

#### NATURAL LAW AND THE NATURE OF LAW

This book provides the first systematic, book-length defence of natural law ideas in ethics, politics and jurisprudence since John Finnis's influential *Natural Law and Natural Rights*. Incorporating insights from recent work in ethical, legal and social theory, it presents a robust and original account of the natural law tradition, challenging common perceptions of natural law as a set of timeless standards imposed on humans from above. Natural law, Jonathan Crowe argues, is objective and normative, but nonetheless historically extended, socially embodied and dependent on contingent facts about human nature. It reflects the ongoing human quest to work out how best to live flourishing lives, given the natures we have and the social environments we inhabit. The nature and purpose of law can be adequately understood only within this wider context of value. Timely, wide-ranging and clearly written, this volume will appeal to those working in law, philosophy and religious studies.

JONATHAN CROWE is Professor of Law at Bond University. He is the author or editor of several books, including *Legal Theory* (3rd edn, 2019) and *Research Handbook on Natural Law Theory* (2019). His work has appeared in leading international journals, including the *Modern Law Review*, the *Oxford Journal of Legal Studies, Jurisprudence, Ratio Juris* and *Law and Critique*.





# NATURAL LAW AND THE NATURE OF LAW

JONATHAN CROWE

Bond University





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108498302 DOI: 10.1017/9781108653237

© Jonathan Crowe 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-49830-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### Contents

Preface		<i>page</i> vii
Introduction		I
PART I NORMATIVE FOUNDATIONS		13
I	Normative Inclinations	15
2	Theorising Human Goods	35
3	Acting for Reasons	58
4	The Common Good	85
5	Rights and Freedoms	99
6	The Role of the State	116
PART II THE NATURE OF LAW		I 3 5
7	The Natural Law Thesis	137
8	Law as an Artifact Kind	156
9	The Function of Law	169
10	Law without Authority	182
ΙΙ	Contextual Interpretation	196
Ι2	The Value of Integrity	224
Conclusion		241
Works Cited		247
Index		259

V





## Preface

This book is about the nature of law. It is also, however, about the nature and conditions of human flourishing. I argue that these two topics are inextricably related. Law is best understood as a kind of artifact with the purpose of marking the boundaries of social conduct. However, the reasons for having law in the first place – as well as the ways in which it succeeds or fails in its function – can be understood only against the normative backdrop of human values and social institutions. Law, viewed from this perspective, becomes a set of communal guidelines for the pursuit of human fulfilment, rather than a collection of rules imposed from above. Any adequate descriptive theory of law must accommodate this wider viewpoint.

This picture of law is illustrated by the book's cover art. Jean-Frédéric Bazille's *Porte de la Reine at Aigues-Mortes* (oil on canvas, 1867) shows an assortment of people going about their everyday tasks in the shadow of a medieval wall. The wall, however, remains permeable, despite its formidable appearance, as illustrated by the opening with light spilling through. This permeability augments, rather than diminishes, the wall's function as a boundary marker. It enables the local residents to incorporate the boundary into their lives, rather than viewing it as an impediment to their individual and collective life plans. Furthermore, although the wall dominates the painting with its sheer size, it is the people in the foreground who draw the eye. The true law, we might say, is not over there, but among us.

Many people have helped me to write this book. I am grateful to my colleagues in the Faculty of Law at Bond University and the Law School and Philosophy Department at the University of Queensland for their support over many years of research, writing and refinement. Some early and late work on the book was undertaken during my time as a visiting scholar in the Philosophy Department at Georgetown University and the Government Department at the University of Texas at Austin. I thank my



viii Preface

colleagues there for their hospitality. Draft chapters were presented to audiences at the University of Auckland, Georgetown University, McMaster University, Monash University, the University of Melbourne, the University of New South Wales, the University of Queensland and the University of Sydney, as well as the meetings of the Australasian Society of Legal Philosophy and the Australasian Association of Philosophy. I thank the participants for their helpful feedback.

