

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

Volume 188



Volumes published under the title:

ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES

	(1919-22) 2 (1923-24)	$\bigg\}$	Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, KC, and H. Lauterpacht, LLD
_	(1925-26) (1927-28)	$\bigg\}$	Edited by Arnold D. McNair, CBE, LLD, and H. Lauterpacht, LLD
Vol. 6 Vol. 7 Vol. 8 Vol. 9 Vol. 10 Vol. 11	(1947) (1948)		Edited by H. Lauterpacht, QC, LLD, FBA

Volumes published under the title:

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

```
Vol. 17 (1950)
Vol. 18 (1951)
Vol. 19 (1952)
Vol. 20 (1953)
                      Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, QC, LLD, FBA
Vol. 21 (1954)
Vol. 22 (1955)
Vol. 23 (1956)
Vol. 24 (1957)
                      Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, QC, LLD, FBA,
                        and E. Lauterpacht
Vol. 25 (1958-I)
                      Edited by E. Lauterpacht, QC
Vol. 26 (1958-II)
Vols. 27-68 and Consolidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1-35 and 36-45
                      Edited by E. Lauterpacht, QC
Vols. 69-150 and Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and
                        Treaties to Vols. 1-80, Vols. 81-100 and Vols. 1-125
                      Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, CBE, QC,
                        and Sir Christopher Greenwood, CMG, QC
Vols. 151-68 and Consolidated Index and Consolidated Table of Treaties to
                        Vols. 1-160
                      Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, CBE, QC, LLD,
                        Sir Christopher Greenwood, CMG, QC, and K. L. Lee
Vols. 169-88
                      Edited by Sir Christopher Greenwood, GBE, CMG, QC,
                        and K. L. Lee
```



> Lauterpacht Centre for International Law University of Cambridge

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 188

Edited by

SIR CHRISTOPHER GREENWOOD, GBE, CMG, QC

Member of the Iran–United States Claims Tribunal
Bencher of Middle Temple
Formerly Judge of the International Court of Justice

and

KAREN LEE

Fellow of the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge Vice-Mistress and Fellow of Girton College, Cambridge





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108495714 DOI: 10.1017/9781108862714

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow Cornwall A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-49571-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

	Page
Preface	vii
Editorial Note	ix
Table of Cases (alphabetical)	xiii
Table of Cases (according to courts and countries)	XV
Digest (main headings)	xvii
Digest of Cases Reported in Volume 188	xix
Table of Treaties	xxxi
Reports of Cases	1
Index	719





PREFACE

The present volume contains the 2016 judgment on preliminary objections of the International Court of Justice in Question of the Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Nicaragua and Colombia beyond 200 Nautical Miles from the Nicaraguan Coast (Nicaragua v. Colombia). International jurisprudence is further reflected in the award on compensation in The Arctic Sunrise (Netherlands v. Russian Federation) arbitration, the judgment of the European Court of Human Rights in Khlaifia v. Italy and the views of the United Nations Human Rights Committee in Whelan v. Ireland. National jurisprudence is represented by decisions from the courts of Austria (Crimea Annexation Case), England (Al-Juffali, Ukraine v. Law Debenture, Pham and Campaign Against Arms Trade), Estonia (European Stability Mechanism Case) and the United States (Jam and Harrison).

The Editors wish to thank the many people whose work has made this volume possible. Ms Ryce Lee prepared the summary of Nicaragua v. Colombia. Ms Natalie Jones summarized Al-Juffali and Law Debenture. Mr Daniel Regan prepared the summaries of Pham, Jam and Harrison. Mr Michael Becker and Dr Stella Margariti wrote the summary of Campaign Against Arms Trade. Ms Anne Coulon summarized The Arctic Sunrise and Ms Caroline Kimeu wrote the summary of Whelan. Ms Andra Laurand summarized the European Stability Mechanism Case and Mr Philipp Janig (under the supervision of Professor Dr Stephan Wittich) prepared the summary and unofficial translation of the Crimea Annexation Case. Ms Karen Lee summarized Khlaifia and saw the volume through the press. Ms Maria Netchaeva, the ILR Editorial Assistant, prepared the Tables of Cases and Digest. Miss Maureen MacGlashan, CMG, compiled the Table of Treaties and Index. Mrs Alison Tickner checked the copy and Mrs Jenny Macgregor read the proofs.

The Editors are also grateful to the International Court of Justice, the Permanent Court of Arbitration, the European Court of Human Rights, the United Nations Human Rights Committee and the United States Supreme Court for kindly permitting these *Reports* to use the electronic files of the judgments posted on their official websites. They are also indebted to Brill publishers for kindly allowing the publication of the text of the unofficial translation prepared for the *Austrian Review*



viii PREFACE

of International and European Law. The unofficial translation of the Estonian case was contributed by the Supreme Court of Estonia Website with its kind permission. The decisions from England published in this volume carry Crown copyright and contain public sector information licensed under the Open Government Licence v.3.0; the electronic files came from the United Kingdom Government, and British and Irish Legal Information Institute websites.

