



Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective

Many Western countries have seen an increase in the volume and importance of external consultants in the public policy process. This book is the first to investigate this phenomenon in a comparative and interdisciplinary way. The analysis shows who these consultants are, and how widely and for what reasons they are used in Britain, the United States, Canada, Australia, the Netherlands and Sweden. In doing so, the book addresses the positive and negative implications of high levels of external policy consultancy, including its implications for the nature of the state (transforming into a contractor state?) and for democratically legitimized and accountable decision-making (transforming into consultocracy?) It provides valuable new insights for students and practitioners in the fields of public administration, public policy, public management, political science and human resource management.

CASPAR VAN DEN BERG is Professor of Governance at the University of Groningen. His work has appeared in journals including *Governance*, *Public Administration* and *JPART*. He received the prestigious Van Poelje Prize for best dissertation in the administrative and policy sciences in the Netherlands and Flanders. He was a visiting fellow at Princeton University (2013–2014). He received a prominent four-year Veni scholarship from the Dutch Science Organization (2015).

MICHAEL HOWLETT is Burnaby Mountain Professor and Canada Research Chair in the Department of Political Science at Simon Fraser University, Canada. He specializes in public policy studies, with an emphasis on natural resource and environmental policy-making. He is currently editor of *Policy Sciences*, *Policy Design and Practice*, *Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis*, *Policy & Society* and the *Annual Review of Policy Design*.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-49667-4 – Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective

Caspar van den Berg, Michael Howlett, Andrea Migone, Michael Howard, Frida Perner, Helen M. Gunter
Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

ANDREA MIGONE is Director of Research and Outreach at the Institute of Public Administration of Canada. He specializes in public policy and public administration. His academic career includes work on decision-making, globalization, innovation policy, procurement and governance. He was a post-doctoral research fellow at Simon Fraser University.

MICHAEL HOWARD is a Conjoint Lecturer at the University of Newcastle, Australia. His career has spanned teaching and research in public policy in both academic and advocacy settings, along with policy development and service delivery within innovative government programmes. His publications have centred on historical aspects of policy-making and contemporary commercialization trends in the public sector, with a focus on consultants.

FRIDA PEMER is Assistant Professor at the Stockholm School of Economics. Her research centres on how organizations use professional services, and on digitalization in professional service firms. She has published her work in highly ranked journals such as *JPART*, *Governance*, *Human Relations*, *Industrial Marketing Management* and *Journal of Business Research*.

HELEN M. GUNTER is Professor of Education Policy at the University of Manchester. She is a Fellow of the UK Academy of Social Sciences, and recipient of the BELMAS Distinguished Service Award 2016. She published *Consultants and Consultancy: The Case of Education* (2017; co-authored with Colin Mills) and her most recent book is *The Politics of Public Education* (2018).

Cambridge Studies in Comparative Public Policy

The **Cambridge Studies in Comparative Public Policy** series was established to promote and disseminate comparative research in public policy. The objective of the series is to advance the understanding of public policies through the publication of the results of comparative research into the nature, dynamics and contexts of major policy challenges and responses to them. Works in the series will draw critical insights that enhance policy learning and are generalizable beyond specific policy contexts, sectors and time periods. Such works will also compare the development and application of public policy theory across institutional and cultural settings and examine how policy ideas, institutions and practices shape policies and their outcomes. Manuscripts comparing public policies in two or more cases as well as theoretically informed critical case studies which test more general theories are encouraged. Studies comparing policy development over time are also welcomed.

General Editors M. Ramesh, *National University of Singapore*; Xun Wu, *Hong Kong University of Science and Technology*; Michael Howlett, *Simon Fraser University, British Columbia and National University of Singapore*

In Defense of Pluralism: Policy Disagreement and its Media Coverage By
Éric Montpetit

Asia after the Developmental State: Disembedding Autonomy Edited by
Toby Carroll and Darryl S. L. Jarvis

*The Politics of Shale Gas in Eastern Europe: Energy Security, Contested
Technologies and the Social Licence to Frack* By Andreas Goldthau

*Healthy or Sick? Coevolution of Health Care and Public Health in a
Comparative Perspective 2018* By Philipp Trein

Policy Accumulation and the Democratic Responsiveness Trap By Christian
Adam, Steffen Hurka, Christoph Knill and Yves Steinebach

*Hyper-Active Governance: How Governments Manage the Politics of
Expertise* By Matthew Wood

*Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective: Patterns, Nuances and
Implications of the Contractor State* By Caspar van den Berg, Michael
Howlett, Andrea Migone, Michael Howard, Frida Perner and Helen M.
Gunter

Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective

Patterns, Nuances and Implications
of the Contractor State

CASPAR VAN DEN BERG

University of Groningen

MICHAEL HOWLETT

Simon Fraser University

ANDREA MIGONE

Institute of Public Administration of Canada

MICHAEL HOWARD

University of Newcastle, Australia

FRIDA PEMER

Stockholm School of Economics

HELEN M. GUNTER

University of Manchester



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-49667-4 – Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective

Caspar van den Berg, Michael Howlett, Andrea Migone, Michael Howard, Frida Perner, Helen M. Gunter
Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108496674

DOI: 10.1017/9781108634724

© Caspar van den Berg, Michael Howlett, Andrea Migone, Michael Howard,
Frida Perner and Helen M. Gunter 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-49667-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of
URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page viii
<i>List of Tables</i>	x
<i>Author Biographies</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvi
1 Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective	1
2 Consultancy in the UK Government: Modernizing Privatism	20
3 Policy Consulting in the USA: Significant but in Decline?	52
4 Entrenched and Escalating: Policy-Relevant Consulting and Contracting in Australia, 1987–2017	85
5 From Corporatist to Contractor State? Policy Consulting in the Netherlands	131
6 Policy Consultants for Substance and Process: A Review of the Supply and Demand for Canadian Policy Consulting	153
7 Swedish Government Agencies' Hiring of Policy Consultants: A Phenomenon of Increased Magnitude and Importance?	177
8 Conclusion: Policy Consulting in Comparative Perspective	221
<i>Appendix A</i>	241
<i>Appendix B</i>	244
<i>Appendix C</i>	248
<i>Appendix D</i>	250
<i>Appendix E</i>	255
<i>Appendix F</i>	256
<i>References</i>	266
<i>Index</i>	300

Figures

3.1	Department expenditures over time 2010–2015	<i>page</i> 76
3.2	Departments key contract codes distribution	78
3.3	Departments key contract codes yearly distribution	79
3.4	DoD service contracts 2012–2015	79
3.5	DoD key contract codes distribution	81
3.6	DoD yearly distribution	81
3.7	Key contract codes distribution 2011–2015, FAIR Act agencies	82
3.8	Service contract spending over time, FAIR Act agencies	83
4.1	Commonwealth department expenditure on consultants, 1983–2017 (AUD\$ million)	94
4.2	Commonwealth department and statutory authority expenditure on contracts for goods and services, 1995–2017 (AUD\$ billion)	95
5.1	Share of externally hired personnel’s working time spent on government assignments	140
5.2	The distribution of activities as carried out in the various ministries 2007–2016	143
5.3	Volume of externally hired staff per year in absolute figures (×1000 Euro), split for activity categories	145
5.4	Volumes of policy consulting per ministry	147
6.1	All GSIN categories: value of contracts awarded millions of dollars	158
7.1	Overview of the studied government agencies’ total spending on management consulting services between 2003 and 2011	188
7.2	Overview of the percentage of the studied government agencies’ total spending on management consulting services in the time period 2003–2011	189

<i>List of Figures</i>	ix
7.3 Overview of the trend in total spending on management consultants from 2003 to 2011 in the nine government agencies spending more than SEK 100,000,000	191
7.4 Overview of the studied government agencies' total spending on PR/communication consulting services from 2003 to 2011	202
7.5 Overview of the percentage of the studied government agencies' total spending on PR/communication consulting services in different ranges, between 2003 and 2011	203
7.6 Overview of the trend in total spending on PR/communication consultants 2003–2011 in the seven government agencies spending more than SEK 10,000,000	204

Tables

1.1	The four communities of policy advisers	<i>page</i> 7
1.2	Three types of consultancy	8
2.1	Government's use of consultants	31
2.2	Types of consultancy spend by departments, 2014	34
2.3	Total MoD expenditure on consultancy	35
2.4	MoD consultancy contracts awarded since May 2010	36
2.5	Thameslink rolling stock project	42
2.6	The Thameslink Programme	42
3.1	List of FPDS codes for policy consulting	64
3.2	Example for the data columns of the service inventory from the Department of Commerce (DoC)	67
3.3	Analysis of two CFO act contracts according to description of requirements	69
3.4	Analysis of 2 FAIR act agency contracts according to description of requirements	73
3.5	Five major policy-related service contract agencies 2015	77
4.1	Product and service classification systems: no. of codes	99
4.2	Example of contract entry	100
4.3	Consultancy categorization	101
4.4	Example category 1.3 consultancy entry	101
4.5	Example category 2.2 consultancy entry	102
4.6	Total spending on policy-relevant contracts per annum: increase from <i>GaPS</i> to <i>AusTender</i> decade, 1997–2017	106
4.7	Distribution of contracts across ABNs: 1997–2017	110
4.8	Income received by top 1 per cent of ABNs as % of total spending on policy-relevant contracts, 1997–2017	112
4.9	Income received by top 1 per cent of ABNs and top 10 ABNs as % of total spending on policy-relevant contracts: pooled searches, 1997–2017	113
4.10	Percentage of total spending received by not-for-profit ABNs, 1997–2017	115

