Democracy at Work

One of the greatest challenges in the twenty-first century is to address large, deep, and historic deficits in human development. Democracy at Work explores a crucial question: how does democracy, with all of its messy, contested, and, time-consuming features, advance well-being and improve citizens’ lives? Professors Brian Wampler, Natasha Borges Sugiyama, and Michael Touchton argue that differences in the local robustness of three democratic pathways – participatory institutions, rights-based social programs, and inclusive state capacity – best explain the variation in how democratic governments improve well-being. Using novel data from Brazil and innovative analytic techniques, the authors show that participatory institutions permit citizens to express voice and exercise vote, inclusive social programs promote citizenship rights and access to public resources, and more capable local states use public resources according to democratic principles of rights protections and equal access. The analysis uncovers how democracy works to advance capabilities related to poverty, health, women’s empowerment, and education.

Brian Wampler is Professor of Political Science at Boise State University. He is the author of Activating Democracy in Brazil: Popular Participation, Social Justice, and Interlocking Institutions (2015), and Participatory Budgeting in Brazil: Contestation, Cooperation and Accountability (2007).

Natasha Borges Sugiyama is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee. She is the author of Diffusion of Good Government: Social Sector Reforms in Brazil (2012).

Michael Touchton is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Miami. He is the co-author of Salvaging Communities: How American Cities Rebuild Closed Military Bases (Forthcoming) with Amanda Johnson.
Democracy at Work

Pathways
to Well-Being in Brazil

BRIAN WAMPLER
Boise State University

NATASHA BORGES SUGIYAMA
University of Wisconsin – Milwaukee

MICHAEL TOUCHTON
University of Miami
Contents

List of Figures vi
List of Tables vii
Preface and Acknowledgments xi
List of Interviews xiv
List of Abbreviations xvii

Introduction 1
1 Democracy at Work 22
2 Building Pathways for Change 58
3 Research Design, Methods, and Variables 85
4 Reducing Poverty: Broadening Access to Income 103
5 Improving Health: Saving Lives 132
6 Empowering Women: Saving Mothers and Enhancing Opportunities 166
7 Educating Society: Promoting Public Education and Learning 198
8 Pathways at Work: Lessons from Brazil’s Poor Northeast 228
Conclusion: How Democracy Improves Well-Being 276

Appendix 294
References 316
Index 344
## Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Democratic ladders of abstraction</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Interaction of pathways</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Brazil and the state of Pernambuco</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Interaction of pathways</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tables

3.1 Key independent variables across models in Chapters 4–7 .......................... page 94
3.2 Summary statistics for key independent variables ........................................ 95
3.3 Brazil’s policy management councils .......................................................... 97
4.1 Poverty across Brazil .................................................................................. 112
4.2 Explaining poverty outcomes 2006–2013: Federal social programs, policy councils, and local state capacity ................................................................. 121
4.3 Policy councils, federal social programs, and public goods spending, 2006–2013 .................................................. 124
4.4 Explaining poverty scores through interactions among policy councils, Bolsa Família coverage, and local state capacity ......................................................... 126
5.1 Regional health differences across Brazil, 1990–2010 ................................ 139
5.2 Health-related policy councils across Brazil, 2001–2013 ........................... 144
5.3 PSF coverage rates across Brazilian municipalities, by region .................. 147
5.4 Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013: Federal social programs, voluntary policy councils, and local state capacity ................................................................. 154
5.5 Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013: Federal social programs and incentivized policy council meetings .......................................................... 156
5.6 Explaining infant mortality: Voluntary policy councils, federal social programs, and local state capacity, 2006–2013 ......................................................... 159
5.7 Explaining infant mortality through interactions among policy councils, Bolsa Família coverage, and local state capacity ............................................. 161
6.1 Political and economic status of Brazilian women ..................................... 178
6.2 Explaining variation in maternal mortality, 2006–2013 ......................... 189
List of Tables