Finally, our thanks go to all the others who have worked to complete this volume, particularly our publishers, Cambridge University Press, and typesetters, SPi, and their staff.

C. J. GREENWOOD

LAUTERPACHT CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW, UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

K. L. LEE

LAUTERPACHT CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW, UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

November 2019



EDITORIAL NOTE

The *International Law Reports* endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the Reports will include cases which bear on the exception of "political offences" or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

The *Reports* seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or ad hoc arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of Justice of the European Union). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

Human rights cases. The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the *Reports* to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the *Reports* will continue to publish decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as "views" of the United Nations Human Rights Committee. Decisions of national courts on the application of conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human rights law or a matter of wider interest to public



x

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-49571-4 — International Law Reports Edited by Christopher Greenwood , Karen Lee Frontmatter More Information

EDITORIAL NOTE

international lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

International arbitrations. The Reports of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these *Reports* are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see Yearbook Commercial Arbitration (ed. Albert Jan van den Berg, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration).) But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, force majeure) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

DECISIONS OF NATIONAL TRIBUNALS

A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

Editorial Treatment of Materials

The basic policy of the Editors is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is no part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.



EDITORIAL NOTE

хi

Presentation of Materials

For reproduction of material in this volume, electronic files have been used wherever possible and their source acknowledged in the Preface. Citations of the reports in which the case may be found are listed in the "Report" section in square brackets at the end of the case; the language of the original decision is also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body of the text indicate the pagination of the original report where included.

Notes

Footnotes. Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

Other notes. References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

DIGEST OF CASES

With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the *Reports* are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at p. xvii.

CONSOLIDATED INDEX AND TABLES

A Consolidated Index and a Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 1-80 were published in two volumes in 1990 and 1991. A further volume containing the Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 81-100 was published in 1996. A Consolidated Index, a Consolidated Tables of Cases and a Consolidated Table of Treaties for volumes 1-125 were published in 2004. A Consolidated Index and a Consolidated Table of Treaties for volumes 1-160 were published in 2017. Volume 185 contains Consolidated Tables of Cases for volumes 126-185.





TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ALPHABETICAL

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

Al-Juffali v. Estrada (Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs intervening) 415

The Arctic Sunrise (Kingdom of the Netherlands v. Russian Federation) (Award on Compensation) 125

Campaign Against Arms Trade Case 548 Crimea Annexation Case (Case 9 Bs 269/ 16x) 350

European Stability Mechanism Case (Case No 3-4-1-6-12) 356

Jam and Others v. International Finance Corporation 672

Khlaifia and Others v. Italy (Application No 16483/12) 168

The Law Debenture Trust Corporation Plc Case 445

Nicaragua v. Colombia (Questions of the Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Nicaragua and Colombia beyond 200 Nautical Miles from the Nicaraguan Coast) (Preliminary Objections) 1 Pham v. Secretary of State for the Home Department 523

Questions of the Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Nicaragua and Colombia beyond 200 Nautical Miles from the Nicaraguan Coast (Nicaragua v. Colombia) (Preliminary Objections) 1

R (Campaign Against Arms Trade) v. Secretary of State for International Trade (Amnesty International and Others intervening) 548

Sudan, Republic of v. Harrison and Others 698

Ukraine v. The Law Debenture Trust Corporation Plc 445

Whelan v. Ireland (Communication No 2425/2014) 317





TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ARRANGED ACCORDING TO COURTS AND TRIBUNALS (INTERNATIONAL CASES) AND COUNTRIES (MUNICIPAL CASES)

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

I. DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

Arbitration Tribunal

2017

The Arctic Sunrise (Kingdom of the Netherlands v. Russian Federation) (Award on Compensation) 125

No 16483/12) 168

European Court of Human Rights

2016 Khlaifia and Others v. Italy (Application International Court of Justice

2016

Questions of the Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Nicaragua and Colombia beyond 200 Nautical Miles from the Nicaraguan Coast (Nicaragua v. Colombia) (Preliminary Objections) 1

United Nations Human Rights Committee

2017

Whelan v. Ireland (Communication No 2425/2014) 317

II. DECISIONS OF MUNICIPAL COURTS

Austria

2016

Crimea Annexation Case (Case 9 Bs 269/ 16x) 350

Estonia

2012 European Stability Mechanism Case (Case No 3-4-1-6-12) 356 United Kingdom, England

2016

Al-Juffali v. Estrada (Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs intervening) 415

2017

R (Campaign Against Arms Trade) v. Secretary of State for International Trade (Amnesty International and Others intervening) 548, 556



xvi

TABLE OF CASES

2018

Pham v. Secretary of State for the Home Department 523 Ukraine v. The Law Debenture Trust Corporation Plc 445

2019

R (Campaign Against Arms Trade) v. Secretary of State for International Trade (Amnesty International and Others intervening) 548, 622 United States of America

2019

Jam and Others v. International Finance Corporation 672 Republic of Sudan v. Harrison and Others 698



DIGEST OF CASES

List of Main Headings

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics. For a guide to the Digest, see the Editorial Note at p. xi.)

