, 173

research and development programs
Autonomous Aerial Cargo/Utility
System, 53–4
Autonomy Research Pilot Initiative,
52–3
Hydra, 55
K-MAX unmanned cargo resupply
helicopter, 53

Micro Autonomous Systems and Technology, 54 Military Imaging and Surveillance Technology, 52

responsibility. See accountability risk

complexity and, 60 exhaustive testing and, 62 Rome Statute Article 17, 139 Article 22(2), 140 Article 25, 155 Article 25(3)(a), 155 Article 25(3)(c), 157, 160 Article 28(a), 163 Article 28(a)(ii), 164 Article 30, 160 Article 30(1), 146

Article 30(2)(a), 147 Article 30(3), 149 Article 5, 139 Article 8, 20 Article 8(2), 139 Article 8(2)(a), 141 Article 8(2)(b), 141, 143 Article 8(2)(b)(i), 141–2 Article 8(2)(b)(xx), 20

Article 8(2)(c), 141 Article 8(2)(e), 141



INDEX 185

Article 8(2)(e)(i), 141
Article 9(3), 147
default mental element and AWS, 150
purpose of, 20
recommendations to accommodate
AWS, 150–1
war crime of attacking civilians, material elements, 142
war crime of attacking civilians, mental elements, 146
weapon developer liability. See
accountability, weapon developers

Schmitt, Michael, 91-2, 135 sense-think-act paradigm, 33 software adaptability vs predictability, 64 brittleness of, 62-4 complexity and weapons reviews, difficulty of testing, 62 error rates in, 60 State responsibility. See accountability, States stored-program computer, 33-4 superfluous injury and unnecessary autonomous control and, 100-1 customary status of, 18 definition of, 100 relationship to military necessity, 12 superfluous injury and unnecessary suffering relationship to military necessity, 9

targeting law
procedural vs substantive rules, 113
vs weapons law, 85–7
taxonomies of machine autonomy
automatic / automated /
autonomous, 41–2
Autonomy Levels for Unmanned
Systems (ALFUS), 44–5
human in / on / out of the loop, 41
intelligence / learning, 42–3
Sheridan and Verplank's ten levels,
44

Spacecraft Mission Assessment and Re-planning Tool (SMART), 45 US Army Science Board, 45 Three Mile Island, 61 tort law, 166–7 treaties Additional Protocol 1 to the Geneva Conventions. See Additional Protocol 1 to the Geneva Conventions Hague Convention of 1907. See

Fourth Hague Convention of 1907 Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court. See Rome Statute treaties and other international

instruments
Biological Weapons Convention, 19,

Brussels Declaration of 1874, 12–13 Chemical Weapons Convention, 19,

Convention Relative to the Laying of Automatic Submarine Contact Mines, 16

Draft Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts, 130–3

Elements of Crimes of the International Criminal Court, 140, 142, 154

Geneva Convention of 1864, 127 Geneva Conventions of 1949, 138, 141, 167–8

Geneva Gas Protocol of 1925, 19, 105 Genocide Convention of 1948, 132, 138

Hague Convention of 1899, 101–2 Lieber Code of 1863, 137 Nuremberg Charter, 138 Ottawa Convention, 81, 90 Oxford Manual of 1880, 13, 137 St Petersburg Declaration, 10–12, 106 Tokyo Charter, 138

United Kingdom, policy on AWS, 23 United States of America, policy on AWS, 23



186 INDEX

weapon systems Aegis Combat System, 80 Counter Rocket, Artillery, and Mortar (C-RAM), 114 F-35 Joint Strike Fighter, 60 Harpy, Israeli Aerospace Industries, 36-7, 115, 124, 129 Iron Dome, 81, 94 land mines, 81, 83 Patriot missile system, 64-6, 80, 167 Phalanx Close-In Weapon Systems (CIWS), 80, 94 Scud missiles, 92 V1 and V2 rockets, 91 weapons law developments in (1974-77), 16, 19 foundational rule of, 88-9 under IHL, 88-9 vs targeting law, 85-7

weapons reviews certainty generally, 172 certainty when reviewing AWS, 172 - 3customary obligation to perform, exhaustive testing and, 171 expertise for, 170-1 need for standards in, 174 of AWS targeting software, of learning machines, 173-4 purpose of, 169 software complexity and, 170 weapons, definition of Australian Department of Defence, 70 US Department of Defense Law of War Working Group, 70