6.3 Explaining variation in earnings for low-income women, 2006–2013 191
6.4 Explaining variation in women’s political participation, 2006–2013 192
6.5 Explaining women’s empowerment through interactions among policy councils, Bolsa Família coverage, and local state capacity 193
7.1 Education across Brazil 206
7.2 Number of councils related to education and youth 209
7.3 Explaining variation in school attendance, 2003–2013 219
7.4 Explaining college entrance exam scores (ENEM), 2006–2013 220
7.5 Explaining elementary school attendance, 2006–2013 222
7.6 Explaining high school test (ENEM) performance, 2006–2013: Interactions among policy councils, Bolsa Família coverage and local state capacity 223
7.7 Explaining educational outcomes through interactions among policy councils, Bolsa Família coverage, and local state capacity 224
8.1 Case study municipalities: Socioeconomic summary statistics 231
8.2 Case study municipalities: Social summary statistics 233
8.3 Case study municipalities: Democratic pathway summary statistics 234

TABLES IN APPENDIX

A4.2.a Explaining poverty outcomes, 2006–2013 296
A4.2.b Explaining poverty outcomes, 2006–2013 297
A4.2.c Explaining poverty outcomes: Voluntary policy councils, 2006–2013 298
A5.4.a Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013 299
A5.4.b Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013 300
A5.4.c Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013 301
A5.4.d Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013 302
A5.5.a Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013 303
A6.3.a Explaining maternal mortality, 2006–2013 304
A6.3.b Explaining variation in maternal mortality, 2006–2013 305
A6.4.a Explaining variation in women’s income, 2006–2013 306
A6.4.b Explaining variation in women’s income, 2006–2013: Federal social programs and voluntary policy councils 307
List of Tables

A6.5.a Explaining variation in women’s political participation, 2006–2013 308
A6.5.b Explaining women’s political empowerment, 2006–2013 309
A7.3.a Explaining school attendance, 2006–2013 310
A7.3.b Explaining school attendance, 2006–2013 311
A7.4.a Explaining ENEM test scores, 2006–2013 312
A7.4.b Explaining high school graduation rates, test scores, and test passage rates, 2006–2013 313
Case Studies: Questionnaire for Democracy at Work 314
Preface and Acknowledgments

This book is born out of each of our experiences studying Brazilian politics and issues of development. We spent countless hours discussing how Brazil made progress toward human development in the 2000s and early 2010s and saw how our three skill sets could combine to thoroughly address this question in a way that few teams could. We came to this project having previously explored different research questions: Brian had written extensively about Brazil’s participatory infrastructure for citizen engagement in local decision-making. Natasha had developed her expertise on municipal-level, pro-poor policy reforms and citizenship development among the poor. Michael brought research experiences related to economic development and an interest in building new datasets to uncover causal processes for Brazil’s social, economic, and political transformations. Each of these unique perspectives come together in our enterprise to understand how local democratic practices contribute to gains in human development in a context with a supportive federal environment and constitutional guarantees for social rights. Where local experiences falter, we wanted to understand why.

Our analysis developed over time and early iterations of our work appeared as conference papers. Together, we have presented versions of chapters at a number of professional conferences organized by the American Political Science Association, the Latin American Studies Association, the International Political Science Association, the Midwest Political Science Association, and the Southern Political Science Association. We thank our panel discussants and audience members for their thoughtful comments and probing questions. Discussants included: Sarah Brooks, Evelyne Huber, James McGuire, Eduardo Moncada, and ...
Joseph Wong. An early version of our work, which we presented at the LASA Congress in New York, won the best paper award of the subnational politics and society section. That paper, “Democracy at Work: Moving beyond Elections to Improve Well-Being,” was later published in the American Political Science Review (2017).

Colleagues from various universities have also been kind enough to host us for research presentations, symposia, and colloquia where we refined our ideas. Collectively, we presented portions of our research at the University of Miami’s Political Science Department and Institute for Advanced Study of the Americas; Clemson University; the University of Alaska, Southeast; Boise State University; and the World Bank. The Fulbright Foundation supported Michael’s engagement with Brazilian scholars at the State University of Campinas (UNICAMP), the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, the Federal University of Espírito Santo, the Federal University of Amapá, and the Fundação Joaquim Nabuco. Wagner Romão was instrumental in helping to make these connections possible.

