Abu Ma’ali al-Juwayni (d. 478/1085) lived in a politically tumultuous period. The rise of powerful dynastic families forced the Abbasid Caliph into a position of titular power and created instability. He also witnessed intellectual upheavals living amid great theological and legal diversity. Collectively, these experiences led him to consider questions of religious certainty and social and political continuity. He questioned that if political elites are constantly changing, paralleled with shifting intellectual allegiances, what ensures the continuity of religion? He concluded that continuity of society is contingent on knowledge and practice of the Shari’a. Here, Sohaira Z. M. Siddiqui explores how scholars grappled with questions of human reason and knowledge, and how their answers to these questions often led them to challenge dominant ideas of what the Shari’a is. By doing this, she highlights the interconnections between al-Juwayni’s discussions on theology, law, and politics and the sociopolitical intellectual landscapes that forged them.

Sohaira Z. M. Siddiqui is an assistant professor at Georgetown University Qatar. She has published articles in the Journal of Islamic Studies, Islamic Law and Society, the Journal of the American Oriental Society, and Middle East Law and Governance. She is also the editor of a forthcoming volume entitled Locating the Shari’a: Legal Fluidity in Theory, History and Practice. She has held fellowships at the University of Cambridge and Harvard Law School and is a series editor for Sapientia Islamica.
Cambridge Studies in Islamic Civilization

Editorial Board
Chase F. Robinson, The Graduate Center, The City University of New York
(general editor)
Michael Cook, Princeton University
Maribel Fierro, Spanish National Research Council
Alan Mikhail, Yale University
David O. Morgan, Professor Emeritus, University of Wisconsin-Madison
Intisar Rabb, Harvard University
Muhammad Qasim Zaman, Princeton University

Other titles in the series are listed at the back of the book.
Law and Politics under the Abbasids

An Intellectual Portrait of al-Juwayni

SOHAIRA Z. M. SIDDIQUI

Georgetown University Qatar
To
All those who are certain of their doubt,
And doubtful of their certainty.
# Contents

_Acknowledgments_ \hspace{1cm} page xi

**Introduction**  \hspace{1cm} 1
- A Brief Glimpse into Nishapur  \hspace{1cm} 5
- Al-Juwaynī: Between Certainty and Continuity  \hspace{1cm} 9
- Al-Juwaynī and Themes in Islamic Studies  \hspace{1cm} 11
- Beyond Themes  \hspace{1cm} 24
- The Scope of the Book  \hspace{1cm} 26

**Part I Historical Background**  \hspace{1cm} 33

1 Politics, Patronage, and Scholarship in Nishapur  \hspace{1cm} 35
- Al-Juwaynī’s Time and His Scholarship  \hspace{1cm} 36
- Nishapur: A City Divided  \hspace{1cm} 39
- The *Fitna* in Nishapur: Who Was to Blame?  \hspace{1cm} 48
- Conclusion  \hspace{1cm} 51

2 Al-Juwaynī: Life of a Scholar  \hspace{1cm} 53
- Al-Juwaynī: Early Life and Education  \hspace{1cm} 53
- Leaving Nishapur and Life in the Hejaz  \hspace{1cm} 57
- Al-Juwaynī’s Return to Nishapur  \hspace{1cm} 60
- Teaching at the Nizāmīyya  \hspace{1cm} 65
- Death  \hspace{1cm} 75
- Conclusion  \hspace{1cm} 76
PART II EPISTEMOLOGY

3 Intellectual Fissures: The Ashʿarīs and the Muʿtazila
The Muʿtazilī School in Nishapur
Muʿtazilī Epistemology and Its Legal Consequences
Ashʿarī Epistemology and Its Legal Consequences
Conclusion

4 The Epistemology of al-Juwaynī
Al-Juwaynī’s Epistemology in the Irshād and the Shāmil
Al-Juwaynī’s Epistemology in the Burbān
Implications of al-Juwaynī’s Epistemology for Law
Epistemology beyond the Self
Conclusion

PART III LEGAL THEORY

5 Certainty in Legal Sources: Ḥadīth
Legal Thought at the Time of al-Juwaynī
Al-Juwaynī and Reports (Akhbār)
Responding to His Predecessors and Establishing His Own Criteria
The Reception of al-Juwaynī’s Arguments on Reports
Al-Juwaynī on Unitary Reports (Akhbār Āḥād)
Conclusion

