

RELIGIOUS VIOLENCE IN THE ANCIENT WORLD

Much like our world today, Late Antiquity (fourth to seventh century CE) is often seen as a period rife with religious violence, not least because the literary sources are full of stories of Christians attacking temples, statues and 'pagans'. However, using insights from Religious Studies, recent studies have demonstrated that the Late Antique sources disguise a much more intricate reality. The present volume builds on this recent cutting-edge scholarship on religious violence in Late Antiquity in order to come to more nuanced judgements about the nature of the violence. At the same time, the focus on Late Antiquity has taken away from the fact that the phenomenon was no less prevalent in the earlier Graeco-Roman world. This book is therefore also the first to bring together scholars with expertise ranging from classical Athens to Late Antiquity to examine the phenomenon in all its complexity and diversity throughout Antiquity.

JITSE H. F. DIJKSTRA is Professor of Classics at the University of Ottawa. His research centres on the process of religious transformation in Late Antiquity, in particular in its Egyptian context. He is the author of numerous studies on the subject, including the monograph *Philae and the End of Ancient Egyptian Religion: A Regional Study of Religious Transformation* (298–642 CE) (2008).

CHRISTIAN R. RASCHLE is Associate Professor of Roman History at the Université de Montréal. He specialises in the history of the administration and political system of the Roman empire, especially the reorganisation of its provinces in Late Antiquity, and themes in the cultural history of the first century CE (Lucan).





RELIGIOUS VIOLENCE IN THE ANCIENT WORLD

From Classical Athens to Late Antiquity

EDITED BY
JITSE H. F. DIJKSTRA

University of Ottawa

and

CHRISTIAN R. RASCHLE

Université de Montréal





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108494908 DOI: 10.1017/9781108860215

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Dijkstra, Jitse H. F., 1976— editor. | Raschle, Christian Rudolf, 1970— editor.

TITLE: Religious violence in the ancient world: from classical Athens to late antiquity / edited by Jitse H. F. Dijkstra, University of Ottawa, Christian R. Raschle,

Université de Montréal.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY, USA: Cambridge
University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020006658 (print) | LCCN 2020006659 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108494908
(hardback) | ISBN 9781108816557 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108860215 (epub)
SUBJECTS: LCSH: Violence–Religious aspects–History.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC BL65.V55 R566 2020 (print) | LCC BL65.V55 (ebook) |

DDC 201/.76332093–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020006658 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020006659

ISBN 978-1-108-49490-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Acı	knowledgements	<i>page</i> viii	
	t of Contributors	X	
	A Note on Abbreviations		
	eneral Introduction e H. F. Dijkstra and Christian R. Raschle	I	
PΑ	RT I METHODOLOGY	Ι5	
Ι	Sacred Prefigurations of Violence: Religious Communities in Situations of Conflict Hans G. Kippenberg	17	
2	Priestesses, Pogroms and Persecutions: Religious Violence in Antiquity in a Diachronic Perspective <i>Jan N. Bremmer</i>	46	
PΑ	RT II RELIGIOUS VIOLENCE IN THE GRAECO-ROMAN W	vorld 69	
3	Ancient Greek Binding Spells and (Political) Violence Esther Eidinow	71	
4	The Expulsion of Isis Worshippers and Astrologers from Rome in the Late Republic and Early Empire <i>Christian R. Raschle</i>	87	
5	Religious Violence? Two Massacres on a Sabbath in 66 CE: Jerusalem and Caesarea	106	



