

Neanderthal Language

Did Neanderthals have language and, if so, what was it like? Scientists agree overall that the behaviour and cognition of Neanderthals resemble that of early modern humans in important ways. However, the existence and nature of Neanderthal language remains a controversial topic. The first in-depth treatment of this intriguing subject, this book comes to the surprising conclusion that collective hunting is a better window on Neanderthal language than other behaviours. It argues that Neanderthal hunters employed linguistic signs akin to those of modern language, but lacked complex grammar. Rudolf Botha unpacks and appraises important inferences drawn by researchers working in relevant branches of archaeology and other prehistorical fields, and uses a large range of multidisciplinary literature to bolster his arguments. An important contribution to this lively field, this book will become a landmark book for students and scholars alike, in essence, illuminating Neanderthals' linguistic powers.

RUDOLF BOTHA is Emeritus Professor of General Linguistics, Stellenbosch University and a former Honorary Professor of Linguistics at Utrecht University. Previous works include *Language Evolution: The Windows Approach* (Cambridge, 2016).

Neanderthal Language

*Demystifying the Linguistic Powers of our
Extinct Cousins*

Rudolf Botha

University of Stellenbosch



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49132-7 – Neanderthal Language
Rudolf Botha
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108491327
DOI: 10.1017/9781108868167

© Rudolf Botha 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Botha, Rudolf P. author.

Title: Neanderthal language : demystifying the linguistic powers of our extinct cousins / Rudolf Botha.

Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019060038 (print) | LCCN 2019060039 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108491327 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108811842 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108868167 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Neanderthals–Language. | Historical linguistics. | Language and languages–Origin. | Anthropological linguistics.

Classification: LCC GN285 .B68 2020 (print) | LCC GN285 (ebook) | DDC 569.9/86–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019060038>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019060039>

ISBN 978-1-108-49132-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page viii
<i>List of Images</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	x
<i>Copyright Permission for Images</i>	xii

Part I Preliminaries

1 Pursuing an Intriguing but Murky Matter	3
1.1 Questions and Concerns	3
1.2 The Approach	6
1.3 Focus and Organisation	8
1.4 Preview	10
2 Telltale Neanderthal Teeth	11
2.1 The Scratched-Teeth Inference	11
2.2 A Cloudy Conclusion about ‘Linguistic Capacities’	13
2.3 Some Decent Data about Scratched Teeth	16
2.4 Uneven Inferential Steps to Handedness, Lateralisation and ‘Linguistic Capacities’	18
2.4.1 The Sound Step from Scratched Teeth to Eating with the Right Hand	19
2.4.2 The Questionable Step from Right-Handedness to Left-Lateralisation	20
2.4.3 The Unsound Step from Left-Lateralisation to ‘Modern Linguistic Capacities’	23
2.5 Conclusion	25

Part II Symbolic Behaviours

3 Making and Wearing Personal Ornaments	33
3.1 The Jewellery Inference	33
3.2 Major Doubts about the Inference	34
3.3 The Link between Neanderthals and Marine Shells, Raptor Talons, etc.	35
3.3.1 At Issue: The Very Existence of a Link at The Grotte du Renne	35
3.3.1.1 Mixed Levels?	36
3.3.1.2 Dubious Dates?	38
3.3.1.3 Evidence from Cueva de los Aviones and Five Other Sites	40
3.3.2 At Issue: The Nature of the Link	44

