

America's Voucher Politics

What explains the explosive growth of school vouchers in the past two decades? In *America's Voucher Politics*, Ursula Hackett shows that the voucher movement is rooted in America's foundational struggles over religion, race, and the role of government versus the private sector. Drawing upon original data sets, archival materials, and more than 100 interviews, Hackett shows that policymakers and political advocates use strategic policy design and rhetoric to hide the role of the state when their policy goals become legally controversial. For over sixty years of voucher litigation, white supremacists, accommodationists, and individualists have deployed this strategy of attenuated governance in court. By learning from previous mistakes and anticipating downstream effects, policymakers can avoid painful defeats, gain a secure legal footing, and entrench their policy commitments despite the surging power of rivals. An ideal case study, education policy reflects multiple axes of conflict in American politics and demonstrates how policy learning unfolds over time.

Ursula Hackett is Senior Lecturer in Politics at Royal Holloway, University of London. Her Oxford doctorate won the Political Studies Association's Sir Walter Bagehot Prize in Government and Public Administration. She researches religion, race, public policy, and American political development and speaks on American politics regularly at Chatham House and the UK Foreign Office.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49141-9 — America's Voucher Politics
Ursula Hackett
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49141-9 — America's Voucher Politics
Ursula Hackett
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

America's Voucher Politics
How Elites Learned to Hide the State

URSULA HACKETT
Royal Holloway, University of London



Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-49141-9 — America's Voucher Politics
 Ursula Hackett
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108491419
 DOI: 10.1017/9781108868594

© Ursula Hackett 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Hackett, Ursula, 1988- author.

Title: America's voucher politics : how elites learned to hide the state / Ursula Hackett, Royal Holloway, University of London.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019058647 | ISBN 9781108491419 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108812054 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Educational vouchers--Law and legislation--United States. | Education and state--United States.

Classification: LCC KF4137 .H33 2020 | DDC 344.73/076--dc23
 LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019058647>

ISBN 978-1-108-49141-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page vii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xiii
Introduction: Subtle Forms of Circumvention	i
1 America's Foundational Identity Struggles	9
2 Two Dimensions of Attenuated Governance	33
3 The Racial Struggle: Segregation Grants in the <i>Brown</i> Era	55
4 The Religious Struggle: Vouchers and the Church–State Question	79
5 The Public–Private Struggle: Union Opposition and the Educational Establishment	108
6 Tax Credit Scholarships in an Era of Republican Dominance	137
7 Education Savings Accounts and Controversies Beyond	165
Conclusion: Attenuated Governance and the State	181
<i>Appendix</i>	201
<i>References</i>	241
<i>Index</i>	269

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49141-9 — America's Voucher Politics
Ursula Hackett
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Figures

1.1	Example of an attenuated policy design	<i>page</i> 10
2.1	The growth of vouchers: cumulative total of voucher programs in the United States, 1945–2018	35
2.2	Weakly attenuated policy delivery	45
2.3	Deeply attenuated policy delivery	45
3.1	Segregation tuition grant bills passed, 1953–64	58
3.2	Selected southern states' issuance of vouchers in the era of segregation	61
3.3	Direct educational expense grants for children at segregated schools	63
3.4	Tuition grants for children at segregated schools	64
3.5	Attenuating the connection between the state and its segregationist purposes	65
3.6	Racial district characteristics and voucher votes	74
4.1	New no-aid provisions enacted by decade, 1793–2018	84
4.2	Modern no-aid provisions by the Hackett strength index, 2019	88
4.3	Trends in usage of child benefit theory, 1955–2017: cumulative total of judicial rulings	92
4.4	Use of child benefit theory defense by judicial decision, 1955–2017	93
5.1	Education provision language in fifty state constitutions	112
5.2	Invest in Kids Act brochure, 2015–16	125
5.3	Relationship between unionization and voucher votes	131
5.4	Relationship between government workforce by district and voucher votes	132

5.5	Right to Work status and voucher votes	133
6.1	Relationship between partisanship and voucher votes	151
6.2	Relationship between district ideology and voucher votes	152
6.3	Challenge and survival rates by voucher program type, 1955–2017	154
6.4	Judicial partisan affiliation and votes on voucher constitutionality	156
6.5	Program design and judicial votes on voucher constitutionality	156
7.1	Importance of hypothetical family characteristics in perceived deservingness to receive a voucher, by respondent partisanship	170
7.2	Voucher votes by program target category	172
7.3	Likelihood of judicial vote in favor of voucher constitutionality over time	179
A1	Location of case study states	208
A2	Growth of enrollments in voucher programs as a proportion of the school-age population in selected states, 2005–2015	221
A3	Number of voucher programs in operation by state in June 2019	222

Tables

1.1	Three foundational identity struggles	<i>page</i> 14
1.2	The value of attenuated governance in three foundational identity struggles	23
1.3	Strategies for avoiding political controversy	27
2.1	Two dimensions of attenuated governance	40
2.2	Deeply and weakly attenuated policy delivery schema	43
2.3	Divergence and convergence between dimensions of attenuated governance	47
3.1	The value of attenuated governance in the racial struggle	57
3.2	Vouchers in the era of segregation	61
3.3	Two arenas of racial policy alliance contestation: policy framing and design	72
4.1	The value of attenuated governance in the religious struggle	82
4.2	Example no-aid provisions in state constitutions	86
4.3	Bans on “direct” and “indirect” aid for religious institutions in state constitutions	87
4.4	Examples of child benefit theory defense in court decisions	94
4.5	Example state requirements for voucher schools	98
5.1	The value of attenuated governance in the public–private struggle	111
5.2	Unionization of private and public school teachers and workers, 1996–2012	121
6.1	Examples of judicial reliance on the indirect–direct distinction	140
A1	Case study states: relevant characteristics	209

