

## Law and the Rule of God

Sharī'a is one of the most hotly contested and misunderstood concepts and practices in the world today. Debates about Islamic law and its relationship to secularism and Christianity have dominated political and theological discourse for centuries. Unfortunately, Western Christian theologians have failed to engage sufficiently with the challenges and questions raised by Islamic political theology, preferring instead to essentialize or dismiss it. In Law and the Rule of God, Joshua Ralston presents an innovative approach to Christian-Muslim dialogue. Eschewing both polemics and apologetics, he proposes a comparative framework for Christian engagement with Islamic debates on sharī'a. Ralston draws on a diverse range of thinkers from both traditions including Karl Barth, Ibn Taymiyya, Thomas Aquinas, and Mohammad al-Jābrī. He offers an account of public law as a provisional and indirect witness to the divine rule of justice. He also demonstrates how this theology of public law deeply resonates with the Christian tradition and is also open to learning from and dialoguing with Islamic and secular conceptions of law, sovereignty, and justice.

JOSHUA RALSTON is Reader in Christian-Muslim Relations at the University of Edinburgh and co-founder and director of the Christian-Muslim Studies Network, supported by the Henry Luce Foundation.



## CURRENT ISSUES IN THEOLOGY

## **General Editors:**

Iain Torrance
Pro-Chancellor of the University of Aberdeen

David Fergusson
University of Edinburgh

## **Editorial Advisory Board:**

David Ford University of Cambridge
Bryan Spinks Yale University
Kathryn Tanner Yale Divinity School

There is a need among upper-undergraduate and graduate students of theology, as well as among Christian teachers and church professionals, for a series of short, focussed studies of particular key topics in theology written by prominent theologians. Current Issues in Theology meets this need.

The books in the series are designed to provide a 'state-of-the-art' statement on the topic in question, engaging with contemporary thinking as well as providing original insights. The aim is to publish books which stand between the static monograph genre and the more immediate statement of a journal article, by authors who are questioning existing paradigms or rethinking perspectives.

## Other titles in the series:

Holy Scripture John Webster
The Just War Revisited Oliver O'Donovan
Bodies and Souls, or Spirited Bodies? Nancey Murphy
Christ and Horrors Marilyn McCord Adams
Divinity and Humanity Oliver D. Crisp
The Eucharist and Ecumenism George Hunsinger
Christ the Key Kathryn Tanner
Theology without Metaphysics Kevin W. Hector
Reconsidering John Calvin Randall C. Zachman
God's Presence Frances Youngman
An Incarnational Model of the Eucharist James M. Arcadi
The Providence of God David Fergusson
Reading the Bible Theologically Darren Sarisky



> JOSHUA RALSTON University of Edinburgh

# Law and the Rule of God A Christian Engagement with Sharīʻa





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

## www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108489829 DOI: 10.1017/9781108779494

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Ralston, Joshua, author.

TITLE: Law and the rule of God : a Christian engagement with Sharīʻa / Joshua Ralston.

 $\label{eq:description: 1.} \ |\ New\ York: Cambridge\ University\ Press,\ 2020.\ |\ Series: Current\ issues\ in\ theology\ |\ Includes\ bibliographical\ references\ and\ index.$ 

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020007787 (print) | LCCN 2020007788 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108489829 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108747646 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108779494 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Dialogue–Religious aspects–Islam. | Dialogue–Religious aspects–Christianity. | Islam and secularism. | Islamic law. | Public law

CLASSIFICATION: LCC BP190.5.D53 R35 2020 (print) | LCC BP190.5.D53 (ebook) | DDC 261.2/7–DC23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020007787

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020007788

ISBN 978-1-108-48982-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Sarah



# Contents

	Acknowledgments	page viii
	Notes on Transliteration and Texts	xiv
1	Christian Political Theology as Comparative	
	Theology	1
2	Neither Conciliation nor Confrontation:	
	A Comparative Approach to Sharī'a and Islamic	
	Jurisprudence	48
3	"That Hideous Schizophrenia": A Genealogy of	
	Muslim Critiques of Christian Theologies of the Law	w 94
4	The Difficulty with Distinctions: Justin Martyr,	
	Thomas Aquinas, and Martin Luther on Law	139
5	Building a Christological Legal Foundation:	
	A Comparative Political Theology after Karl Barth	199
6	The Witness of the Law in Comparative Perspective	e 253
	Conclusion: Toward a Comparative Theo-Legal	
	Discourse	324
	Select Bibliography	330
	Index	343