Our research was supported by a number of institutions, for which we are grateful. The University of Miami also provided generous support for Michael to take a research leave to complete fieldwork on this project. Boise State University and the School of Public Service provided financial support for Brian’s research trip to Brazil, sabbatical support, and funding for undergraduate and graduate research assistants. The University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee (UWM) supported Natasha’s sabbatical to Brazil. Thanks also go to UWM’s Center for Latin American and Caribbean Studies (CLACS) for Natasha’s research support in Brazil and to the Office of Undergraduate Research for their Student Undergraduate Research Fellowship program, which connected Natasha to talented undergraduate research assistants.

At the risk of omitting colleagues who offered us helpful comments along away, we also thank the following individuals: Rebecca Abers, Sonia Alvarez, Leonardo Avritzer, Merike Blofield, Joaíldo Burity, Maxwell Cameron, Jose Maria Cardoso de Silva, Euzeneia Carlos, Alan Cavalcanti da Cunha, Helenilza Cunha, Zach Elkins, Gustavo Fernandes, Ben Goldfrank, Laura Gomez-Mera, Calla Hummel, Felícia Knaul, Marcelo Kunrath, Luciana Andressa Martins de Souza, Ricardo Mayer, Françoise Montambeault, Carlos Pereira, Tiago Peixoto, Roberto Pires, Lucio Renno, and Kurt Weyland for providing us with their feedback and venues for fruitful dialogue about our ideas. Special thanks go to Wendy.
Preface and Acknowledgments

Hunter, with whom Natasha has worked closely on other research related to Bolsa Familia.

Several individuals have served as extended team members on this project, including graduate and undergraduate students at our three home institutions. Ana Costa has been an important contributor to our work, assisting with data collection, Freedom of Information requests, graphics, translations, and even accompanying Brian and Mike to conduct research in Pernambuco. In Milwaukee, Luis Mauro Valadão Quiroz Filho and Samuel Orlowski assisted in transcribing focus group interviews. In Brazil, we were aided by Gleiciane Souza, who assisted us in setting up interviews in Camaragibe, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, and Garanhuns.

At the editorial stage, we benefited from advice and copyediting by Jennifer Morales. We are especially grateful to Sara Doskow at Cambridge University Press who provided us with early feedback and guided our manuscript through the review process. Our anonymous reviewers read our manuscripts with great care and offered valuable suggestions, which improved the book tremendously.

It is a terrible custom in academic book publishing to thank family and friends last. We are remiss in doing so here, not because their contributions are any less important, but rather because it is their support that serves as the backbone to our present and future academic enterprise. Our families made the beginnings of this project possible by joining us on research trips and sabbaticals many years ago. Our children, nephews, and nieces motivate us to keep working for a world where social inclusion is a reality for all. So we end with our thanks to them because they inspire our future. In particular, Brian thanks Paula, Sebastian, and Ginger. Natasha thanks Greg, Nina, and Anton. Michael thanks Mom, Dad, and Paul. This book is dedicated to Brazilians who engage with and defend democratic practices to further a more just and inclusive society.
Interviews

Ana Claudia, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; June 1, 2017.
Ana Paula Oliveira Soares. President of the FUNDEB Council, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; June 1, 2017.
Ana Selma Santos. Former Executive Secretary of Women, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; June 6, 2017.
Andrea Gomes de Sa. President of the Municipal Education Council, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; June 1, 2017.
Catalina, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 28, 2017.
David, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 31, 2017
Diana Conceição. President of the Municipal Social Assistance Council, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 31, 2017.
List of Interviews

Edvaldo Ferreira, Jr. Secretary of Social Assistance, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 17, 2017.
Eliane Alves. CSO leader and women’s advocate, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 18, 2017.
Eliane Simões Vilar. Secretary of Women, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 31, 2017.
Flavio Eduardo Santos. Executive Secretary of the Health Care Council, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 18, 2017.
Gilberta, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; June 3, 2017.
Givaldo Nascimento. President of the Municipal Social Assistance Council, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 18, 2017.
Humberto Granja Neto. Manager of Cadastro Único, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; June 1, 2017.
José Juca Melo Filho. Vice President of the Social Assistance Council and Civil Society Councilor, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 31, 2017.
Laudicea Oliveira. Journalist and member of Women’s and Health Care Councils, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 17, 2017.
List of Interviews


Maria do Carmo Mendes de Oliveira. Former Executive Secretary of Education in Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Olinda, Pernambuco; June 5, 2017.

