

SPACE AND FATES OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The book offers the first analysis of the influence exercised by the concept of space on the emergence and continuing operation of international law. By adopting a historical perspective and analysing work of two central early modern thinkers – Leibniz and Hobbes – it offers a significant addition to a limited range of resources on early modern history of international law. The book traces links between concepts of space, universality, human cognition, law, and international law in these two early modern thinkers in a comparative fashion. Through this analysis, the book demonstrates the dependency of the contemporary international law on the Hobbesian concept of space. Although some Leibnizian elements continue to operate, they are distorted. This continuing operation of Leibnizian elements is explained by the inability of international law, which is based on the Hobbesian concept of space, to ensure universality of its normative foundation.

Ekaterina Yahyaoui Krivenko is the current Chair of the Interest Group on International Legal Theory and Philosophy of the European Society of International Law. In 2016 she received NUI Galway President's award for research excellence. Her work critically examines theoretical underpinnings of international law and human rights.



ASIL STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL LEGAL THEORY

Series Editors

Mark Agrast, ASIL Mortimer Sellers, University of Baltimore

Editorial Board

Samantha Besson, Université de Fribourg
Allen Buchanan, Duke University
David Kennedy, Harvard University
Jan Klabbers, University of Helsinki
David Luban, Georgetown University
Larry May, Vanderbilt University
Mary Ellen O'Connell, University of Notre Dame
Onuma Yasuaki, Meiji University
Helen Stacy, Stanford University
John Tasioulas, University College London
Fernando Tesón, Florida State University

The purpose of the ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series is to clarify and improve the theoretical foundations of international law. Too often the progressive development and implementation of international law has foundered on confusion about first principles. This series raises the level of public and scholarly discussion about the structure and purposes of the world legal order and how best to achieve global justice through law. This series grows out of the International Legal Theory project of the American Society of International Law. The ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series deepens this conversation by publishing scholarly monographs and edited volumes of essays considering subjects in international legal theory.

Books in the Series

Space and Fates of International Law: Between Leibniz and Hobbes Ekaterina Yahyaoui Krivenko

Why Punish Perpetrators of Mass Atrocities?: Purposes of Punishment in International Criminal Law

Edited by Florian Jeßberger and Julia Geneuss

The Challenge of Inter-legality

Edited by Jan Klabbers and Gianluigi Palombella

The Nature of International Law

Miodrag A. Jovanović

Reexamining Customary International Law

Edited by Brian D. Lepard

Theoretical Boundaries of Armed Conflict and Human Rights

Edited by Jens David Ohlin

Human Rights in Emergencies

Edited by Evan J. Criddle



The Theory of Self-Determination

Edited by Fernando R. Tesón

Negotiating State and Non-State Law: Global and Local Legal Pluralism

Edited by Michael A. Helfand

Jus Post Bellum and Transitional Justice

Edited by Larry May and Elizabeth Edenberg

Normative Pluralism and International Law: Exploring Global Governance

Edited by Jan Klabbers and Touko Piipaerinen

The Future of International Law: Global Government

Joel P. Trachtman

Morality, Jus Post Bellum, and International Law

Edited by Larry May and Andrew T. Forcehimes

Global Justice and International Economic Law: Opportunities and Prospects

Edited by Chios Carmody, Frank J. Garcia, and John Linarelli

Parochialism, Cosmopolitanism, and the Foundations of International Law

Edited by Mortimer Sellers

The Role of Ethics in International Law

Edited by Donald Earl Childress III

The New Global Law

Rafael Domingo

Customary International Law: A New Theory with Practical Applications

Brian D. Lepard

International Criminal Law and Philosophy

Edited by Larry May and Zachary Hoskins



Space and Fates of International Law

BETWEEN LEIBNIZ AND HOBBES

EKATERINA YAHYAOUI KRIVENKO

National University of Ireland Galway





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108488754
DOI: 10.1017/9781108771771

© Ekaterina Yahyaoui Krivenko 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-48875-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To my husband, Y.M.B.S.



Contents

No	te on	Uses of Leibniz's and Hobbes's Works and Abbreviations	page xii		
	Intr	oduction	1		
	Con	ntext and the Main Arguments of the Study	1		
		cture of the Study	5		
		hodological Issues	7		
1	Science and Law in the Seventeenth Century				
	1.1	Main Relevant Debates in Science and Philosophy	10		
	1.2	Political Climate and Law	19		
	1.3	Conclusions	24		
2	Space				
	2.1	The Context of the Debate on Space in the Sixteenth and			
		Seventeenth Century	27		
	2.2	Hobbes on Space	33		
		2.2.1 Hobbes's System of Sciences	33		
		2.2.2 Real and Imaginary Space	36		
		2.2.3 Body and Space	41		
	2.3	Leibniz on Space	43		
		2.3.1 General Discussions of Space	44		
		2.3.2 Space and Monadology	48		
	2.4	Divide between Hobbes and Leibniz on the Issue of Space			
3	The Idea of Universals and Human Cognition				
	3.1	General Philosophical Context	58		
	3.2	What Are Universals?	60		