Air International Organizations

Aliens International Tribunals

Arbitration Jurisdiction

Canals Lakes and Landlocked Seas

Claims Nationality

Comity Recognition

Conciliation Relationship of International Law and

Municipal Law

State Immunity

Damages Reprisals and Countermeasures

Rivers

Consular Relations

Diplomatic Relations

Economics, Trade and Finance

Environment Sources of International Law

Evidence before International Courts | Space

and Tribunals

Expropriation State Responsibility

Extradition State Succession

General Principles of International Law | States

Governments Territory

Human Rights Terrorism

International Court of Justice Treaties

International Criminal Law War and Armed Conflict

xvii





DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 188

Page

Aliens

Migration crisis — Humanitarian crisis — Applicants leaving Tunisia as part of mass migration — Migrants held in reception centre on island of Lampedusa in Italy — Migrants subsequently held on ships in Palermo Harbour — Applicants lodging complaints against Italian Government with European Court of Human Rights — Complaints concerning confinement and conditions in reception centre and on ships — Whether applicants subjected to collective expulsion — Whether applicants having effective remedy under Italian law — Italian Government objecting to admissibility of complaints — Whether Italian Government estopped from raising objection concerning non-exhaustion of domestic remedies — Whether objection raised in timely manner — Italian Government objecting to applicability of Article 5 — Whether European Court of Human Rights having jurisdiction ratione materiae to examine applicants' complaints — State having right to control aliens' entry into and residence in its territory — Whether right exercised in accordance with European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — Whether Italian Government violating Articles 3, 5 and 13 of European Convention and Article 4 of Protocol No 4 to Convention — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Khlaifia and Others v. Italy (Application No 16483/12)

168

Arbitration

United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 ("UNCLOS"), Part XV and Annex VII — Award on Jurisdiction — Award on Merits — Russia in breach of its obligations to the Netherlands under UNCLOS — Heads of damage for which compensation due — Quantum of compensation — Arbitration Tribunal

The Arctic Sunrise (Kingdom of the Netherlands v. Russian Federation) (Award on Compensation)

125



XX

DIGEST OF CASES

Damages

Compensation — Compensable and non-compensable claims — Restitution — Return of confiscated equipment and items — Material damage for vessel repairs and replacement of objects belonging to vessel — Material damage for loss of use of vessel — Material damage for bail and security — Material damage for injury to personal belongings — Material damage for unpaid deposits to arbitration tribunal — Non-material damage for wrongful arrest, prosecution and detention of persons — Arbitration Tribunal

The Arctic Sunrise (Kingdom of the Netherlands v. Russian Federation) (Award on Compensation)

125

Compensation — Quantum of compensation — Compensation in form of a lump sum — Compensation on an equitable basis — Interest rate — Start date for calculation of interest — Arbitration Tribunal

The Arctic Sunrise (Kingdom of the Netherlands v. Russian Federation) (Award on Compensation)

125

Diplomatic Relations

Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961 — Article 22 — Inviolability of embassy premises — Whether service of process at embassy premises interfering with inviolability of embassy premises — United States Supreme Court

Republic of Sudan v. Harrison and Others

698

Economics, Trade and Finance

Euro area — Economic and financial stability — European Stability Mechanism — Financial sovereignty — Treaty Establishing the European Stability Mechanism, 2012, Article 4(4) — Constitution of Estonia — Budgetary powers — Whether Article 4(4) of Treaty in conflict with Constitution of Estonia — Estonia, Supreme Court

European Stability Mechanism Case (Case No 3-4-1-6-12)

356

UK Export Control Act 2002 — 1998 EU Code of Conduct on Arms Exports — European Council Common Position 2008/ 944/CFSP — Whether Criterion 2(c) triggered by Saudi Arabia conduct of hostilities in Yemen — England, High Court, Queen's



DIGEST OF CASES

xxi

Bench Division (Administrative Court) and Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

R (Campaign Against Arms Trade) v. Secretary of State for International Trade (Amnesty International and Others Intervening)

548

Environment

Pollution — Construction and operation of coal-fired power plant in India — International Finance Corporation ("IFC") making loan to Indian company for construction of plant — Noncompliance of Indian company with environmental and social action plan — Loan agreement allowing IFC to revoke financial support if terms of agreement not complied with — Petitioners bringing claims against IFC — Whether IFC having immunity from suit under International Organizations Immunities Act 1945 — United States, Supreme Court

Jam and Others v. International Finance Corporation

672

Evidence before International Courts and Tribunals

Review of evidence by experts — Methodology for reviewing evidence — Assessment of evidence by tribunal — Arbitration Tribunal

