

## Explanations in Sociosyntactic Variation

What explains variation in human language? How are linguistic and social factors related? How do we examine possible semantic differences between variants? These questions and many more are explored in this volume, which examines syntactic variables across several languages. It brings together a team of internationally acclaimed authors to provide perspectives on how and why syntax varies between and within speakers, with a focus on explaining theoretical backgrounds and methods. The analyses presented are based on a range of languages, making it possible to address the questions from a cross-linguistic perspective. All chapters demonstrate rigorous quantitative analyses, which expose the conditioning factors in language change and offer important insights into community and individual grammars. It is essential reading for researchers and students with an interest in language variation and change, and in the theoretical framework and methods applied in the study of how and why syntax varies.

TANYA KAROLI CHRISTENSEN is Professor at the Department of Nordic Studies and Linguistics at the University of Copenhagen.

TORBEN JUEL JENSEN is Associate Professor at the Department of Nordic Studies and Linguistics at the University of Copenhagen.



Studies in Language Variation and Change

Series Editor
Sali A. Tagliamonte, University of Toronto

Studies in Language Variation and Change is dedicated to studies of systematic and inherent variation in language, including contemporary or historical sources. It is concerned with the impact of society, geography and culture insofar as they intersect with the structures and processes of language. Studies in Language Variation and Change is firmly situated in the variationist sociolinguistic enterprise with its roots in historical linguistics, dialectology, anthropology and importantly in the advancing quantitative methods of the field. The series concentrates on book length syntheses of research that engages with the details of linguistic structure in actual speech production and processing (or writing). It emphasizes replicability of findings, consistent reporting and building critical and substantive explanations out of empirical foundations.

#### Forthcoming titles:

Meaning, Identity and Interaction: Sociolinguistic Variation and Change in Gametheoretic Pragmatics by Heather Burnett

Linguistic Variation and Language Change: Synchrony Meets Diachrony by Alexandra D'Arcy

Syntactic Variation in English around the World: Quantitative Methods and Comparative Analysis by Benedikt Szmrecsanyi and Jason Grafmiller

#### Published so far in the series:

Sociolinguistic Variation in Children's Language: Acquiring Community Norms by Jennifer Smith and Mercedes Durham



**More Information** 

# Explanations in Sociosyntactic Variation

Edited by

Tanya Karoli Christensen

University of Copenhagen

Torben Juel Jensen

University of Copenhagen





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108492843

DOI: 10.1017/9781108674942

© Cambridge University Press 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Christensen, Tanya, editor. | Jensen, Torben Juel, editor. Title: Explanations in sociosyntactic variation / edited by Tanya Karoli

Christensen, Torben Juel Jensen.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, [2022] | Series: Studies in language variation and change | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021033254 (print) | LCCN 2021033255 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108492843 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108674942 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Language and languages – Variation. | Grammar, Comparative and general – Syntax. | Sociolinguistics. | BISAC: LANGUAGE ARTS & DISCIPLINES / Linguistics / General | LCGFT: Essays.

Classification: LCC P120.V37 E97 2020 (print) | LCC P120.V37 (ebook) | DDC 417/.7–dc23/eng/20211020

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021033254 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021033255

ISBN 978-1-108-49284-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## Contents

Li	st of Figures	page vi
Li	st of Tables	viii
Li	st of Contributors	X
Se	ries Editor's Preface	xiii
	LI A. TAGLIAMONTE	
Αc	cknowledgements	XV
	Introduction: Analysing and Explaining Syntactic Variation TANYA KAROLI CHRISTENSEN AND TORBEN JUEL JENSEN	1
1	Comparing Syntactic Variables SALI A. TAGLIAMONTE	30
2	Mapping Syntax and the Sociolinguistic Monitor JENNIFER SMITH AND SOPHIE HOLMES-ELLIOTT	58
3	A Columbia School Perspective on Explanation in Morphosyntactic Variation RICARDO OTHEGUY AND NAOMI L. SHIN	90
4	On the Inevitability of Social Meaning and Ideology in Accounts of Syntactic Change: Evidence from Pronoun Competition in Netherlandic Dutch STEFAN GRONDELAERS, PAUL VAN GENT AND ROELAND VAN HOU	120 JT
5	The Predictability of Social Stratification of Syntactic Variants LEONIE CORNIPS	144
6	When Variants Lack Semantic Equivalence: Adverbial Subclause Word Order	171
	TANYA KAROLI CHRISTENSEN AND TORBEN JUEL JENSEN	
In	Index	

