This book offers an in-depth account of the failure of popular constitution making in Turkey from 2011 to 2013. The aim to include different segments of society and political parties in constitution making makes this process an anomaly in the otherwise authoritarian history of Turkish constitutional politics. In the end, however, long-standing societal divides regarding political, cultural and religious diversity that were amplified in the negotiations led to the failure of the process. Most notably, the ruling AKP’s insistence on establishing a presidential system – supported by neither the other three political parties nor the public – destabilized the process and exacerbated distrust among the drafters. In addition, unfavorable procedures prevented consensus and allowed the AKP to hijack the process. The failure of popular constitution making in 2013 was a missed opportunity for democratization before Turkey plunged into full-fledged democratic backsliding.

Felix Petersen is the Minerva Post-Doctoral Fellow at the Richard Koebner Center for German History at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. His research interests include modern political thought, constitutional politics, theory of democracy, and German and Turkish politics. He is a co-author of the forthcoming book The Constitutional Court of Turkey: Judicial Politics between Authoritarianism and Democracy.

Zeynep Yanasınmayan is senior research fellow and coordinator of the Max Planck Society-funded research initiative “The Challenges of Migration, Integration and Exclusion” at the Department of Law and Anthropology, Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology. Her research interests include migration and citizenship studies, governance of religious diversity, law and society and Turkish politics. She is the author of The Migration of Highly Educated Turkish Citizens to Europe: From Guestworkers to Global Talent (2019), and co-editor of Belief, Law and Politics: What Future for Secular Europe? (2014).
Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

Books in the Series

The Failure of Popular Constitution Making in Turkey: Regressing Towards Constitutional Autocracy
Edited by Felix Petersen and Zeynep Yanan

A Qualified Hope: The Indian Supreme Court and Progressive Social Change
Edited by Gerald N. Rosenberg, Sudhir Krishnaswamy, and Shishir Bail

Constitutions in Times of Financial Crisis
Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Mark D. Rosen, and Georg Vanberg

Reconstructing Rights: Courts, Parties, and Equality Rights in India, South Africa, and the United States
Stephan Stohler

Constitution Making and Transnational Legal Order
Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Terence C. Halliday, and Gregory Shaffer

Hybrid Constitutionalism
Eric C. Ip

The Politico-Legal Dynamics of Judicial Review
Thenuis Roux

The Invisible Constitution in Comparative Perspective
Edited by Rosalind Dixon and Adrienne Stone

Constitutional Courts in Asia: A Comparative Perspective
Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen and Andrew Harding

Judicial Review in Norway
Anine Kierulf

Constituent Assemblies
Edited by Jon Elster, Roberto Gargarella, Vatsal Naresh, and Bjorn Erik Rasch

The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America: Politics, Governance, and Judicial Design
Daniel M. Brinks and Abby Blass

The Adventures of the Constituent Power: Beyond Revolutions?
Andrew Arato
Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49762-6 — The Failure of Popular Constitution Making in Turkey
Edited by Felix Petersen, Zeynep Yanas

Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia and Sri Lanka
Dian A. H. Shah

Canada in the World: Comparative Perspectives on the Canadian Constitution
Edited by Richard Albert and David R. Cameron

Courts and Democracies in Asia
Po Jen Yap

Proportionality: New Frontiers, New Challenges
Edited by Vicki C. Jackson and Mark Tushnet

Constituents before Assembly: Participation, Deliberation, and Representation in the Crafting of New Constitutions
Todd A. Eisenstadt, A. Carl LeVan, and Tofigh Maboudi

Assessing Constitutional Performance
Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Huq

Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law: The Pyrrhic Constitutionalism of Sri Lanka
Benjamin Schonthal

Engaging with Social Rights: Procedure, Participation and Democracy in South Africa's Second Wave
Brian Ray

Constitutional Courts as Mediators: Armed Conflict, Civil-Military Relations, and the Rule of Law in Latin America
Julio Ríos-Figueroa

Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies
David Kosář

Making We the People: Democratic Constitutional Founding in Postwar Japan and South Korea
Chaihark Hahm and Sung Ho Kim

Radical Deprivation on Trial: The Impact of Judicial Activism on Socioeconomic Rights in the Global South
César Rodríguez-Garavito and Diana Rodríguez-Franco

Unstable Constitutionalism: Law and Politics in South Asia
Edited by Mark Tushnet and Madhav Khosla

Magna Carta and Its Modern Legacy
Edited by Robert Hazell and James Melton

Constitutions and Religious Freedom
Frank B. Cross

International Courts and the Performance of International Agreements: A General Theory with Evidence from the European Union
Clifford J. Carrubba and Matthew J. Gabel

Reputation and Judicial Tactics: A Theory of National and International Courts
Shai Dothan

Social Difference and Constitutionalism in Pan-Asia
Edited by Susan H. Williams

Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century
Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen
The Failure of Popular Constitution Making in Turkey

REGRESSING TOWARD CONSTITUTIONAL AUTOCRACY

Edited by

FELIX PETERSEN
Hebrew University of Jerusalem

ZEYNEP YANAS¸MAYAN
Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Figures</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of Contributors</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PART I INTRODUCTION**

1. Introduction

   *Felix Petersen and Zeynep Yanas*mayan*

2. Explaining the Failure of Popular Constitution Making in Turkey (2011–2013)

   *Felix Petersen and Zeynep Yanas*mayan*

**PART II CONTEXTUALIZING CONSTITUTION MAKING IN TURKEY**

3. The People and Its Embodiment: Authoritarian Foundations of Constitutions in Turkey

   *Ertuğ Tombuş*

4. Regime Cycles, Constitution Making, and the Political System Question in Ottoman and Turkish Constitutional Developments

   *Şule Özsoy Boyunsuz*

5. Illiberal Media and Popular Constitution Making in Turkey

   *Burcu Baykurt*

**PART III DEBATING AND DRAFTING THE CONSTITUTION IN 2011–2013**

© in this web service Cambridge University Press  
www.cambridge.org
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Debating State Organization Principles in the Constitutional Conciliation Commission</td>
<td>Gözde Boçü and Felix Petersen</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Countermajoritarian Institutions in Turkish Constitution Making</td>
<td>Maria Abad Andrade</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Debating the Amendment-Making Rule: The Rigidity vs. Flexibility Debate in the Turkish Constitution-Making Process</td>
<td>Oya Yegen</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td></td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Index</td>
<td></td>
<td>404</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figures

1.1 The spectrum of popular constitution making page 32
7.1 Party positions on the High Council of Judges and Prosecutors 237
7.2 Results of the deliberations on the High Council of Judges and Prosecutors 240
7.3 Party positions on the Turkish Constitutional Court 242
8.1 Historical evolution of constitutional amendment-making procedure in Turkey 261
8.2 Party proposals on the amendment-making procedure 270
8.3 AUK draft amendment-making rule (Art. 146) 275
Appendix 1.1 AUK members and legal consultants 283
Contributors

MARIA ABAD ANDRADE is a researcher in the Department of Social Sciences at Humboldt University of Berlin.
BÜRÇU BAYKURT is an assistant professor of urban futures and communication at the University of Massachusetts Amherst.
GÖZDE BÜÇÜ is a doctoral candidate in the Political Science Department at the University of Toronto.
ŞULE ÖZSOY BOYUNSUZ is an associate professor in the Faculty of Law at Galatasaray University.
FELIX PETERSEN is a research fellow in the Richard Koebner Center for German History at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem.
ERTUĞ TOMBUŞ is a research associate in the Department of Social Sciences at Humboldt University of Berlin.
ZEYNEP YANAŞMAYAN is a senior research fellow in the Department of Law and Anthropology at the Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology in Halle, Germany.
OYA YEGEN is an assistant professor of Political Science in the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences at Sabancı University.