Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-49782-4 — Conceptions of Set and the Foundations of Mathematics Luca Incurvati Index More Information

Index

∈-induction, see membership, induction on ∈-minimal element, 45 (Collapse), 25-26, 175 (Comp), see Comprehension, Naïve (Comp2), see Comprehension, Second-Order (Comp_Ø), 133, 159 (DefV), 152 (E), see Equivalence Schema (GoodV), 152 (IE), 29, 168, see also indefinite extensibility (New V), 142, 146 (New V⁻), 146 (SComp), see Comprehension, Stratified (U), 28-29, see also universality (V), see Basic Law V abstraction principle, see criterion of identity, two-level AC, see Axiom of Choice Aczel, Peter, 185-193, 195-196, 200, 211 AFA, see Anti-Foundation Axiom AFA1, 190, 197, see also Anti-Foundation Axiom AFA2, 190, 191, 197-199, see also Anti-Foundation Axiom anti-exceptionalism, 129, 172 Anti-Foundation Axiom, 190-191, 195-201, 209 Antonelli, Aldo, 210 apg, 187, 193 decoration of, 187 extensional, 187-189 isomorphism-extensional, 188-189, 197, 200 Scott-extensional, 189, 191 strongly-extensional, 191 tagged, 213-214 unfolding of, 189-191 well-founded, 187, 196 Axiom (p), 48, 49, 50n25, 50, 98n32 Axiom of Accumulation, 48, 81

Axiom of Choice, 43, 46-47, 91-92, 103, 138-139 and the graph conception, 207-208 and the iterative conception, 43-44 and limitation of size, 144 and New Foundations, 165-166, 181-182 second-order, 138 Axiom of Collection, 186n4 Axiom of Constructibility, 43, 210 Axiom of Counting, 166 Axiom of Creation, 48 Axiom of Empty Set, 45, 131, 144, 201 Axiom of Extensionality, 10-11 and the graph conception, 196-197, 199-200 and iterative set theory, 45, 48 and limitation of size, 144 and naïve set theory, 24, 119-120 and New Foundations, 162, 175-176, 180, see also Axiom of Weak Extensionality axiom of extent, 23-24, 45, 47 Axiom of Foundation, 38, 45, 49-50, 107, 144-145, 165 Axiom of Infinity, 41 and the definite conception, 154 and the graph conception, 201-203 and iterative set theory, 45, 48 and limitation of size, 144, 146-148 and New Foundations, 165-166 and Reflection, 97-98 axiom of nature, 23-24, 45, 47, 48 Axiom of Ordinals, 41, 92-93 Axiom of Powerset, 42, 52 and the graph conception, 206 and iterative set theory, 45 and limitation of size, 144, 146-147 and New Foundations, 165 Axiom of Restriction, 48, 81 Axiom of Union, 45, 144-145, 165, 206, 208 Axiom of Unordered Pairs, 45, 144, 165, 206 Axiom of Weak Extensionality, 166

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-49782-4 — Conceptions of Set and the Foundations of Mathematics Luca Incurvati Index

More Information

234

BA1, see Boffa's Weak Axiom BAFA, see Boffa's Anti-Foundation Axiom Barwise, John, 194-195, 213 Basic Law V, 25-26, 142, 174 restricted, 142, 146, 152 Bernays, Paul, 31, 44, 98, 140 bisimulation, 191 Boffa set theory, 187-188 Boffa's Anti-Foundation Axiom, 187-188 Boffa's Weak Axiom, 188n6 Boolos, George, 11, 44, 45, 62, 67-69, 73, 90, 93, 95, 142-144, 149-150, 201, 207-208, 217 Brady, Ross Thomas, 113-114, 117 Burali-Forti's Paradox, 29, 137-138, 149-150, 161-162, 164-165, 167-169 Cameron, Ross, 57-58 Cantor's Paradox, 28-29, 150, 161, 164, 168 Cantor's Theorem, 29, 34-35, 45, 135 and New Foundations, 164 and paraconsistent set theory, 107, 117-118 and the zigzag theory, 161 Cantor, Georg, 4-5, 31, 33, 95, 134-139, 148 cardinal, 28, 136, 164 α -Mahlo, 166 aleph, 34, 136 beth, 91-92 Erdös, 42, 99 Frege-Russell, 33, 161, 163, 171 inaccessible, 41, 96, 98-99, 118 large, 41, 96, 99-100, 118 large large, 96n30, 99, 218 Mahlo, 41, 96, 98-99, 118 measurable, 42, 118, 210 Scott-Tarski, 80 small large, 96n30, 98 stationary in κ , 96n31 von Neumann cardinal assignment, 34 weakly compact, 42, 98 categoricity, 49 quasi-, 49-50, 211 class logical, see extension; objectified property as many, 3-4, see also plurality as one, 4, see also set proper, 85-86, 140 Closure Principle, 96, see also Reflection Principle Cocchiarella, Nino B., 175, 177-178 cofinality principle, 94-95 Collapsing Lemma Mostowski's, 34, 209 Priest's, 121-124 combinatorial conception, 31-32, 44, 62n36, 75-77, 178, 182-183, 194, 208-218 composition, 22 as identity, 5-6, 6n5