vi	Contents	
6	Religion, Violence and the Diasporic Experience: The Jewish Diaspora in Flavian Rome and Puteoli <i>Andreas Bendlin</i>	133
7	Animal Sacrifice and the Roman Persecution of Christians (Second to Third Century) <i>James B. Rives</i>	177
8	The Great Persecution and Imperial Ideology: Patterns of Communication on Tetrarchic Coinage Erika Manders	203
9	The Violent Legacy of Constantine's Militant Piety Elizabeth DePalma Digeser	228
PAR	T III RELIGIOUS VIOLENCE IN LATE ANTIQUITY	249
10	Religious Violence in Late Antiquity: Current Approaches, Trends and Issues <i>Wendy Mayer</i>	251
II	Coercion in Late Antiquity: A Brief Intellectual History Peter Van Nuffelen	266
12	Crowd Behaviour and the Destruction of the Serapeum at Alexandria in 391/392 CE Jitse H. F. Dijkstra	286
13	Violence and Monks: From a Mystical Concept to an Intolerant Practice (Fourth to Fifth Century) Fabrizio Vecoli	306
14	The Discipline of Domination: Asceticism, Violence and Monastic Curses in Theodoret's <i>Historia Religiosa Chris L. de Wet</i>	323
15	Suffering Saints: Shaping Narratives of Violence after Chalcedon Christine Shepardson	345
16	Fighting for Chalcedon: Vitalian's Rebellion against Anastasius	367

Hugh Elton



	Contents	vii
17	The Emperor, the People and Urban Violence in the Fifth and Sixth Centuries Geoffrey Greatrex	389
Inde	ex of Sources	406
General Index		123



Acknowledgements

It was during the Annual Meeting of the Classical Association of Canada on 6–9 May 2014 that we first discussed organising a conference together. Since Dijkstra was at that time preparing a large-scale research project on religious violence in Late Antique Egypt, we settled on religious violence as a timely topic that reunited both our research interests and those of our home institutions. We thus decided to organise an international workshop, which would bring together for the first time leading specialists on Graeco-Roman religions and Late Antiquity, including Religious Studies scholars, historians of religion, biblical scholars, scholars of early Christianity, classicists and ancient historians, to reflect together upon the phenomenon of religious violence throughout Antiquity.

The workshop was held under a similar title to that of the current volume at the home institutions of both editors, the Université de Montréal and the University of Ottawa, between 28 and 30 September 2017. The conference was opened (on 28 September) with a public keynote address at the Musée des Beaux-Arts, Montreal, by the distinguished historian of (ancient) religions, Jan Bremmer, who gave an overview of the phenomenon of religious violence in Antiquity illustrated by several concrete cases, thus setting the scene for the rest of the programme. Two days of lectures followed, one day in Montreal (29 September) with specialists in Graeco-Roman religions, one day in Ottawa (30 September) with those specialising in Late Antiquity. In order to disseminate the specific theme of the workshop to a wider audience, eminent scholar of contemporary religion Hans Kippenberg concluded the programme by giving a public lecture on religious violence in both its ancient and modern contexts.

We would like to thank the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC) for awarding us a Connection grant, which funded most of the workshop. Our sincere thanks also go to Les Belles Soirées de l'Université de Montréal for hosting the opening talk by



Acknowledgements

ix

Bremmer, as well as to the Faculté des arts et des sciences, the Institut des études religieuses, the Centre d'études classiques and the Département d'histoire at the Université de Montréal and the Faculty of Arts and the central administration at the University of Ottawa for additional financial support. We are also immensely grateful to the 'Religion and Diversity Project' of Lori Beaman (University of Ottawa) for co-organising the closing lecture by Kippenberg and to Her Excellency Sabine Sparwasser, Ambassador of Germany to Canada, for covering his travel costs, speaking a few words of welcome before the talk and offering the wonderful reception that followed it.

It was a joy to see graduate students from both institutions mingle at the Emerging Scholars Seminar that was held by the Association des étudiants du Centre d'études classiques de l'Université de Montréal in collaboration with the Graduate Students' Association in Classics and Religious Studies of the University of Ottawa on the afternoon before the conference (on 28 September). The Seminar was led by Peter Van Nuffelen, whom we kindly thank for his expert feedback on the students' papers. The team of graduate students who assisted in the practicalities of the workshop (including driving the speakers by minibus from Montreal to Ottawa on the night of 29 September) and engaged freely with speakers throughout the conference also contributed in large part to its success.

