

## Index

Ackermann, Laurie, 206, 233 ANC (African National Congress), 4, 21, ACLU (American Civil Liberties Union), 189-92, 195, 200, 210, 216 Anglo-Indians, 141 Adarand Constructors v. Peña (1995), 59-60 arguable violation theory, 86 Adivasis, see also STs Ashcroft, John, 124 discrimination against, 134, 141 Ashoka Kumar Thakur v. India (2008), 185, 186 Advani, L.K., 171-2 at-large voting districts, 102, 104, 108-10, 112, affirmative action (India), see also reservations see also redistricting consequential seniority and, 162-4 in minority schools, 182 backward classes, see also SCs; STs; OBCs quotas, 133-46, 150, 152, 156, 184, 186 constitutional guarantees for, 138-9 reverse discrimination under, 166-7 difficulty in defining, 143 affirmative action (South Africa) social position of, 133, 142 Backward Classes Commission, 134, 143, 145-7 as a differentiated policy, 195 Balaji v. Mysore (1963), 147, 152 reverse discrimination, 189 as transformative, 190 basic structure doctrine, 136, 148, 157, 158, 185, under the interim Constitution, 195-7 see also Kesavananda Bharathi v. Kerala under transformative constitutionalism, Bato Star Fishing v. Minister of Environmental affirmative action (USA), see also Title VI; Affairs (2004), 214 Title VII; Voting Rights Act (1965) Beer v. United States (1976), 81, 114-5, 119 as "diversity management," 47 Bel Porto School Governing Body v. Premier of the Western Cape Province (2002), 4 judicial interpretation of, 87 Bell, Griffin, 38 as remedying disparate impact, 85-6 reverse discrimination under, 31, 37, 38, 45 Bharatiya Janata Party, see BJP in the workforce, 85-7 Bharti, Uma, 177 African National Congress, see ANC Bihar, 139, 140, 146, 171 AJGAR formula, 149 BJP (Bharatiya Janata Party), 137, 149, 161, Álexander v. Aero Lodge (1977), 90 170-2, 177 Alexander v. Gardner-Denver (1974), 78 black capitalism, 74 All-India Public Service Black Economic Empowerment, 211 caste-based employment in, 133, 150, 155, Black, Hugo, 113 Blackmun, Harry, 44, 86, 92, 123 Allen v. State Board of Elections (1969), 103, Blumrosen, Alfred W., 75, 79 105-7, 113, 119 bona fide seniority systems, 70, 72, 90, see also Allen, James, 7 constructive seniority American Civil Liberties Union, see ACLU Bork, Robert, 81 American Tobacco v. Patterson (1982), 90 Bowers, Sam, 101



260 Index

Brennan, William, 40, 41, 43–6, 62–3, 79–80, 84, 86, 90, 109, 112–3, 118–9
Breyer, Steven, 115–6
Brink v. Kitschoff (1995), 203
Burger, Warren, 5, 46, 51–2, 54–6, 76–7, 81–2, 109, 111, 119
Bush, George H.W., 96
Bushey v. New York State Civil Service Commission (1985), 88–9

California Brewers Association v. Bryant (1070), 80 capitation fees, 175-7 carry-forward rules, 158-60 caste system as source of inequality, 133, 141 use of in reservations, 141-3, 145-147, 153-4 vs. national unity, 140, 142 Central Educational Institutions (Reservations in Admissions) Act (2007), 185 Chamerlain, Wilt, 74 Chaskalson, Arthur, 200, 202, 216 City Council of Pretoria v. Walker (1998), 3, 212-3, 219 City of Richmond v. JA Croson (1989), 49–50, 56 Civil Rights Act (1957), 74

Civil Rights Act (1964), 27, 33–4, 52, 54, 60, 67, 69, 103, see also Title VI (of the Civil Rights Act); Title VII (of the Civil Rights Act)

Civil Rights Act (1991), 96–100

Coehlo v. Tamil Nadu (2007), 157 color-blind interpretations (of the law), 31–2, 34, 52–5, 61 Commerce Clause, 69, 88 Congress of Racial Equality, see CORE

consequential seniority, 162–4 Constituent Assembly, 138–9, 141–3 Constitutional Assembly, 194, 198, 199

consent decrees, 91-2

Constitutional Assembly, 194, 198, 199 constructive seniority, 79, 81, see also bona fide seniority systems

coordinated discourse legal interpretation as, 12, 231–3 CORE (Congress of Racial Equality), 74 Craig v. Boren (1976), 43–4