6 Certainty in Legal Sources: Ijmāʿ
The Roots of Ijmāʿ
Early Defenses of Ijmāʿ
A Note on Custom
Al-Juwaynī on Ijmāʿ
The Reception of al-Juwaynī’s Notion of Ijmāʿ
Two Cases of Custom: Mutawāṭir Ḥadīth and Ijmāʿ
Conclusion

7 The Rise of Legal Uncertainty: Qiyās al-Maʿnā
Qiyāṣ and the ʿILLA: Preliminary Investigations
Qiyāṣ: Definition and Defense
Types of Qiyāṣ and Extracting the ʿILLA and Maʿnā
Conclusion
Contents

8 Coping with Legal Uncertainty: *Qiyāṣ al-Shabah* 209

*Qiyāṣ al-Shabah*: A Debated Source 209
*Qiyāṣ al-Shabah* According to al-Juwaynī 213
*Maṣlaḥa* in *Qiyāṣ* 216
The Hierarchy within *Qiyāṣ* 223
Regulating Variance: The Role of the *Mujtahid* 227
Conclusion 231

PART IV POLITICAL THOUGHT 233

9 The Search for Continuity: Al-Juwaynī’s Political Thought 235

Islamic Political Thought: An Overview 236
The Necessity of the Imamate: Its Justification and Purpose 243
The Selection of the Imam 244
The Qualifications of the Imam 247
The Purpose of the Imamate 250
Envisioning the Absence of the Imam 252
Conclusion 254

10 Continuity, Custom, and Applied Epistemology in al-Juwaynī’s Political Thought 256

Living without Rulers: The Rise of the ‘*Ulamā’* 257
The Loss of All ‘*Ulamā’* 262
The Continuity of Legal Guidance 264
The Loss of the *Sharīʿa* 270
The *Sharīʿa* and Custom as Governance 273
Conclusion 282

Conclusion 284

Expanding Methodological Approaches within the Academic Study of Islam 286
Concluding Remarks 288

*Bibliography* 291
*Index* 307
Acknowledgments

The requisites of knowledge: a quick mind, zeal, poverty, foreign land, a teacher’s inspiration, and of life a long span.

After many iterations of these pages I realized that striving for perfectly complete acknowledgments is akin to chasing a receding horizon. A project that has been in gestation for the past ten years is inevitably inspired, informed, and assisted by more individuals than can be adequately acknowledged in a few pages. What follows is a mere attempt at recognizing the confluence of forces, individuals, and prayers that facilitated the completion of this project.

I must begin by thanking God, who created human beings with reason. Curiosity, ingenuity, invention, and knowledge are but outworkings of this basic faculty of reason. Though scholars have long debated its limits and form, none has contested its existence.

This project started off as a simple question on human reason and legal knowledge that I posed to my PhD supervisor and mentor, Ahmad Atif Ahmad. Instead of giving me a direct answer, he asked me whether I had read al-Juwaynī’s discussion on the matter. My answer in the negative brought on his suggestion to do so. Dr. Ahmad’s refusal to provide me with immediate satisfaction resulted in this project, and his unparalleled dedication and mentorship has left an indelible mark on this work and on my entire approach to the discipline of Islamic law. He graciously sat with me for countless hours reading classical treatises in ḥal al-fiqh, guiding me toward nuanced arguments not immediately intelligible to an apprentice’s eye. His intellectual curiosity, uncanny ability to recall texts with
xii Acknowledgments

great accuracy, and emphasis on the interconnectivity of seemingly dis-
tinct inquiries and disciplines has continued to inspire me. This project
would have been simply impossible without him. I thank him most for
reaching me the value of not giving simple answers to complex questions.

