CONTENTS

Acknowledgements xiv
List of Interviews xx
List of Abbreviations xxiii

1 Introduction 1
1.1 Apocalypse Now 1
1.2 The Research Framework 6
1.3 Top-down: The Exhaustiveness of Judicial Oversight 10
  1.3.1 ECtHR’s Effectiveness and the Authoritarian State 10
1.4 Bottom-up: Responsiveness to Victims’ Claims 14
  1.4.1 Legal Mobilization: Origins and Concepts 14
  1.4.2 Mobilizing the ECtHR 16
1.5 The ECtHR and Turkey’s Kurdish Conflict 19
  1.5.1 Turkey: The Perpetual Footnote in ECHR Scholarship 19
  1.5.2 Kurdish Lawyers: Contesting State Violence in Authoritarian Settings 24
1.6 Unravelling a Hard Case 26
1.7 Timeframe and Methodology 29
1.8 Layout 32

PART I Turkey, Europe and the Kurds: A History

2 Human Rights and Democracy under European Watch 37
2.1 Introduction 37
2.2 Perpetual Authoritarianism under Polyarchy 38
  2.2.1 Constitution-making under the Shadow of the Military: 1950–1980 39
  2.2.2 After the Coup: The Institutionalization of Constitutional Authoritarianism 42
  2.2.3 The Transition (back) to Civilian Rule 43
  2.2.4 When the Junta Drafts a Constitution 45
  2.2.5 The 1982 Constitutional Regime 48
CONTENTS

2.3 Importing Human and Minority Rights 50
  2.3.1 Historical Origins 51
  2.3.2 Foreign Policy on Human Rights Treaties: A Selective Engagement 53

2.4 European Oversight During the Cold War 57
  2.4.1 EU and CoE: The Political Dimension 57
  2.4.2 ECtHR: The Judicial Dimension 59

2.5 The EU’s Post-Cold War Engagement in Turkey 63
  2.5.1 The Pre-Candidacy Process 65
  2.5.2 From Helsinki to Brussels: 2000–2004 66
  2.5.3 EU–Turkey Relations in Turbulence 68

2.6 Conclusion 76

3 The Kurdish Question in Historical Context 79
  3.1 Introduction 79
  3.2 Empire to Republic: Responding to Kurdish Claims 81
    3.2.1 The Ottoman Legacy 82
    3.2.2 The Republican Foundation 85
  3.3 Kurdish Political Mobilization: 1950–1980 90
  3.4 Law Is Not Blind: Exceptionalizing the Kurds 93
    3.4.1 Suppression of Kurdish Political and Cultural Rights 93
    3.4.2 State Security Courts 95
    3.4.3 State of Emergency 96
    3.4.4 Anti-Terror Law 99
  3.5 Mobilizing in the Era of Counterterrorism 99
  3.6 The ECtHR on Political and Cultural Rights Claims 109
    3.6.1 Political Party Dissolutions 110
    3.6.2 National Electoral Threshold 114
    3.6.3 Local Political Representation 116
    3.6.4 The Use of the Kurdish Alphabet in Official Documents 119
    3.6.5 Kurdish Correspondence in Prisons 120
    3.6.6 The Use of Kurdish in Electoral Campaigns 121
  3.7 The EU’s Impact on the Kurdish Question 122
    3.7.1 The Age of Reforms 123
    3.7.2 Seeking ‘Peace’ in the Shadow of War 125
  3.8 Conclusion 129

4 The Actors, Acts and Victims of State Violence 133
  4.1 Introduction 133
  4.2 Actors Involved in State Violence 134
    4.2.1 JITEM 135
    4.2.2 Village Guards 140
    4.2.3 Hizbulah 145
    4.2.4 Confessors/Informants 148
4.3 Acts of State Violence 149
   4.3.1 Enforced Disappearances 149
   4.3.2 Extrajudicial Executions 153
   4.3.3 Forced Evictions, Village Burnings and Property Destruction 156
   4.3.4 Torture 160

4.4 Impunity 165

4.5 Victims of State Violence: Four Stories 167
   4.5.1 Targeting Kurdish Civilians: Enforced Disappearance As a Punitive Instrument 167
   4.5.2 Victimizing Kurdish Women: Rape and Torture As a Punitive Instrument 171
   4.5.3 Silencing Kurdish Intellectuals: Extrajudicial Executions As a Punitive Instrument 174
   4.5.4 Oppressing Kurdish Peasantry: Forced Displacement As a Punitive Instrument 177

