

Practical Philosophy from Kant to Hegel

Scholarship on Kant's practical philosophy has often overlooked its reception in the early days of post-Kantian philosophy and German Idealism. This volume of new essays illuminates that reception and how it informed the development of practical philosophy between Kant and Hegel. The essays discuss, in addition to Kant, Hegel and Fichte, relatively little-known thinkers such as Pistorius, Ulrich, Maimon, Erhard, E. Reimarus, Reinhold, Jacobi, F. Schlegel, Humboldt, Dalberg, Gentz, Rehberg, and Möser. Issues discussed include the empty formalism objection, the separation between right and morality, freedom and determinism, nihilism, the right to revolution, ideology, and the limits of the liberal state. Taken together, the essays provide an historically informed and philosophically nuanced picture of the development of post-Kantian practical philosophy.

JAMES A. CLARKE is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of York. He has published several articles on Fichte and Hegel. He is a member of the editorial board of the *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, with responsibility for translations.

GABRIEL GOTTLIEB is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Xavier University. In addition to publishing multiple articles on Fichte, he is the editor of *Fichte's Foundations of Natural Right: A Critical Guide* (Cambridge University Press, 2016).

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49772-5 — Practical Philosophy from Kant to Hegel
Edited by James A. Clarke , Gabriel Gottlieb
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Practical Philosophy from Kant to Hegel

Freedom, Right, and Revolution

Edited by

James A. Clarke

University of York

Gabriel Gottlieb

Xavier University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49772-5 — Practical Philosophy from Kant to Hegel
Edited by James A. Clarke, Gabriel Gottlieb
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108497725
DOI: 10.1017/9781108647441

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-49772-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	page vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	viii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	ix
Introduction	1
JAMES A. CLARKE AND GABRIEL GOTTLIEB	
1 The Original Empty Formalism Objection: Pistorius and Kant	10
PAUL GUYER	
2 Freedom and Ethical Necessity: A Kantian Response to Ulrich (1788)	28
KATERINA DELIGIORGI	
3 Maimonides and Kant in the Ethical Thought of Salomon Maimon	45
TIMOTHY QUINN	
4 Erhard on Right and Morality	61
JAMES A. CLARKE	
5 Erhard on Revolutionary Action	80
MICHAEL NANCE	
6 Elise Reimarus on Freedom and Rebellion	99
REED WINEGAR	
7 Freedom and Duty: Kant, Reinhold, Fichte	118
DANIEL BREAZEALE	
8 Fichte's Ethical Holism	138
OWEN WARE	
9 Jacobi on Revolution and Practical Nihilism	157
BENJAMIN CROWE	

vi	Contents	
10	The Political Implications of Friedrich Schlegel's Poetic, Republican Discourse ELIZABETH MILLÁN BRUSSLAN	174
11	The Limits of State Action: Humboldt, Dalberg, and Perfectionism after Kant DOUGLAS MOGGACH	192
12	Echoes of Revolution: Hegel's Debt to the German Burkeans REIDAR MALIKS	213
13	Public Opinion and Ideology in Hegel's <i>Philosophy of Right</i> KAREN NG	229
	<i>Bibliography</i>	249
	<i>Index</i>	261

Contributors

DANIEL BREAZEALE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Kentucky.

JAMES A. CLARKE is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of York.

BENJAMIN CROWE is Lecturer in Philosophy at Boston University.

KATERINA DELIGIORGI is Reader in Philosophy at the University of Sussex.

GABRIEL GOTTLIEB is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Xavier University.

PAUL GUYER is the Jonathan Nelson Professor of Humanities and Philosophy at Brown University.

REIDAR MALIKS is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Oslo.

ELIZABETH MILLÁN BRUSSLAN is Professor of Philosophy at DePaul University.

DOUGLAS MOGGACH is University Chair of Political Thought at the University of Ottawa.

MICHAEL NANCE is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Maryland Baltimore County.

KAREN NG is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Vanderbilt University.

TIMOTHY QUINN is Professor of Philosophy at Xavier University.

OWEN WARE is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Toronto.

REED WINEGAR is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Fordham University.

Acknowledgments

This volume of essays was originally conceived as part of the British Arts and Humanities Research Council research network “Reason, Right, and Revolution: Practical Philosophy between Kant and Hegel.” We are grateful to all of the participants in that network and especially to Michael Beaney, Vicky Nesfield, and Elisabeth Thorsson for their help and support.

