

## SHOULD YOU BELIEVE WIKIPEDIA?

As we interact online we are creating new kinds of knowledge and community. How are these communities formed? How do we know whether to trust them as sources of information? In other words, should we believe Wikipedia? This book explores what community is, what knowledge is, how the internet facilitates new kinds of community, and how knowledge is shaped through online collaboration and conversation. Along the way the author tackles issues such as how we represent ourselves online and how this shapes how we interact, why there is so much bad behavior online, and what we can do about it. And the most important question of all: What can we as internet users and designers do to help the internet to bring out the best in us all?

AMY S. BRUCKMAN is Regents' Professor and Senior Associate Chair in the School of Interactive Computing at the Georgia Institute of Technology, where she studies online communities. Bruckman received her PhD from the MIT Media Lab in 1997. She is a Fellow of the ACM and a member of the SIGCHI Academy. She founded her first online community in 1993, and has been teaching the class "Design of Online Communities" at Georgia Tech since 1998. She currently helps moderate a number of large online communities.

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-49032-0 — Should You Believe Wikipedia?  
Amy S. Bruckman  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

SHOULD YOU BELIEVE  
**WIKIPEDIA?**

Online Communities and the  
Construction of Knowledge

AMY S. BRUCKMAN



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-49032-0 — Should You Believe Wikipedia?  
Amy S. Bruckman  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education,  
learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108490320](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108490320)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108780704

© Amy S. Bruckman 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and  
to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

NAMES: Bruckman, Amy, author.

TITLE: Should you believe Wikipedia? : online communities and the construction of  
knowledge / Amy S. Bruckman, Georgia Institute of Technology.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press,  
2022. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021031711 (print) | LCCN 2021031712 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108490320  
(hardback) | ISBN 9781108748407 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108780704 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Online social networks. | Internet—Social aspects. | Internet—Psychological  
aspects. | Internet users—Psychology. | Knowledge, Theory of

CLASSIFICATION: LCC HM742 .B78 2022 (print) | LCC HM742 (ebook) | DDC 302.23/1—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021031711>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021031712>

ISBN 978-1-108-49032-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-74840-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy  
of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication  
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
accurate or appropriate.

For Pete, Noah, and Evan

## CONTENTS

*Acknowledgments* page xi

Introduction: Design and Social Behavior 1

- 1 Are Online “Communities” Really  
Communities? 8  
What Is a “Community”? 9  
Social Capital 12  
Strong and Weak Ties 13  
Persistent and Pervasive Community 16  
Third Places 18  
Online Third Places 21  
Social Roles 24  
Social Norms 27  
Theoretical Summary 29  
Practical Applications 31
- 2 What Can Online Collaboration Accomplish? 32  
From the *World Book* to Wikipedia 33  
Citizen Science 36  
Motivation in Citizen Science 40  
Peer Production and Intellectual Challenge: The  
Polymath Project 43  
Understanding Online Collaboration as a Mode  
of Production 45  
The Structure of Wikipedia 49  
Open-Source Software: The Cathedral and  
the Bazaar 52

vii

## CONTENTS

- Innovation and Leadership in Online Collaboration 57  
 When Good Will Fails: Boaty McBoatface 61  
 Theoretical Summary 62  
 Practical Implications 63
- 3 Should You Believe Wikipedia? 64  
 How Do You Know? 64  
 Metaphysics: Internal Realism 68  
 Epistemology 70  
 Social Construction of Knowledge 73  
 Peer Review 76  
 The Reality of Review 77  
 Should You Believe Wikipedia? 79  
 Theoretical Summary 86  
 Practical Implications 87
- 4 How Does the Internet Change How  
 We Think? 91  
 Becoming Part of a Knowledge-  
 Building Community 93  
 Knowledge Building as a Socio-technical System 97  
 Across Distance 98  
 Echo Chambers 99  
 Threats to Knowledge Building 103  
 Is the Internet Encouraging Belief in Conspiracies? 107  
 Enter the Trolls 110  
 Quality of the Product 114  
 Theoretical Summary 115  
 Practical Implications 116
- 5 How Do People Express Identity Online, and Why  
 Is This Important for Online Interaction? 118  
 The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life 118  
 Expressions Given and Expressions Given Off 122

## CONTENTS

|   |   |     |
|---|---|-----|
|   | Fronts and Roles  | 124 |
|   | Identity Online: Usernames                                    | 125 |
|   | Elements of Online Identity                                   | 128 |
|   | Gender Online   | 129 |
|   | Identity Workshop   | 135 |
|   | Identity Deception  | 137 |
|   | Age and Race  | 139 |
|   | Identity and Communities Focused on a<br>Specific Demographic | 140 |
|   | Subgroup Conversation in a Public Space:<br>Black Twitter     | 143 |
|   | Privacy   | 144 |
|   | Social Networks and Privacy                                   | 147 |
|   | From Anonymous to Identified                                  | 149 |
|   | Why We Need Pseudonymity                                      | 152 |
|   | Anonymity and Accountability                                  | 154 |
|   | The Future of Online Identity                                 | 156 |
|   | Theoretical Summary   | 158 |
|   | Practical Implications  | 159 |
| 6 | What Is Bad Online Behavior, and What Can We<br>Do About It?  | 160 |
|   | What Regulates Behavior?                                      | 163 |
|   | Laws  | 163 |
|   | How Could Laws About Speech be Improved?                      | 167 |
|   | Rules and Social Norms  | 171 |
|   | Online Groups, Civility, and Radicalization                   | 173 |
|   | Technology  | 176 |
|   | Enacting Moderation: Software, Volunteers,<br>and Staff       | 180 |
|   | An Ounce of Prevention  | 182 |
|   | Online Public Shaming   | 184 |
|   | Computer-Generated Content                                    | 185 |