The Arctic Sunrise (Kingdom of the Netherlands v. Russian Federation) (Award on Compensation)

125

Extradition

Treaties — European Convention on Extradition, 1957 — Extradition for criminal prosecution — Whether permissible for Russian Federation to request extradition of Ukrainian nationals for crimes committed in Crimea prior to incorporation of Crimea — Austria, Higher Regional Court Linz

Crimea Annexation Case (Case 9 Bs 269/16x)

350

General Principles of International Law

Res judicata — Identity between parties, object and legal ground — Final and definitive determination of Nicaragua's extended continental shelf claim — Scope of 2012 Judgment — Meaning of operative clause established by reference to reasoning of Judgment — Nicaragua's obligation to submit information on



xxii

DIGEST OF CASES

General Principles of International Law (cont.)

limits of extended continental shelf to Commission on the Limits of the Continental Shelf ("CLCS") — Article 76 of the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 ("UNCLOS") — Whether Nicaragua's claim to a continental shelf barred by *res judicata* — International Court of Justice

Questions of the Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Nicaragua and Colombia beyond 200 Nautical Miles from the Nicaraguan Coast (Nicaragua v. Colombia) (Preliminary Objections)

Human Rights

Prohibition of collective expulsion of aliens — Article 4 of Protocol No 4 to European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — Whether removal of applicants from Italian territory to Tunisia against their will constituting expulsion — Whether expulsion as a group — Whether applicants undergoing identification — Whether nationality of applicants established — Whether applicants afforded genuine and effective possibility of arguing against their expulsion — Whether Italian Government violating Article 4 of Protocol No 4 — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Khlaifia and Others v. Italy (Application No 16483/12)

168

1

Prohibition of torture and inhuman or degrading treatment — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 3 — Whether conditions in which applicants held in reception centre constituting inhuman or degrading treatment — Whether conditions in which applicants held on ships constituting inhuman or degrading treatment — Absolute prohibition -Requirement that any ill-treatment attain minimum level of severity — Relevant factors — Persons deprived of liberty being in vulnerable situation — Whether impugned regulations and practices defective to point of constituting a violation — Whether State's right to control aliens' entry into and residence in territory exercised in accordance with Convention Evidence — Mass migration crisis — Whether situation faced by Italian authorities in 2011 following Arab Spring exceptional — Relevance — Whether Italian Government violating Article 3 of European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Khlaifia and Others v. Italy (Application No 16483/12)

168

Right to an effective remedy — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 13 — Whether violation of Article 13 taken



DIGEST OF CASES

xxiii

together with Article 3 of Convention — Whether any remedies available to applicants for complaining about conditions at reception centre and on ships — Whether violation of Article 13 taken together with Article 4 of Protocol No 4 — Whether applicants could appeal against refusal-of-entry orders — Whether allegations of real risk of violation of rights guaranteed under Articles 2 and 3 of Convention in destination country — Whether lack of suspensive effect of removal decision in itself constituting violation of Article 13 — Whether Italian Government violating Article 13 of Convention — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Khlaifia and Others v. Italy (Application No 16483/12)

168

Right to freedom from cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment — Right to privacy — Right to equality and non-discrimination — Prohibition of abortion in a non-viable pregnancy — Whether Ireland violating its obligations under Articles 2(1), 3, 7, 17, 19 and 26 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee

Whelan v. Ireland (Communication No 2425/2014)

317

Right to liberty and security of person — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 5 — Article 5(1) — Exceptions — Article 5(1)(f) — State permitted to control liberty of aliens in immigration context — Whether applicants' deprivation of liberty falling within Article 5(1)(f) — Whether having requisite legal basis in Italian law — Relevance of migration crisis — Article 5(2) — Whether applicants informed why being deprived of liberty — Article 5(4) — Ability of applicants to challenge lawfulness of their deprivation of liberty — Whether Italian Government violating Articles 5(1), (2) and (4) of European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Khlaifia and Others v. Italy (Application No 16483/12)

168

International Court of Justice

Jurisdiction — American Treaty on Pacific Settlement, 1948 ("Pact of Bogotá"), Article XXXI — Nicaragua instituting proceedings against Colombia — Nicaragua's First Request concerning delimitation of continental shelf between Parties in area beyond 200 nautical miles from Nicaraguan coast — Nicaragua's Second Request requesting Court to determine principles and rules of international law governing right and duties of two States in relevant area pending delimitation — Whether



xxiv

DIGEST OF CASES

International Court of Justice (cont.)