We are thankful for the support and advice of our colleagues at the University of York and Xavier University, especially Timothy Brownlee, Owen Hulatt, Chris Jay, Mary Leng, Timothy Quinn, and Tom Stoneham. We thank Sean Hamill for his editorial assistance; and we thank Mitchell Nolte (mitchellnolte.com) for creating the cover illustration for this volume. James is grateful to Sophie Gibb, Linda Clarke, and John Clarke for their love, support, and advice. Gabe is grateful to Kristen Renzi and Josephine Gottlieb for their love and support, as well as his loving family in Texas and beyond. Many, many thanks to Hilary Gaskin and the team at Cambridge University Press for their support, guidance, and patience.

Abbreviations

We have only included abbreviations for primary sources, with an emphasis on sources by Kant, post-Kantians, and Kant's critics. In the case of Kant, we follow the standard practice of citing *Kant's gesammelte Schriften* according to the volume and page number (e.g. *GW*, 4: 399), except in the case of the *Critique of Pure Reason*, where references are to the A and B editions. With other philosophers, when there is an available English translation, the English translation is cited first, followed by a reference to the German edition.

Erhard

AT	“Apologie des Teufels,” in <i>ÜRAS</i> .
BA	“Betrachtungen über die Rede des Boetie und über die Alleinherrschaft, nach Anleitung der Geschichte und Erfahrung,” <i>Der neue Teutsche Merkur</i> , 2:7 (1793): 209–42.
BF	“Brief an Forberg vom Dezember 1794,” in <i>ÜRAS</i> .
DA	“Devil’s Apology,” trans. J. A. Clarke and C. Rhode, <i>British Journal for the History of Philosophy</i> , 27:1 (2019): 194–215.
DW	<i>Denkwürdigkeiten des Philosophen und Arztes Johann Benjamin Erhard</i> , ed. Karl August Varnhagen von Ense. Stuttgart and Tübingen: Cotta, 1830.
IG	“Die Idee der Gerechtigkeit als Princip einer Gesetzgebung betrachtet,” <i>Die Horen</i> , 3:7 (1795): 1–30.
PA	“Prüfung der Alleinherrschaft nach moralischen Prinzipien,” <i>Der neue Teutsche Merkur</i> , 3:12 (1793): 329–33.
RF	“Rezension von Fichtes Revolutionsbuch,” in <i>ÜRAS</i> .
ÜRAS	<i>Über das Recht des Volks zu einer Revolution und andere Schriften</i> , ed. H. G. Haasis. Frankfurt am Main: Syndikat, 1976.
ÜRVR	<i>Über das Recht des Volks zu einer Revolution</i> , in <i>ÜRAS</i> .

x List of Abbreviations

Fichte

- AGN* *Addresses to the German Nation*, trans. Gregory Moore. Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- B* *Beitrag zur Berichtigung der Urteile des Publikums über die französische Revolution*, ed. Richard Schottky. Hamburg: Meiner, 1973.
- CCS* *The Closed Commerical State*, trans. Anthony Adler. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2012.
- EPW* *Fichte: Early Philosophical Writings*, trans. Daniel Breazeale. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1988.
- FNR* *Foundations of Natural Right*, trans. Michael Baur, ed. Frederick Neuhouser. Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- GA* *J. G. Fichte: Gesamtausgabe der Bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften*, eds. Reinhard Lauth, Hans Gliwitzky, and Erich Fuchs. Stuttgart-Bad Cannstatt: Frommann-Holzboog, 1964–2012.
- GGZ* *Die Grundzüge des gegenwärtigen Zeitalters*, in *SW*, Bd. VII.
- IW* *Introductions to the Wissenschaftslehre and Other Writings (1797–1800)*, trans. Daniel Breazeale. Indianapolis: Hackett, 1994.
- R* “Reclamation of the Freedom of Thought from the Princes of Europe, Who Have Oppressed It until Now,” in James Schmidt (ed.), *What Is Enlightenment?: Eighteenth-Century Answers and Twentieth-Century Questions*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996.
- SE* *The System of Ethics*, trans. Daniel Breazeale and Günter Zöller. Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- SK* *The Science of Knowledge (Wissenschaftslehre)*, trans. Peter Heath and John Lachs. Cambridge University Press, 1982.
- SW* *Johann Gottlieb Fichtes sämtliche Werke*, ed. I. H. Fichte. Berlin: Veit, 1845–6.
- VBG* *Einige Vorlesungen über die Bestimmung des Gelehrten*, in *SW*, Bd. VI.
- VM* *The Vocation of Man*, trans. Peter Preuss. Indianapolis: Hackett, 1987.
- WLnm* *Foundations of Transcendental Philosophy: (Wissenschaftslehre) Nova Methodo (1796/99)*, trans. Daniel Breazeale. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1992.
- WM* *Über die Würde des Menschen (1794)*, in *SW*, Bd. I.

