Does Immigration Increase Crime?

Do migrants lead to an increase in crime rates in their host societies? This highly contentious issue has become a mainstay in the political debate and a lightning rod for the galvanization of populist movements, despite often lacking any empirical support. In this game-changing book, the authors examine what the existing data actually says, and provide their own novel evidence on the immigration-crime connection. Taking the unusual approach of analysing the subject from an economic perspective, the authors build on the pioneering work of Nobel Prize winner Gary Becker to construct their innovative arguments. By considering evidence from different countries, with a focus on establishing causal relationships, the authors are able to analyse not only if migrants do cause crime but also whether migration policies can play a role in shaping incentives for migrants to engage in crime. This book will appeal to students and academics across the social sciences, as well as citizens interested in this topical issue.

Francesco Fasani is an Associate Professor at the School of Economics and Finance, Queen Mary University of London. He is a Research Affiliate at CEPR (Centre for Economic Policy Research) and a Research Fellow at CReAM (Centre for Research and Analysis of Migration) and IZA (Institute for the Study of Labor, Bonn).

Giovanni Mastrobuoni is Carlo Alberto Chair at the Collegio Carlo Alberto and Professor in Economics at the University of Turin, ESOMAS, and at the University of Essex. He is a research fellow at the Institute for the Study of Labor in Bonn and editor of the The B.E. Journal of Economic Analysis and Policy.

Emily G. Owens is a Professor in the Department of Criminology, Law, and Society and the Department of Economics at the University of California, Irvine. She is an associate editor of the Journal of Quantitative Criminology, a senior research fellow at the Police Foundation, and a fellow of the Academy of Experimental Criminology.
P A O L O  P I N O T T I is Endowed Associate Professor in Economic Analysis of Crime at the Department of Social and Political Sciences at Bocconi University. His other roles include Coordinator of Fondazione Rodolfo Debenedetti, Director of the CLEAN Unit on the economics of crime at the Baffi-Carefin Center, Senior Researcher at FBK-Irvapp.
Does Immigration Increase Crime?
Migration Policy and the Creation of the Criminal Immigrant

FRANCESCO FASANI
Queen Mary University of London

GIOVANNI MASTROBUONI
Collegio Carlo Alberto, University of Turin and University of Essex

EMILY G. OWENS
University of California, Irvine

PAOLO PINOTTI
Bocconi University and Fondazione Rodolfo Debenedetti
Contents

List of Figures
List of Tables
Acknowledgements

Introduction

1 Immigration and Crime: Perceptions and Reality
  1.1 Attitudes towards Migrants
  1.2 Regular and Irregular Migration: Perceptions and Reality
  1.3 Evidence from Incarceration Rates
  1.4 Trends in Immigration and Crime Rates

2 Migration Policy and Crime in Italy
  2.1 Migration Policy in Italy
  2.2 Immigrants’ Involvement in Crime
  2.3 Legal Status and Criminal Behaviour of Immigrants in Italy

3 Immigration and Crime in the United Kingdom
  3.1 Introduction
  3.2 Immigration in the UK: Policy, Numbers, and Flows
  3.3 Crime Trends in the UK
  3.4 Immigrant Crime in the UK: Evidence from Prison Records
  3.5 Do Immigrants Cause Crime in the UK?
  3.6 Conclusions
## CONTENTS

4 The Case of the United States  
4.1 Institutional Background 91  
4.2 The 1917 Immigration Act 92  
4.3 The 1986 Immigration Reform and Control Act 113  
4.4 Conclusions 122

5 Refugee Waves and Crime: Evidence from EU Countries 129  
5.1 Introduction 129  
5.2 Refugees and Crime: Theory and Evidence 133  
5.3 Data and Descriptive Statistics 139  
5.4 Graphical Analysis 141  
5.5 Empirical Strategy 148  
5.6 Results 151  
5.7 Concluding Remarks 153

Conclusion 156

Appendix 1: Italian Legislation on Immigration 162  
Appendix 2: Appendix Tables – Immigration and Crime in the United Kingdom (chapter 3) 164  
Appendix 3: Appendix Tables – Refugee Waves and Crime: Evidence from EU Countries (Chapter 5) 174  
References 188  
Index 198
Figures

1.1 Natives’ concerns about immigration page 10
1.2 Percentage vote share of some anti-immigrant parties at European Parliament elections, 2004–14 12
1.3 Concerns about the impact of immigrants on jobs, taxes, and crime rates 13
1.4 Crime rate concerns associated with regular and irregular immigrants 14
1.5 Share of regular and irregular immigrants over the total resident population 16
1.6 Information and concerns about excessive immigration 16
1.7 Immigrants’ incarceration rates across countries 18
1.8 Trends in immigration and crime in the OECD, 2001–12 20
1.9 Changes in crime rates and in immigrant populations over the period 2001–12 21
2.1 Immigrant population in Italy, 1971–2014 27
2.2 Estimates of undocumented immigrants, 1990–2010 32
2.3 Percentage of foreigners among individuals charged for several types of crime 34
2.4 Trends in immigration and crimes, 1990–2013 (index = 1 in 1990) 34
2.5 Drug-related crimes and number of immigrants incarcerated for drug-related offences since 1991 (index = 1 in 1991) 35
2.6 Share of foreign-born population in the Italian judicial system, 1991–2011 37
viii LIST OF FIGURES

