

Ambrose, Augustine, and the Pursuit of Greatness

Since Aristotle, the concept of the magnanimous or great-souled man was employed by philosophers of antiquity to describe individuals who attained the highest degree of virtue. Greatness of soul (*magnitudo animi* or *magnanimitas*) was part of the language of Classical and Hellenistic virtue theory central to the education of Ambrose and Augustine. Yet, as bishops they were conscious of fundamental differences between Christian and pagan visions of virtue. Greatness of soul could not be appropriated wholesale. Instead, the great-souled man had to be baptized to conform with Christian understandings of righteousness, compassion, and humility. In this book, J. Warren Smith traces the development of the ideal of the great-souled man from Plato and Aristotle to latter adaptions by Cicero, Seneca, and Plutarch. He then examines how Ambrose's and Augustine's theological commitments influenced their different critiques, appropriations, and modifications of the language of magnanimity.

J. Warren Smith is Associate Professor of Historical Theology at Duke Divinity School. He is the author of *Passion and Paradise: Human and Divine Emotion in the Thought of Gregory of Nyssa* (Crossroad, 2004) and *Christian Grace and Pagan Virtue: The Theological Foundation of Ambrose's Ethics* (Oxford University Press, 2011).





Ambrose, Augustine, and the Pursuit of Greatness

J. WARREN SMITH

Duke University





CAMBRIDGE LINIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108490740
DOI: 10.1017/9781108854764

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data NAMES: Smith, J. Warren, 1964– author.

TITLE: Ambrose, Augustine, and the pursuit of greatness / J. Warren Smith, Duke University, North Carolina.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020013861 (print) | LCCN 2020013862 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108490740 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108796392 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108854764 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Magnanimity. | Ambrose, Saint, Bishop of Milan, -397. | Augustine, of Hippo, Saint, 354-430.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC BJ1533.M3 \$65 2020 (print) | LCC BJ1533.M3 (ebook) | DDC 241/.4-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020013861 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020013862

ISBN 978-1-108-49074-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



In meorum magistrorum memoriam

Abraham J. Malherbe

(1930-2012)

who first taught me to read Christian texts in their Greco-Roman context

Marilyn McCord Adams

(1943-2017)

who with warmth taught me that studying historical theology is doing theology

et potissime

Rowan A. Greer

(1934-2014)

who taught me how to see the Fathers as broken lights that nonetheless give flashes of insight into the One who is light and life

Sir Thomas More: Why not be a teacher? You'd be a fine teacher; perhaps a great one.

Richard Rich: If I was, who would know it? Sir Thomas More: You; your pupils; your friends; God. Not a bad public, that.

Robert Bolt, A Man for All Seasons





Contents

Acknowledgments		page ix	
Li	st of Abbreviations	xi	
Int	troduction	I	
	PART I THE PROBLEM OF GREATNESS AND		
	THE GREAT-SOULED MAN FROM PLATO TO PLUTAR	СН	
I	Greatness of Soul: The Perfection of Classical Virtue	23	
2	The Roman Ideal of Great-Souled Men	68	
	PART II AMBROSE'S GREAT-SOULED CHRISTIANS		
3	Ambrose: Law, Gospel, and Exemplary Patriarchs	107	
4	Toward a Higher Standard of Greatness: Renarrating		
	Perfection	132	
5	Humiliation without Shame or Resentment	168	
	PART III AUGUSTINE AND THE MAGNUS ANIMUS		
6	Augustine: The "Sublime Indifference" of Greatness?	195	



viii	i Contents	
7	The Witness of Death and the Witness of Conscience: Augustine and the Shaming of Roman Virtue	237
Epilogue: The End of Virtue		269
	bliography dex	275 287



Acknowledgments

This book grew out of the research that I began more than ten years ago for a previous monograph. Consequently, the content and the production of this volume have been influenced and made possible through the contribution of many scholars and friends. Not the least of these are Duke's PhD and ThD graduate students who, as research assistants, spent hours tracking down books in the libraries at Duke and elsewhere, recording chapters on audio files, proofreading these chapters, and being conversation partners along the way: Arial Bybee Lawson, David Fink, John Slotemaker, Jennifer Berry, Katie Benjamin, Jennifer Benedict, Erin Galgay Walsh, Tom McGlothlin, Julia Lillis, Daniel Becerra, Brad Boswell, Taylor Ross, Colum Dever, Nathan Tilley, Bobby Douglas, Jillian Marcantonio, Aaron Ebert, Nathaniel Brotzman, Wilco de Vries, and Shin-fung Hung. Every reader will join me in thanking Judith Heyhoe, whose editorial work on this manuscript throughout its writing has made it infinitely more readable. If monographs like this are to be a part of real conversations among scholars seeking to piece together a picture of early Christian thought, then the scholar cannot write in the solitude of her study. Indeed, considerable insight can be gained through public presentations, even of ideas that are a little more than half-baked. For this reason, I am grateful to George Kalanzis and Greg Lee of the Wheaton Center for Early Christian Studies for inviting me to give the Papatheofanis Lecture in 2012 and Father Robert Grant and Ethan Gannaway of the Academy for the Study of St. Ambrose of Milan at St. Ambrose University in Davenport, Iowa, for asking me to give one of the plenary lectures for the "St. Ambrose of Milan: (Re)Constructing Community" conference in April 2018.



Acknowledgments

A number of colleagues in the guild have proven invaluable conversation partners along the way through our email correspondence, helping me think through various issues. Among these are Lewis Ayres, Patout Burns, Phillip Cary, John Cavidini, Marcia Colish, Brian P. Dunkle, the late William Harmless, Han-luen Kantzer Komline, John Kenney, Greg Lee, David Meconi, Zlatko Plese, and James Wetzel.