Dahmer, Vernon, 101
Dalits, see SCs
Days, Drew, III, 41–3, 45–7, 52, 55, 62, 80, 81, 86–7
DeFunis v. Odegaard (1974), 37, 38, 42, 43, 63, 81
Desai, Morarji, 148

Desai, Morarji, 148 differentiated policies (South Africa) affirmative action as, 195 vs. dignity-based policies, 200
as remedies for historical harms, 192
disparate impact, 67–78, 83–5, 93–6, 103, 106, 108
affirmative action as remedying, 85–6
statistical evidence as demonstration of, 95
disparate treatment, 69, 84–5
diversity
as rationale for race-conscious policies, 32, 47, 232
Dole, Robert, 111
Douglas, William, 36–8, 42, 106
DP (Democratic Party, South Africa), 196, 198, 200, 206, 207
Dunne, John R., 113

economic transformation
Mbeki's vision for South Africa's, 210–11
EEA (Employment Equity Act), 212
EEOA (Equal Employment Opportunity Act, 1972), 40, 77, 83
EEOC (Equal Employment Opportunity Commission), 72, 75, 80
Eisenhower, Dwight, 40
Employment Equity Act, see EEA
Equal Employment Opportunity Act, see
EEOA

Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, see EEOC Equal Protection Clause (USA), 37–9, 46, 55, 58, 62, 69, 84, 88–9 Equality Clause (RSA), 189, 191–3, 204 Ervin, Samuel, 39–40, 77

Fair Employment Practices, see FEP Fairley, J.C., 101 FCC (Federal Communications Commission), 46 FEP (Fair Employment Practices), 67, 68 FF (Freedom Front, South Africa), 198 Fifteenth Amendment, 105, 114, 116 fifty-percent ceiling rule, 155 Fisher v. University of Texas I (2013), 31, 64 Fourteenth Amendment, 33, 37, 46, 60, 62, 69, 83, 85, 88-9, 107, 110, see also Title VI (of the Civil Rights Act) judicial interpretation of, 55-6 Franks v. Bowman Transportation (1976), 79, 81 Freedom Democratic Party, 102 Freedom Front (South Africa), see FF Fullilove v. Klutznick (1980), 45, 49, 54-7, 91

Gajendragadkar, P.B., 153 Gandhi, Indira, 137, 147 Gandhi, Rajiv, 149, 169



> Index 261

GEAR (Growth, Employment, and Redistribution), 210 gender discrimination, 43-4 General Building Contractors Association v. Pennsylvania (1982), 93 General Manager, Southern Railway v. Rangachari (1961), 157, 163 Georgia v. Ashcroft (2003), 124-6 Gephardt, Richard, 50 gerrymandering, see also redistricting evidentiary standards for claiming, 123-4 historical use of, 118 right to challenge, 103 Ginsburg, Ruth Bader, 44, 57, 59-60, 63, 64, 115, 124 GNU (Government of National Unity), 194 Goldstone, Richard, 206, 233 Gomillion v. Lightfoot (1960), 118 Government of National Unity, see GNU Griggs v. Duke Power Company (1971), 75, 77, 82, 83, 85, 87, 93, 94 Growth, Employment, and Redistribution, see **GEAR** Harksen v. Lane (1997), 208 higher education (India) government authority over, 168, 177-80 India's privatization of, 173 public vs. private, 167 Hindu nationalism, 168-70, see also BJP (Bharatiya Janata Party) historical harms Fullilove v. Klutznick (1980), 45, 49, 54-7 race-conscious policies as remedying, 43, 46, 48, 49 Humphrey, Hubert, 69, 73 Illinois Fair Employment Practices Commission, 66 Inamdar v. Maharashtra (2005), 183 Indian National Congress, 20, 172-3, 226, 228 Indian Supreme Court characteristics of, 135-7 Indra Sawhney v. India (1992), 150, 152-5, 157, 160, 163 Insurance Act (1943), 203 interim Constitution (RSA, 1993) affirmative action under, 195-7 after apartheid, 192 reconciliatory constitutionalism under, 205-6 intermediate scrutiny, 43-5, 59, 63 vs. strict scrutiny, 32 International Brotherhood of Teamsters v. United States (1977), 80, 82