V



## Figures

1.1	Frequency of zero complementizers in the history of English	page 33
1.2	Random forest analysis of internal and external predictors for	
	complementizer variation in York	40
1.3	Random forest analysis of internal and external predictors for	
	complementizer variation in Toronto	40
1.4	Frequency of restrictive wh- relatives in the history of English	44
1.5	Frequency of relative who across communities, UK	46
1.6	Distribution of <i>that</i> in subject relative clauses by job type	49
1.7	Distribution of that in subject relative clauses by job type and	
	interlocutors	49
2.1	The research site Buckie, Scotland	63
2.2	Use of negative concord by age	71
2.3	Use of negative concord by interviewer	72
2.4	Use of negative concord by interviewer and age	72
2.5	Use of negative concord by gender	73
2.6	Use of negative concord by age and gender	73
2.7	Use of negative concord by indeterminate type	74
2.8	Use of negative concord by indeterminate type and interviewer	75
2.9	Use of <i>never</i> by age	78
2.10	Use of <i>never</i> by gender	78
2.11	Use of <i>never</i> by interviewer	79
2.12	Use of <i>never</i> by interviewer and age	79
2.13	Use of <i>never</i> by adverbial presence	80
4.1	Evaluation on the status dimension of subject-hun,	
	subject-zaai, subject-zij	131
4.2	Evaluation on the dynamism dimension of subject-hun,	
	subject-zaai, subject-zij	132
4.3	Evaluation on the disapproval dimension of subject-hun,	
	subject- <i>zaai</i> , subject- <i>zij</i>	133
6.1	Distribution of V > Adv word order on 'main conjunctions'	187
6.2	Proportions of V > Adv word order for linguistic factors, social	
	factors and overall	189

vi



> List of Figures vii 6.3 Best model of variable adverbial subclause word order, full 190 data set 6.4 Mixed models effects of variable adverbial subclause word order, full data set 191 6.5 Random forest analysis of variable adverbial subclause word order, full data 192 Best model of variable adverbial subclause word order, 2000s 6.6 recordings with Generation 2 195 6.7 Mixed models effects of variable adverbial subclause word

order, 2000s recordings with Generation 2

196



## **Tables**

1.1	Frequency of zero in I think, you know, I mean	page 36
1.2	Fixed effects logistic regression of predictors conditioning zero	
	complementizer - Toronto (Canada), excluding tokens of	
	I think, I mean and you know	38
1.3	Fixed effects logistic regression of predictors conditioning zero	
	complementizer – York, England, excluding tokens of <i>I think</i> ,	
	I mean and you know	39
1.4	Variation of relative markers (SUBJECT ONLY)	45
1.5	Distribution of relative markers (NON-SUBJECT)	45
1.6	Three fixed effects logistic regression analyses of the	
	contribution of factors to the probability of SUBJECT	
	restrictive relative clauses in the UK	47
1.7	Distribution of relative markers by animacy of the antecedent,	
	subject function only in Toronto, Canada	47
1.8	Fixed effects logistic regression analyses of the contribution of	
	factors to the probability of SUBJECT relative who - Toronto,	
	Canada	48
2.1	Speaker sample	64
2.2	Overall distribution of negative concord	71
2.3	Mixed-effects logistic regression model of negative concord	74
2.4	Overall distribution of <i>never</i> for <i>didn't</i>	78
2.5	Mixed-effects logistic regression model of never	81
3.1	Spanish subject personal pronouns	91
3.2	Regression A	106
3.3	Regression B	112
3.4	Regression C	112
4.1	Factor loadings for fifteen visual prestige measures on three	
	principal components after varimax rotation	130
5.1	Arrangement of components of grammar from outer to inner	
	form (Muysken 2006, 150)	145
5.2	Number of speakers in each cell divided by speaker variables	149
5.3	Occurrences of om and voor	150