Court having jurisdiction to entertain application — Colombia raising preliminary objections — Whether Court lacking jurisdiction ratione temporis — Pact of Bogotá — Denunciation by Colombia — Interpretation of Pact of Bogotá — Whether Article XXXI of Pact of Bogotá remaining in force on date of application — Effect of second paragraph of Article LVI — Whether effet utile principle applicable — Travaux préparatoires — Whether Court having "continuing jurisdiction" — Whether Court having already fully dealt with Nicaragua's claims regarding delimitation of continental shelf between Nicaragua and Colombia beyond 200 nautical miles of Nicaraguan coast — 2012 Judgment — Whether Nicaragua's claim barred by way of res judicata — Issue concerning Article 76(8) of United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — Whether application attempt to revise 2012 Judgment — Admissibility of application — International Court of Justice

Questions of the Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Nicaragua and Colombia beyond 200 Nautical Miles from the Nicaraguan Coast (Nicaragua v. Colombia) (Preliminary Objections)

1

International Organizations

European Union — Treaties — Law of the European Union — Treaty Establishing the European Stability Mechanism, 2012 — Whether Treaty on European Stability Mechanism part of European Union law — Estonia, Supreme Court

European Stability Mechanism Case (Case No 3-4-1-6-12)

356

Immunities and privileges Jurisdictional immunity Representative to international organization — Permanent to Maritime Organization Representative International Headquarters Agreement between United Kingdom and International Maritime Organization — International Maritime Organization (Immunities and Privileges) Order 2002 — Whether court entitled to conduct functional review of appointment of Permanent Representative — England, Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

Al-Juffali v. Estrada (Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs Intervening)

Immunity — Absolute immunity — Restrictive immunity — International Finance Corporation — International Organizations Immunities Act 1945 ("IOIA") — Whether IOIA conferring same immunity on international organizations

415



DIGEST OF CASES

XXV

as foreign governments enjoying under Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act 1976 — Whether international organizations enjoying absolute or limited immunity under United States Federal law — Whether restrictive immunity meaning unlimited exposure to suit — United States, Supreme Court

Jam and Others v. International Finance Corporation

672

Jurisdiction

Immunity — Diplomatic immunity — International organizations — Permanent Representative to international organizations — United Nations Convention on the Privileges and Immunities of Specialized Agencies, 1948 — Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961 — Permanent residents only entitled to immunity in exercise of official functions — Definition of permanent residency — England, Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

Al-Juffali v. Estrada (Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs Intervening)

415

Immunity — Immunity from suit — International Organizations Immunities Act 1945 — Privileges and immunities of international organizations comparable to those enjoyed by foreign governments — Whether international organizations enjoying absolute or limited immunity under United States Federal law — Whether restrictive immunity meaning unlimited exposure to suit — Whether International Finance Corporation enjoying absolute immunity from suit — United States, Supreme Court

Jam and Others v. International Finance Corporation

672

Nationality

Statelessness — United Nations Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, 1961 — Article 8 — British nationality — British Nationality Act 1981, Section 40(2) — Interpretation — Whether a person can be deprived of his status as a British citizen on the basis of repudiating his obligation of loyalty — Whether a person can be deprived of nationality on that basis if not posing a risk to national security — Dual nationality — Terrorism — Individual serving long prison sentence in third State — Whether capable of posing current threat — England, Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

Pham v. Secretary of State for the Home Department

523



xxvi

DIGEST OF CASES

Recognition

States — Legal personality of a State under English law — Whether recognized as a State by United Kingdom Government — Whether Ukraine having capacity to issue bonds — Bond issuance illegal under Ukrainian law — England, Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

Ukraine v. The Law Debenture Trust Corporation Plc

445

Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law

Dealings between sovereign States — Governments — Rule of non-justiciability of dealings between sovereign States in English courts — Public policy exception — Whether public policy exception applicable — Duress — Whether defence of duress justiciable — *Jus cogens* — Use of force — Russia — Threat of force — Relationship of *jus cogens* with municipal law — England, Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

Ukraine v. The Law Debenture Trust Corporation Plc

445

International humanitarian law — Requirement that licences for arms sales not be granted by United Kingdom if clear risk that items will be used to commit serious violations of IHL — Obligation of decision-maker to carry out sufficient inquiry to assess prospective risk — Whether court could intervene to override finely balanced determination by the executive — England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court) and Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

R (Campaign Against Arms Trade) v. Secretary of State for International Trade (Amnesty International and Others Intervening)

548

Treaties — Treaty Establishing the European Stability Mechanism, 2012 — Article 4(4) — Emergency procedure — Callable capital stock — Estonia signing but not ratifying Treaty — Whether Article 4(4) of Treaty in conflict with Constitution of Estonia — Whether petitioner having competence to challenge Treaty — Principle of parliamentary democracy — Principle of parliamentary reservation — Budgetary powers of Parliament — Sovereignty clause in Constitution — Interpretation — Financial sovereignty — Whether State waiving part of its sovereignty in entering into international agreements — Democratic State subject to rule of



DIGEST OF CASES

xxvii

law — Budgetary powers — Whether interference with constitutional principles permissible — Whether Article 4(4) of Treaty in conflict with Constitution of Estonia — Estonia, Supreme Court