Islamic Academy of Education v. Karnataka (2003), 182Janata Dal, see JD Janata Party, 148 jatis, 145 JD (Janata Dal), 149-50, 235 Jim Crow, 34, 39, 52, 67, 101 Johnson, Lyndon B., 41, 48, 74, 105 Joshi, Murli Manohar, 177 JSC (Judicial Service Commission), 202 judicial authority, 91–3, 137, 225–7 judicial interpretation, see also specific topic judicial review risks of 6 under the Ninth Schedule (India), 157 Judicial Service Commission, see JSC Kalelkar Commission, see Backward Classes Commission Kalelkar, Kaka, 145 Kennedy, Anthony, 58 Kerala v. Thomas (1976), 160 Kesavananda Bharathi v. Kerala (1973), 136, 138, 182 Khare, V.N., 182 Kirpal, Bhupinder Nath, 178 Krishnamachari, T.T., 138, 143 Lahoti, Ramesh Chandra, 183 Langa, Pius, 202, 212 layoff quotas, 88 LDF (Legal Defense Fund), 41, 75 League of United Latin American Citizens v. Perry (2006), 123 Lee, Bill L., 116 Legal Defense Fund, see LDF Lee, Rex, 83 legal interpretation as coordinated discourse, 12 schools of thought regarding, 7-12 legal rights top-down vs. bottom-up development of, 227–30 Leonard, Jerris, 76–7 Lewis, John, 122 Lok Sabha (Indian Parliament), 140 LTTE (Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam), 172 majority-minority districts, 120, 124 Mandal Commission, 134, see also reservations Mandal, Bindheshwari Prasad, 134 Mandel II, see Central Educational Institutions (Reservations in Admissions) Act (2007)

Mandela, Nelson, 189, 195, 202, 205 Marshall, Thurgood, 40, 49, 63, 80, 81, 232

invidious racial discrimination, 34, 38, 53, 60



262

Mbeki, Thabo, 190, 209-12 MBEs (Minority Business Enterprises), 45, 53, 55 McDonnell Douglas v. Green (1973), 78 Meese, Edwin, III, 51 Metro Broadcasting v. FCC (1990), 46, 50, Miller v. Johnson (1995), 122 Minister of Finance v. van Heerden (2004), 4, 214-6, 219 Minnick v. California Department of Corrections (1981), 87 Minority Business Enterprises, see MBEs minority disenfranchisement, 118 minority rights vs. Hindu nationalism, 168–70 minority schools (India) affirmative action in, 182-4 TMA Pai Foundation v. Karnataka (2002), 178-80, 181 minority set-aside program City of Richmond v. JA Croson (1989), 56 Mkontwana v. Nelson Mandela Metropolitan Municipality (2004), 217 Mobile v. Bolden (1980), 110-13, 115, 126, 128 Mohd. Ahmed Khan v. Shah Bano Begum (1985), 169 Mohini Jain v. Karnataka (1992), 175-7 Mokgoro, Yvonne, 215, 216 Moseneke, Dikgang, 215, 216 MPNP (Multi-Party Negotiation Process), 192 Munshi, K.M., 143 Muslim Women (Protection of Rights on Divorce) Act (1986), 170 Muslims (India) minority treatment of, 142 separation of, 140 Myart v. Motorola (1963), 66-7, 71, 74 Myart, Leon, 66-8, 71, 74

NAACP (National Association for the Advancement of Colored People), 38, 79, 101, 119 Nagaraj v. India (2006), 160 National Association for the Advancement of Colored People, see NAACP

National Front coalition government, 134, 171 National Judicial Appointments Commission, see NJAC

National Party (South Africa), see NP national unity vs. caste system, 140, 142

Nehru, Jawaharlal, 139 neoliberalism, 173–4 Ninety-Third Amendment Ac

Ninety-Third Amendment Act (2005), 184, 185 Ninth Schedule (India)

judicial review under, 157

Index

Nixon, Richard M., 73–6, 78, 113 NJAC (National Judicial Appointments Commission), 137 non-retrogression standard, 115, 116, 125 Norris v. Alabama (1935), 75 NP (National Party), 192, 198, 228