vii



# Acknowledgments

The ideas of this book began during the halcyon days shortly after Hosni Mubarak stepped down as the president of Egypt. During the spring of 2011, I lived in Egypt, teaching courses at the Evangelical Theological Seminary of Cairo to Egyptian Christians (and one Italian Nun) on Christian-Muslim dialogue. It was in Cairo and then later for two years in Ramallah that I began to wrestle with the central ideas and to write - in fits and starts - the first drafts of this project. The work began when the possibilities of a renewed political and social vision, beyond the confines of dictatorial nationalism or religious slogans, seemed not only possible but imminent. I write this acknowledgment as "wars and rumors of war" engulf much of the Levant, Mesopotamia, and parts of North Africa: the Syrian War continues to displace and kill millions; the chaos unleashed by the United States led invasion of Iraq is unabated; millions of Palestinians still lack the basic dignities offered by citizenship; and populist nationalist parties have gained power and traction across Europe and North America, in part through anti-Muslim, anti-Jewish, and antimigrant appeals.

Writing would have been easier had I heeded Karl Barth's advice to write theology as if nothing happened. But how could I when my Palestinian neighbors were crossing countless checkpoints daily to get to work? How could I write about law being a witness to God's rule when the law was being invoked to justify the eviction of Palestinians from their own homes? How could I dare offer a sympathetic approach to *sharī'a* when Da'esh (ISIS) or the al-Nusra front invoked divine law to justify murder? How could

viii



## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I write hopefully about Christian-Muslim relations when the Egyptian pastors that I had taught in Cairo were posting on Facebook about their churches being burned down? How could Christian theologies of law be untangled from their anti-Semitism, when anti-Jewish attacks and rhetoric were once again prominent in the United States and Europe? How could Christian visions of public law be a source for prophetic and radical possibilities, when the gospel and Christian tradition are invoked to close borders and separate families? I still have no answers to these persistent realities, but I have worked diligently to write about texts and ideas without ceasing to hear the constant interrogations offered by human beings and societies. Even though the arguments of this book only tangentially name or discuss the current sociopolitical realities of Europe, the United States, and most of all the Levant and Egypt, the issues no, the people and their hopes, joys, dreams and sumūd - form the deep motivation of my work.

This book is a major revision of a PhD completed in the Graduate Division of Religion at Emory University. I offer a shukran jazilan to Abdullahi An-Na'im, whose seminar on Islamic Law and participation in my comprehensive exam committee provided the intellectual foundation for much of my research into sharī'a and figh. The inchoate ideas for this comparative project began in a directed study with Richard C. Martin on Modern and Contemporary Islamic Thought. I am grateful to Rich for introducing me to the complexity of Islamic debates, for his engagement with my work, and for his willingness to tolerate my theological inclinations. Joy Ann McDougall's energy and commitment to her students are nearly without parallel. For over a decade, Joy has been teaching me the value of a close reading of a text and the importance of theological passion; she has been an intellectual sparring partner and fellow lover of a long coffee break. Steffen Lösel introduced me to theological conversations and debates, particularly in the German and Catholic worlds, that continue to open my thinking to new possibilities. A long conversation with him deep into the night in the spring of



## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

2013 revitalized my hope that I might complete this project. Even if my Reformed commitments indicate otherwise, Ian A. McFarland's theological perspective has profoundly shaped this book, my broader theological inclinations, and my approach to scholarship. Ian has modeled an approach to theology that is deeply committed to the tradition(s) and simultaneously open to the diversity of the world. For all of my teachers, I hope this work and my continued teaching and writing might bear witness – but not capture – the profound importance of your vocations as scholars and teachers.

At Emory, I am grateful for a broader cohort at Candler and the Graduate Division of Religion that included lifelong friends and models of scholarship, especially Parker Diggory, Carl S. Hughes, Adam Young, Jessica Smith, and Kyle Tau. Those in the community of Clarkson, especially Gad Mpoyo, Luma Mufleh, and Ibrahim, 'Amr, and Tamir Abdelhamed, shaped this work more than they will ever realize. Even after he left for Fordham, John David Penniman has influenced my life and work more than anyone else at Emory. His wide-ranging intellectual interests, friendship, and abiding kindness have been a constant source of scholarly and human companionship – a sustaining gift that allows us to jointly navigate life in academia.

The first version of this work was completed while working as an Instructor of Theology at Union Presbyterian Seminary in Richmond, Virginia, from 2013 to 2015. President Brian K. Blount and Dean Stanley Skreslet were ardent supporters of my teaching and writing, giving me more time to write than I deserved. My colleagues-turned-friends, especially Dawn DeVries, Katie Geneva Cannon, Christine Luckritz Marquis, and Paul Galbreath, profoundly shaped my theology, pedagogy, and ethics. I am grateful for the countless conversations, coffees, and meals that we shared. The interfaith community of Richmond, particularly Imad Damaj, Bill Sachs, and Ammar Amonette, continues to be a model for the type of public interreligious engagement that takes both justice and difference seriously.

