

INTERNATIONAL  
LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 193

*Volumes published under the title:*

**ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS  
 OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES**

- |                   |   |   |
|-------------------|---|---|
| Vol. 1 (1919-22)  | } | Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, KC,<br>and H. Lauterpacht, LLD |
| Vol. 2 (1923-24)  |   |   |
| Vol. 3 (1925-26)  | } | Edited by Arnold D. McNair, CBE, LLD,<br>and H. Lauterpacht, LLD    |
| Vol. 4 (1927-28)  |   |   |
| Vol. 5 (1929-30)  | } | Edited by H. Lauterpacht, QC, LLD, FBA                              |
| Vol. 6 (1931-32)  |   |   |
| Vol. 7 (1933-34)  |   |   |
| Vol. 8 (1935-37)  |   |   |
| Vol. 9 (1938-40)  |   |   |
| Vol. 10 (1941-42) |   |   |
| Vol. 11 (1919-42) |   |   |
| Vol. 12 (1943-45) |   |   |
| Vol. 13 (1946)    |   |   |
| Vol. 14 (1947)    |   |   |
| Vol. 15 (1948)    |   |   |
| Vol. 16 (1949)    |   |   |

*Volumes published under the title:*

**INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS**

- |  |   |   |
|--|---|---|
| Vol. 17 (1950)   | } | Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, QC, LLD, FBA  |
| Vol. 18 (1951)   |   |   |
| Vol. 19 (1952)   |   |   |
| Vol. 20 (1953)   |   |   |
| Vol. 21 (1954)   |   |   |
| Vol. 22 (1955)   |   |   |
| Vol. 23 (1956)   |   |   |
| Vol. 24 (1957)   |   | Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, QC, LLD, FBA,<br>and E. Lauterpacht                               |
| Vol. 25 (1958-I)   | } | Edited by E. Lauterpacht, QC  |
| Vol. 26 (1958-II)  |   |   |
| Vols. 27-68 <i>and</i> Consolidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1-35 <i>and</i> 36-45  |   | Edited by E. Lauterpacht, QC  |
| Vols. 69-150 <i>and</i> Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and<br>Treaties to Vols. 1-80, Vols. 81-100 <i>and</i> Vols. 1-125 |   | Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, CBE, QC,<br>and Sir Christopher Greenwood, CMG, QC                 |
| Vols. 151-68 <i>and</i> Consolidated Index and Consolidated Table of Treaties to<br>Vols. 1-160  |   | Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, CBE, QC, LLD,<br>Sir Christopher Greenwood, CMG, QC, and K. L. Lee |
| Vols. 169-93   |   | Edited by Sir Christopher Greenwood, GBE, CMG, QC,<br>and K. L. Lee                                 |

*Lauterpacht Centre for International Law  
University of Cambridge*

# INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME  
193

*Edited by*

SIR CHRISTOPHER GREENWOOD, GBE, CMG, QC  
*Member of the Iran–United States Claims Tribunal  
Bencher of Middle Temple  
Formerly Judge of the International Court of Justice*

*and*

KAREN LEE  
*Fellow of the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge  
Vice-Mistress and Fellow of Girton College, Cambridge*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-49570-7 – International Law Reports  
Edited by Christopher Greenwood, Karen Lee  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.  
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108495707](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108495707)  
DOI: 10.1017/9781108862684

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

ISBN 978-1-108-49570-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy  
of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication  
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
accurate or appropriate.

## CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
PREFACE	vii
EDITORIAL NOTE	ix
TABLE OF CASES (alphabetical)	xiii
TABLE OF CASES (according to courts and countries)	xv
DIGEST (main headings)	xvii
DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 193	xix
TABLE OF TREATIES	xxix
REPORTS OF CASES	1
INDEX	637

## PREFACE

The present volume contains both international and national jurisprudence relating to the environment, human rights and the rights of indigenous peoples. It includes orders on provisional measures and the judgment on merits and reparations of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights in *Sarayaku People v. Ecuador* as well as the Court's Advisory Opinion OC-23/17 on *Environmental Obligations of States Arising from Duty to Protect Human Rights*. International jurisprudence is further reflected in the Views of the United Nations Human Rights Committee in *Poma Poma v. Peru*, *Portillo Cáceres v. Paraguay* and *Teitiota v. New Zealand*. National jurisprudence is reflected in decisions from Australia (*Akiba*), Canada (*First Nation of Nacho Nyak Dun*), Colombia (*Lozano Barragán*), England (*Plan B Earth*) and the Netherlands (*Urgenda*).

The Editors wish to thank the many people whose work has made this volume possible. Ms Caroline Kimeu undertook the significant task of summarizing the cases from the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, *Teitiota* and *First Nation*. Dr Natalie Jones prepared the summary of *Plan B Earth* and *Urgenda*. Mr Gustavo Guarín and Dr Maciej Żenkiewicz prepared the unofficial translation and summary of the case from Colombia. Dr Stephen Tully wrote the summary of *Akiba* and Dr Monica Vlad contributed to the summary of *Poma Poma*. Ms Karen Lee summarized *Portillo Cáceres* and saw the volume through the press. Ms Isabelle I'Anson, the ILR Editorial Assistant, prepared the Tables of Cases and Digest. Miss Maureen MacGlashan, CMG, compiled the Table of Treaties and Index. Mrs Diane Ilott checked the copy and Mr Jack Webb read the proofs.

The Editors are very grateful to the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, the United Nations Human Rights Committee, the High Court of Australia, the Supreme Court of Canada and the Supreme Court of the Netherlands for kindly permitting these *Reports* to use the electronic files of the relevant judgments posted on their official websites. The judgment from England published in this volume carries Crown copyright and contains public sector information licensed under the Open Government Licence v3.0; the electronic file was sourced from the British and Irish Legal Information Institute Website.

Finally, our thanks go to all the others who have worked to complete this volume, particularly our publishers, Cambridge University Press, and typesetters, SPi, and their staff.

C. J. GREENWOOD

LAUTERPACHT CENTRE  
FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW,  
UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

K. L. LEE

LAUTERPACHT CENTRE  
FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW,  
UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

*September 2020*

## EDITORIAL NOTE

The *International Law Reports* endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the *Reports* will include cases which bear on the exception of “political offences” or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

### DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

The *Reports* seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or ad hoc arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of Justice of the European Union). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

*Human rights cases.* The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the *Reports* to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the *Reports* will continue to publish decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as “views” of the United Nations Human Rights Committee. Decisions of national courts on the application of conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human rights law or a matter of wider interest to public



international lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

*International arbitrations.* The *Reports* of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these *Reports* are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see *Yearbook Commercial Arbitration* (ed. Stephan W. Schill, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration).) But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, *force majeure*) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

#### DECISIONS OF NATIONAL TRIBUNALS

A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

#### EDITORIAL TREATMENT OF MATERIALS

The basic policy of the Editors is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is no part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.

#### PRESENTATION OF MATERIALS

For reproduction of material in this volume, electronic files have been used wherever possible and their source acknowledged in the Preface. Citations of the reports in which the case may be found are listed in the “Report” section in square brackets at the end of the case; the language of the original decision is also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body of the text indicate the pagination of the original report where included.

#### NOTES

*Footnotes.* Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

*Other notes.* References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

#### DIGEST OF CASES

With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the *Reports* are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at p. xvii.

#### CONSOLIDATED INDEX AND TABLES

A Consolidated Index and a Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 1-80 were published in two volumes in 1990 and 1991. A further volume containing the Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 81-100 was published in 1996. A Consolidated Index, a Consolidated Tables of Cases and a Consolidated Table of Treaties for volumes 1-125 were published in 2004. A Consolidated Index and a Consolidated Table of Treaties for volumes 1-160 were published in 2017. Volume 190 contains Consolidated Tables of Cases for volumes 126-190.