O'Connor, Sandra Day, 56–8, 60, 64, 94, 112, 118, 121, 124
O'Regan, Kate, 203, 216, 217
OBC reservations, see reservations
OBCs (Other Backward Classes), see also STs;
SCs; backward classes
expansion of reservations to, 20, 134, 167, 171
historical discrimination against, 150

PAAS (Patidar Anamat Andolan Samiti), 166

Pant, G.B., 146 Parasaran, Sri K., 226 Patel, Hardik, 166 Patel, Vallabhbhai, 141 Patidar Anamat Andolan Samiti, see PAAS Patidar *iati* expansion of reservations to, 166 Patrick, Deval L., 115, 123 Patterson, Joe, 102 Perez, Thomas, 60 Philadelphia Plan, 35-6 Pollak, Stephen, 105 Pottinger, J. Stanley, 77, 81, 81-114 Powell, Adam Clayton, 106 Powell, Lewis, 47, 53, 78, 82, 89, 109 preclearance mechanism, 103, 114-8 Premier, Province of Mpumalanga v. Executive Committee of the Association of Governing Bodies of State Aided Schools (1998), 3President of the Republic of South Africa v. Hugo (1997), 206 Pressman, Sonia, 75 private schools (India) expansion of reservations to, 168, 185 vs. public schools, 167 Proctor & Gamble v. Fisher (1981), 89 promotion quotas, 157-8, 162 public schools (India)

Quarles v. Philip Morris (1968), 79

Public Works Employment Act (1977), 53

vs. private schools, 167

Punjabi Sikhs, 142

race-conscious policies diversity as rationale for, 32, 47, 232 remedy vs. diversity, 32, 47 as remedying historical harms, 43, 46, 48, 49



Index 263

race-policy conservatives	Scheduled Tribes, see STs
Republican Party alignment of, 31–2, 64, 73,	Schultz, George, 35
106, 113	SCs (Scheduled Castes), 133, 138, 141, 153,
racial discrimination, 189	156, 167
racial disparities	Second Backward Classes Commission, see
statistical evidence as demonstration of,	Mandal Commission
66, 85	seniority
racial gerrymandering, see gerrymandering	bona fide systems, 70, 72, 90
Rao, P.V. Narasimha, 173	constructive, 79, 81
Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh, see RSS	rights under Title VII, 78–80
RDP (Reconstruction and Development	Shaw v. Reno (1993), 121, 122
Programme), 210	Shelby County v. Holder (2013), 126, 128
Reagan, Ronald, 39, 51, 87–8, 111, 113	Shudras, 134, 142
reconciliatory constitutionalism	Singh, Arjun, 184
judicial role in, 206–8	Singh, Charand, 149
under interim Constitution, 206	Singh, Kuldip, 159, 175
	Singh, Manmohan, 173
vs. transformative constitutionalism, 191, 212	Singh Vishwanath Pratan 124 140 225
Reconstruction and Development	Singh, Vishwanath Pratap, 134, 149, 235
Programme, see RDP	Skweyiya, Zola, 211
Reddy, B.P. Javeen, 176	Slovo, Joe, 192
Reddy, Jeevan, 153, 157, 160, 163	Souter, David, 115, 123
redistricting, 106-7, 118-9, 121, 126	Souter, David H., 232
Regents of the University of California v. Bakke	South African Communist Party, see SACP
(1978), 38, 41, 45, 46, 49, 52, 57, 87, 88	South African Law Commission, see SALC
Rehnquist, William, 56, 62, 82, 87, 109, 118	South African Police Service v. Solidarity obo
Republican Party	Barnard (2014), 216
alignment of race-policy conservatives with,	South African Police Services, see SAPS
31–2, 64, 73, 106, 113	South Carolina v. Katzenbach (1966), 104, 113
reservations	southern states
caste-based eligibility for, 141–7, 153–4	voter suppression by, 103
expansion to OBCs of, 150–2, 167, 171, 226	southern states (USA)
expansion to obos of, 150 2, 107, 171, 220	voter suppression by, 101
historic use of, 133	states' rights (USA)
opposition to expansion of, 133, 134, 150, 155	vs. VRA, 113
relaxed standards for reserved candidates,	statistical evidence
160–62	as demonstration of disparate impact, 95
reverse discrimination	as demonstration of racial disparities, 66, 8
affirmative action policies as, 31, 37, 38, 45,	statutory interpretation, 88
166–7	Stevens, John Paul, 49, 52–3, 115, 123, 232
Reynolds, William Bradford, 51, 55, 82, 91	Stewart, Potter, 41, 80–1, 114, 232
Roberts, John, 125, 128	Strauder v. West Virginia (1880), 75
Robinson, Jackie, 74	strict scrutiny, 32, 43, 57–60, 63
Rodino, Peter W., Jr., 110	STs (Scheduled Tribes), 134, 138, 141, 153,
Rogers v. Lodge (1982), 111	156, 167
Roosevelt, Franklin D., 36	subdivision rule, 153
RSS (Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh), 170	040411010111410, 1))
N35 (Nashtilya Swayamsevak Sangil), 1/0	Tamil Nadu, 155–6
C. I.L	
Sabharwal v. Punjab (1995), 159	Thakur, Ashoka Kumar, 185
Sabharwal, Y.K., 157	Thomas, Clarence, 56, 59, 61
Sachs, Albie, 195, 202–4, 213, 216, 220, 233	Thornburg v. Gingles (1986), 112
SACP (South African Communist Party), 192	Thurmond, Strom, 73
Saint Stephen's College v. University of Delhi	Title VI (of the Civil Rights Act), 27, 32-5, 43
(1992), 177	53, 60, 81
SALC (South African Law Commission), 199	Title VII (of the Civil Rights Act), 27, 67–73,
Salve, Harish, 178	75–8, 80, 82, 83, 88, 89, 91
SAPS (South African Police Services), 189	impact of on seniority rights, 78-83
Scalia, Antonin, 56–9, 61, 116	judicial interpretation of, 86-7
Scheduled Castes, see SCs	judicial limits under, 72



