

## Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	page xi
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xv
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	xxv
<i>List of Acronyms, Abbreviations and Frequently Cited Works</i>	xxxviii
PART I CHARITIES AND ACCUMULATION DELINEATED	
<b>1 Introduction</b>	3
1.1 Why Investigate the Accumulation of Assets by Charities?	3
1.1.1 Why Do Charities Matter?	4
1.1.2 Why Does Accumulation Matter?	6
1.2 Key Concepts	7
1.2.1 Charities and Not-for-Profits	7
1.2.2 Accumulation	11
1.3 Research Questions	14
1.4 Methodology	16
1.4.1 What Legal Constraints Apply to Accumulation by Charities and Do Those Constraints Address the Key Issues Raised by Accumulation?	16
1.4.2 To the Extent that Existing Legal Constraints Do Not Address the Key Issues Raised by Accumulation, How Could They Be Reformed to Better Address Those Issues?	18
1.5 Book Structure	19
<b>2 The Charity Sector, Its Goals and Accumulation</b>	21
2.1 Introduction	21
2.2 Charity Sector	22

2.3	Goals of the Charity Sector and of Charity Law	25
2.3.1	Charity Law	25
2.3.2	Theories Explaining the Existence of the Charity Sector	26
2.3.3	Themes Emerging	28
2.4	Accumulation by Charities	31
2.4.1	Accumulation in Each Jurisdiction	31
2.4.2	Areas of High Accumulation	34
2.5	Reasons for Accumulation and Implications Arising	35
2.5.1	Reason 1: Financial Sustainability of the Accumulating Charity	35
2.5.2	Reason 2: Independence	37
2.5.3	Reason 3: Improved Allocation Efficiency	37
2.5.4	Implication 1: The Intergenerational Deferral of Benefits	38
2.5.5	Implication 2: Which Generation Decides the Intergenerational Distribution of Benefits?	43
2.5.6	Implication 3: Enhanced Agency Costs	47
2.6	Conclusion	49

## PART II CHARITIES AND ACCUMULATION DELIMITED

<b>3</b>	<b>Legal Restraints on Accumulation Applicable on Creation</b>	<b>53</b>
3.1	Introduction	53
3.2	Outline of Perpetuities Rules	54
3.3	Statutory Abolition of Perpetuities Restraints?	56
3.3.1	Abolition Resulting in No Perpetuities Accumulation Rules	56
3.3.2	Abolition Leaving the Common Law Accumulation Rule in Place	58
3.4	Common Law Accumulation Rule	60
3.4.1	The Link between the Remoteness Rule and the Accumulation Rule	61
3.4.2	What Item of Property Does the Accumulated Income Represent?	63
3.4.3	Case Law on a Vesting in Charitable Purposes	64
3.4.4	Underlying Principles and Conclusion as to Vesting	74
3.5	Reformed Statutory Accumulation Rules	76
3.5.1	Initial Disposition	77
3.5.2	Subsequent Disposition	79
3.5.3	An Alternative Interpretation of the Statutory Perpetuities Constraints	83

		<i>Contents</i>	vii
	3.6	Charity Validity	87
	3.7	Conclusion	92
<b>4</b>		<b>Operational Restraints on Accumulation: Controller Duties</b>	<b>95</b>
	4.1	Introduction	95
	4.2	Controller Duties Arising from Legal Form	96
	4.2.1	Charitable Trusts	97
	4.2.2	Companies and Nonprofit Corporations	98
	4.2.3	Incorporated Associations/Societies and CIOs	102
	4.2.4	Unincorporated Associations	104
	4.3	Application of Controller Duties to Accumulation	106
	4.3.1	'Duty' to Retain Endowment	107
	4.3.2	Duty to Act upon Genuine Consideration	109
	4.3.3	Duty of Impartiality	116
	4.3.4	A Purported 'Duty' to Distribute Income within a Reasonable Period of Receipt	123
	4.4	Conclusion	124
<b>5</b>		<b>Operational Restraints on Accumulation: Alternative Control Mechanisms</b>	<b>128</b>
	5.1	Introduction	128
	5.2	Directly Controlling Accumulation	129
	5.2.1	Administrative Schemes	131
	5.2.2	Charity Proceedings Legislation	135
	5.2.3	Cy-près Schemes	137
	5.2.4	Trustee Expediency Provisions	146
	5.3	External Administration as a Means of Indirectly Controlling Accumulation	147
	5.3.1	Winding-up	147
	5.3.2	Removing and Replacing Controllers	149
	5.4	Member Action	152
	5.4.1	Controlling Directors	152
	5.4.2	Amending the Constitution to Remove Accumulation Requirements	155
	5.5	Conclusion	156
<b>6</b>		<b>Operational Restraints on Accumulation: Taxation</b>	<b>160</b>
	6.1	Introduction	160
	6.2	Income Tax Exemption – The Operational/'Application-for- Purposes' Requirement	161