European Stability Mechanism Case (Case No 3-4-1-6-12)

356

Reprisals and Countermeasures

Countermeasures — Ukraine — Russia — Violation of territorial sovereignty — Whether non-repayment of bonds justified as a proportionate countermeasure — Whether doctrine of countermeasures recognized under domestic law — Relationship of international law and municipal law — England, Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

Ukraine v. The Law Debenture Trust Corporation Plc

445

Sea

Maritime delimitation — Delimitation of continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles — Role and function of Commission on the Limits of the Continental Shelf ("CLCS") — Delineation not delimitation — Article 76 of United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 ("UNCLOS") — Delimitation of continental shelf governed by Article 83 of UNCLOS — Whether obligation to obtain recommendation by CLCS before International Court of Justice could delimit continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles — International Court of Justice

Questions of the Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Nicaragua and Colombia beyond 200 Nautical Miles from the Nicaraguan Coast (Nicaragua v. Colombia) (Preliminary Objections)

1

State Immunity

Jurisdiction — Procedure — Service of process on foreign State — Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act 1976 — Section 1608 — Service of process on minister of foreign affairs — Whether service at embassy of foreign State constituting adequate service — Whether service of process must be mailed to foreign minister in foreign State — Service via embassy of foreign State — United States Supreme Court

Republic of Sudan v. Harrison and Others

698



xxviii

DIGEST OF CASES

State Responsibility

Peremptory norms — Obligation not to recognize situations created in violation of peremptory norms — International Law Commission, Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts, 2001, Article 41(2) — Customary status of Article 41(2) — Whether Austria having an obligation not to recognize incorporation of Crimea — Austria, Higher Regional Court Linz

Crimea Annexation Case (Case 9 Bs 269/16x)

350

Territory

Annexation — Occupation — Treaties — Treaty between Russian Federation and Republic of Crimea on Accession of Republic of Crimea to Russian Federation and on Forming New Constituent Entities within Russian Federation of 18 March 2014 — Legal status of Crimea under international law — Whether incorporation of Crimea by Russian Federation lawful under international law — Whether sovereign acts by Russian authorities for or pertaining to Crimea valid under international law — Austria, Higher Regional Court Linz

Crimea Annexation Case (Case 9 Bs 269/16x)

350

Treaties

Denunciation — Effect — Interpretation — American Treaty on Pacific Settlement, 1948 ("Pact of Bogotá") — Whether Article XXXI of Pact of Bogotá remaining in force on date of application — Effect of second paragraph of Article LVI — Transmission of notification — One-year period between denunciation and termination of Pact — Institution of proceedings during one-year period — Object and purpose of Pact — A contrario interpretation — Effet utile principle — Whether applicable — Travaux préparatoires — Whether Court having jurisdiction by means of Article XXXI of Pact of Bogotá — Whether necessary for Court to consider other bases of jurisdiction — International Court of Justice

Questions of the Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Nicaragua and Colombia beyond 200 Nautical Miles from the Nicaraguan Coast (Nicaragua v. Colombia) (Preliminary Objections)

I



DIGEST OF CASES

xxix

Legal effects — 2014 Accession Treaty between Russian Federation and Republic of Crimea — Territorial scope of European Convention on Extradition, 1957 — Whether treaties between Russian Federation and Austria extending to Crimea — Austria, Higher Regional Court Linz

Crimea Annexation Case (Case 9 Bs 269/16x)

350

Treaty Establishing the European Stability Mechanism, 2012 — Whether satisfying requirements of Article 2(1)(a) of Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969 — Article 4(4) of Treaty — Emergency procedure — Callable capital stock — Constitutionality of Treaty — Whether petitioner having competence to challenge Treaty — Financial sovereignty — Whether State waiving part of its sovereignty in entering into international agreements — Democratic State subject to rule of law — Budgetary powers — Whether interference with constitutional principles permissible — Whether Article 4(4) of Treaty in conflict with Constitution of Estonia — Estonia, Supreme Court

European Stability Mechanism Case (Case No 3-4-1-6-12)

356

Treaty on European Union, 2009 — Treaty on Functioning of the European Union, 2009 — Further delegation of powers — Necessity of referendum on more extensive integration — Estonia, Supreme Court

European Stability Mechanism Case (Case No 3-4-1-6-12)

356

War and Armed Conflict

Force — Use or threat of force — Charter of the United Nations, 1945, Article 2(4) — Prohibition of the use or threat of force a peremptory norm — Whether conduct of Russian Federation in relation to Crimea violating prohibition — Austria, Higher Regional Court Linz

Crimea Annexation Case (Case 9 Bs 269/16x)

350

Mixed international and internal armed conflict — International humanitarian law — Conflict in Yemen — Whether Saudi Arabia in breach of IHL obligations — Consequences of non-compliance with IHL on licensing of arms sales from United Kingdom to Saudi Arabia — Rationality standard to assess whether clear risk of non-compliance with IHL obligations in the