It is no small favor to ask of a colleague that she read a manuscript in draft. It is, however, a necessary favor, for we all have blind spots. We reach a point where we have lost any objectivity about our writing either because we have dubiously fallen in love with the majesty of our own prose or because we are certain our argument is right. The converse may also be true. We may be so close to the project that we doubt whether we can trust our own judgment of the work's clarity or cogency. We need to see the project through others' eyes and hear frank reactions. I am extremely thankful for those who have been my second set of eyes for various parts of this book: Jed Atkins, Paul Blowers, Luke Bretherton, Patout Burns, Jason Byassee, Marcia Colish, Jesse Couenhoven, Ashley Hairston, Stanley Hauerwas, George Parsenios, Kavin Rowe, and Dan Williams. Lastly, I am grateful to my editor Beatrice Rehl, and to Eilidh Burrett and all those at Cambridge University Press whose labors have brought these thoughts to the light of day.

Since one's personal and professional lives cannot be placed in states of quarantine but bleed into each other, bringing their respective pleasures and frustrations, I must thank my wife, Kim, and our children, Katherine and Thomas, whose love reminds me that the joy of unmerited grace far surpasses any delight one finds in one's own virtue and accomplishments. Thank you for taking me out of myself and giving me moments of self-forgetting. Even if not truly analogous to Monica and Augustine's fellowship in Ostia, our life together provides moments that are in their own way a foretaste of the Kingdom.

There is one other I should thank. When I was in high school, my father, W. Thomas Smith, published *Augustine: His Life and Thought* (John Knox, 1980), which he dedicated to me. In the inscription to my personal copy, he wrote, "Someday you will write a book on Augustine and dedicate it to your father." That dedication came in a book, not on Augustine but on Gregory of Nyssa. This book is a partial repayment of the profound debt I owe to the man who shared his love of church history with his son and made Augustine come alive.

Super omnia, Deo omnia gloria et honor et laus.



Abbreviations

Abr. De Abraham Ambrose Alc. Alcibiades Plutarch Plato Alc. 1 Alcibiades, I Alc. 2 Alcibiades, II Plato An. Post. Analytica Posteriora Aristotle Annales **Tacitus** Ann.Apol.Apology for David Ambrose Artax. Artaxerxes Plutarch b. vita De beata vita Augustine ben. De beneficiis Seneca c. duas ep. Pel. Contra duas epistulas Pelagianorum Augustine c. Faust. Contra Faustum Augustine c. Jul. Contra Julianum Manicheum Augustine Cain De Cain et Abel Ambrose Cat. Min. Cato Minor Plutarch CCSLCorpus Christianorum Series Latina civ. Dei De civitate Dei Augustine clem. De clementia Seneca Conf. Confessiones Augustine Constant. De constantia sapientis Seneca CSEL Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum De amicitia Cicero De amic. de Or. de Oratore Cicero De tranq. De tranquillitate animi Plutarch anim. Disc. Discourses **Epictetus** div. qu. De diversis quaestionibus octoginta tribus Augustine doc. Chr. De doctrina Christiana Augustine



xii

List of Abbreviations

en. Ps.	enarrationes in Psalmos	Augustine
ench.	enchiridion ad Laurentium de fide spe et	Augustine
	caritate	C
Ep.	Epistulae	Seneca
ep. Jo.	In epistulam Joannis ad Parthos tractatus	Augustine
Eth. Eud.	Ethica Eudemia	Aristotle
Eth. Nic.	Ethica Nicomachea	Aristotle
fin.	De finibus	Cicero
Her. F.	Hercules Furens	Seneca
Hex.	Hexameron	Ambrose
Iac.	De Iacob et uita beata	Ambrose
II.	Iliad	Homer
Inst. ora.	Institutio oratoria	Quintilian
inv. rhet.	De inventione rhetorica	Cicero
Ios.	De Ioseph	Ambrose
Ira	De Ira	Seneca
Is.	De Isaac vel anima	Ambrose
Luc.	Expositio euangelii secundum Lucam	Ambrose
Max. cum	Maxime cum principibus philosopho	Seneca
prin.	musume cum principione princeopno	Scheeu
Med.	Meditations	Marcus
111001	THE WINDS	Aurelius
Nab.	De Nabuthae	Ambrose
nat. d.	De natura deorum	Cicero
NPNF	Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers	Ciccio
Od.	Odyssey	Homer
Off.A.	De Officiis	Ambrose
Off.C.	De Officiis	Cicero
paen.	De paenitentia	Ambrose
pat.	De patientia	Augustine
Phdr.	Phaedrus	Plato
Phoc.	Phocion	Plutarch
PL	Patrologia Latina	Tiutaicii
Pol.	Politica	Aristotle
Prae. ger. reip.	Praecepta gerendae reipublicae	Plutarch
psal.	Expositio psalmi	Ambrose
Resp.	Respublica	Plato
Rb.	Rhetoric	Aristotle
S.	Sermones	Augustine
sacr.	De sacramentis	Ambrose
SC SC	Source Chrétiennes	Timbrose
Sol.	Soliliquia	Augustine
Spir.	De Spiritu sancto	Ambrose
Sym.	Symposium	Plato
Them.	Themisocles	Plutarch
inem.	1 Wernisocies	riutarcii



List of Abbreviations

xiii

Trin.De TrinitateAugustineTusc.Tusculanae disputationesCicerovera rel.De vera religioneAugustinevirg.De virginibusAmbrose