2.7 Share of foreign-born population, by age and gender, 2011 38
2.8 Probability of receiving a sentence for Italians and immigrants, by age group, 2006 39
2.9 Immigrant status and legal status of offenders, by type of crime 40
2.10 Over-representation of official and undocumented immigrants among offenders 41
2.11 Probability of committing a serious crime before and after click day 46
2.12 Immigrants’ crime and amnesties, 1992–2005 48
3.1 Immigration, emigration, and net immigration flows, 1980–2016 58
3.2 Foreign-born residents and foreign nationals in the UK, 2000–17 60
3.3 Foreign-born residents by area of origin, 2004–17 62
3.4 Share of population aged 15–64 years with tertiary education in EU15 countries + Norway + Switzerland: natives and foreign born, 2015 64
3.5 Trends in total CSEW crime and recorded crime, by offence group 65
3.6 UK prison population by nationality, 2002–16 67
3.7 British and foreign nationals detained, by status, 2002, 2009, and 2016 70
3.8 Prison population by sentence length: British and foreign nationals, 2016 71
3.9 Foreign national detainees, share by area of origin, 2002–16 72
3.10 European detainees, by macro-area, 2002–16 73
3.11 Log crime rate and immigrant share: ten-year (2004–14) changes, by type of offence 79
3.12 Log crime rate and immigrant share: five-year (2004–09) changes, by type of offence 80
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.13</td>
<td>Log crime rate and immigrant share: five-year (2009–14) changes, by type of offence</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Incarceration rates for natives and Asian immigrants, by age group, 1870–1910</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Incarceration rates (in %) for natives and immigrants, by age group, 1870–1920</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Example of a literacy test for potential immigrants</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Incarceration rates (in %) for ‘old’ and ‘new’ immigrants, by age group, 1870–1940</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Incarceration rates (in %) for natives and Mexican immigrants, by age group, 1870–1980</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Incarceration rates (in %) for native and non-native men, by age (1870–1980), along with major immigration reforms</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Illiteracy and incarceration rates</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Initial illiteracy and changes in migrant population</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>Felony charges filed against Bexar County residents</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Reporting rates of Hispanics and natives around the IRCA</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Asylum applications (2014–16) and refugee population (2016) in EU15 countries</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Major concerns about refugees in selected EU countries, 2016</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Property and drug crime: FR, DE, SE, UK, 1995–2016</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Property and drug crime: AT, DK, IT, NL, 1995–2016</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Homicide rate: FR, DE, SE, UK, 1995–2016</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Homicide rate: AT, DK, IT, NL, 1995–2016</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>Refugees and property and drug crime: yearly changes in EU15 countries, 1995–2015</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
X  LIST OF FIGURES

5.8  Asylum seekers and property and drug crime: yearly changes in EU15 countries, 1995–2015  146
5.9  Refugees and violent crime: yearly changes in EU15 countries, 1995–2015  147
5.10 Asylum seekers and violent crime: yearly changes in EU15 countries, 1995–2015  148
## Tables

1.1 Immigration and crime in OECD countries, 2002–13  
   *page 24*

2.1 ISMU survey (2003–09), characteristics of documented and undocumented immigrants  
   *43*

4.1 Incarceration rates  
   *96*

4.2 Incarceration rates for foreign and native-born by Census year and illiteracy status  
   *115*

4.3 Incarceration rates and illiteracy rates by country of birth  
   *118*

4.4 Illiterate and incarceration regressions  
   *121*

A.1 Countries of origin in 2000 and 2017  
   *165*

A.2 Foreign national inmates by area of origin in 2002 and 2016  
   *166*

A.3 European inmates: top ten nationalities in 2002 and 2016  
   *167*

A.4 Descriptive statistics  
   *168*

A.5 Log crime rate and share of foreign-born population – first differences estimates  
   *169*

A.6 Log crime rate and share of foreign nationals – first differences estimates  
   *170*

A.7 Log crime rate and share of foreign-born population: before and after the 2008 financial crisis – first differences estimates  
   *171*

A.8 Log crime rate and share of foreign-born population – instrumental variable estimates  
   *173*

A.9 Asylum applications and refugee population (per 10,000 population) in EU15 countries  
   *175*

A.10 Average crime rates in EU15 countries, by type of offence  
   *176*
xii  LIST OF TABLES

A.11  Property and drug crime and refugee population in EU15 countries – first differences estimates  177
A.12  Property and drug crime and asylum applications in EU15 countries – first differences estimates  179
A.13  Violent crime and refugee population in EU15 countries – first differences estimates  181
A.14  Violent crime and asylum applications in EU15 countries – first differences estimates  183
A.15  Crime rates and refugee population: the timing of the effect – first differences estimates  185
A.16  Crime rates and asylum applications: the timing of the effect – first differences estimates  186
A.17  Crime rates, refugees, and asylum applications in NMS13 countries – first differences estimates  187
Acknowledgements

This research was possible thanks to generous funding from Fondazione Rodolfo Debenedetti. We thank the Italian Ministry of Interior for disclosing the data on residence permits and crime; Giancarlo Blangiardo (ISMU) for providing part of the data used in Chapter 2; and Josh Angrist, Randi Hjalmarsson, Stephen Machin, Nicola Persico, and Luigi Pistaferri for invaluable comments on an earlier draft of this work. We also thank Dimitrios Bermperoglou, Giammarco Cezza, Chiara Serra, Giulia Tagliaferri, and Giulia Tomaselli for excellent research assistance.