Index

Comprehension Naïve, 24, 28–29, 71–78, 101–133, 142, 159, 179 Second-Order, 24-26, 75, 175 Stratified, 162-167 Weakly Stratified, 167 computability, 16-17 concept, 25, 77, see also property; property, objectified closed, 144 definite, 152 extensionally definite, 155-156 inconsistent, 19-20 intensionally definite, 155 range of application of, 15-19 small, 142 transitive, 144 well-founded, 145 conception as analysis, 18-19 characterized, 12-14 inference to the best, 61, 64-69, 125, 219 justifying a theory, 23-24 pluralism, 219 as replacement, 19-20 sanctioning a theory, 23-24 as sharpening, 15-18 conditional enthymematic, 119-120 logical reading of, 115-116 relevant, see relevant logic consistency maxims, 128-133 as a theoretical virtue, 65-66, 125 consistency strength, 165-166 constructible hierarchy, 43 Contraction axiom 112 rule, 103-105, 112-114, 116 structural rule, 102n1, 103n2 Coret's Axiom B, 80n9, 163n5 Counterexample Rule, 117-118 Crabbé, Marcel, 166 criterion of application, 7-8, 15-19, 22 criterion of identity, 7-9, 15, 18, 25 Fregean, see criterion of identity, two-level for non-well-founded sets, 198-200, see also Anti-Foundation Axiom, Boffa's Anti-Foundation Axiom, Finsler's Anti-Foundation Axiom, Scott's Anti-Foundation Axiom one-level, 8-9 for sets, 10-11, see also Axiom of Extensionality two-level, 8-9, 25, 142 CRP, see Reflection Principle, Complete cumulative hierarchy, 37-44, 78-81 absolutely infinite, 95-100

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-49782-4 — Conceptions of Set and the Foundations of Mathematics Luca Incurvati Index

More Information

as an inner model, 121–126, 210 as an intuitive model, 126, 180, 210 level of, 37, 42–44, 48, 81 as obtained from the type-theoretic hierarchy, 170–172 Curry's Paradox, 103–105, 107, 112

Davidson, Donald, 8 definite conception, 152–156, 218 Devlin, Keith, 198 dialetheism, 102, 105–109, 118, 120–127 disjunctive syllogism, 105, 107, 118 DKQ, 117 DLQ, 117–119 Dummett, Michael, 7, 27, 126n20, 153–155

equinumerosity, 33 Equivalence Schema, 64, 132 Etchemendy, John, 213 *ex falso quodlibet*, 102–103, 107 extension, 24–25, 75–76, 142, 145–146, 177–178

FAFA, see Finsler's Anti-Foundation Axiom fictionalism 30 Field, Hartry, 76, 114 Fine, Kit, 54-56 Finsler's Anti-Foundation Axiom, 189, 197 Finsler, Paul, 3 Finsler-Aczel set theory, 189, 196 FN, see Frege-von Neumann set theory FN⁻, 146 FN*, 146–147 formula absolute, 42n5 bounded, 166 relativized, 87n17, 97 simple, 161-162, 167 stratified, 162-167, 172, 176-177 weakly stratified, 167 well-formed, 2 Fraenkel, Abraham, 78n6, 170 Frege, Gottlob, 7, 9-10, 25-26, 33, 76-77, 174, 179-180 Frege-von Neumann set theory, 142, 147, 149 fusion, 5-6, 11 Generalized Continuum Hypothesis, 165n10 Global Well-Ordering, 138-140, 141n12 Gödel, Kurt, 11n10, 19, 42n6, 62-63, 76-80, 90-93, 96, 170-171, 173-174, 179 graph, 186 accessible, 187 accessible pointed, see apg directed, 186 edge of, 186 node of, 186

