

DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 193

	<i>Page</i>
Aliens	
Treaties — United Nations Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, 1951 — Bases for protection under Convention — Whether environmental degradation providing basis for protection — New Zealand deporting asylum seeker fleeing effects of climate change — Whether New Zealand violating Article 6 of International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee	
<i>Teitiota v. New Zealand (Communication No 2728/2016)</i>	361
Damages	
Reparation — Adequate compensation — Effective and thorough investigation — Criminal and administrative penalties — Harm caused by environmental pollution — Obligation on State to provide authors of complaint with effective remedy — Article 2 (3)(a) of Covenant — United Nations Human Rights Committee	
<i>Portillo Cáceres and Others v. Paraguay (Communication No 2751/2016)</i>	332
Reparation — Reparation commensurate to harm sustained — Obligation on State to provide authors of complaint with effective remedy — Article 2(3)(a) of International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee	
<i>Poma Poma v. Peru (Communication No 1457/2006)</i>	317
Environment	
Alleged damage to ecosystem — Indigenous community land — Degradation of author's land due to water diversion operations — Indigenous peoples — Rights of minorities — Right to enjoy own culture — Traditional customs — Whether State Party violating its obligations under Article 27 of International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee	
<i>Poma Poma v. Peru (Communication No 1457/2006)</i>	317

Environment (*cont.*)

Climate change — Sea level rise — United Nations Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, 1951 — Whether environmental degradation providing basis for protection under Refugee Convention or protected person jurisdiction — United Nations Human Rights Committee

Teitiota v. New Zealand (Communication No 2728/2016) 361

Natural resources — Oil exploitation — State obligation to consult indigenous peoples on development projects impacting their territory — Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, 1989 (ILO Convention No 169) — Whether obligation to consult applying to contract concluded before ratification of ILO Convention No 169 — Whether obligation to consult a treaty obligation or general principle of international law — Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Kichwa Indigenous People of Sarayaku v. Ecuador (Provisional Measures Orders) (Merits and Reparations) 1

Pollution — Environmental rights — Recognition — Crop fumigation with agrochemicals — Infringement of domestic environmental laws — Impact on people's lives — International tribunals recognizing link between environment and human rights — Whether environmental degradation adversely affecting enjoyment of right to life — Whether environmental degradation constituting violations of private and family life and the home — Whether effective investigation into environmental pollution — United Nations Human Rights Committee

Portillo Cáceres and Others v. Paraguay (Communication No 2751/2016) 332

State obligations in relation to environmental protection — American Convention on Human Rights, 1969 — Scope of the word “jurisdiction” under Article 1(1) of American Convention for purposes of determining State responsibility — Convention for the Protection and Development of the Marine Environment in the Wider Caribbean Region, 1983 — State obligations under special environmental protection treaty regimes — Whether special environmental protection treaty regimes establishing extraterritorial jurisdiction for purposes of States Parties' obligations under American Convention — Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Environmental Obligations of States Arising from Duty to Protect Human Rights (Advisory Opinion OC-23/17) 182

Territory — Whether territories “subject of rights” — Prevalence of general interest — Duty to protect natural wealth of nation — Ecological function of private property — Natural parks as inalienable, imprescriptible and unattachable — Sustainable development — Collective rights and interests — Colombian Constitutional Court Judgment C-431 of 2000 — Amazon Cooperation Treaty, 1978 — precautionary principle — Principle of intergenerational equity — Principle of solidarity — Colombia, Supreme Court of Justice

Lozano Barragán and Others v. Presidency of the Republic of Colombia and Others 443

Treaties — Climate change — Greenhouse gases — Paris Agreement, 2015 — Whether failure to take Paris Agreement into account vitiating decision to designate third runway — Whether Directive 2001/42/EC requiring unincorporated international agreements to be taken into account — England, Court of Appeal

R (Plan B Earth) v. Secretary of State for Transport; R (Friends of the Earth Ltd) v. Secretary of State for Transport; R (London Borough of Hillingdon and Others) v. Secretary of State for Transport 535

Treaties — Interpretation — Climate change — United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, 1992 — Annex I — Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change — Greenhouse gases — Emissions reduction targets — Whether Netherlands obliged to reduce greenhouse gas emissions in line with Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change scenario — Treaty interpretation — The Netherlands, Supreme Court

The Netherlands v. Stichting Urgenda 478

Human Rights

Article 26 of American Convention on Human Rights, 1969 — State obligation of progressive realization of rights implicit in the economic, social, educational, scientific and cultural standards in Charter of the Organization of American States, 1948 — Whether rights under Article 26 justiciable — Right to a healthy environment — Whether right to a healthy environment encompassed by Article 26 — Whether right to a healthy environment an autonomous right — Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Environmental Obligations of States Arising from Duty to Protect Human Rights (Advisory Opinion OC-23/17) 182

Human Rights (*cont.*)