6.2.1	The Conventional View: Direct or Active Use of Income and Assets	164
6.2.2	Interrogating the Conventional View	167
6.2.3	Does the Additional ‘Governing Rules’ Condition Affect the Interpretation of the ‘Application-for-Purposes’ Rule?	178
6.2.4	Charitable Institutions	179
6.2.5	Conclusion on the Operational/‘Application-for-Purposes’ Test	181
6.3	Minimum Distribution Requirements	183
6.4	Endowment Excise Tax	187
6.5	Conclusion	188
PART III CHARITIES AND ACCUMULATION REFORMED		
7	<b>Intergenerational Justice and the Intergenerational Distribution of Benefits</b>	193
7.1	Introduction	193
7.2	Approach of the Existing Accumulation Rules	194
7.3	A Normative Basis for Intergenerational Distribution of Benefits	196
7.3.1	Intergenerational Justice	197
7.3.2	Interaction with Economic Efficiency	202
7.4	Implementing a Focus on Intergenerational Justice	205
7.4.1	Social Welfare Functions as Tools to Assist with the Practical Difficulties	208
7.4.2	Charities Focus on Efficiency and the State Focuses on Intergenerational Distribution by Way of the Tax System	211
7.4.3	Minimum Distribution Rules	213
7.4.4	Intervention by a Regulator to Determine the Intergenerational Distribution	216
7.4.5	Requiring That Charity Controllers Have Regard to Principles of Intergenerational Justice	217
7.5	Conclusion	223
8	<b>Which Generation Decides the Intergenerational Distribution of Benefits?</b>	225
8.1	Introduction	225
8.2	Gaps in the Decision-Making Ability of the Present Generation	226

8.3	Normative Bases for Providing Present and Future Generations with Greater Decision-Making Ability about the Intergenerational Distribution of Benefits	230
8.3.1	Cy-près Insights into the Normative Bases	231
8.3.2	Intergenerational Justice Insights into the Normative Bases	237
8.3.3	Conclusions about the Normative Bases	240
8.4	Implementing Reform	243
8.4.1	Broadening the Grounds for Schemes	244
8.4.2	Greater Charity Controller Discretion to Decide How to Amend Means and Ends	248
8.4.3	Time Period of Protection for Charity Creator Accumulation Restrictions	251
8.5	Conclusion	254
<b>9</b>	<b>Enhanced Agency Costs</b>	257
9.1	Introduction	257
9.2	Market Mechanisms	257
9.3	Enforcement of Controller Duties	259
9.4	Coordinated Action by Regulators	268
9.5	Conclusion	270
<b>10</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>	272
10.1	Introduction	272
10.2	What Legal Constraints Apply to Accumulation by Charities and Do Those Constraints Address the Key Issues Raised by Accumulation?	272
10.2.1	Intergenerational Distribution of Benefits	273
10.2.2	Which Generation Decides the Intergenerational Distribution of Benefits?	275
10.2.3	Enhanced Agency Costs	277
10.3	To the Extent Existing Legal Constraints Do Not Address the Key Issues Raised by Accumulation, How Could They Be Reformed?	278
10.4	The Way Forward	281
	<i>Index</i>	283