A2	Vouchers, tax credit vouchers, and education savings account schemes by state, value, and participation (selected examples)	219
A3	Southern states' years of first modern voucher program	222
A4	Attenuating and direct rhetoric cited in voucher cases	223
A5	No-aid provision strength: full scoring by criterion	229
A6	No-aid provision scoring table	231
A7	States listed with no-aid provision scores	233
A8	Successful and selected unsuccessful voucher bills, 2005–17	234
A9	Individual legislator votes on successful and unsuccessful voucher bills, 2005–17	238
A10	Modeling the likelihood of a voucher vote being held: logistic regression with standard errors clustered by state	239
A11	Logistic regression with clustered standard errors: individual judicial opinions, dissents, and concurrences in voucher cases, 1955–2017	239
A12	Program age at time of legal challenge by decision	240

Acknowledgments

I am grateful to have a generous circle of colleagues who graciously read and commented upon all or parts of early drafts of this book. Nigel Bowles, David Campbell, Chris Hanretty, Nadia Hilliard, Desmond King, Lisa Miller, Chris Prosser, and the anonymous Cambridge University Press reviewers: thank you all. This book improved immeasurably as a result of my colleagues' friendly and forensic engagement. It has also been a pleasure to work with my editor at Cambridge University Press, Sara Duskow, who facilitated a wonderfully smooth and helpful review process.

Over the years many scholars have helped to bring *America's Voucher Politics* to completion. At Oxford, Christopher Hood, Desmond King, Nigel Bowles, and David Campbell posed a series of searching questions that would shape my postdoctoral research plans and ultimately inspire this book. An alfresco conversation with Sid Milkis helped clarify the conceptual apparatus of attenuated governance when the book was in its early stages. Over a series of coffees in Chicago, Suzanne Mettler kindly gave her feedback and encouragement to various iterations of this project. Over brunch in Boston, Andrea Campbell pushed me to think more about the extent to which attenuation strategies are symmetrically available to conservatives *and* liberals. My work improved greatly as a result.

It would not have been possible to write this book without deep conversations with coauthors and friends. Conversations with Desmond King are never dull. It was a delight to coauthor a paper with Des on vouchers and racial policy alliances, which ultimately fed into Chapter 3. I am grateful for Des's pathbreaking scholarship, continued friendship, and encyclopedic knowledge of the literature. I am also grateful to

my excellent colleague Andrew Lewis. When he won a grant to retrieve materials from Ohio governor George Voinovich's archive, Andy and I had many fruitful discussions about the Ohio voucher effort. We received great feedback on the resulting paper at the Midwest Political Science Association conference, and Andy generously allowed me to utilize some of those materials in Chapter 4.

I presented parts of this book at the annual meetings of the American Political Science Association, the Midwest Political Science Association, and the European Consortium for Political Research. I particularly appreciated helpful conversations on school choice with Linda White, Jim Farney, and Clark Banack over a very expensive dinner in Oslo. And I am grateful to Charlotte Haberstroh and Julian Garritzmann for inviting me to present at the Political Economy of Education workshop in Oxford, where I sharpened up Chapter 5 on the recommendations of Leslie Finger and Tim Hicks.

At the Toronto Political Development Workshop, I found my tribe. This annual event is an extraordinary forum for junior scholars: sharply focused, hour-long discussions of every paper by a team of intellectual heavyweights, coupled with a warm welcome and dinner at Rob Vipond's own home. I am enormously appreciative of the analytical firepower provided over the years by David Bateman, Gerry Boychuk, Andrea Campbell, Gerald Gamm, Nicholas Jacobs, Jeffrey Jenkins, Peter John, Richard Johnson, Richard Johnston, Desmond King, Robert Lieberman, Jack Lucas, Jim Morone, Adam Sheingate, Carolyn Tuohy, Rob Vipond, Tim Weaver, Margaret Weir, Linda White, and Christina Wolbrecht.

I am glad to have many wonderful colleagues at Royal Holloway who regularly lend me their support and intellectual engagement, including Nicholas Allen, Michael Bacon, Sofia Collignon, Yoav Galai, Andreas Goldthau, Chris Hanretty, Oliver Heath, Cassilde Schwartz, and Kaat Smets. I am proud to be part of such an open and collegial department.

To my husband, Chris, my emotional support, relentless cheerleader, fellow political scientist, and dearest friend – thank you for everything.

Abbreviations

ACA	Affordable Care Act
AFT	American Federation of Teachers
BAEO	Black Alliance for Educational Options
CBT	child benefit theory
ESA	education savings account
FHA	Federal Housing Administration
HHS	Department of Health and Human Services
MPCP	Milwaukee Parental Choice Program
NAACP	National Association for the Advancement of Colored People
NAP	No-Aid Provision, a.k.a. Blaine Amendment
NEA	National Education Association
RFRA	Religious Freedom Restoration Act
STO/SFO/SGO	Scholarship Tuition/Funding/Granting Organization
UFT	United Federation of Teachers

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49141-9 — America's Voucher Politics
Ursula Hackett
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