<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
4.11 Ministerial departments: contracts, 1997–2007	120
4.12 Department groupings: % share of spending on policy-related contracts, 1997–2007	121
4.13 Ministerial departments: contracts, 2007–2017	123
4.14 Department groupings: % share of spending on policy-related contracts, 2007–2017	125
4.15 Department groupings: % share of spending on searches 2–14 and 16 contracts, 1997–2017	126
5.1 Types of government personnel deployment	138
5.2 Field of education of externally hired personnel by Dutch central government organizations	139
5.3 Involvement of external consultants in various policy- and process-related activities, per ministry	141
5.4 A categorization of activities carried out by externally hired personnel as used by the Netherlands central government	146
5.5 The relative development of internally appointed and externally hired staff across ministries (2007–2016)	149
6.1 First subset – codes potentially relevant to policy advice (180 GSIN codes): entities × total expenditure, 2008–2017: distribution	159
6.2 First subset (180 GSIN codes): major end user by value awarded	160
6.3 First subset (180 GSIN codes): contract awarded 2009/10–2016/17 – over \$50 million	161
6.4 Second subset – codes most likely relevant to policy advice: contract awarded 2009/10–2016/17	162
6.5 GSIN AJ716500 humanities and social sciences (R&D) contract history	163
6.6 GSIN AJ716500 – distribution of contracts by end user	165
6.7 Third subset contracts most relevant to policy advice and with contracting unit with a policy name	167
6.8 First subset (180 GSIN codes): distribution of supplier contract income	170
6.9 Top ten suppliers by award size	171
6.10 Select suppliers award comparison – \$ million	172
6.11 Areas of activity of suppliers – aggregated categories	172
6.12 (180 GSIN codes): award income – policy services firms/all firms	173

6.13	Distribution by GSIN codes of suppliers with policy-related services	174
6.14	Suppliers with policy-related services and contract income over \$1 million	175
7.1	Overview of the nine government agencies that spent in total more than SEK 100,000,000 from 2003 to 2011	190
7.2	Overview of the most consistently used suppliers (including only those suppliers used in at least six out of the nine studied years), in the nine government agencies with largest spending on management consulting services	195
7.3	Overview of the government agencies that spent between SEK 50,000,000 and SEK 100,000,000 on management consulting services from 2003 to 2011	196
7.4	Overview of the government agencies that spent between SEK 10,000,000 and SEK 50,000,000 on management consulting services from 2003 to 2011	197
7.5	Overview of the government agencies that spent up to SEK 10,000,000 on management consulting services from 2003 to 2011	199
7.6	Overview of the seven government agencies that spent more than SEK 10,000,000 on PR/communication consulting services in the 2003–2011 period	203
7.7	Overview of the most consistently used suppliers (including only those suppliers used in at least six out of the nine studied years), in the seven government agencies with largest spending on PR/communication consulting services	208
7.8	Overview of the government agencies' spending between SEK 1,000,000 and SEK 10,000,000 in total on PR/communication consulting services in the 2003–2011 time frame	209
7.9	Overview of the government agencies' spending between SEK 100,000 and 1,000,000 in total on PR/communication consulting services in the 2003–2011 period	211
7.10	Overview of the government agencies spending between SEK 0 and SEK 100,000 in total on PR/communication consulting services in the 2003–2011 time frame	212

Author Biographies

Caspar van den Berg is Professor of Governance, and Director of the Graduate School Campus Fryslân at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands. He holds a PhD from Leiden University, on the impact of European integration on the national civil service systems of the Netherlands, Britain and France, which was awarded the Van Poelje Prize for best dissertation in the administrative and policy sciences in the Netherlands and Flanders. He was previously a visiting fellow at Princeton University (2013–2014). His work has appeared in journals, including *Governance*, *Public Administration* and the *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*.

Michael Howlett is Burnaby Mountain Professor and Canada Research Chair (Tier 1) in the Department of Political Science at Simon Fraser University. He specializes in public policy analysis, political economy, and resource and environmental policy. His latest books are *Designing Public Policies* (2019), *The Policy Design Primer* (2019), *Collaboration and Public Service Delivery* (2019), *Making Policies Work* (2019), the *Routledge Handbook of Policy Design* (2019) and *Policy Styles and Policy Making* (2019).