Moisés Gomes dos Santos. Member of the Municipal Health Care Council and Community Leader, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; May 22, 2017.


Shisneyida Furtado. Acting Secretary of Health, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; June 3, 2017.

Socorro Araújo. State Executive Secretary of Social Assistance, Recife, Pernambuco; June 8, 2017.

Vera Leão. President of the Municipal Education Council, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 16, 2017.


Abbreviations

BF
Bolsa Família
Family Grant

BPC
Beneficio de Proteção Continuada
Social Protection Benefit

CCT
Conditional Cash Transfer

CEDAW
Convention on the Elimination against All Forms of Discrimination against Women

CGU
Controladoria Geral da União
Comptroller General of the Union

CRAS
Centro de Referência da Assistência Social
Social Assistance Reference Centers

CREAS
Centro de Referência Especializado de Assistência Social
Specialized Social Assistance Reference Centers

CSO
Civil Society Organization

DEM
Democratas
Democrats

DFID
Department for International Development

ENEM
Exame Nacional do Ensino Médio
National High School Exam

FIRJAN
Federação das Indústrias do Estado do Rio de Janeiro
Industry Federation of the State of Rio de Janeiro

FUNDEB
Fund de Manutenção e Desenvolvimento da Educação Básica
Fund for the Maintenance and Development of Basic Education
List of Abbreviations

FUNDEF  Fundo de Manutenção e Desenvolvimento do Ensino Fundamental e de Valorização do Magistério
         Fund for Maintenance and Development of the Fundamental Education and Valorization of Teaching
GDP    Gross Domestic Product
GMM    Generalized method of moments
GNI    Gross National Income
GOBI   Growth monitoring, oral rehydration, breastfeeding, and immunization
HDI    Human Development Index
IBGE   Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística
        Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics
IBGE MUNIC Pesquisa de Informações Básicas Municipais
            Survey of Basic Municipal Information
IGD    Índice de Gestão Descentralizada
INAMPS Instituto Nacional de Assistência Médica da Previdência Social
        National Institute of Medical and Social Services
MDB    Movimento Democrático Brasileiro
        Brazilian Democratic Movement
MDGs   Millennium Development Goals
MDS    Ministério do Desenvolvimento Social e Combate à Fome
        Ministry of Social Development and Fight against Hunger
NGO    Non-governmental organization
NOB    Normas Operacionais Basicas
        Basic Operational Norms
OECD   Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
OLS    Ordinary least squares
PAHO   Pan American Health Organization
PC do B Partido Comunista do Brasil
        Communist Party of Brazil
        PDT Partido Democrático Trabalhista
        Democratic Labor Party
PFL    Partido da Frente Liberal
        Liberal Front Party
PISA   Program for International Student Assessment
PMDB   Partido do Movimento Democrático Brasileiro
### List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PSB</td>
<td>Partido Socialista Brasileiro (Brazilian Socialist Party)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSDB</td>
<td>Partido da Social Democracia Brasileira (Brazilian Social Democracy Party)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSF</td>
<td>Programa Saúde da Família (Family Health Program)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PT</td>
<td>Partido dos Trabalhadores (Workers’ Party)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTB</td>
<td>Partido Trabalhista Brasileiro (Brazilian Labour Party)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDGs</td>
<td>Sustainable Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SERNAM</td>
<td>Servicio Nacional de la Mujer (National Women’s Service)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPM</td>
<td>Secretaria Nacional de Políticas para Mulheres (National Women’s Secretariat)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUS</td>
<td>Sistema Único de Saúde (Unified Health System)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUAS</td>
<td>Sistema Único de Assistência Social (System of Unified Social Assistance)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPA</td>
<td>Transparency, Participation, and Accountability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations International Children’s Emergency Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>