Many Western countries have seen an increase in the volume and importance of external consultants in the public policy process. This book is the first to investigate this phenomenon in a comparative and interdisciplinary way. The analysis shows who these consultants are, and how widely and for what reasons they are used in Britain, the United States, Canada, Australia, the Netherlands and Sweden. In doing so, the book addresses the positive and negative implications of high levels of external policy consultancy, including its implications for the nature of the state (transforming into a contractor state?) and for democratically legitimized and accountable decision-making (transforming into consultocracy?) It provides valuable new insights for students and practitioners in the fields of public administration, public policy, public management, political science and human resource management.

Caspar van den Berg is Professor of Governance at the University of Groningen. His work has appeared in journals including Governance, Public Administration and JPART. He received the prestigious Van Poelje Prize for best dissertation in the administrative and policy sciences in the Netherlands and Flanders. He was a visiting fellow at Princeton University (2013–2014). He received a prominent four-year Veni scholarship from the Dutch Science Organization (2015).

Michael Howlett is Burnaby Mountain Professor and Canada Research Chair in the Department of Political Science at Simon Fraser University, Canada. He specializes in public policy studies, with an emphasis on natural resource and environmental policy-making. He is currently editor of Policy Sciences, Policy Design and Practice, Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis, Policy & Society and the Annual Review of Policy Design.
ANDREA MIGONE is Director of Research and Outreach at the Institute of Public Administration of Canada. He specializes in public policy and public administration. His academic career includes work on decision-making, globalization, innovation policy, procurement and governance. He was a post-doctoral research fellow at Simon Fraser University.

MICHAEL HOWARD is a Conjoint Lecturer at the University of Newcastle, Australia. His career has spanned teaching and research in public policy in both academic and advocacy settings, along with policy development and service delivery within innovative government programmes. His publications have centred on historical aspects of policy-making and contemporary commercialization trends in the public sector, with a focus on consultants.

FRIDA PEMER is Assistant Professor at the Stockholm School of Economics. Her research centres on how organizations use professional services, and on digitalization in professional service firms. She has published her work in highly ranked journals such as JPART, Governance, Human Relations, Industrial Marketing Management and Journal of Business Research.

HELEN M. GUNTER is Professor of Education Policy at the University of Manchester. She is a Fellow of the UK Academy of Social Sciences, and recipient of the BELMAS Distinguished Service Award 2016. She published Consultants and Consultancy: The Case of Education (2017; co-authored with Colin Mills) and her most recent book is The Politics of Public Education (2018).
Cambridge Studies in Comparative Public Policy

The Cambridge Studies in Comparative Public Policy series was established to promote and disseminate comparative research in public policy. The objective of the series is to advance the understanding of public policies through the publication of the results of comparative research into the nature, dynamics and contexts of major policy challenges and responses to them. Works in the series will draw critical insights that enhance policy learning and are generalizable beyond specific policy contexts, sectors and time periods. Such works will also compare the development and application of public policy theory across institutional and cultural settings and examine how policy ideas, institutions and practices shape policies and their outcomes. Manuscripts comparing public policies in two or more cases as well as theoretically informed critical case studies which test more general theories are encouraged. Studies comparing policy development over time are also welcomed.

General Editors M. Ramesh, National University of Singapore; Xun Wu, Hong Kong University of Science and Technology; Michael Howlett, Simon Fraser University, British Columbia and National University of Singapore

In Defense of Pluralism: Policy Disagreement and its Media Coverage By Éric Montpetit
Asia after the Developmental State: Disembedding Autonomy Edited by Toby Carroll and Darryl S. L. Jarvis
The Politics of Shale Gas in Eastern Europe: Energy Security, Contested Technologies and the Social Licence to Frack By Andreas Goldthau
Healthy or Sick? Coevolution of Health Care and Public Health in a Comparative Perspective 2018 By Philipp Trein
Policy Accumulation and the Democratic Responsiveness Trap By Christian Adam, Steffen Hurka, Christoph Knill and Yves Steinebach
Hyper-Active Governance: How Governments Manage the Politics of Expertise By Matthew Wood
Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective: Patterns, Nuances and Implications of the Contractor State By Caspar van den Berg, Michael Howlett, Andrea Migone, Michael Howard, Frida Pemer and Helen M. Gunter
Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective

Patterns, Nuances and Implications of the Contractor State

CASPAR VAN DEN BERG
University of Groningen

MICHAEL HOWLETT
Simon Fraser University

ANDREA MIGONE
Institute of Public Administration of Canada

MICHAEL HOWARD
University of Newcastle, Australia

FRIDA PEMER
Stockholm School of Economics

HELEN M. GUNTER
University of Manchester
Contents

List of Figures ................. page viii
List of Tables ................ x
Author Biographies ............ xiii
Acknowledgements ............... xv
List of Abbreviations .......... xvi

1 Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective ........ 1
2 Consultancy in the UK Government: Modernizing Privatism .... 20
3 Policy Consulting in the USA: Significant but in Decline? ... 52
5 From Corporatist to Contractor State? Policy Consulting in the Netherlands .......... 131
7 Swedish Government Agencies’ Hiring of Policy Consultants: A Phenomenon of Increased Magnitude and Importance? ........ 177
8 Conclusion: Policy Consulting in Comparative Perspective .......... 221

Appendix A ....................... 241
Appendix B ....................... 244
Appendix C ....................... 248
Appendix D ....................... 250
Appendix E ....................... 255
Appendix F ....................... 256
References ....................... 266
Index .......................... 300

© in this web service Cambridge University Press
www.cambridge.org
## Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Department expenditures over time 2010–2015</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Departments key contract codes distribution</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Departments key contract codes yearly distribution</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>DoD service contracts 2012–2015</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>DoD key contract codes distribution</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>DoD yearly distribution</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Key contract codes distribution 2011–2015, FAIR Act agencies</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>Service contract spending over time, FAIR Act agencies</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Commonwealth department expenditure on consultants, 1983–2017 (AUD$ million)</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Commonwealth department and statutory authority expenditure on contracts for goods and services, 1995–2017 (AUD$ billion)</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Share of externally hired personnel’s working time spent on government assignments</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>The distribution of activities as carried out in the various ministries 2007–2016</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Volume of externally hired staff per year in absolute figures (×1000 Euro), split for activity categories</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Volumes of policy consulting per ministry</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>All GSIN categories: value of contracts awarded millions of dollars</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Overview of the studied government agencies’ total spending on management consulting services between 2003 and 2011</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Overview of the percentage of the studied government agencies’ total spending on management consulting services in the time period 2003–2011</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

7.3 Overview of the trend in total spending on management consultants from 2003 to 2011 in the nine government agencies spending more than SEK 100,000,000 191
7.4 Overview of the studied government agencies’ total spending on PR/communication consulting services from 2003 to 2011 202
7.5 Overview of the percentage of the studied government agencies’ total spending on PR/communication consulting services in different ranges, between 2003 and 2011 203
7.6 Overview of the trend in total spending on PR/communication consultants 2003–2011 in the seven government agencies spending more than SEK 10,000,000 204
Tables

1.1 The four communities of policy advisers  page 7
1.2 Three types of consultancy  8
2.1 Government's use of consultants  31
2.2 Types of consultancy spend by departments, 2014  34
2.3 Total MoD expenditure on consultancy  35
2.4 MoD consultancy contracts awarded since May 2010  36
2.5 Thameslink rolling stock project  42
2.6 The Thameslink Programme  42
3.1 List of FPDS codes for policy consulting  64
3.2 Example for the data columns of the service inventory from the Department of Commerce (DoC)  67
3.3 Analysis of two CFO act contracts according to description of requirements  69
3.4 Analysis of 2 FAIR act agency contracts according to description of requirements  73
3.5 Five major policy-related service contract agencies 2015  77
4.1 Product and service classification systems: no. of codes  99
4.2 Example of contract entry  100
4.3 Consultancy categorization  101
4.4 Example category 1.3 consultancy entry  101
4.5 Example category 2.2 consultancy entry  102
4.6 Total spending on policy-relevant contracts per annum: increase from GaPS to AusTender decade, 1997–2017  106
4.7 Distribution of contracts across ABNs: 1997–2017  110
4.8 Income received by top 1 per cent of ABNs as % of total spending on policy-relevant contracts, 1997–2017  112
4.9 Income received by top 1 per cent of ABNs and top 10 ABNs as % of total spending on policy-relevant contracts: pooled searches, 1997–2017  113
4.10 Percentage of total spending received by not-for-profit ABNs, 1997–2017  115
List of Tables