Helen M. Gunter is Professor of Educational Policy at The Manchester Institute of Education, University of Manchester. She is a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences, and recipient of the BELMAS Distinguished Service Award 2016. Her work focuses on the politics of education policy and knowledge production in the field of school leadership. Her most recent books are: *An Intellectual History of School Leadership Practice and Research* (2016), *Consultants and Consultancy: The Case of Education* (co-authored with Colin Mills; 2017) and *The Politics of Public Education* (2018).

Michael Howard is a Conjoint Lecturer in the School of Humanities and Social Sciences at the University of Newcastle (UoN) in Australia,

having been a continuing lecturer at UoN in social and public policy from 2000 to 2018. His research publications have centred on commercialization trends in the public sector, with a focus on the use of consultants, together with historical aspects of policy-making in Australia. At UoN his teaching has spanned courses in Politics and Policy, Social Science and Human Services. Prior to 2000 he held lecturing and research positions at the University of Sydney and the University of New South Wales, together with positions in policy development and programme delivery in community welfare and health in the NSW Public Service.

Andrea Migone has taught at Simon Fraser University and York University; he is currently Director of Research and Outreach at the Institute of Public Administration of Canada (IPAC). His research and publications focus on the intersection of public policy and public administration as a space where design and implementation come together. He is interested in a variety of subfields, including policy advisory systems, procurement, innovation, public sector leadership and governance.

Frida Perner is Assistant Professor at the Department of Management and Organization at the Stockholm School of Economics. She holds a PhD in Organization Theory from the Stockholm School of Economics, and has been awarded the Wallander grant for best dissertation in business administration. Her research centres on how public and private organizations use professional services, and on digitalization in professional service firms. She has been a visiting researcher at the University of Oxford, and has published her work in highly ranked journals, including *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, *Human Relations*, *Industrial Marketing Management*, *Journal of Business Research* and *Journal of Supply Chain Management*.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-49667-4 – Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective

Caspar van den Berg, Michael Howlett, Andrea Migone, Michael Howard, Frida Perner, Helen M. Gunter
Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

Acknowledgements



Netherlands Organisation
for Scientific Research



This work is part of the research programme *Patterns of Politicization*, which is financed by The Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO) (project number 451-14-009), and of the *Consultancy and Knowledge Production in Education* project, which is funded by the British Academy (project number SG121698).

Abbreviations

4Cs	Consultants, Consulting, Consultation, Consultancy
ABN	Australian Business Number
ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
ALP	Australian Labor Party
ANZSCC	Australian and New Zealand Standard Commodity Classification
APS	Australian Public Service
APSC	Australian Public Service Commission
ASIC	Australian Standard Industrial Classification
ASIC	Australian Securities and Investment Commission
ATO	Australian Taxation Office
BIS	Department for Business, Innovation and Skills
CATS	Consultants and Temporary Staff
CCS	Crown Commercial Service
COFOG	Classification of the Functions of Government
DAS	Department of Administrative Services
DCSH	Department of Community Services and Health
DEET	Department of Employment, Education and Training
DEFRA	Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs
DFAT	Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
DfEE	Department for Education and Employment
DFES	Department for Education and Skills
DG	Director General
DITAC	Department of Industry, Commerce and Technology
DMO	Defence Materiel Organisation
DND	Department of National Defence
DoD	Department of Defence
DoF	Department of Finance
DoFA	Department of Finance and Public Administration
DPS	Defence Procurement Strategy
DSS	Department of Social Security
DUO	Dutch Executive Agency for Educational Affairs

List of Abbreviations

xvii

DWP	Department for Work and Pensions
EIPP	Evidence-Informed Policy and Practice
EU	European Union
EY	Ernst & Young
FCO	Foreign and Commonwealth Office
FMV	Swedish Defence Material Administration
GaPS	Gazette Publishing System
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GSIN	Goods and Services Identification Number
GST	Goods and Services Tax
HMRC	Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
JBR	Annual Management Report of Dutch Central Ministries
JCPAA	Joint Committee on Public Accounts and Audit
MAF	Management Accountability Framework
MinBZK	Dutch Ministry of Home Affairs
MinFin	Dutch Ministry of Finance
MoD	Ministry of Defence
NAO	National Audit Office
NHS	National Health Service
NPM	New Public Management
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
P&S codes	Product and Service Codes
PPA	Public Procurement Act
PPPs	Public–Private Partnerships
PwC	PricewaterhouseCoopers
PWGSC	Public Works and Government Services Canada
R&D	Research and Development
SCP	Dutch Social and Cultural Planning Office
SEK	Swedish Krona
SOU	The Government's Official Investigations
SSCFPA	Senate Standing Committee on Finance and Public Administration
TEP	Temporary External Staff
TINA	There Is No Alternative
TSBPS	Task and Solutions Based Professional Services
UNSPSC	United Nations Standard Products and Services Code