vi	Contents	
3.4	The Step from Marine Shells, Raptor Talons etc., to Personal Ornaments	46
3.4.1	The Theory of Neanderthal Personal Ornaments	46
3.4.2	The Ornament-Hood of Marine Shells, Raptor Talons etc.	49
3.5	The Step from Personal Ornaments to Symbols	53
3.5.1	Run-up	53
3.5.2	Lessons from the Blombos Debate	54
3.5.2.1	About Telling Exchanges	54
3.5.2.2	About (In)Adequate Conceptual Frameworks	59
3.5.3	The Symbol-Hood of Neanderthal Personal Ornaments	63
3.6	Conclusion	67
4	Producing Cave Art	69
4.1	The Cave-Art Inference	69
4.2	The Hashtag-Engraving Inference	71
4.3	The Red-Disks-and-Hand-Stencils Inference	74
4.4	The Iberian-Caves Inferences	76
4.5	Conclusion	80
5	Beautifying Bodies	83
5.1	The Body-Decoration Inference	83
5.2	The Step from Pigment Use to Body Decoration	84
5.3	The Step from Body Decoration to Symbolic Behaviour	85
5.4	Conclusion	86
6	Burying the Dead	88
6.1	The Deliberate-Burial Inference	88
6.2	The Step from Skeletal Remains to Deliberate Burials	91
6.3	The Step from Deliberate Burials to Symbolic Behaviour	93
6.4	Conclusion	96
7	Leaping to Language	97
7.1	The Language Inference	97
7.2	The Many Guises of Neanderthal Language	97
7.3	A Flimsy Foundation	101
7.4	A Bridge Too Far	103
7.5	Conclusion	106
Part III Non-symbolic Behaviours		
8	Making Stone Tools	111
8.1	Connecting Stone Tools via Knapping to Language	111
8.2	A Dubious Old Connection	112
8.3	The Knapping Inference	113
8.4	Conclusion	121
9	Teaching Stone-Tool Making	122
9.1	Connecting Stone Tools via Teaching to Language	122
9.2	The Knapping-Pedagogy Inference	122
9.3	Conclusion	126

Contents	vii
10 Hunting Big Game	128
10.1 ‘Excellent Tacticians, Casual Executioners and Discerning Diners’	128
10.2 The Hunting Inference: Its Anatomy	129
10.3 The Hunting Inference: Its Soundness	133
10.4 Conclusion	137
Part IV Implications	
11 Dispersing the Murk	141
11.1 Retrospect	141
11.2 The No-Language Inference	142
11.3 Inferences from Biological Attributes	144
11.3.1 Genes and Brains	144
11.3.2 The <i>FOXP2</i> Inference	145
11.3.3 The Brain Inference	148
11.3.4 Conclusions	152
11.4 The Primacy of Warrants	152
11.5 The Nature of the Beast	154
<i>Notes</i>	158
<i>References</i>	179
<i>Index</i>	204

Figures

2.1 Basic structure of a simple window inference about language evolution	<i>page</i> 12
2.2 The scratched-teeth inference	13
2.3 Two-layered structure of a simple window inference about language evolution	26
3.1 The jewellery inference	34
4.1 The hashtag-engraving inference	72
4.2 The red-disks-and-hand-stencils inference	76
4.3 The Iberian-caves inference	78
5.1 The body-decoration inference	84
6.1 The deliberate-burial inference	90
7.1 The language inference	98
8.1 The knapping inference	113
8.2 Recursive flake production in making Karari scrapers	118
8.3 Proposed action sequence of a basic ‘flake’ operation in tool knapping, displayed in terms of a tree-like organisation	119
9.1 The knapping-pedagogy inference	124
10.1 The hunting inference	130
11.1 The no-language inference	143
11.2 The <i>FOXP2</i> inference	146
11.3 The brain inference	149

Images

1.1 A cast of the skull of The Old Man of La Chapelle- aux-Saints	<i>page</i> 5
2.1 Scratches on three Vindija maxillary teeth	17
3.1 Pierced and grooved body ornaments (pendants) from the Grotte du Renne attributed to Neanderthals	36
3.2 The perforated marine shells from level II of Cueva de los Aviones	41
3.3 A left talon of a white-tailed eagle recovered at Krapina. Shown are a highly polished area (a) and two cut marks (arrow) above it	41
3.4 <i>Aspa marginata</i> shells from the Mousterian of Fumane Cave, Italy	43
3.5 A <i>Conus</i> shell, referred to as 'Conus 2', probably originating from Border Cave layer 1 RGSB	50
3.6 Middle Stone Age <i>Nassarius kraussianus</i> shell beads from Blombos Cave, South Africa	55
4.1 The hashtag engraving from Gorham's Cave, Gibraltar	71
4.2 A red hand stencil from El Castillo Cave Frieze G	75
4.3 A red scalariform (ladder-shaped) sign, panel 78 in hall XI of La Pasiega gallery C	77
4.4 A Neanderthal handaxe, Moyenville, France, ca. 100,000. Flint 13.9 × 10.7 cm	82
6.1 A reconstruction of the skeleton of The Old Man in The Museum of Neanderthal Man at La Chapelle-aux-Saints, France	89
6.2 The burial pit in the bouffia Bonneval at La Chapelle-aux- Saints, France	93

Acknowledgements

This book has been long in the making. And I could not have written it without the generous support of various institutions and persons.