I was also fortunate to have the direct academic guidance of Juan Campo,
who pushed me to investigate the implications of al-Juwaynī’s scholarship
both during his time and beyond to ours. Racha El Omari also served as an
invaluable advisor and inspiration with her keen insight into the develop-
ment of early Islamic thought. Her attention to detail encouraged me to trace
the intellectual debates in usūl al-fiqh to their earliest articulations, which are
often found in books of kalām. Going back further, I am indebted to
Jonathan Brown and Clark Lombardi for introducing me to the intellectual
playground of usūl al-fiqh and the implications of classical Islamic legal
thought in the modern world. The first primary text I read in Islamic legal
theory was with Jonathan, and it was al-Juwaynī’s Waraqāt fi usūl al-fiqh.
Neither he nor I had any premonition at the time that al-Juwaynī would
become such a long-standing intellectual companion.

In the formulation of this project I benefited greatly from the institutional
support of the Asian and Middle Eastern Studies Faculty at Cambridge
University, the Islamic Legal Studies Program at Harvard Law School, the
University of Tübingen, and, most of all, Georgetown University in Qatar.
The support I found in Qatar for the past few years has been especially
important. In particular I would like to thank Rory and Michelle Miller,
Mahveen Azam, Mateen Quraishi, Sophie Khan, and Billal Riaz – their
unending words of encouragement, friendship, and ceaselessly open table
spreads saw this project through to its completion. Conversations with
mentors, colleagues, and friends who took the time to engage with this
project have also been invaluable, and for this I would like to thank Asma
Afsaruddin, Asifa Quraishi-Landes, Ovamir Anjum, Anver Emon, Lejla
Demiri, Dale Correa, Samy Ayoub, Sohail Hanif, Heba Sewliman, Rosabel
Martin-Ross, Munther al-Sabbagh, Samaneh Oladi, Nathan French, Ahmet
Temel, Elliott Bazzano, Rico Monge, Martin Becker, and Dusty Hoesly.
Special gratitude is due to my closest confidants who, beyond encouraging
my academic development, were pillars of emotional and spiritual support.
They taught me that few things cannot be resolved through long walks,
thoughtful conversation, and true companionship – to Amina Nawaz,
 Arsalan Ghani, Nabila Winter, and Layla El-Wafi, I am truly indebted.

It is standard in academia to recognize one’s students, as they are usually
the most consistent interlocutors for one’s ideas and writings. Though this
is certainly the case with my students, their role goes beyond that: they
pushed me to personalize this project and my study of Islamic law in a way I had previously neglected. Perhaps most important, they made me realize that the community I speak of within this book is in fact the community both they and I inhabit – a community with a continually evolving set of challenges and circumstances that must be addressed in a way that is both methodologically robust and religiously honest. For their curiosity, questions, and insight, I specifically thank Nada Abdelhay, Salman Ahad, Sherif el Gindi, Hisham Hassan, Aya Makki, and Abdurrehman Naveed.

My parents deserve the most gratitude, for contrary to their better judgment and cultural mores, they simply set me free to explore. Everything they taught me before that moment informed everything that happened after it. My sister and brother have been my most cherished friends throughout this entire project. My sister, Fareeha Siddiqui, deserves particular mention, as the burden of sacrificing her own dreams early in her life led her to fearlessly defend mine. At all the pivotal crossroads in life, she was my most important signpost. My brother and oldest companion, Waqas Siddiqui, is the archetypal elder brother – never have I encountered a brother with such generosity, an entrepreneur with such humility, or a man with so many bow ties. Our conversations have always been a source of insight, and his dedication to his vocation has served as an inspiration. But what I thank them for most are my nieces, Maysoun and Maysaan, born during the final stages of this project. Together they perfected the art of distraction with smiles and syllable-based talk, providing a constant source of joy and welcome distraction. I enjoyed writing the most when they were cradled in my arms or bouncing on my knees.

When the ebbs and flows of this project, and academia more broadly, could have easily derailed me, I always found myself guided and grounded by my husband, Rizwan Rahman. He has been my most consistent interlocutor, my most cherished confidant, my most sympathetic critic, and my most beloved companion. This project has been enriched by his ceaseless support, and my life by his love.

Finally, I would like to thank al-Juwaynī for his thoughts, his students for transmitting them, scribes for writing them, and the generations of scholars who kept his ideas alive by teaching them. I am continuously humbled and amazed by the breath and ingenuity of Islamic thought. It is my sincere prayer that this book provides accurate reflection of a man in whose shadow I have stood for many years. Inasmuch as I can call this project my own, it is the product of the support I received and the erudition of centuries of scholars before me, and that has made all the difference.