Finally, sincere thanks are due to the participants who responded with enthusiasm and encouragement to the initial plans of organising the conference and supplied titles and abstracts as required for the SSHRC application more than nine months before the event. Preliminary versions of the speakers' papers were circulated well in advance of the conference, which stimulated and focused the discussions at the workshop and has no doubt significantly contributed to the coherence of this volume. After the conference, we were able to include seventeen of the eighteen papers delivered at the workshop in the present collection. The contributors have again been extremely cooperative in providing additional information where needed during the editing process. A special word of thanks is reserved for Roxanne Bélanger Sarrazin, who, besides her contributions to the organisation of the workshop, acted as our Research Assistant and as such was responsible for the basic editing of the papers and the General Index.

Jitse H. F. Dijkstra and Christian R. Raschle
Ottawa and Montreal



List of Contributors

- Andreas Bendlin is Associate Professor of Classics at the University of Toronto. He is interested in and has published on ancient Mediterranean migration, Roman associations and Graeco-Roman cultural history more generally, but the main focus of his research is religion in the Roman Mediterranean, from the city of Rome and Italy to the imperial Greek East, and from the archaic period to Roman religion's *Nachleben* in the modern world.
- Jan N. Bremmer is Professor Emeritus of Religious Studies at the University of Groningen. His specialities are Graeco-Roman religion and early Christianity, as well as their historiography in modern times. His latest books are *Maidens, Magic and Martyrs in Early Christianity* (2017) and *The World of Greek Religion and Mythology* (2019).
- Elizabeth DePalma Digeser is Professor of History at the University of California, Santa Barbara. She has published two books on Late Antiquity, *The Making of a Christian Empire: Lactantius and Rome* (2000) and *A Threat to Public Piety: Christians, Platonists and the Great Persecution* (2012).
- Jitse H. F. Dijkstra is Professor of Classics at the University of Ottawa. His research centres on the process of religious transformation in Late Antiquity, in particular in its Egyptian context. He is the author of numerous studies on the subject, including *Philae and the End of Ancient Egyptian Religion: A Regional Study of Religious Transformation* (298–642 CE) (2008).
- Esther Eidinow is Professor of Ancient History at the University of Bristol. Her area of expertise is ancient Greek culture, with specific focus on religion and magic. Her latest monograph is *Envy, Poison, and Death: Women on Trial in Classical Athens* (2016).



List of Contributors

хi

- Hugh Elton is Professor of Ancient History and Classics at Trent University. His research focuses on how the late Roman empire worked, in particular in Anatolia. His publications include the monograph *The Roman Empire in Late Antiquity: A Political and Military History* (2018).
- Geoffrey Greatrex is Professor of Classics at the University of Ottawa. He has written extensively on Roman–Persian relations and Late Antique historiography, including military and religious conflict, as explored, for instance, in his commentary on *The Chronicle of Pseudo-Zachariah of Mytilene* (2011, with R. Phenix and C. Horn).
- Hans G. Kippenberg is Professor Emeritus of Comparative Religious Studies at the University of Bremen. His research areas are ancient and modern Mediterranean and European religions, the emergence of Religious Studies as a discipline, religious violence in the contemporary world, Max Weber's sociology of religion and the legal regulations concerning the freedom of religion. His books include *Violence as Worship: Religious Wars in the Age of Globalization* (2011).
- Erika Manders is a postdoctoral fellow at the Institute of Historical, Literary and Cultural Studies of Radboud University, Nijmegen. Her research focuses on modes of transmitting imperial ideology in general and religious representation of Late Antique emperors in particular. Her publications include the monograph *Coining Images of Power* (2012).
- Steve Mason is Distinguished Professor of Ancient Mediterranean Religions and Cultures at the University of Groningen. His interests are the history and historiography of the Greek world under Roman rule, with Judaea and Flavian Rome as foci. He is the editor-in-chief of *Flavius Josephus: Translation and Commentary* (2000–). His latest monograph is *A History of the Jewish War, AD 66–74* (2016).
- Wendy Mayer is Professor and Associate Dean for Research at Australian Lutheran College, University of Divinity. She has published numerous articles and books on religious conflict in Late Antiquity, including *Reconceiving Religious Conflict* (2018, with C. de Wet) and *Heirs of Roman Persecution* (2019, with É. Fournier).
- Peter Van Nuffelen is Professor of Ancient History at Ghent University. He has published widely on ancient religion, early Christianity and Late Antiquity. His most recent books are *Penser la tolérance durant l'Antiquité tardive* (2018) and *The Fragmentary Latin Histories of Late Antiquity*, AD 300–620 (2020, with L. van Hoof).