## CONTENTS

|   |   |     |
|---|---|-----|
|   | Exit, Voice, and Loyalty                                      | 188 |
|   | Value Judgments   | 190 |
|   | Theoretical Summary   | 191 |
|   | Practical Implications  | 192 |
| 7 | How Do Business Models Shape Online Communities?              | 194 |
|   | Markets as a Regulator  | 195 |
|   | The Cost of Customer Service                                  | 198 |
|   | The Evolution of Business Models for Online Communities       | 201 |
|   | Business Models as Regulation                                 | 202 |
|   | What New Business Models Are Possible?                        | 207 |
|   | Theoretical Summary   | 211 |
|   | Practical Implications  | 212 |
| 8 | How Can We Help the Internet to Bring Out the Best in Us All? | 213 |
|   | Community   | 214 |
|   | Collaboration   | 217 |
|   | Truth and Knowledge   | 217 |
|   | Identity  | 221 |
|   | Living with and Managing Bad Behavior                         | 223 |
|   | The Need for an Educated Citizenry                            | 225 |
|   | Aspiration and Design   | 227 |
|   | <i>References</i>   | 231 |
|   | <i>Index</i>  | 253 |



## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I had so much fun writing this book – I’m actually sad that it’s done. First and foremost, I’d like to thank my husband Pete Weimann and my sons Noah and Evan Weimann, who listened to me ramble about the book over dinner and on long hikes for years. Evan, thanks for figuring out where to stick the privacy content that needed a place, and I’m sorry there are two anecdotes about your brother and none about you.

I’d like to thank my mother, Cynthia Zucker, for the *World Book Encyclopedia*, and my stepfather, Bernie Zucker, for teaching me about free speech starting at age nine. You are the best parents a person could hope for. I wish my father Robert Bruckman was here to see the finished book – he would be proud.

I found starting this project intimidating. Sherry Turkle gave me excellent advice on the book proposal process, and also told me that my draft chapter was actually good. Coming from Sherry, that meant a lot. I took one class from Sherry in grad school and worked as her research assistant for half a summer, but how I see people’s relationship to computing was profoundly shaped by what I learned from her.

I’d like to thank Nancy Baym for her words of wisdom on why writing a book can be an emotional roller coaster. That helped me throughout this process. Warm

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

thanks to everyone who gave helpful comments on the book proposal, including Gilda Bruckman, Joseph Calamia, Scott Counts, Eric Gilbert, Mark Guzdial, and Barry Wellman.

I'd like to thank the people I asked about climate change for the intro to Chapter 3: Eshwar Chandrasekharan, Michaelanne Dye, J. Alex Godwin, Beki Grinter, Jochen Rick, and Eva Sharma.

Andrea Wiggins Grover helped me with the section on citizen science. Keith Hampton gave invaluable comments on the chapter on community. I couldn't have written Chapter 8 without the brilliant comments I received from David Karger. Wikipedia regular WereSpielChequers gave helpful comments on the Wikipedia chapter.

It was a great pleasure to locate my undergraduate professor for history of physics, Gerald Holton, and tell him that I still remember his class fondly. Thank you Professor Holton for your comments on the philosophy of science content in Chapter 3.

I'm grateful to all the students who gave comments on draft chapters assigned in class, especially Beatriz Palacios Abad, Suood Alroomi, D. Scott Appling, Stephanie Baione, Jennifer Guzdial, Hannah Tam, and Jordan Taylor. Thanks also to former student Vanessa Rood Weatherly and Sijia Xiao. Big thanks to PhD student Daniel Nkemelu for letting me put your homework in the book.

I am not trained as an epistemologist. I am grateful to the real epistemologists on the Facebook group Social Epistemology Network who provided helpful references. I would be lost without your help.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

My Reddit moderator friends have tolerated my rambling about this book project almost as much as my family. Thanks especially to Elizabeth Crocker, Adrian de Novato, Joshua Landman, Benjamin Lippi, Claudia Lutz, Thorbjörn Sievert, and Colin Sullender.

Thanks to Georgia Tech for being a great place to work. Ayanna Howard's time as chair of the School of Interactive Computing matched the time I was writing this book almost exactly, start to finish. I am grateful for all her support – I can't imagine a more supportive boss. My colleague Colin Potts has encouraged me throughout this process, and is my role model for computer scientists who spend too much time reading philosophy.

I have worked with so many wonderful students at Georgia Tech. Everything in this book has evolved through conversations with my graduate students and students in my classes. Thanks especially to my current and former PhD students Julia Deeb-Swihart, Jill Dimond, Betsy DiSalvo, Michaelanne Dye, Jason Elliott, Jason Ellis, Casey Fiesler, Andrea Forte, Sucheta Ghoshal, Shagun Jhaver, Camille Harris, Jim Hudson, Kurt Luther, Sarita Schoenebeck, and José Zagal, and to my advisors when I was a graduate student, Glorianna Davenport and Mitchel Resnick.

I was fortunate to work with Lauren Cowles at Cambridge University Press. Her hard work and ninja editing skills made this a much better book, and I am grateful.