XXX

DIGEST OF CASES

War and Armed Conflict (cont.)

future — Whether rational to dismiss evidence from external agencies pointing to breaches of IHL violations by Saudi Arabia — Whether "serious violations" synonymous with "war crimes" and "grave breaches" — England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court) and Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

R (Campaign Against Arms Trade) v. Secretary of State for International Trade (Amnesty International and Others Intervening)

548



TABLE OF TREATIES

This table contains a list, in chronological order according to the date of signature, of the treaties referred to in the decisions printed in the present volume. It has not been possible to draw a helpful distinction between treaties judicially considered and treaties which are merely cited.

In the case of bilateral treaties, the names of the parties are given in alphabetical order. Names of countries follow contemporaneous usage except in the case of small spelling changes (e.g. Roumania/Romania) where modern usage is adopted throughout. Where this seems helpful, the name of a treaty as it is commonly known is included.

Wherever possible, each treaty includes a reference to where an online English-language version of the treaty can be found. For treaties between 1648 and 1919, this is almost always the Consolidated Treaty Series (CTS), under Oxford Historical Treaties on the Oxford Public International Law website. Post-1919, references are most frequently to the League of Nations Treaty Series/United Nations Treaty Series (LNTS/UNTS). Here it should be noted that historically LNTS/UNTS references have taken the form "39 UNTS 55", 39 being the volume number, 55 the page number. With effect from UNTS volume 2301, UNTS no longer includes the volume and page number as part of the reference, using simply the registration number. UNTS references are now in the form UNTS 42146. For ILR purposes, because of its value as an identifier, the registration number is now being added parenthetically to pre-volume 2301 treaties in the form 213 UNTS 221 [UNTS 2889].

Reference is also made to other treaty databases such as the European Treaty Series (ETS), Organization of American States Treaty Series (OASTS) or to Official Journals, particularly where these are the only databases currently hosting a treaty. Where a treaty appears to be available only on the website of the parent international organization, usually without any citation identifier, users are referred to the relevant website. For bilateral treaties, often the only source it has been possible to find is a non-English-language version on one of the parties' official websites, such as the parliamentary proceedings approving the treaty. Users requiring a comprehensive list of written sources should refer to the CTS, or to the Flare Index to Treaties, available at IALS Digital.

For abbreviations used in the Table of Treaties reference should be made to the table of abbreviations attached to the index in individual volumes.

1929	
Jan. 5	General Treaty of Inter-American Arbitration (130 LNTS 135 [LNTS 2988])
	Art. 920-

xxxi



xxxii	TABLE OF TREATIES
Jan. 5	General Treaty of Inter-American Conciliation (100 LNTS 401 [LNTS 2309]) Art. 16
1945	
June 26	Charter of the United Nations (https://treaties.un.org/) (UNTS registration number "not available") Chapter I Art. 2(4)
June 26	Statute of the International Court of Justice (https://treaties.un.org/) (UNTS registration number "not available") Chapter I Art. 31(3) 13 Chapter II Art. 34(3) 13-14 Art. 36(2) 20, 22-4, 30 Chapter III Art. 40(2) 13 Art. 40(3) 12 Art. 59 34-5, 47-8, 88-5 Art. 60 34-5, 43, 47-8 Art. 63(1) 13-14
1947	
Nov. 21	Convention on the Privileges and Immunities of the Specialized Agencies of the United Nations (SAPIC) (33 UNTS 261 [33 UNTS 521])
1948 Apr. 30	American Treaty on Pacific Settlement (Pact of Bogotá) (30 UNTS 55 [UNTS 449]) Preamble



	TABLE OF TREATIES	xxxiii
	Art. VIII Chapter 5 (judicial procedure) Art. XXXI	2, 43-4, 70-1 29-30 29-30 22 22 21-32, 122-4 123-4
Apr. 30	Charter of the Organization of American States (OA (119 UNTS 4 [UNTS 1609]) (as amended by the I Buenos Aires (1967), the Protocol of Cartagena de In the Protocol of Washington (1992) and the Protoco Managua (1993)) (available at: https://www.refworld3ae6b3624.html) Part I, Chapter V (Pacific Settlement of Disputes) Art. 27	Protocol of ndias (1985), l of l.org/docid/
1950		
Nov. 4	European Convention for the Protection of Human and Fundamental Freedoms (ECHR), Fourth Protoc (16 December 1963) (ETS 46) Art. 2 Art. 4 180, 257-71, 282 Note: entries relating to Convention itself after 1 Novem to be found under that date below.	col 213 -4, 287-316
1957		
Dec. 13	European Convention on Extradition (359 UNTS 273 [UNTS 5146]) Art. 1	353-5
1961		
Apr. 18	Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations (VCD (500 UNTS 95 [UNTS 7312]) Art. 8(1)	420-1