4.11 Ministerial departments: contracts, 1997–2007 120
4.12 Department groupings: % share of spending on policy-related contracts, 1997–2007 121
4.13 Ministerial departments: contracts, 2007–2017 123
4.14 Department groupings: % share of spending on policy-related contracts, 2007–2017 125
4.15 Department groupings: % share of spending on searches 2–14 and 16 contracts, 1997–2017 126
5.1 Types of government personnel deployment 138
5.2 Field of education of externally hired personnel by Dutch central government organizations 139
5.3 Involvement of external consultants in various policy- and process-related activities, per ministry 141
5.4 A categorization of activities carried out by externally hired personnel as used by the Netherlands central government 146
5.5 The relative development of internally appointed and externally hired staff across ministries (2007–2016) 149
6.1 First subset – codes potentially relevant to policy advice (180 GSIN codes): entities × total expenditure, 2008–2017: distribution 159
6.2 First subset (180 GSIN codes): major end user by value awarded 160
6.3 First subset (180 GSIN codes): contract awarded 2009/10–2016/17 – over $50 million 161
6.4 Second subset – codes most likely relevant to policy advice: contract awarded 2009/10–2016/17 162
6.5 GSIN AJ716500 humanities and social sciences (R&D) contract history 163
6.6 GSIN AJ716500 – distribution of contracts by end user 165
6.7 Third subset contracts most relevant to policy advice and with contracting unit with a policy name 167
6.8 First subset (180 GSIN codes): distribution of supplier contract income 170
6.9 Top ten suppliers by award size 171
6.10 Select suppliers award comparison – $ million 172
6.11 Areas of activity of suppliers – aggregated categories 172
6.12 (180 GSIN codes): award income – policy services firms/all firms 173
6.13 Distribution by GSIN codes of suppliers with policy-related services 174
6.14 Suppliers with policy-related services and contract income over $1 million 175
7.1 Overview of the nine government agencies that spent in total more than SEK 100,000,000 from 2003 to 2011 190
7.2 Overview of the most consistently used suppliers (including only those suppliers used in at least six out of the nine studied years), in the nine government agencies with largest spending on management consulting services 195
7.3 Overview of the government agencies that spent between SEK 50,000,000 and SEK 100,000,000 on management consulting services from 2003 to 2011 196
7.4 Overview of the government agencies that spent between SEK 10,000,000 and SEK 50,000,000 on management consulting services from 2003 to 2011 197
7.5 Overview of the government agencies that spent up to SEK 10,000,000 on management consulting services from 2003 to 2011 199
7.6 Overview of the seven government agencies that spent more than SEK 10,000,000 on PR/communication consulting services in the 2003–2011 period 203
7.7 Overview of the most consistently used suppliers (including only those suppliers used in at least six out of the nine studied years), in the seven government agencies with largest spending on PR/communication consulting services 208
7.8 Overview of the government agencies’ spending between SEK 1,000,000 and SEK 10,000,000 in total on PR/communication consulting services in the 2003–2011 time frame 209
7.9 Overview of the government agencies’ spending between SEK 100,000 and 1,000,000 in total on PR/communication consulting services in the 2003–2011 period 211
7.10 Overview of the government agencies spending between SEK 0 and SEK 100,000 in total on PR/communication consulting services in the 2003–2011 time frame 212
Author Biographies

Caspar van den Berg is Professor of Governance, and Director of the Graduate School Campus Fryslân at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands. He holds a PhD from Leiden University, on the impact of European integration on the national civil service systems of the Netherlands, Britain and France, which was awarded the Van Poelje Prize for best dissertation in the administrative and policy sciences in the Netherlands and Flanders. He was previously a visiting fellow at Princeton University (2013–2014). His work has appeared in journals, including Governance, Public Administration and the Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory.


Helen M. Gunter is Professor of Educational Policy at The Manchester Institute of Education, University of Manchester. She is a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences, and recipient of the BELMAS Distinguished Service Award 2016. Her work focuses on the politics of education policy and knowledge production in the field of school leadership. Her most recent books are: An Intellectual History of School Leadership Practice and Research (2016), Consultants and Consultancy: The Case of Education (co-authored with Colin Mills; 2017) and The Politics of Public Education (2018).