The institutions include two universities and an institute for advanced study. The History Department at Stellenbosch University has offered me a hospitable academic environment in which I have been able to work unencumbered by cares of a non-academic sort. Two chairpersons of this department, Albert Grundlingh and Anton Ehlers, deserve my heartfelt thanks for their unflagging support.

My formal association with Utrecht University, and specifically with the Utrecht Institute of Linguistics, has been a source of constant intellectual and material support. This includes access to the impressive collections of the Utrecht University Library. I am deeply indebted to Martin Everaert, Henriëtte de Swart and Frank Wijnen, three directors of this vibrant institute, for allowing me to share in its resources.

I was able to spend some time at the Stellenbosch Institute for Advanced Study (STIAS), during which I was able to work on a part of the manuscript of the present book. At STIAS, I benefited greatly from the steps taken by its management and staff to create conditions favourable to focused intellectual work.

Various scholars made significant contributions to the content of this book. Some gave freely of their time to listen to my story, their questions and comments prodding me to clarify my thinking. For this, Martin Everaert and Riny Huijbregts deserve special thanks. Others perceptively read and re-read my manuscript. Their comments and suggestions contributed substantially to its final version. In this regard, I owe a special debt of gratitude to Tom Wynn, who read the manuscript twice, to Fred Coolidge and to Iain Davidson.

Walter Winckler went through the manuscript in more than one version. I am most grateful to him for constructively suggesting numerous improvements in both its conceptualisation and formulation. The diagrams and images used in some chapters owe their existence to the computer skills of Connie

Acknowledgements

xi

Park, whom I would like to thank in addition for the patience with which she met my ‘evolving’ requests.

Finally, my wife, Hanna, deserves much more in the way of gratitude than I can express in a couple of sentences. Without her unflagging support, both emotionally and otherwise, this book would not have existed.

Copyright Permission for Images

The following persons and/or organisations (alphabetically) have kindly given permission for the use of the images in this book:

Cedric Beauval: Image 6.2, The burial pit in the bouffia Bonneval at La Chapelle-aux-Saints, France.

© **Bone Clones, Inc., www.boneclones.com:** Image 1.1, Cast of the reconstructed skull of The Old Man of La Chapelle-aux-Saints.

Croatian Natural History Museum: Image 3.3, A left talon of a white-tailed eagle recovered at Krapina.

Francesco d’Errico: Image 3.5, A *Conus* shell, referred to as ‘*Conus 2*’, probably originating from Border Cave layer 1 RGBS.

David Frayer: Image 2.1, Scratches on three Vindija maxillary teeth.

Christopher Henshilwood: Image 3.6, Middle Stone Age *Nassarius kraussianus* shell beads from Blombos Cave, South Africa.

The Museum of Neanderthal Man: Image 6.1, A reconstruction of the skeleton of The Old Man in The Museum of Neanderthal Man at La Chapelle-aux-Saints, France.

Marco Peresani: Image 3.4, *Aspa marignata* shells from the Mousterian of Fumane Cave (Italy).

Marian Vanhaeren and Michèle Julien: Image 3.1, Pierced and grooved body ornaments (pendants) from the Grotte du Renne attributed to Neanderthals.

Thomas Wynn: Image 4.4, A Neanderthal handaxe, Moyenville, France.

João Zilhão: Image 3.2, The perforated marine shells from level II of Cueva de los Aviones; Image 4.1, The hashtag engraving from Gorham’s Cave, Gibraltar; Image 4.2, A red hand stencil from El Castillo Cave Frieze G; Image 4.3, A red scalariform (ladder-shaped) sign, panel 78 in hall XI of La Pasiega gallery C.