Environmental rights — Deforestation of Colombian Amazon forest — Protection of human rights — Right to a healthy environment — Right to life — Right to health — Colombian action of protection (“*acción de tutela*”) of human rights — Whether appropriate mechanism for applicants to protect their rights — Climate change — Effects — International and national instruments for protection of environment — Whether Amazon an entity “subject of rights” — Whether defendants failing to protect applicants’ rights — Whether defendants violating Paris Agreement on Climate Change and Colombian Law 1753 of 2015 — Colombia, Supreme Court of Justice

Lozano Barragán and Others v. Presidency of the Republic of Colombia and Others

443

Human rights and the environment — Articles 4(1) and 5(1) of American Convention on Human Rights, 1969 — Right to life — Right to personal integrity — State environmental protection obligations for protection of rights to life and personal integrity — Obligation of prevention — Precautionary principle — Obligation of cooperation — Procedural obligations — Access to information — Public participation — Access to justice — Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Environmental Obligations of States Arising from Duty to Protect Human Rights (Advisory Opinion OC-23/17)

182

Obligation of States to protect rights of persons under their jurisdiction — American Convention on Human Rights, 1969 — Scope of obligation under Article 1(1) — Right to property — Right to life — Right to freedom of movement and residence — Right to personal integrity — Obligation to adopt domestic legal measures — Whether Ecuador’s oil exploitation project in Sarayaku territory violating indigenous peoples’ rights under American Convention — Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Kichwa Indigenous People of Sarayaku v. Ecuador (Provisional Measures Orders) (Merits and Reparations)

1

Right to a healthy environment — Environmental rights — Action of protection (“*acción de tutela*”) in Colombia to protect human rights — Article 86 of Colombian Constitution — Popular action (“*acción popular*”) to protect human rights — Article 88 of Colombian Constitution — Right to life expectancy — Environmental protection — Right to enjoy a

healthy environment, life and health — Relationship of environment and ecosystem with fundamental rights of life and health, and with human dignity — Fundamental rights to access water, breathe clean air, and enjoy healthy environment — Right not to be sick due to environmental degradation — Right to fresh water — Right to environmental sanitation — Colombia, Supreme Court of Justice

Lozano Barragán and Others v. Presidency of the Republic of Colombia and Others

443

Right to life — Asylum seeker fleeing effects of climate change — Deportation of asylum seeker — Admissibility of author's complaint — Article 5(2)(a) and (b) of Optional Protocol to International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — Whether same matter being examined under another international procedure — Whether failure to exhaust domestic remedies — Whether *prima facie* case established — Victim status — Whether New Zealand violating Article 6 of Covenant by deporting asylum seeker fleeing effects of climate change — United Nations Human Rights Committee

Teitiota v. New Zealand (Communication No 2728/2016)

361

Right to life — Right to life with dignity — Conditions in society threatening those rights — Environmental pollution — Right to freedom from arbitrary or unlawful interference with privacy, family or home — Whether States Parties obliged to adopt positive measures to ensure effective exercise of this right — Whether degradation of environment constituting violations of private and family life and the home — Right to an effective remedy — Admissibility of authors' complaint — Article 5(2)(a) and (b) of Optional Protocol to International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — Whether same matter being examined under another international procedure — Whether failure to exhaust domestic remedies — Whether Paraguay violating its obligations under Articles 6, 7 and 17, read alone and in conjunction with Article 2(3), of Covenant — United Nations Human Rights Committee

Portillo Cáceres and Others v. Paraguay (Communication No 2751/2016)

332

Treaties — Interpretation — Application — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — Article 2 — Right to life — Article 8 — Right to private and family life — Climate change — Greenhouse gases — Emissions reduction targets — Whether Netherlands having positive obligation to reduce

Human Rights (*cont.*)

greenhouse gas emissions — Principle of effective interpretation of treaties — Right to effective protection — The Netherlands, Supreme Court

The Netherlands v. Stichting Urgenda

478

Tribunals — United Nations Human Rights Committee — Minority rights — Indigenous peoples — Members of indigenous community constituting a minority — Author member of ethnic minority — Right to enjoy own culture — Indigenous peoples — Indigenous community land in the Andes in Peru — State project to divert water from Andes to provide water for city of Tacna — Community land in the Andes — Degradation of author's land — Death of livestock — State activities — Whether substantially compromising or interfering with culturally significant economic activities of a minority — Right of minority to participate in decision-making process — Proportionality — Right to effective remedy — Admissibility of author's complaint — Article 5(2)(a) of Optional Protocol to International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — Whether same matter being examined under another international procedure — Whether referral to Commission on Human Rights constituting another international procedure within meaning of Article 5(2)(a) — Whether State Party violating its obligations under Articles 27 and 2(3)(a) of Covenant — United Nations Human Rights Committee

Poma Poma v. Peru (Communication No 14571/2006)

317

International Tribunals

Jurisdiction — Advisory jurisdiction — Extent of jurisdiction — Whether advisory jurisdiction restricted by related petitions before Inter-American Commission on Human Rights — Whether advisory jurisdiction restricted by related contentious cases before International Court of Justice — Question posed — Whether Court empowered to reformulate question — Admissibility — Whether Request meeting formal and substantive requirements — Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Environmental Obligations of States Arising from Duty to Protect Human Rights (Advisory Opinion OC-23/17)

