

AT THE MARGINS OF GLOBALIZATION

Despite the tremendous progress in the development of scientific knowledge, the understanding of the causes of poverty and inequality, and the role of politics and governance in addressing modern challenges, issues such as social inclusion, poverty, marginalization and despair continue to be a reality across the world – and most often impact Indigenous Peoples. At the Margins of Globalization explores how Indigenous Peoples are affected by globalization, and the culture of individual choice without responsibility that it promotes, while addressing what can be done about it. Though international trade and investment agreements are unlikely to go away, the inclusion of Indigenous rights provisions has made a positive difference. This book explains how these provisions operate and how to build from their limited success.

SERGIO PUIG is Professor of Law and Director of the International Trade and Business Law Program at the University of Arizona. He specializes in free trade agreements, international investment law and dispute settlement, with a particular focus on the NAFTA (now USMCA), as well as economic rights of Indigenous Peoples. Before entering academia, he practiced international law and arbitration, and worked as a diplomat at the World Bank Group.



GLOBALIZATION AND HUMAN RIGHTS

The series provides unique and multi-disciplinary perspectives on the interface of the global economy and human rights. It offers space for exploring the challenges of globalization, the role of human rights in framing and shaping regulation and politics and, more critically, whether human rights are a mere product or legitimation of globalization.

Series Editors Malcolm Langford César Rodríguez-Garavito

Forthcoming Books in the Series

Jeremy Perelman, The Rights-ification of Development: Global Poverty, Human Rights, and Globalization in the Post-Washington Consensus



At the Margins of Globalization

INDIGENOUS PEOPLES AND INTERNATIONAL ECONOMIC LAW

SERGIO PUIG

University of Arizona





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108497640
DOI: 10.1017/9781108596503

© Sergio Puig 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-49764-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> To Sabrina Puig Robles To Negar, Diego and Daria



Contents

List of Tables	раде xi
Preface and Acknowledgments	xiii
Introduction	1
Globalization and Its Multiple Discontents	9
1.1 Globalization and Absolute Gains	12
1.2 Discontents Based on Relative Gains	13
1.2.1 The Populist Discontent	14
1.2.2 The Corporate Power Discontent	15
1.2.3 The Protectionist Discontent	16
1.2.4 The Geoeconomic Discontent	17
1.3 Discontents Based on Absolute Losses	19
1.3.1 The Sustainability Perspective	19
1.3.2 TWAIL and Other Perspectives	20
2 The Process of Susceptibility and Exclusion	23
2.1 Illegitimacy	26
2.2 Discrimination	28
2.3 Reregulation	31
2.4 Inequality	33
3 Indigenous Peoples under International Economic Law	36
3.1 General Protections under International Law	39
3.2 Specific Protections in Economic Regimes	44
3.2.1 Intellectual Property	44
3.2.2 Finance	58



VIII	Contents	
	3.2.3 Trade	67
	3.2.4 Investment	73
4	The Experience of Indigenous Peoples under	
4	Economic Regimes	82
	4.1 A Methodological Caveat	82
	4.2 Intellectual Property	84
	4.2.1 The Kuna People	84
	4.2.2 The San People	86
	4.3 Finance	88
	4.3.1 The Huave People	88
	4.3.2 The Maasai People	89
	4.4 Trade	93
	4.4.1 The Inuit People	93
	4.4.2 The Guarani-Kaiowá People	95
	4.5 Investment	98
	4.5.1 Two North American Tribes	98
	4.5.2 The Sawhoyamaxa People	100
5	The Recalibration of Indigenous Rights and Economic Law	104
	5.1 Normative and Jurisprudential Impacts	105
	5.1.1 A Shield for Indigenous Rights	106
	5.1.2 A Sword for Indigenous Rights	110
	5.2 Transformative Impacts	115
	5.2.1 New Standards, Metrics and Tools	116
	5.2.2 The Practice of International Economic Lawmaking	119
	5.2.3 Social and Development Policy	123
6	Indigenous Interests and the Future of Economic Treaties	126
	6.1 The Synthesis of Marginalization	127
	6.2 Legitimacy: Toward the Empowerment of	•
	the Marginalized	132
	6.2.1 The Safeguard Role of Consultations	133
	6.2.2 Minimum Procedural Standards to	
	Achieve Protection	133
	6.2.3 Self-Determination and Consent	134
	6.2.4 Shared Responsibilities	135
	6.3 Neutrality: Improving Indigenous-Tailored Design	135



	Contents	ix
	nilored Exceptions	135
6.3.2 Lo	ocking in Domestic Legal Reform	136
6.4 Democ	racy: Demo-Regulation for the Rise of Equality	137
6.5 Equalit	y: Shared Benefits and Beyond	138
7 Toward an	Indigenous-Based Critique of Globalization	141
7.1 Beyond	the Cycle of Susceptibility and Exclusion	142
7.2 Indigen	ous Peoples as Core Participants of Globalization	145
Conclusion		148
Index		149



Tables

2.1	The susceptibility and exclusion framework	page 25
3.1	Institutionalization of indigeous interests under	
	economic regimes	81



Preface and Acknowledgments

Scholarship on the links between business and human rights is widespread. However, the specific ways in which globalization accommodates the economically marginalized and those who are likely most vulnerable to its negative effects has received scant attention. The increasingly obvious manifestations of discontent over the effects of globalization – from Brexit to the election of President Trump – combined with the evidence that confirms the very uneven distribution of its benefits, indicate that this is an important scholarly gap.

This book explores the extent to which the main fields of international law that are tasked with promoting economic interdependence – international finance, investment, trade and intellectual property – address the rights and interests of Indigenous peoples, an expressly protected category of marginalized and/or vulnerable people under international law. Relying on recent legal practice and eight case studies, the book compares these fields and explains the different ways Indigenous peoples' interests are accommodated by international economic law. More broadly, the intersection between international economic law and indigenous rights provides important lessons for current demands to address the negative effects of globalization.

The book is the result of the author's experiences and perspectives working with different institutions including the World Bank Group as well as with the Committee for Mexico's Legal and Constitutional Reform Regarding Indigenous and Afromexican Peoples' Rights. I would like to thank S. James Anaya, Derek Bambauer, Tomer Broude, James Cavallaro, Anupam Chander, Andrew Coan, Seth Davis, David A. Gantz, Negar Katirai, Malcolm Langford, Cesar Rodriguez-Garavito, Lise Johnson, Jason Kreag, Robert A. Hershey, Moshe Hirsch, James Hopkins, Toni Massaro, David Marcus, Lauge Poulsen, Christopher T. Robertson, Rebecca Tsosie, Gregory Shaffer, Melissa L. Tatum, Steven R. Ratner, Adelfo Regino, Rebecca Tsosie, Robert



xiv

Preface and Acknowledgments

Williams, Mark Wu and the participants of workshops at the University of California, Irvine, University of Arizona, University of Colorado, University College London and the Hebrew University, for their helpful criticisms, advice, inspiration and/or suggestions for the book. Alancay Morales, Andrew J. Shepherd, Maxmilien Bradley and Benedict M. Nchalla, provided excellent research and editorial assistance. The book was made possible in part thanks to grants from the Lannan Foundation and the Arizona Summer Research Grant.

Cover image: Guarijio (Makurawe) Dancers in San Bernado, Álamos, Sonora, Mexico by Marsel Paulina Bermúdez Gaona, INPI.