X



## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The School of Divinity and the University of Edinburgh have proven to be the ideal location for my scholarship and to engage the growing and emerging fields of Christian-Muslim relations and comparative theology. The past and current heads of the school, Paul Foster and Helen Bond, respectively, as well as the whole support staff in the office led by Louisa Grotrian have created a collegial and engaging environment for research and teaching. My research students as well as students in my courses on Islamic law and Christian-Muslim relations have forced me to return again to the main ideas that animate this work. Matthew Novenson has become a good friend and provided me with countless leads into New Testament studies and the endless debates on Paul. Leah Robinson and I started as lecturers in Edinburgh at the same time and she was a constant companion during her time here. She presses me to consider theology's practical and social meaning, be attentive to lived reality, and also shares a love of good drink and chat. Bashir Saade, Chloë Kennedy, Zoe Marks, David Fergusson, Ulrich Schmiedel, Omar Anchassi, and Abdul Rahman Mustafa have engaged my work in various ways and offered insights and perspectives from their own areas of expertise that have changed, altered, and troubled my writing. No one at Edinburgh merits a bigger thanks than my colleague and friend Mona Siddiqui. She has been a constant conversation partner over the last four years, from our offices in Edinburgh to cafes on the Mediterranean in Beirut to small roads in the German countryside. She has opened doors and opportunities for me that I did not deserve, making work more challenging and interesting. She continually presses me to think and write more clearly, engage more widely, and risk saying what I really think. Her scholarship and commitment to public engagement is a model and inspiration.

Edinburgh has opened me to a much larger community of scholarship and conversation in Christian-Muslim studies. A special work of thanks to the Henry Luce Foundation and their support of the Christian-Muslim Studies Network. The conferences,

хi



## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

courses, symposia, and seminars that we have been able to run and organize have encouraged an interdisciplinary and transnational cohort of scholars. I am thankful for those who have read and engaged my work in this book, especially during presentation at the University of Paderborn, Boston College, Hamad bin Khalifa University, American University of Cairo, Yale Divinity School, the Islamic and Middle Eastern Studies Department at Edinburgh, and the Candler School of Theology. Three colleagues in particular merit special thanks for their critical engagement and intellectual friendship: Linn Marie Tonstad, Klaus von Stosch, and Marianne Moyaert. They will agree not with all, or even much in this book, but all three have made me a better thinker and theologian.

The whole team at Cambridge University Press has provided amazing support. Iain Torrance believed in this project and the book idea with unwavering commitment. The comments from anonymous reviewers and also two previous reviewers vastly improved the book, even if errors remain. Beatrice Rehl and Eilidh Burrett provided invaluable editorial and practical support for this project. I am also grateful to Stephanie Sakson for her expert copy editing, Travis Ables for assistance on the index, and Khaled al-Saai for the stunning art on the cover of the book.

None deserves more thanks than my family.

To my in-laws Jan and Ty Miller: You have endured the perplexity of having your first son-in-law seemingly stuck as a perpetual student. Your love, support, occasional questions about my writing, vacations, and warmth continue to be a life-giving witness to God's grace. It is a gift to be part of the broader family of Riley, Mary Claire, Eric, Molly, Nick, and my nieces and nephews.

To my parents Cathy and Bruce Ralston: You instilled in me a love of the gospel, education, the world, the Golden State Warriors, and the San Francisco Giants. I have been shaped by all those loves, but most of all by the unfathomable depths of support for me. To Joel and Micah, even if I am on the other side of the world and rarely see you or Nickie, Jackie, and the kids, I am proud to be your

xii



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

older brother and to see your commitment to your vocations and family.

More than anyone else, save one, my daughters – Adele Charis and Miriam Noor – are my grace and light.

I owe no one more than my partner in life, Sarah Elizabeth Miller. Her life and vocation – especially in the globe-hopping years that it took me to complete this project – has been a dynamic and embodied witness to the promise of God's justice. You vibrantly live what I can only struggle to write.



## Notes on Transliteration and Texts

Arabic texts and names have been transliterated using the system of the *International Journal of Middle East Studies*. Major cities or countries have been left in common English usage (Mecca instead of Makka), and names and terms cited directly in quotes or in titles of books have not been altered. Biblical citations are from the New Revised Standard Version, with minor translation alterations noted. Qur'ānic citations are from Seyyed Hossein Nasr, Caner K. Dagli, Maria Massi Dakake, Joseph E. B. Lumbard, and Mohammed Rustom, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary* (New York: HarperCollins, 2015), although all have been slightly altered by myself to accord with my own reading of the Arabic.

xiv