viii



More Information

	List of Tables	ix
5.4	Categorical and variable use of <i>om</i> and/or <i>voor</i>	150
5.5	Distribution of <i>voor</i> versus all tokens of <i>om</i> and <i>voor</i>	151
5.6	Proportion of speakers using the 'object' pronoun hun 'them'	
	as a subject pronoun	152
5.7	Token distribution (numerator) and alternatives (denominator)	
	of <i>doen</i> 'do' + infinitive	155
5.8	Use of the orders Aux > Part or Part > Aux by sixty-seven	
	speakers in Heerlen	156
5.9	Categorical and variable use of Aux > Part or Part > Aux order	
	at the level of the individual speaker	156
5.10	Distribution of Aux > Part order versus all tokens combined	156
5.11	T-test/Kruskal-Wallis test for social stratification on the	
	proportion of Aux > Part per individual speaker	157
5.12	Distribution of tokens of the dative inalienable possessor	
	(numerator) and all possible occurrences (pronoun plus dative	
	constructions; denominator)	159
5.13	Proportion of speakers using the dative inalienable possession	
	construction	159
5.14	Distribution of the tokens of the benefactive dative	
	construction (numerator) and all possible standard Dutch	
	for-PP and benefactive dative tokens (denominator)	162
5.15	Social stratification of the six syntactic variables	163
5.16	Frequency and social stratification (yes/no) of the six linguistic	
	variables	163
5.17	Arrangement of the syntactic variables from outer to inner	
	form	164
6.1	Linguistic predictors assumed to influence word order in	
	adverbial subclauses	179
6.2	Informants in the LANCHART word order study	186



#### Contributors

TANYA KAROLI CHRISTENSEN is Professor of Danish Language at the Department of Nordic Studies and Linguistics, University of Copenhagen. She draws upon theories and methods of functional linguistics, variationist sociolinguistics and corpus linguistics in her research, and is a proponent of forensic linguistics in Denmark. Ongoing research projects include studies of word order in main and subordinate clauses, of grammatical features in Danish social media postings, and of the language and genre of threatening messages.

LEONIE CORNIPS is Professor in LanguageCulture in Limburg at Maastricht University and a senior researcher at NL-Lab, Humanities Cluster at the Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences. Her research has focused on sociolinguistic and syntactic variation, bilingual and bidialectal child acquisition, and local identity constructions including linguistic placemaking and belonging. She is currently exploring non-human animal languages, in particular multimodal, embodied and multisensorial interactions by dairy cows.

PAUL VAN GENT is a master's student of linguistics at Radboud University, Nijmegen, the Netherlands. Van Gent divides his time between his studies and his work as a freelancer in the IT sector. Together with Stefan Grondelaers and Roeland van Hout, he has carried out a series of experiments that measure evaluations of variants and varieties in Netherlandic and Belgian Dutch. Van Gent's research interests lie in the wider field of sociolinguistics as well as variation and change.

STEFAN GRONDELAERS is a senior researcher and lecturer at the Centre for Language Studies at Radboud University, Nijmegen, the Netherlands. With Dirk Speelman (University of Leuven), Grondelaers has combined laboratory experiments and corpus analysis in multivariate studies of syntactic variation. After joining the research group Variation and Distance at Radboud University in 2007, Grondelaers has focused on the attitudinal

X



List of Contributors xi

and ideological correlates of variation and change processes in Belgian and Netherlandic Dutch.

SOPHIE HOLMES-ELLIOTT is Lecturer in Sociolinguistics at Queen Mary University of London. She is a quantitative variationist and her research focuses on the role that children play in language change. Her work combines real and apparent time approaches in order to track the developmental shifts made by young speakers within the context of ongoing community trends.

ROELAND VAN HOUT is Professor Emeritus of Applied and Variationist Linguistics at the Centre for Language Studies at Radboud University, Nijmegen, the Netherlands. His main fields of research are sociolinguistics, dialectology and second language acquisition, and he has a special interest in research methodology and statistics. His recent work includes incorporating linguistic similarity measures in the explanation of second language learning, and social, geographical and semantic patterns of variation.

TORBEN JUEL JENSEN is Associate Professor of Danish Language at the LANCHART Centre and the Department of Nordic Studies and Linguistics at the University of Copenhagen, Denmark. His research area is variation and change in modern Danish grammar. Ongoing projects focus on diffusion of linguistic innovations in space and time, intra-individual variation, and the interplay between social/interactional and functional/ semantic factors in explaining linguistic variation and change.

RICARDO OTHEGUY is Professor Emeritus of Linguistics at the Graduate Center of the City University of New York. His work in theoretical and applied linguistics has appeared in major international journals. His interests in theoretical linguistics are in the areas of sociolinguistics, language contact and functional-semiotic approaches to grammar. In applied linguistics, his publications are in the areas of bilingual education and the teaching and assessment of the language of Latinos in the United States.

NAOMI L. SHIN is Associate Professor of Linguistics and Hispanic Linguistics at the University of New Mexico. Her primary interests include child language acquisition, bilingualism, language contact and sociolinguistics. Her theoretical research examines how patterns of morphosyntactic variation are acquired during childhood and how they change in situations of language contact. Her applied work has focused on developing a sociolinguistic approach to teaching Spanish grammar.