xxxiv	TABLE OF TREATIES
	Art. 31 420-1 Art. 38 418 Art. 38(1) 420-1, 435-44 Art. 39 418, 420-1, 425 Art. 39(1) 420-1, 426-7 Art. 43 420-1, 425-6
Aug. 30	Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness (989 UNTS 175 [989 UNTS 1518])
1966 Dec. 16	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) (999 UNTS 171 [UNTS 14668]) Art. 2
Dec. 16	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Optional Protocol 1 (999 UNTS 171 [UNTS 14668]) Art. 5(2)(a)
1968 Nov. 28	Intergovernmental Maritime Consultative Organization (IMCO) (later the International Maritime Organization (IMO))–UK, Headquarters Agreement (677 UNTS 3 [UNTS 9632]) including amendments by Exchange of Notes dated 20 January 1982 and 4/23 January 2002 (Cmnd 5473)
1969 May 23	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (VCLT) (1155 UNTS 331 [UNTS 18232]) Art. 26



	TABLE OF TREATIES XXX
	Art. 31(1) 20 Art. 31(3)(b) 30-1 Arts. 31-3 19-21, 24-31 Art. 32 20-1, 307 Art. 34 84-5 Arts. 34-6 116-17, 122 Art. 39 377-8 Art. 44(1) 124
Nov. 22	American Convention on Human Rights (ACHR) (1144 UNTS 123 [UNTS 17512]) Art. 22(9)
1975	
Mar. 14	Vienna Convention on the Representation of States in their Relations with International Organizations of a Universal Character (UN doc. A/Conf 67/16; 1975 UNJYB 87; 69 AJIL 730) (not in force/no UNTS registration number) 434 Art. 1(1)(2) 433-4 Art. 1(1)(18) 433-4 Art. 2(1) 433-4 Art. 30 433-4
1981	
June 26	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights (ACHPR) (1520 UNTS 218 [UNTS 26363]) Art. 12(5)
1000	
1982 Dec. 10	UN Convention on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS) (1833 UNTS 3 [UNTS 31363]) Part VI Art. 76
	Art. 76(1) . 43-6, 37-64, 81-2, 83, 89-96, 111-12, 118-22 Art. 76(8) 38-42, 46-8, 60-9, 85-6, 109-11, 117-22 Art. 76(10)
	Art. 136
	Annex II (Commission on the Limits of the Continental Shelf Art. 3(1)(a)
	Art. 9



xxxvi

TABLE OF TREATIES

1998	
Nov. 1	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1950) as amended by Protocol 11, effective as of 1 November 1998 (ECHR) (213 UNTS 221 [UNTS 2889]) Art. 3
2000 Dec. 7	European Charter of Fundamental Rights (CFR) (OJ 2000 C364/01) Art. 19(1)
2007	
Dec. 13	Treaty of Lisbon amending the Treaty on European Union (TEU) (OJ 2010 C83/1) Art. 3(4)
Dec. 13	Treaty of Lisbon on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU) (OJ 2012 C326/47) Part I, Title I Categories and Areas of Community Competence Art. 3(1)(c)



TABLE OF TREATIES

xxxvii

	Part III Union Policies and Internal Actions, Title VIII
	Economic and Monetary Policy, Chapter 1 Economic Policy
	Art. 120
	Part III Union Policies and Internal Actions, Title VIII
	Economic and Monetary Policy, Chapter 2 Monetary Policy
	Art. 127(1)
	Part III Union Policies and Internal Actions, Title VIII
	Economic and Monetary Policy, Chapter 4 Provisions Specific to
	Member States Whose Currency Is the Euro
	Art. 136 390-1
2012	
Feb. 2	Treaty Establishing the European Stabilization Mechanism
100. 2	(EMS Treaty) (https://www.esm.europa.eu/legal-documents/
	esm-treaty)
	Preamble 5
	Preamble 6 365, 391, 403
	Art. 3 380, 389, 403
	Art. 8(1)
	Art. 8(2)
	Art. 8(4)
	Ant. 0(4)
	Art. 8(5)
	Art. 9
	Art. 9(2)
	Art. 9(3) 365, 376-7
	Art. 10(1)
	Art. 12(1)
	Art. 13(1)
	Art. 13(3)
	Art. 13(6)
	Art. 25
	Art. 25(1)
	Art. 25(2)
	Art. 25(3) 365
	Arts. 28-9
	Art. 37(3)
	Art. 41(1)
	Art. 41(2)
	Art. 42(1)
	Art. 48
Mar. 2	Treaty on Stability, Coordination and Governance in the
	Economic and Monetary Union (Fiscal Stability Treaty) (TSCG)
	(https://www.consilium.europa.eu/media/20399/st00tscg26_en12.pdf)
	Preamble 4
	Art. 3
	ин. Э 300

