CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-49466-3 — Logical Pluralism and Logical Consequence
Erik Stei
Frontmatter
More Information

LOGICAL PLURALISM AND LOGICAL CONSEQUENCE

Logical pluralism is the view that there is more than one correct logic. This is not necessarily a controversial claim but in its most exciting formulations, pluralism extends to logics that have typically been considered rival accounts of logical consequence – to logics, that is, which adopt seemingly contradictory views about basic logical laws or argument forms. The logical pluralist challenges the philosophical orthodoxy that an argument is either deductively valid or invalid by claiming that there is more than one way for an argument to be valid. In this book, Erik Stei defends logical monism, the view that there is exactly one correct logic. He provides a detailed analysis of different possible formulations of logical pluralism, and offers an original account of the plurality of correct logics that incorporates the benefits of both pluralist and monist approaches to logical consequence. His book will be valuable for a range of readers in the philosophy of logic.

ERIK STEI is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Utrecht University.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-49466-3 — Logical Pluralism and Logical Consequence
Erik Stei
Frontmatter
More Information

LOGICAL PLURALISM AND LOGICAL CONSEQUENCE

ERIK STEI
Utrecht University

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-49466-3 — Logical Pluralism and Logical Consequence
Erik Stei
Frontmatter
More Information

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108494663

DOI: 10.1017/9781108859585

© Erik Stei 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-49466-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-49466-3 — Logical Pluralism and Logical Consequence
Erik Stei
Frontmatter
More Information

Contents

List of Figures *page* vi
Preface vii

1 Logical Pluralism Introduced 1
2 What Does It Mean for a Logic to Be Correct? 12
3 Three Dimensions of Plurality 37
4 The Cardinality of Logical Consequence 52
5 Domain Dependence 81
6 Pluralities of Meanings 110
7 Pluralism and Disagreement 151
8 Normativity and Collapse 180
9 Closing Remarks 204

References 208
Index 218

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-49466-3 — Logical Pluralism and Logical Consequence
Erik Stei
Frontmatter
More Information

Figures

2.1 A relation between arguments *page* 29
3.1 Three dimensions of plurality 37
4.1 P-correct contra-logics 61
4.2 P-correct sub-logics 61
4.3 X-correct contra-logics 66
4.4 X-correct sub-logics 66
5.1 Cook's domain model 89
6.1 Truth tables for K_3 and LP 117
7.1 The dispute according to a pluralistic theory of negation 158

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-49466-3 — Logical Pluralism and Logical Consequence
Erik Stei
Frontmatter
More Information

Preface

Logical theories are typically austere. Logical theorizing, in contrast, can often be ingenuous, inquisitive, and quite unconstrained. In his *Logical Syntax of Language,* Rudolf Carnap likened the flexibility of logical theory building to "the boundless ocean of unlimited possibilities". Carnap also claimed that we needed to overcome the "impediment" of striving after correct logics in order to be able to appreciate the immense freedom that modern mathematical methods provide. But maybe striving after correctness does not impede that freedom. Properly understood, the thought that exactly one logic provides the correct theory of logical consequence is quite compatible with the unlimited possibilities of formal logical theorizing. This, at least, is one of the central theses of this book.

I have been thinking about logical pluralism for quite a while now and during that time I was lucky enough to be able to talk to many people who were generous with their feedback and advice. I would like to thank Elke Brendel, Colin Caret, Daniel Cohnitz, Michael De, Filippo Ferrari, and Bjørn Jespersen for their helpful comments on drafts of some of the material of this book. I am particularly grateful to Graham Priest and Gillian Russell for their incredibly helpful feedback and for being such wonderful hosts during my research leave at the CUNY Graduate Center and at UNC Chapel Hill. Thanks also to the German Research Foundation (DFG) for funding the research fellowship enabling that leave.

I would also like to thank the many people with whom I had valuable discussions on matters of logic and pluralism over the years. These include, with sincere apologies to everyone I am forgetting, Magdalena and Brendan Balcerak Jackson, Jc Beall, Christopher Blake-Turner, Daniel Boyd, Jan Broersen, Otávio Bueno, Leon Commandeur, Roy Cook, Catarina Dutilh Novaes, Matti Eklund, Hartry Field, Rohan French, Ole Hjortland, Rosalie Iemhoff, Ralph Jenkins, Dirk Kindermann, Teresa Kouri Kissel, Nathan Kellen, Michael Lynch, Shay Logan, Benjamin Martin,

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-49466-3 — Logical Pluralism and Logical Consequence
Erik Stei
Frontmatter
More Information

Jean-Moritz Müller, Sebastiano Moruzzi, Hitoshi Omori, Eugenio Orlandelli, Romina Padro, Nikolaj Pedersen, Martin Pleitz, David Ripley, Marcus Rossberg, Gil Sagi, Gila Sher, Sebastian Speitel, Diego Tajer, Pilar Terrés Villalonga, and Jack Woods. I also benefited immensely from the feedback I got from the audiences at talks where I presented material of this book and from the engaging work environment within the Theoretical Philosophy Group at Utrecht University.

Finally, I would like to thank two referees at Cambridge University Press for their helpful and constructive comments as well as my editor Hilary Gaskin for her support and patience throughout the process of the writing of this book.

Some of the book has appeared in print before. Parts of Chapters 6 and 7 appeared as "Disagreement about Logic from a Pluralist Perspective" in *Philosophical Studies* 177 (2020), Chapters 6 and 8 contain material that first appeared in "Rivalry, Normativity, and the Collapse of Logical Pluralism", *Inquiry* 63 (2020), and Chapter 8 draws on "Non-Normative Logical Pluralism and the Revenge of the Normativity Objection" published in *The Philosophical Quarterly* 70 (2020). Thanks to Springer, Taylor and Francis, and Oxford University Press for permission to use this material.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org