Hegel

- BrH* *Briefe von und an Hegel. Band I: 1785–1812*, ed. Johannes Hoffmeister. Hamburg: Felix Meiner, 1969.
- D* *The Difference between Fichte's and Schelling's System of Philosophy*, trans. W. Cerf and H. S. Harris. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1977.
- GC* "The German Constitution," in *Hegel: Political Writings*, trans. H. B. Nisbet, ed. Laurence Dickey and H. B. Nisbet. Cambridge University Press, 1999.
- HW* *Werke in zwanzig Bänden*, ed. Eva Moldenhauer and Karl Markus Michel. Frankfurt: Suhrkamp, 1971.
- L* *Hegel: The Letters*, trans. Clarke Butler and Christiane Seiler. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984.
- LPH* "Lectures on the Philosophy of History (1827–1831)," in *Hegel: Political Writings*, trans. H. B. Nisbet, ed. Laurence Dickey and H. B. Nisbet. Cambridge University Press, 1999.
- PH* *Introduction to the Philosophy of History*, trans. Leo Rauch. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 1988.
- PhS* *Phenomenology of Spirit*, trans. A. V. Miller. Oxford University Press, 1977.
- PR* *Elements of the Philosophy of Right*, trans. H. B. Nisbet, ed. Allen W. Wood. Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- NL* *Natural Law: The Scientific Ways of Treating Natural Law, Its Place in Moral Philosophy, and Its Relation to the Positive Sciences of Law*, trans. T. M. Knox. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1975.
- SL* *Science of Logic*, trans. George di Giovanni. Cambridge University Press, 2010.

Jacobi

- JBW* *Briefwechsel - Nachlaß - Dokumente*, ed. Walter Jaeschke. Stuttgart-Bad Canstatt: Frommann-Holzboog, 1981–.
- JWA* *Werke*, ed. Klaus Hammacher and Walter Jaeschke. Hamburg: Felix Meiner, 1998–.
- MPW* *Main Philosophical Writings and the Novel Allwill*, trans. George di Giovanni. Montreal: McGill-Queen's Press, 1995.

xii List of Abbreviations

Kant

- AA *Kant's gesammelte Schriften* (Akademie Ausgabe). Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1902–.
- CJ *Critique of the Power of Judgment*, trans. and ed. Paul Guyer and Eric Matthews. Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- CPR *Critique of Pure Reason*, trans. Paul Guyer and Allen W. Wood. Cambridge University Press, 1998.
- CPrR *Critique of Practical Reason*, trans. Mary Gregor in *PP*.
- ETP *Theoretical Philosophy 1755–1770*, trans. David Walford, ed. David Walford and Ralf Meerbote. Cambridge University Press, 2003.
- GW *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*, trans. Mary Gregor in *PP*.
- LDPP *Lectures and Drafts on Political Philosophy*, trans. Frederick Rauscher and Kenneth R. Westphal, ed. Frederick Rauscher. Cambridge University Press, 2016.
- MM *Metaphysics of Morals*, trans. Mary Gregor in *PP*.
- PP *Practical Philosophy*, trans. Mary Gregor, ed. Allen Wood. Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- RBMR *Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason*, trans. George di Giovanni in *Religion and Rational Theology*, trans. and ed. Allen Wood and George di Giovanni. Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- TP “On the Common Saying: That May Be Right in Theory but It Is of No Use in Practice,” trans. Mary Gregor in *PP*.
- TPP *Toward Perpetual Peace*, trans. Mary Gregor in *PP*.
- UHC *Idea for a Universal History from a Cosmopolitan Point of View*, trans. Lewis White Beck in Lewis White Beck (ed.), *Kant on History*. New York: Macmillan, 1963.

Maimon

- ANP “Attempt at a New Presentation of the Principle of Morality and a Deduction of Its Reality,” trans. Timothy Sean Quinn. *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, 27:1 (2018): 155–82.
- MGW *Gesammelte Werke*, ed. Valerio Verra. Hildesheim: Georg Olms, 1965–76.
- ÜGN “Ueber die ersten Gründe des Naturrechts,” *Philosophisches Journal einer Gesellschaft Teutscher Gelehrter*, 1:2 (1795): 141–74.

Reimarus

- BE* *Betrachtungen*, trans. Almut Spalding, in Almut Spalding, *Elise Reimarus (1735–1805), the Muse of Hamburg: A Woman of the German Enlightenment*. Würzburg: Königshausen & Neumann, 2005.
- FR* *Freiheit*. Hamburg: Meyn, 1791.
- VN* *Versuch einer Läuterung und Vereinfachung der Begriffe vom natürlichen Staatsrecht*, trans. Almut Spalding, in Almut Spalding, *Elise Reimarus (1735–1805), the Muse of Hamburg: A Woman of the German Enlightenment*. Würzburg: Königshausen & Neumann, 2005.