xii List of Contributors

Christian R. Raschle is Associate Professor of Roman History at the Université de Montréal. He specialises in the history of the administration and political system of the Roman empire, especially the reorganisation of its provinces in Late Antiquity, and themes in the cultural history of the first century CE (Lucan).

- James B. Rives is Kenan Eminent Professor of Classics at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. His research focuses on religion in the Roman empire, especially in its relation to socio-political authority. He is the author of numerous articles and books, including *Religion in the Roman Empire* (2007).
- Christine Shepardson is Lindsay Young Professor and Head of the Department of Religious Studies at the University of Tennessee. She has authored two monographs on fourth-century Christianity: *Anti-Judaism and Christian Orthodoxy* (2008), on Ephrem's Syriac writings, and *Controlling Contested Places* (2014), on the Christianisation of Antioch.
- Fabrizio Vecoli is Associate Professor of Religious Studies at the Université de Montréal. He specialises in the history of Late Antique Christianity (especially with regards to the spirituality of early monasticism) and some themes of method and theory in the study of religion. His books include *Il sole e il fango. Puro e impuro tra i padri del deserto* (2007).
- Chris L. de Wet is Associate Professor of New Testament and Early Christian Studies at the University of South Africa, and Honorary Research Fellow at Australian Lutheran College. He has written two monographs, *Preaching Bondage: John Chrysostom and the Discourse of Slavery in Early Christianity* (2015) and *The Unbound God* (2018).



A Note on Abbreviations

Throughout this book, journals are abbreviated according to J. Marouzeau (ed.), L'année philologique: bibliographie critique et analytique de l'antiquité gréco-latine (Paris, 1924–), available online at https://about.brepolis.net/aph-abreviations/ and reference works and corpora according to S. Hornblower, A. Spawforth and E. Eidinow (eds.), The Oxford Classical Dictionary, 4th ed. (Oxford, 2012), available online at https://oxfordre.com/classics/page/abbreviation-list/. Epigraphical abbreviations follow the Supplementum Epigraphicum Graecum (SEG) (Leiden and Amsterdam, 1923–), available online at http://referenceworks.brillonline.com/entries/supplementum-epigraphicum-graecum/abbreviations-aabbr. For papyrological abbreviations, see J. F. Oates et al. (eds.), Checklist of Editions of Greek and Latin Papyri, Ostraca and Tablets, 5th ed. (Atlanta, 2001), an updated version of which is available online at http://papyri.info/docs/checklist. Other abbreviations used are:

CPJ	V. A. Tcherikover, A. Fuks and M. Stern, <i>Corpus Papyrorum Judaicarum</i> , 3 vols. (Cambridge, MA, 1957–64).
CSCO	Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium
	(Leuven, 1903–).
EDR	Epigraphic Database Roma, available online at www.edr-edr
	.it/English/introduc_en.php.
NETS	A. Pietersma and B. G. Wright (eds.), A New English
	Translation of the Septuagint (Oxford, 2007).
NRSV	B. M. Metzger, R. C. Dentan and W. Harrelson (eds.), The
	Holy Bible containing the Old and New Testaments with the
	Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books. New Revised Standard
	Version (New York, 1989).

xiii



xiv A Note on Abbreviations

RGG⁴ H. D. Betz et al. (eds.), Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart:

Handwörterbuch für Theologie und Religionswissenschaft,

4th ed., 8 vols. (Tübingen, 1998–2005).

Suppl. It. Supplementa Italica (Rome, 1981–).