FILTERING POPULIST CLAIMS TO FIGHT POPULISM

The new wave of populism that has emerged over the last five years in Europe and in the US urgently needs to be better understood in a comparative and historical context. Using Italy – including the experiment of a self-styled populist coalition government – as a case study, this book investigates how populists in power borrow, use and manipulate categories of constitutional theory and instruments of constitutional law. Giuseppe Martinico goes beyond treating constitutionalism and populism as purely antithetical to dive deeply into the impact of populism on the activity of some instruments of constitutional democracy, endeavoring to explore their role as possible fora of populist claims and targets of populist attacks. Most importantly, he points to ways in which constitutional democracies can channel populist claims without jeopardizing the legacy of post-World War II constitutionalism. This book is aimed at academics and practicing lawyers interested in populism and comparative constitutional law.

Giuseppe Martinico is Full Professor of Comparative Public Law at the Sant’Anna School of Advanced Studies. Previously, he was García Pelayo Fellow at the Centre for Political and Constitutional Studies (CEPC), Madrid, and Max Weber Fellow at the European University Institute, Florence.
COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLICY

Series Editors
Tom Ginsburg
University of Chicago

Zachary Elkins
University of Texas at Austin

Ran Hirschl
University of Toronto

Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

Books in the Series

Filtering Populist Claims to Fight Populism: The Italian Case in a Comparative Perspective
Giuseppe Martinico

Constitutionalism in Context
David S. Law

The New Fourth Branch: Institutions for Protecting Constitutional Democracy
Mark Tushnet

The Veil of Participation: Citizens and Political Parties in Constitution-Making Processes
Alexander Hudson

Tower ing Judges: A Comparative Study of Constitutional Judges
Edited by Rehan Abeyratne and Iddo Porat

The Constitution of Arbitration
Victor Ferrer es Comella

Redrafting Constitutions in Democratic Orders: Theoretical and Comparative Perspectives
Edited by Gabriel L. Negretto

From Parchment to Practice: Implementing New Constitutions
Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Z. Huq

The Failure of Popular Constitution Making in Turkey: Regressing Towards Constitutional Autocracy
Edited by Felix Petersen and Zeynep Yanaşmayan

A Qualified Hope: The Indian Supreme Court and Progressive Social Change
Edited by Gerald N. Rosenberg, Sudhir Krishnaswamy, and Shishir Bail

Reconstructing Rights: Courts, Parties, and Equality Rights in India, South Africa, and the United States
Stephan Stohler

Constitutions in Times of Financial Crisis
Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Mark D. Rosen, and Georg Vanberg
Hybrid Constitutionalism: The Politics of Constitutional Review in the Chinese Special Administrative Regions
Eric C. Ip

Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order
Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Terence C. Halliday, and Gregory Shaffer

The Invisible Constitution in Comparative Perspective
Edited by Rosalind Dixon and Adrienne Stone

The Político-Legal Dynamics of Judicial Review: A Comparative Analysis
Themis Roux

Constitutional Courts in Asia: A Comparative Perspective
Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen and Andrew Harding

Judicial Review in Norway: A Bicentennial Debate
Anine Kierulf

Constituent Assemblies
Edited by Jon Elster, Roberto Gargarella, Vatsal Naresh, and Bjorn Erik Rasch

The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America: Politics, Governance, and Judicial Design
Daniel M. Brinks and Abby Blass

The Adventures of the Constituent Power: Beyond Revolutions?
Andrew Arato

Canada in the World: Comparative Perspectives on the Canadian Constitution
Edited by Richard Albert and David R. Cameron

Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia and Sri Lanka
Dian A. H. Shah

Courts and Democracies in Asia
Po Jen Yap

Proportionality: New Frontiers, New Challenges
Edited by Vicki C. Jackson and Mark Tushnet

Constituents before Assembly: Participation, Deliberation, and Representation in the Crafting of New Constitutions
Todd A. Eisenstadt, A. Carl LeVan, and Tofigh Maboudi

Assessing Constitutional Performance
Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Huq

Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law: The Pyrrhic Constitutionalism of Sri Lanka
Benjamin Schonthal

Engaging with Social Rights: Procedure, Participation and Democracy in South Africa’s Second Wave
Brian Ray

Constitutional Courts as Mediators: Armed Conflict, Civil-Military Relations, and the Rule of Law in Latin America
Julio Ríos-Figueroa

Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies
David Kosarz

Making We the People: Democratic Constitutional Founding in Postwar Japan and South Korea
Chaihark Hahn and Sung Ho Kim

Radical Deprivation on Trial: The Impact of Judicial Activism on Socioeconomic Rights in the Global South
César Rodríguez-Garavito and Diana Rodríguez-Franco
Filtering Populist Claims to Fight Populism

THE ITALIAN CASE IN A COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

GIUSEPPE MARTINICO
Sant’Anna School of Advanced Studies (Pisa)
## Contents

1. **Introduction and Acknowledgements** 1

2. **Populist Constitutionalism: An Oxymoron?** 10
   1.1 The Many Faces of the Populist Challenge: A Conceptual Clarification for the Purpose of the Book 10
   1.2 Constitutionalism and Populism: Between Mimetism and Parasitism 16
   1.3 The Constitution as a Straitjacket 20
   1.4 Some Guidelines to Challenge the Populist Constitutional Counter-Narrative 22
   1.5 Final Remarks 26

3. **Italy and Post–World War II Constitutionalism** 29
   2.1 Italy and Populism(s) 29
   2.2 Constitutionalism and Memory of Horror 30
   2.3 Italy and Post–World War II Constitutionalism 38
   2.4 The Resistance as a Constituent Moment 40
   2.5 Italian Populisms: An Overview 49

4. **Mimetism and Parasitism in Action: Sovereignism and Identity Politics versus Post–World War II Constitutional Openness** 63
   3.1 Sovereignism, Sovereign Democracy and Identity Politics 63
   3.2 The EU and the New Wave of Populisms 66
   3.3 European Law in Sovereignist Times 70
   3.4 Openness and Italian Constitutional Law 77
   3.5 Openness and Post–World War II Constitutionalism 90

5. **Mimetism and Parasitism in Action: Politics of Immediacy and the Case of the Referendum** 99
   4.1 The Perils of the Politics of Immediacy 99
Contents

4.2 The Referendum and Constitutional Law: An Instrument to Handle with Care
4.3 How Constitutions Coordinate Referendums and Representative Democracy
4.4 How Populists Understand the Referendum
4.5 The Italian Debate from a Comparative Perspective
4.6 What Comparative Constitutional Law Can Teach Us
5 The Assault on Representative Democracy as the Other Side of the Politics of Immediacy
  5.1 Anti-parliamentarism and Populism: An Introduction
  5.2 Representative Democracy and the Five Star Movement
  5.3 A First Assessment of the Impact of the Five Star Movement on the Activity of the Italian Parliament
  5.4 Final Remarks
6 The Return of the Imperative Mandate?
  6.1 Objectocracy and Political Mediation
  6.2 A ‘Cornerstone of European Democratic Constitutionalism’
  6.3 Article 67 of the Italian Constitution: Genesis and Current Issues
  6.4 A Party in Disguise: How to Understand the Five Star Movement from a Legal Point of View
7 Filtering Populist Claims to Fight Populism: Final Remarks

Bibliography
Index