JENNIFER SMITH is Professor in English Language and Linguistics at the University of Glasgow, Scotland. Her research is in variationist sociolinguistics, concentrating on the quantitative analysis of



#### xii List of Contributors

morphosyntactic features of non-standard dialects. She has worked in the acquisition of variation in preschool children and bidialectalism across the generations. She is Director of the Scots Syntax Atlas, a digital resource mapping variation and change across Scotland.

SALI A. TAGLIAMONTE is Professor of Linguistics at the University of Toronto, Canada. She has published on African-American varieties, British, Irish and Canadian dialects, teen language and television. Her ongoing research on Ontario dialects focuses on morphosyntactic and discourse-pragmatic features, and using cross-variety and apparent time comparisons in synchronic corpora to explore linguistic change.



#### Series Editor's Preface

## Sali A. Tagliamonte

This volume focuses on foundational issues in the study of grammatical variation and change, what has come to be referred to as 'sociosyntax'. The volume arose from a two-day symposium at the University of Copenhagen sponsored by the famed LANCHART project.¹ The goals of the workshop were ambitious and programmatic: to elevate the research enterprise to a higher level of synthesis, to facilitate discussion of foundational issues, to promote convergence between different approaches and to extend the research foci of scholars from a language-specific to a cross-linguistic perspective. Eight scholars from six countries (Denmark, the Netherlands, Scotland, Belgium, Canada and the United States) came together to present data and results relevant to sociosyntax research, with the instruction to exemplify a foundational issue with a case study probing it. The organizers were Tanya Karoli Christensen and Torben Juel Jensen, and the original set of invited scholars was Leonie Cornips, Stefan Grondelaers, Ricardo Otheguy, Jennifer Smith, Dirk Speelman and Sali Tagliamonte.

The workshop was held in November 2014, at a time when Variationist Sociolinguistics was expanding its enterprise to include new quantitative methods and tools, and there was an expanding concern for research on lesser-known languages and communities and cross-fertilization among scholars. Just a month earlier in October the premiere conference on variation, NWAV 43, was held in Chicago. At that conference, there was a homage to William Labov, who had just retired, and a slate of papers pushing the boundaries of a burgeoning community studying language as it is used in the world. Fresh from this stimulating meeting, we all re-grouped in Copenhagen, about a month later.

In Labov's foreword to *Principles of Linguistic Change, Volume 2* (Labov 2001:xvi), he admonishes researchers of something he considers to be of great importance: 'it is hard to understand the world by rising above it.' In this workshop we did not do that! With a set of common variables to present as case studies, including zero complementizers, general extenders, pronouns, auxiliaries and word order, we literally rolled up our sleeves and got down to work.

xiii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> https://lanchart.hum.ku.dk, accessed 31 October 2021.



#### xiv Series Editor's Preface

To facilitate discussion and to spark interaction among the group, each invited speaker was also asked to respond to one of the other papers immediately after it was presented. This led to rousing debate, sometimes friction, but always jovial appreciation made possible by what many of us experienced only for the first time – an infusion of convivial Danish *hygge*. Late into the dark evenings, we delved deep into the thick of all the problems; we confronted the tension between linguistic and non-linguistic factors; we addressed the still mysterious relationship between production and perception; we debated the dilemma of variants with no semantic equivalence and the nebulous boundaries of grammar and variation. This volume is the result. It embraces an expanded set of scholars as the original participants brought in their collaborators and contributors and were encouraged to make connections across chapters.

Explanations in Sociosyntactic Variation sets new standards for future research, explicitly focussing on the overarching theoretical and methodological challenges posed by studying syntactic variation and offering a body of evidence based on interpretations that attempt synthesis. The research studies focus on syntactic variables but engage with how the broader context influences these constructions and configurations: taking a comparative perspective, scrutinizing how variables are embedded in society, how they operate in conjunction with morphology, how they are impacted by meaning and ideology, whether social stratification patterns are predictable and how to deal with variants that do not mean the same thing or come from the same source. A common finding is that the syntactic underpinnings of language are critical but that this deep, indeed tectonic, component of language is also influenced by a myriad of social, historical, cognitive and functional factors. In sum, this volume champions the idea that scholars in pursuit of insightful interpretation should look broadly and deeply; they should seek explanations of linguistic variables in all the splendid phenomena that influence communication in the secular world, paradoxes and all.



## Acknowledgements

Aside from our author colleagues, who have waited so patiently for this book to be completed, and our families, who have suffered our long nights of work and preoccupation, we want to give special thanks to professors Frans Gregersen and Sali A. Tagliamonte, who graciously offered to read and review the introduction to this volume. It is greatly enhanced because of your insights.

Remaining errors are our own.