4.6 Conclusion 181

PART II Kurdish Lawyers, the Turkish State and the ECtHR

5 Bottom-up: Kurdish Legal Mobilization at the ECtHR 185

5.1 Introduction 185

5.2 Kurdish Human Rights Movement: The Origins 188
   5.2.1 The İHD: A People’s Movement 189
   5.2.2 Solitary Advocates: The Kurdification of the İHD 191
   5.2.3 ‘Living at Gunpoint’: Life and Death at İHD Diyarbakır 194
   5.2.4 The Price of Attestation: Investigating Human Rights under Fire 196

5.3 Kurdish Lawyers Setting Precedents for Europe 198
   5.3.1 Early Beginnings, Converging Paths: The Kurdish Advocates Meet the ECtHR 199
   5.3.2 A Novel Model of Transnational Legal Mobilization 202
   5.3.3 Paying the Price without Getting Full Credit 205
   5.3.4 The ECtHR’s Growing Visibility among the Kurdish Lawyers 208
   5.3.5 The Golden Age of Kurdish Legal Mobilization 209

5.4 The Second Phase: A Less Receptive Court 212
   5.4.1 Turkey’s Counter-tactics: Winning Strike-out Decisions with Unilateral Declarations 213
   5.4.2 Turkey’s ‘Counter-reforms’: Winning a Pilot Judgment 216
   5.4.3 The End of the KHRP, the End of an Era 222
   5.4.4 Internal and External Obstacles to Effective Legal Mobilization 224

5.5 The Legacy of Kurdish Legal Mobilization 226
xii CONTENTS

6 Top-down: The ECtHR’s Oversight of State Violence 230

6.1 Introduction 230
6.2 Phase 1: The Golden Age 232
  6.2.1 The ECtHR on Procedural Issues 235
    6.2.1.1 Admissibility: The Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies 235
    6.2.1.2 Establishing the Facts amid Government Denial 239
  6.2.2 The ECtHR on Substantive Issues 244
    6.2.2.1 Turkey’s Emergency and Derogation Regimes 245
    6.2.2.2 Violence As a State Policy 249
    6.2.2.3 Impunity As a State Policy 254
    6.2.2.4 Defining the Scope of Substantive Rights 257
      6.2.2.4.1 Enforced Disappearances 258
      6.2.2.4.2 Extrajudicial Executions 262
      6.2.2.4.3 Torture and Degrading and Inhuman Treatment 266
      6.2.2.4.4 Forced Displacement/Property Destruction 268
      6.2.2.4.5 Discrimination 270
6.3 Phase 2: Collaborating with Authoritarianism 272
  6.3.1 Turkey’s Era of Reforms: Complying with the ECtHR with an Eye to the EU 272
  6.3.2 Back to Domestic Remedies 277
  6.3.3 A Lost Opportunity? The Search for Truth and Justice in Turkey 279
6.4 Phase 3: The ECtHR’s Reluctant Comeback 285
  6.4.1 Old Wine in Not-So-New Bottles: The Resumption of State Violence 285
  6.4.2 When ‘Partnering’ Goes Wrong 288
6.5 Conclusion 293

7 Conclusion: Assessing the ECtHR’s Effectiveness 298

7.1 Main Research Findings 298
  7.1.1 The ECtHR As an Obstacle to Its Effectiveness 299
  7.1.2 Realpolitik As an Impediment to the Court’s Effectiveness 301
  7.1.3 The Diminishing Impact of Kurdish Mobilization 302
7.2 Recent Developments 304
  7.2.1 Obstacles to Effective Legal Mobilization 306
  7.2.2 Suppressing Kurdish Political and Cultural Rights 309
  7.2.3 An ‘Effective’ Remedy: Turkey’s Constitutional Complaint Mechanism 311
  7.2.4 When Subsidiarity Goes Too Far: The ECtHR As a Rubber Stamp 313
7.3 Implications for Further Research 318
# Contents

References 323  
*Documents of International Organizations* 347  
News Articles 352  
ECHR Case Law 355  
*IACtHR and IAComHR Case Law* 362  
Turkish Legislation 362  
*Jurisprudence of Turkish Courts* 367  
*Turkish Lower Court Documents* 368  
Table of Cases 369  
Subject Index 371