Index

235

graph conception, 185, 193-195, 218 axioms justified on, 195-209 objections to, 209-216 graph-theoretic hierarchy, 210-212 Hartogs's Theorem, 92 Haslanger, Sally, 20 Henson, C. Ward, 166 Holmes, Randall, 165-166 Horwich, Paul, 64, 132 implementation independency, 176-177 impossible world, 113, 115-116 Incurvati, Luca, 130, 132-133, 157-158 indefinite extensibility, 27-30, 37, 39, 74-78, 152-156, 167-169, 179, 183-185, 218 Indiscernibility of Identicals, 109 individual, 17, 37, 39-41, 45, 62, 73-75, 79, 144, 171, 213-214 interpretation higher-order, 86 intended, 82-84 set-theoretic, 2, 81, 88 iterative conception, 36-39, 42-44, 218-219 axiomatizations based on, 44-50 constructivist account of, 51-53 dependency account of, 53-61 minimalist account of, 61-64, 69 minimalist approach to, 61-67, 69, 85n15 objections to, 70-90 substantial approach to, 51-59 vs limitation of size, 149-151 Jensen, Ronald, 166, 180 justification, intrinsic vs extrinsic, 67 Kim, Jaegwon, 15 Koellner, Peter, 91-92, 98-99 Kreisel, Georg, 43, 73n4, 82-83, 87-90 K₃, 106 language of first-order set theory, 24, 42, 82-84, 98, 163, 215 formalized, 2 of nth-order set theory, 97 of second-order set theory, 98 Lavine, Shaughan, 79n6 Leng, Mary, 30n21 Lévy, Azriel, 97-99 Lewis, David, 40 limitation of size conception, 136-137, 218 axiomatizations based on, 142-146 as a logical conception, 141, 143 Cantor Limitation of Size, 135-139, 141 maximalist vs non-maximalist, 140-141 objections to, 145-151

pointed, 186

subgraph, 188

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-49782-4 — Conceptions of Set and the Foundations of Mathematics Luca Incurvati Index

More Information

236

limitation of size conception (cont.) Ordinal Limitation of Size, 138–139, 141, 147.151 Russell's, 137-138 Von Neumann Limitation of Size, 139-142, 147 Linnebo, Øystein, 26, 53-56, 60-61, 138-139, 150-151, 154-156, 214-216 Logic of Paradox, 105-108 with identity, 107 minimally inconsistent, 110-111 logical conception, 31-32, 75-77, 86n16, 143, 177-179, 182, 218 Lowe, E. J. 9, 54-57 LP, see Logic of Paradox LP=, see Logic of Paradox, with identity LPm, see Logic of Paradox, minimally inconsistent Lyndon, Roger, 165 MacLane set theory, 166 Maddy, Penelope, 31, 66, 130, 210 Martin, Donald Anthony, 169-170, 178 material implication, paradoxes of, 114-116 maxim of minimum mutilation, 129 McGee's Theorem, 132 generalized, 132-133, 157-159 McGee, Vann, 132 meaning containment, 113-114 membership, 4 derivative, 31, 143, 177 induction on, 50 primitive, 32 membership structure, 194-195, 198 mereological sum, see fusion metaphysical dependence, 54-61 Mirimanoff's Paradox, 29, 163 Mirimanoff, Dmitry, 194-195 Mirimanoff-von Neumann result, 34, 208-209 Mitchell, Emerson, 132 ML, 165 model, 2, 30, 83 class, 49n18 collapsed, 122-124 non-well-founded, 50 transitive, 52n27 Modus Ponens Axiom, 104-105, 112 Montague, Richard, 97 Moschovakis, Yannis Nicholas, 196 Moss, Lawrence, 194-195 Mostowski's Collapsing Lemma, see Collapsing Lemma, Mostowski's MPA, see Modus Ponens Axiom multiplicity, 4, see also plurality; property consistent, 4, 134-137, see also set inconsistent, 134-137 Murzi, Julien, 130, 132-133, 157-158 Myhill, John, 75-76