182

Jurisdiction

Human rights protection — Collective rights — Appropriate mechanism to protect applicants' rights — *Acción de tutela* — Whether appropriate for protection of collective rights and interests — Whether protection of environment entailing safeguarding of supra-legal individual guarantees — Whether minors can bring claim without representation — Colombia, Supreme Court of Justice

Lozano Barragán and Others v. Presidency of the Republic of Colombia and Others

443

Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law

Treaties — Paris Agreement on Climate Change, 2015 — Other international instruments — International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966 — Convention on the Prohibition of Military or Any Other Hostile Use of Environmental Modification Techniques, 1976 — Protocol I additional to Geneva Conventions relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts, 1977 — 1972 Stockholm Declaration — United Nations Environment Programme — United Nations Conference on Environment and Development held in Rio de Janeiro, 1992 — United Nations Commission on Sustainable Development — Rio Declaration on Environment and Development — Principles for a Global Consensus on the Management, Conservation and Sustainable Development of All Types of Forests — Convention on Biological Diversity, 1992 — United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, 1992 — Colombian Law 1844 of 2017 approving Paris Agreement — Colombian Law 1753 of 2015 — Constitution of Colombia — Whether Colombia violating its obligations under international and national law — Whether defendants failing to protect applicants' rights — Whether defendants violating Paris Agreement on Climate Change and Law 1753 of 2015 — Colombia, Supreme Court of Justice

Lozano Barragán and Others v. Presidency of the Republic of Colombia and Others

443

Treaties — Treaty not incorporated into municipal law — Whether minister required to take treaty into account — Paris Agreement on Climate Change, 2015 — Decision to designate third runway at Heathrow Airport — Airports National Policy Statement — Planning Act 2008 — Directive 2001/42/EC —

Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law (*cont.*)

Paris Agreement not taken into account — Whether Secretary of State obliged to take Paris Agreement into account — Whether taking Paris Agreement into account would give effect to unincorporated international agreement in domestic law — England, Court of Appeal

R (Plan B Earth) v. Secretary of State for Transport; R (Friends of the Earth Ltd) v. Secretary of State for Transport; R (London Borough of Hillingdon and Others) v. Secretary of State for Transport 535

Treaties — United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, 1992 — Decisions of Conference of the Parties — Whether having effect in interpretation and application of domestic law — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — Right to life — Right to private and family life — The Netherlands, Supreme Court

The Netherlands v. Stichting Urgenda 478

Sea

Native title — Native title rights in relation to waters including accessing and taking resources for any purpose — Native Title Act 1993 (Cth) — Whether successive legislation which prohibited taking fish and other aquatic life for commercial purposes without licence inconsistent with that right — Extinguishment — Australia, High Court

Akiba on Behalf of the Torres Strait Regional Seas Claim Group v. Commonwealth of Australia and Others 389

Territorial sea — Reciprocal access and use rights recognized in Islander society arising out of personal relationships — Whether reciprocal rights “native title rights and interests” — Australia, High Court

Akiba on Behalf of the Torres Strait Regional Seas Claim Group v. Commonwealth of Australia and Others 389

State Responsibility

Partial responsibility — Climate change — Human rights — Global problem — Treaties — United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, 1992 — Paris Agreement,

2015 — Whether Netherlands partially responsible for reducing global greenhouse gas emissions — Individual responsibility — The Netherlands, Supreme Court

The Netherlands v. Stichting Urgenda 478

Wrongful acts — Wrongful acts resulting in environmental damage and human rights violations — State responsibility for wrongful acts of third parties within jurisdiction — Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Environmental Obligations of States Arising from Duty to Protect Human Rights (Advisory Opinion OC-23/17) 182

Territory

Agreement recognizing traditional territories of First Nations in Yukon portion of the Peel Watershed, and their right to participate in management of public resources in that area — Canada, Supreme Court

First Nation of Nacho Nyak Dun and Others v. Government of Yukon 422

Whether territories “subject of rights” — Human rights — Environmental rights — Deforestation of Colombian Amazon forest — Ecocentric anthropic society — Whether Amazon an entity “subject of rights” — Colombia, Supreme Court of Justice

Lozano Barragán and Others v. Presidency of the Republic of Colombia and Others 443

Treaties

Nature of treaty — Interpretation — Treaty rights — Agreement between Canada, First Nations and Government of Yukon establishing consultative process for development of land use plans in Yukon portion of the Peel Watershed — Umbrella Final Agreement between Government of Canada, Council for Yukon Indians and Government of Yukon, 1993 — Whether subject to international law principles for treaty interpretation — Whether Yukon Government’s approval of proposed land use plan contravening consultative process set out in agreement — Modern treaties — Role of courts in resolving disputes concerning modern treaty implementation — Canada, Supreme Court

First Nation of Nacho Nyak Dun and Others v. Government of Yukon 422