I am indebted to Sophie Grace Chappell and Gary Chartier for their detailed notes on a draft manuscript. I also recall valuable comments from Jim Allan, Niharika Ahuja, Nick Aroney, Kit Barker, Cicely Bonnin, Mikayla Brier-Mills, Tom Campbell, Peter Cane, Alice Dalziel, Margaret Davies, Maks Del Mar, Ken Ehrenberg, Patrick Emerton, Chris Essert, Rachael Field, Nick Gaskell, Eric Ghosh, Maurice Goldsmith, Jeff Goldsworthy, Ross Grantham, Matthew Harding, Heidi Hurd, Radha Ivory, Barbora Jedličková, Andrew Johnston, Matthew Kramer, Martin Krygier, Julian Lamont, Constance Youngwon Lee, Judy Lichtenberg, Denise Meyerson, Rob Mullins, Mark Murphy, Hillary Nye, Suri Ratnapala, Arie Rosen, Kristen Rundle, Tim Sellers, Dale Smith, Peta Stephenson, Michael Stokes, Kevin Toh, Lisa Toohey, Kevin Walton, Lulu Weis, Robin West and Kylie Weston-Scheuber. I am sure there are others whom I have forgotten. They have my apologies, as well as my gratitude.

A few other contributions deserve special acknowledgment. Cicely Bonnin remains, as always, my most trusted friend and advisor. I am constantly inspired by her passion, determination and commitment to intellectual enquiry. I thank my parents-in-law, Barbara and Geoffrey Bonnin, in whose home the opening chapters of this book were written, and my aunt- and uncle-in-law, Liz and David Bogard, in whose home I finalised the manuscript. Finally, I thank my parents, Marilyn and Andrew Crowe, who imparted to me the sense of moral integrity and love of wisdom that I hope are reflected in these pages. This book is dedicated to them.

Excerpts from the following works are reproduced in this book with the permission of the publishers: Jonathan Crowe, 'Natural Law in Jurisprudence and Politics' (2007) 27 Oxford Journal of Legal Studies 775; Jonathan Crowe, 'Dworkin on the Value of Integrity' (2007) 12 Deakin Law Review 167; Jonathan Crowe, 'Explaining Natural Rights: Ontological Freedom and the Foundations of Political Discourse' (2009) 4 New York University Journal of Law and Liberty 70; Jonathan Crowe, 'Clarifying the Natural Law Thesis' (2012) 37 Australian Journal of Legal



#### Preface

ix

Philosophy 159; Jonathan Crowe, 'The Role of Contextual Meaning in Judicial Interpretation' (2013) 41 Federal Law Review 417; Jonathan Crowe, 'Law as an Artifact Kind' (2014) 40 Monash University Law Review 737; Jonathan Crowe, 'Radicalising Hayekian Constitutionalism' (2014) 33 University of Queensland Law Journal 379; Jonathan Crowe, 'Natural Law and Normative Inclinations' (2015) 28 Ratio Juris 52; Jonathan Crowe, 'Natural Law Theories' (2016) 11 Philosophy Compass 91; Jonathan Crowe and Barbora Jedličková, 'What's Wrong with Cartels?' (2016) 44 Federal Law Review 401; Jonathan Crowe, 'Metaphysical Foundations of Natural Law Theories' in George Duke and Robert P. George (eds.), The Cambridge Companion to Natural Law Jurisprudence (Cambridge University Press, 2017); Jonathan Crowe, 'Functions, Context and Constitutional Values' in Rosalind Dixon (ed.), Australian Constitutional Values (Hart, 2018) (reproduced with permission of Hart Publishing, an imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing); and Jonathan Crowe, 'Integrity and Truth in Law's Empire' in Salman Khurshid, Lokendra Malik and Veronica Rodriguez-Blanco (eds.), Dignity in the Legal and Political Philosophy of Ronald Dworkin (Oxford University Press, 2018) (reproduced with permission of Oxford University Press India; compilation © Oxford University Press 2018).