Index

naïve conception, 24-25, 218 as intuitive, 128-129, 170 of set of individuals, 73-75 naïve set theory, 24, 84 inconsistency of, 25-26 in a paraconsistent setting, 101-127 NBG, see von Neumann-Bernays-Gödel set theory NDLQ, 117-118 Neumann, John von, 38, 139-141 New Foundations, 162-166 as ad hoc, 169-170 and the Axiom of Choice, see Axiom of Choice, and New Foundations as obtained from type theory, 170-175 as rejecting indefinite extensibility, 167-169 as a theory of objectified properties, 175-182 with Urelemente, 166 as a zigzag theory, 167 NF, see New Foundations NFU, see New Foundations, with Urelemente NLP, 103, 107-109, 124, 126 NLP=, 108-109, 121-126 NLPm, 110-111 no class theory, 137, 162 nominalization, 174-175, 180, 182 Oliver, Alex, 11, 21, 69 open-texture, 16-17, 18 ordinal, 28 arbitrary, 41-42 Frege-Russell, 33, 161, 163 limit, 34 Scott-Tarski, 80, 91 successor, 34 successor of an 34 von Neumann, 34 Orey, Steven, 166 PA, see Peano Arithmetic, first-order PA2, see Peano Arithmetic, second-order paraconsistent logic, 84, 102 paraconsistent set theory, see naïve set theory, in a paraconsistent setting paradoxes, set-theoretic, 25-30, 64-66, 75-78, 148-151 parameter, 24, 91-92, 97-98, 131 Parsons, Charles, 92n21, 178 Paseau, Alexander, 44, 67-68, 100 path, 187 Peano Arithmetic first-order, 49, 132n7, 166 second-order, 49, 83n10 permutation invariance, 177 Pettigrew, Richard, 214-216 platonism, 30, 51, 53, 59-60 plurality, 3-6, 10-11 Potter, Michael, 48, 51, 54, 147-148, 153-154

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-49782-4 — Conceptions of Set and the Foundations of Mathematics Luca Incurvati Index

More Information

Index

powerset, 13, 37, 50n21, 62, 79-80, 90-93 not absolute, 52 Priest, Graham, 71n2, 71-72, 78, 81, 83-84, 102 - 127Principle of Graph-Extensionality, 199-200 property, 11 of being an ordinal, 135 definite, 152, 154 determining a set, 134-137, 152 essential, 54-56 natural, 11n9 as object, 174 objectified, 75-78, 86n16, 174-179, 181-183, 218 - 219structural, 96 subproperty, 135 universal, 140 Property Comparability, 138-141, 151 propositional function, 27, 137, 161 Q. see Robinson Arithmetic Quine, Willard Van Orman, 13-14, 128-129, 162-164, 170, 172-173, 177-178 Ramsey, Frank Plumpton, 44 Rayo, Augustín, 86-87 Reflection Principle, 95-97, 99-100 Complete, 97-98 Template, 97 relation total order, 33n25 well-founded, 29n20, 50 well-order, 33n25 relevant logic, 111-112 depth, 112-118 **B** 112 Replacement and the definite conception, 153-156 and the graph conception, 208-209 impredicative, 53 and the iterative conception, 90-100 and limitation of size, 144 and New Foundations, 165 Property Replacement, 138-139, 151, 153-156 Property Size, 136 Schema, 47, 49 second-order axiom, 50, 151 Restall, Greg, 107-108 Rieger, Adam, 185, 196-197, 199-200 Robinson Arithmetic, 132-133 Rosser, John Barkley, 165-166 Routley, Richard, 103 RP, see Reflection Principle, Template Russell's Paradox, 25-28, 39, 75, 163, 168 Russell, Bertrand, 3-4, 26-28, 137-138, 147-148, 152-153, 161-162, 167-172