Michael Howard is a Conjoint Lecturer in the School of Humanities and Social Sciences at the University of Newcastle (UoN) in Australia,
having been a continuing lecturer at UoN in social and public policy from 2000 to 2018. His research publications have centred on commercialization trends in the public sector, with a focus on the use of consultants, together with historical aspects of policy-making in Australia. At UoN his teaching has spanned courses in Politics and Policy, Social Science and Human Services. Prior to 2000 he held lecturing and research positions at the University of Sydney and the University of New South Wales, together with positions in policy development and programme delivery in community welfare and health in the NSW Public Service.

Andrea Migone has taught at Simon Fraser University and York University; he is currently Director of Research and Outreach at the Institute of Public Administration of Canada (IPAC). His research and publications focus on the intersection of public policy and public administration as a space where design and implementation come together. He is interested in a variety of subfields, including policy advisory systems, procurement, innovation, public sector leadership and governance.

Frida Pemer is Assistant Professor at the Department of Management and Organization at the Stockholm School of Economics. She holds a PhD in Organization Theory from the Stockholm School of Economics, and has been awarded the Wallander grant for best dissertation in business administration. Her research centres on how public and private organizations use professional services, and on digitalization in professional service firms. She has been a visiting researcher at the University of Oxford, and has published her work in highly ranked journals, including Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory, Human Relations, Industrial Marketing Management, Journal of Business Research and Journal of Supply Chain Management.
Acknowledgements

This work is part of the research programme Patterns of Politicization, which is financed by The Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO) (project number 451-14-009), and of the Consultancy and Knowledge Production in Education project, which is funded by the British Academy (project number SG121698).
## Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4Cs</td>
<td>Consultants, Consulting, Consultation, Consultancy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABN</td>
<td>Australian Business Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABS</td>
<td>Australian Bureau of Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALP</td>
<td>Australian Labor Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANZSCC</td>
<td>Australian and New Zealand Standard Commodity Classification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APS</td>
<td>Australian Public Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APSC</td>
<td>Australian Public Service Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIC</td>
<td>Australian Standard Industrial Classification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIC</td>
<td>Australian Securities and Investment Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATO</td>
<td>Australian Taxation Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIS</td>
<td>Department for Business, Innovation and Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CATS</td>
<td>Consultants and Temporary Staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCS</td>
<td>Crown Commercial Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COFOG</td>
<td>Classification of the Functions of Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAS</td>
<td>Department of Administrative Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCSH</td>
<td>Department of Community Services and Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEET</td>
<td>Department of Employment, Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEFRA</td>
<td>Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFAT</td>
<td>Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DiEE</td>
<td>Department for Education and Employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFES</td>
<td>Department for Education and Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DG</td>
<td>Director General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DITAC</td>
<td>Department of Industry, Commerce and Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DMO</td>
<td>Defence Materiel Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DND</td>
<td>Department of National Defence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoD</td>
<td>Department of Defence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoF</td>
<td>Department of Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoFA</td>
<td>Department of Finance and Public Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPS</td>
<td>Defence Procurement Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSS</td>
<td>Department of Social Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DUO</td>
<td>Dutch Executive Agency for Educational Affairs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Abbreviations

DWP Department for Work and Pensions
EIPP Evidence-Informed Policy and Practice
EU European Union
EY Ernst & Young
FCO Foreign and Commonwealth Office
FMV Swedish Defence Material Administration
GaPS Gazette Publishing System
GDP Gross Domestic Product
GSIN Goods and Services Identification Number
GST Goods and Services Tax
HMRC Her Majesty’s Revenue and Customs
ICT Information and Communication Technology
JBR Annual Management Report of Dutch Central Ministries
JCPAA Joint Committee on Public Accounts and Audit
MAF Management Accountability Framework
MinBZK Dutch Ministry of Home Affairs
MinFin Dutch Ministry of Finance
MoD Ministry of Defence
NAO National Audit Office
NHS National Health Service
NPM New Public Management
OECD Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
P&S codes Product and Service Codes
PPE Public Procurement Act
PPPs Public–Private Partnerships
PwC PricewaterhouseCoopers
PWGSC Public Works and Government Services Canada
R&D Research and Development
SCP Dutch Social and Cultural Planning Office
SEK Swedish Krona
SOU The Government’s Official Investigations
SSCFPA Senate Standing Committee on Finance and Public Administration
TEP Temporary External Staff
TINA There Is No Alternative
TSBPS Task and Solutions Based Professional Services
UNSPSC United Nations Standard Products and Services Code