

DELUSIONAL STATES

ജ

Delusional States is the first in-depth study of state-making and social change in Gilgit-Baltistan, a Shia-majority region of Sunni-dominated Pakistan and a contested border area that forms part of disputed Kashmir. For over seven decades, the territorial conflict over Kashmir has locked India and Pakistan in brutal wars and hate-centred nationalisms. The book illuminates how within this story of hate lie other stories—of love and betrayal, loyalty and suspicion, beauty and terror—that help us grasp how the Kashmir conflict is affectively structured and experienced on the ground. Placing these emotions at the centre of its analysis, the book rethinks the state–citizen relation in deeply felt and intimate terms, offering a multi-layered ethnographic understanding of power and subjection in contemporary Pakistan.

It argues that Gilgit-Baltistan's image within Pakistan as an idyllic paradise elides how the region is governed as a suspect security zone, and dispossessed through multiple processes of state-making including representation, militarization, sectarianized education, and biodiversity conservation. The book charts this rule of state and empire as delusion, demonstrating how the region's inhabitants nevertheless struggle to promote a progressive vision of ethics and politics. From political activists and preachers to poets and pastoralists, citizen-subjects in the region are demanding inclusion not only in terms of political rights—an aspect that over-determines the discourse on Kashmir—but also through struggles for religious recognition and ecological sovereignty which they feel is integral to a meaningful life of dignity.

A powerful contribution to studies of citizenship, development, and Muslim sociality in South Asia, the book additionally offers distinct theoretical insights in the fields of social movements, education, cultural studies, and political ecology.

Nosheen Ali teaches at the Institute for Educational Development, The Aga Khan University, Pakistan. She is the founder of *UmangPoetry*, a digital humanities archive for documenting contemporary poetic knowledges in South Asia, and *Karti Dharti*, an alternative learning space for ecological inquiry.



DELUSIONAL STATES

8003

FEELING RULE AND DEVELOPMENT IN PAKISTAN'S NORTHERN FRONTIER

NOSHEEN ALI





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, vic 3207, Australia
314 to 321, 3rd Floor, Plot No.3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org /9781108497442

© Nosheen Ali 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in India

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-108-49744-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

ജ

Lis	t of Maps and Figures	VII
Ac	knowledgements	IX
List of Abbreviations		XI
Int	roduction	1
РΑ	RT I: Representation and Repression	
1.	Unimagined Communities in the Eco-body of the Nation	31
2.	Loyalty, Suspicion, Sacrifice: Feeling and Force under Militarism	77
РА	RT II: Education and the Politics of Faith	
3.	Challenging School Textbooks:	
	The Sectarian Making of National Islam	113
4.	Sectarian Imaginaries and Poetic Publics	153
РА	RT III: Saving Nature, Saving People	
5.	The Nature of Development: Neoliberal Environments and Pastoral Visions	195
6.	Books vs. Bombs? Humanitarian Education, Empire, and the Narrative of Terror	231
Conclusion: The Great Media Game		257
Bibliography		265
Index		297



Maps

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-49744-2 — Delusional States Nosheen Ali Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

MAPS AND FIGURES

8003

-			
1.1	The city of Gilgit and the village of Shimshal, in relation to Gilgit-Baltistan	22	
1.1	Section from 'Pakistan: Showing Administrative Districts'	51	
1.2	'Pakistan: Showing Administrative Division'	52	
1.3	Section of 'Pakistan: Political Divisions'	55	
1.4	Map of Pakistan used in the book Pakistan	56	
Figures			
3.1	Page from Meri Kitab (My Book), Class 1	128	
3.2	Page from Art and Drawing, Class 7	129	
4.1	Dancers and musicians perform before the polo match at the Silk Route Festival, Gilgit, 2006	165	
4.2	Poetry festival held at the Karakoram International University, Gilgit, 2006	188	
5.1	A village settlement in central Shimshal	205	



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

8003

To acknowledge is a political act, and a particularly consequential one when one is researching a heavily surveilled, border territory.

How do I acknowledge anyone when I cannot freely name the allies from Gilgit-Baltistan who made this research possible? Anonymously, hence, to my wonderful friends, hosts, and colleagues in Gilgit-Baltistan, I offer my eternal gratitude. Thank you for your immense generosity, your warm support and knowledge-sharing, for looking out for me and after me, for showing me how to be. I kept the promise.

This book is dedicated to my parents, who despite gendered social worries, always supported me in my rebellious, out-of-the-way journeys. The research and writing for the book has been supported by the Charlotte W. Newcombe Doctoral Dissertation Fellowship, the Mellon/ACLS Early Career Fellowship, and the Cornell University Graduate Fellowship in Peace Studies.



ABBREVIATIONS

8003

ADP Annual Development Programme

AJK Azad Jammu and Kashmir

AK Azad Kashmir

AKDN Aga Khan Development Network BNF Balawaristan National Front

CAFOs Concentrated Animal Feedlot Operations

CBNRM Community-Based Natural Resource Management

CCHA Community Controlled Hunting Area

CIA Central Intelligence Agency

CPEC China-Pakistan Economic Corridor

DC District Commissioner
DFO District Forest Officer
DMT District Monitoring Team

FANA Federally Administered Northern Areas
FATA Federally Administered Tribal Areas

FC Frontier Constabulary

FCNA Force Command Northern Areas FCR Frontier Crimes Regulation

FMCC Field Monitoring Coordination Cell

FWO Frontier Works Organisation

GBDA Gilgit Baltistan Democratic Alliance
GBLA Gilgit-Baltistan Legislative Assembly
GBNA Gilgit-Baltistan National Alliance

GECA Gojal Educational and Cultural Association

GEF Global Environment Facility
GIS Geographic Information System



XII NO DELUSIONAL STATES

ID Identification

IMF International Monetary Fund ISI Inter-Services Intelligence

IUCN International Union for Conservation of Nature

JI Jamaat-e-Islami JUI Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam

KANA Kashmir Affairs and Northern Areas

KKH Karakoram Highway

KIU Karakoram International University
KNM Karakoram National Movement
KNP Khunjerab National Park

LoC Line of Control

MNAs Members of the National Assembly MoU Memorandum of Understanding

NA Northern Areas

NALA Northern Areas Legislative Assembly NALC Northern Areas Legislative Council

NCCW National Council for Conservation of Wildlife

NGO Non-Governmental Organization

NLI Northern Light Infantry NWFP North-West Frontier Province

NAPWD Northern Areas Public Works Department

PIA Pakistan International Airlines PMA Pakistan Military Academy PML (N) Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz)

PPP Pakistan People's Party

PRT Provincial Reconstruction Team

PTV Pakistan Television SCI Safari Club International

SCO Special Communication Organization

SNT Shimshal Nature Trust SSP Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan TCT Three Cups of Tea

TJP Tehrik-e-Jafaria Pakistan

UN United Nations

UNCIP United Nations Commission for India and Pakistan

UNDP United Nations Development Programme



ABBREVIATIONS OF XIII

UNEP United Nations Environment Programme

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

US United States

USAID United States Agency for International Development

VC Vice Chancellor

WCNPPA World Congress on National Parks and Protected Areas

WWF World Wide Fund for Nature