237

Scharp, Kevin, 20 Scott set theory, 189–192 Scott's Anti-Foundation Axiom, 189-191 Scott, Dana, 48-49, 80-81, 172, 210 Scott-Potter set theory, 48-49, 80-81 Scott-Tarski trick, 80, see also cardinal, Scott-Tarski; ordinal, Scott-Tarski second-order logic, 2, 24-25 and choice principles, 44n11, 138 semantics Henkin, 25 higher-order, 86-87 set-theoretic, 81-82, 87 standard, 25 Separation and the definite conception, 153-156 and the graph conception, 206, 207n19 impredicativity of, 51-53 and limitation of size, 144, 148-149 and New Foundations, 165 Property Separation, 136, 149, 153-156 Schema, 35, 42-43, 45, 48 second-order axiom, 42, 50 set canonical picture of, 187n5 Cantor's characterization of, 4-5 cantorian, 164-166, 181-182 choice, 43-44, 207-208 exact picture of, 187 graph-extensional, 198-199 as having a unique decomposition, 6 maximally consistent, 132-133 picture of, 187 pure, 39-40, 144-145, 182, 213-214 Russell, 26, 39, 102, 131, 163 strongly cantorian, 166 transitive, 34, 117 as a unity, 4-6 universal, 28, 130, 163 well-founded, 29, 45, 81, 218 well-ordered, 34, 90-92 set formation, 22 set of operation, 61-63, 79-80, 90-93, 100, 212 set theory almost trivial, 110 as a foundation for mathematics, 45, 66, 71n2, 104, 133, 181, 214-216, 219 non-trivial, 103-104, 125-126 as a theory of the infinite, 66, 104, 133 Shapiro, Stewart, 16-17, 52-53, 60 Shoenfield, Joseph Robert, 93-95 Smiley, Timothy, 11, 21 SP, see Scott-Potter set theory Specker, Ernst Paul, 165, 173 squeezing argument, 87-90 ST (stage theory), 46, 203, 205 stratification, see formula, stratified

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-49782-4 — Conceptions of Set and the Foundations of Mathematics Luca Incurvati Index

More Information

238

stratified conception, 175-177, 218 as a logical conception, 177-179 objections to, 179-182 Strawson, Peter, 15 structuralism, 59-61, 63 subset, 13 arbitrary, 42-44 describable, 43 subtension, 142 hereditarily small, 144 transitive, 144 well-founded, 145 syntactic restrictionism, 160-163 T (theory of trees), 203-207 Tait, William Walker, 91-92, 98 Tarski, Alfred, 80, 87 theory, 1 axiomatic, 1-2 following from a conception, see conception, sanctioning a theory formal. 2 justified on a conception, see conception, sanctioning a theory Thomas, Morgan, 110-111 transfinite recursion, 34, 50, 117 transitive closure, 39n2, 50n23, 50, 187, 211 tree, 187, 203-206 root of, 187 subtree, 189n9 truth in all structures, 88-89 arithmetical 154 as an inconsistent concept, 20 in an interpretation, 82-84 logical 82 minimalist account of, 64, 132 Turing, Alan, 17 type theory, 170-175, 179-180, 181 typical ambiguity, 172-173 universality, 27-30, 37, 39, 74-78, 152, 156,

167–169, 179, 183–185, 218 Urelement, see individual Uzquiano, Gabriel, 50n25, 86

V = L, *see* Axiom of Constructibility validity, logical, 81–82 for set theory, 82–90

Index

von Neumann-Bernays-Gödel set theory, 85, 91n19, 140 Waismann, Friedrich, 16 Wang, Hao, 52, 76, 94n24, 99-100 Weakening Rule, 119 Weber, Zach, 117-120 Weir, Alan, 89-90, 102n1, 108-109, 124n18 Well-Ordering Theorem, 34, 46, 165 Whitehead, Alfred North, 170-171 Williamson, Timothy, 8-9, 18-19, 86-87 Z, see Zermelo set theory, first-order Z⁺, 48–50, 82–83, 92–93 Z⁺₂, 50n23, 50 Z_2 , see Zermelo set theory, second-order Zermelo set theory first-order, 45-46, 49-52 second-order, 50n23, 50 Zermelo, Ernst, 38, 41, 46, 50, 85n13, 129-130, 165 Zermelo-Fraenkel set theory first-order, 47, 98 second-order, 50 Zermelo-Fraenkel set theory with the Axiom of Choice first-order, 45, 47 with Urelemente, 45, 86 second-order, 87n17, 211 with Urelemente, 86-87 Zermelo-König inequality, 133n10 ZF, see Zermelo-Fraenkel set theory, first-order Zf⁺, 92–93 Zf⁺₂, 92 ZF2, see Zermelo-Fraenkel set theory, second-order ZFA, 190-192, 195-197, 201, 207, 209-211 ZFA2, 211 ZFC, see Zermelo-Fraenkel set theory with the Axiom of Choice, first-order **ZFC**⁻, 186 ZFC₂, see Zermelo-Fraenkel set theory with the Axiom of Choice, second-order ZFCU, see Zermelo-Fraenkel set theory with the Axiom of Choice, first-order, with Urelemente ZFCU₂, see Zermelo-Fraenkel set theory with the Axiom of Choice, second-order, with Urelemente $Z_i, 46$ zigzag theory, 137, 161-162, 167-169 Z_i^- , 201, 204, 207