264

Title VII (of the Civil Rights Act), cont. legislative intent of, 68 legislative interpretation of, 77 results-oriented interpretations of, 77 seniority rights under, 71 TMA Pai Foundation v. Karnataka (2002), totality standard, 109-12 Tower Amendment (to Title VII), 71 Tower, John, 71 transformative constitutionalism affirmative action under, 211-4, 232 limits to, 216-7 vs. reconciliatory constitutionalism, 191, 212 United Jewish Organizations v. Carey (1977), 118, 119, 123–4 United States Commission on Civil Rights, United States, Reno v. Bossier Parish School Board (1997), 115–6 United States, Reno v. Bossier Parish School Board II (2000), 116-8 United Steelworkers of America v. Weber (1979), 86, 87, 89 Unni Krishnan v. Andhra Pradesh (1993), 176

Venkataramana v. Madras (1951), 145 VHP (Vishwa Hindu Parishad), 169

Uttar Pradesh, 139, 140, 146, 149, 150, 171

## Index

Voinovich v. Quilter (1993), 120, 122, 124 vote banks, 140 vote dilution, see also gerrymandering; redistricting Allen v. State Board of Elections (1969), 105, 107, 113 evidentiary standards for claiming, 107 vs. minority disenfranchisement, 118 voter suppression by southern states, 101, 103 Voting Rights Act (1965), 27, 34, 45, 81, 102–3, 105 vs. states' rights, 113 Voting Rights Act Reauthorization Act (2006), 117, 125 VRA, see Voting Rights Act (1965) Wallace, George, 73 Wards Cove Packing v. Atonio (1989), 95 Warren, Earl, 40, 105 Washington v. Davis (1976), 81, 83 Watson v. Fort Worth Bank & Trust (1988), 93 Waxman, Henry, 38 Whitcomb v. Chavis (1971), 108 White v. Regester (1973), 109 White, Byron, 41, 84, 108, 232 Wright v. Rockefeller (1964), 106 Wygant v. Jackson Board of Education (1986),

Yacoob, Zak, 217

49, 58, 88