Schiller

- AEM* *On the Aesthetic Education of Man in a Series of Letters*, bilingual edition, trans. and ed. Elizabeth Wilkinson and L. A. Willoughby. Oxford University Press, 1967.
- DGG* “Die Götter Griechenlands,” *Sämtliche Werke*, Bd. I, Munich: Hanser, 1962.
- LK* “Kallias or Concerning Beauty: Letters to Gottfried Körner,” in J. M. Bernstein (ed.), *Classic and Romantic German Aesthetics*. Cambridge University Press, 2003.

Schlegel

- ECR* “Essay on the Concept of Republicanism,” trans. Frederick C. Beiser in Frederick C. Beiser (ed.), *The Early Political Writings of the German Romantics*. Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- KFSA* *Kritische Ausgabe*, 35 vols., ed. Ernst Behler et al. Paderborn: Schöningh, 1958.
- LF* *Lucinde and the Fragments*, trans. Peter Firchow. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1971.
- OI* “On Incomprehensibility,” trans. Jochen Schulte-Sasse in Jochen Schulte-Sasse et al. (eds.), *Theory as Practice: A Critical Anthology of Early German Romantic Writings*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1997.
- PH* *Philosophical Fragments*, trans. Peter Firchow. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1991.

xiv List of Abbreviations

Others

- AJB* *Aus Jens Baggesen's Briefwechsel mit Karl Leonhard Reinhold*, Teil I. Leipzig: Brockhaus, 1831.
- BKP* Reinhold, Karl L. *Briefe über die Kantische Philosophie*, Bd. II. Basel: Schwabe, 2008.
- D* Bergk, Johann Adam. "Does Enlightenment Cause Revolutions?," in James Schmidt (ed.), *What Is Enlightenment?: Eighteenth-Century Answers and Twentieth-Century Questions*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996.
- EFN* Ulrich, J. A. H. *Eleutheriologie oder über Freiheit und Notwendigkeit*. Jena: Kröcker, 1788.
- GDA* Dalberg, C. Th. [K. von]. *Grundsätze der Ästhetik, deren Anwendung und künftige Entwicklung*. Erfurt, 1791.
- GM* Pistorius, Hermann Andreas. "Grundlegung zur Metaphysik der Sitten von Immanuel Kant," *Allgemeine deutsche Bibliothek*, 66:2 (1786): 447–63; reprinted in Gesang 2007: 26–38.
- KP* Pistorius, Hermann Andreas. "Kritik der praktischen Vernunft, von Immanuel Kant," *Allgemeine deutsche Bibliothek*, 117:1 (1794): 78–105; reprinted in Gesang 2007: 78–98.
- N* Gentz, Friedrich. "Nachtrag zu dem Raisonement des Herrn Professor Kant über das Verhältniß zwischen Theorie und Praxis," in Dieter Henrich (ed.), *Kant, Gentz, Rehberg: Über Theorie und Praxis*. Frankfurt: Suhrkamp, 1967.
- OSP* Anonymous Author. *The Oldest Systematic Program of German Idealism*, in Ernst Behler (ed.), *Philosophy of German Idealism*. New York: Continuum, 1987.
- TLS* Dalberg, K. von. "Von den wahren Grenzen der Wirksamkeit des Staats in Beziehung auf seine Mitglieder," two eds., 1793/1794, Sommer: Leipzig; reproduced in R. Leroux, *La théorie du despotisme éclairé chez Karl Theodor Dalberg*. Strasbourg University Press, 1932, 45–54.
- U* Bergk, Johann Adam. *Untersuchungen aus dem Natur-, Staats- und Völkerrechte. Mit einer Kritik der neuesten Konstitution der französischen Republik*. Kronberg: Scriptor Verlag, 1975.
- UFR* Rehberg, August Wilhelm. *Untersuchungen über die Französische Revolution*, Erster Teil. Hannover and Osnabrück: Christian Ritscher, 1793.

List of Abbreviations

xv

- ÜPF* Gentz, Friedrich, “Über Politische Freiheit und das Verhältnis derselben zur Regierung,” in Edmund Burke and Friedrich Gentz, *Über die französische Revolution: Betrachtungen und Abhandlungen*, ed. Herman Klenner. Berlin: Akademie, 1991.
- ÜTP* Rehberg, August Wilhelm. “Über das Verhältniß der Theorie zur Praxis,” in Dieter Henrich (ed.), *Kant, Gentz, Rehberg: Über Theorie und Praxis*. Frankfurt: Suhrkamp, 1967.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49772-5 — Practical Philosophy from Kant to Hegel
Edited by James A. Clarke , Gabriel Gottlieb
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