x Contents

		3.2.1 Hobbes	61
		3.2.2 Leibniz	65
	3.3	Knowledge of Universals and Discovery of Truth	70
		3.3.1 Hobbes	70
		3.3.2 Leibniz	75
		3.3.2.1 Innate and Eternal Truths, Senses, Reason,	
		and the Human Brain	76
		3.3.2.2 Process of Truth Discovery	83
	3.4	Conclusions and Transition	86
4	Law		88
	4.1	Preliminary Remarks	88
	4.2	Hobbes on Law	89
	•	4.2.1 State of Nature and Its Relation to Law	89
		4.2.2 Transitioning from the State of Nature	
		to a Commonwealth	94
		4.2.3 The Commonwealth and the Role of Law	99
		4.2.4 Law as a Border	104
	4.3	Leibniz on Law	105
		4.3.1 Leibniz's Conceptual Approach	107
		4.3.2 Justice	109
		4.3.3 Political Form of Life	113
		4.3.4 Normative Form of Life	118
		4.3.5 Law as a Cognitive Device	122
	4.4	Conclusions	124
5	Inte	rmezzo	127
6	Space(s) of International Law		131
	6.1	Influences	132
	6.2	States as Subjects of International Law	134
		6.2.1 General Remarks	134
		6.2.2 Leibniz on Sovereignty and Subjects	
		of International Law	136
		6.2.2.1 General Context	136
		6.2.2.2 Jus suprematus	138
		6.2.2.3 Majestas	143
		6.2.2.4 Leibniz's Later Writings	145
		6.2.3 Hobbes on Sovereignty and Subjects	
		of International Law	147



	Contents	xi	
	6.2.3.1 Domestic Analogy	149	
	6.2.3.2 Space and States as Subjects		
	of International Law	153	
	6.2.4 Relevance to Contemporary International I	Law 156	
6.3	The Theory of Sources of International Law	161	
6.4	Universality and Possibility of International Law	171	
6.5	Fates of International Law	175	
Cor	nclusions and the Way Forward	179	
Bibliography			
Index			



Note on Uses of Leibniz's and Hobbes's Works and Abbreviations

LEIBNIZ'S WORKS

Throughout this study, the majority of references to Leibniz's works contain two indicators: first, a reference to the original text and, second, a reference to an English translation of the specific source used, when such a translation is available. In all other instances (when no source of translation is indicated), translations of Leibniz's texts as well as translations of other texts in languages other than English are my own. For the original text of Leibniz's works, the Academy edition is used for all works that have been published as such. For later works that did not yet appear in the Academy edition but are published in other collections of Leibniz's works, the reference is made to the collection used. The bibliography contains references to the collections of Leibniz's works used, not to individual pieces within these collections. These individual pieces are always mentioned in the footnotes.

The following abbreviations are used for the most frequently cited editions and translations:

- A Sämtliche Schriften und Briefe (Darmstadt and Berlin: Berlin Academy, 1923–)
- GM Leibnizens Mathematische Schriften, Karl Immanuel Gerhardt, ed., 7 Vols. (Berlin: Verlag von A. Ascher, 1849–63)
- GP *Die philosophischen Schriften von Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz*, Karl Immanuel Gerhardt, ed., 7 Vols. (Berlin: Weidmannische Buchhandlung, 1875–90)
- L Philosophical Papers and Letters, Leroy E. Loemker, ed., 2nd ed. (Dordrecht: D. Reidel, 1969)



Hobbes's Works

xiii

HOBBES'S WORKS

Hobbes's works are mostly cited according to Thomas Hobbes, *The English Works of Thomas Hobbes of Malmesbury: Now First Collected and Edited by Sir William Molesworth, Bart.* (London: John Bohn, 1839), which is abbreviated as EW. Because English texts of Hobbes's works used here are mostly either his own translations or translations endorsed by himself, reference is usually made directly to the English text. In a few instances where Latin text provides additional clarity, the Latin text is also reproduced.

The following abbreviations of Hobbes's works are used:

DeCi Thomas Hobbes, *De Cive*, EW II DeCo Thomas Hobbes, *De Corpore*, EW I

DH Thomas Hobbes, *De Homine*, in Thomas Hobbes, *Opera philoso-phica quae latine scripsit omnia in unum corpus nunc primum collecta*, Vol. 2 (London: Bohn, 1839)

Lev: Thomas Hobbes, Leviathan, or the Matter, Form, and Power of a Commonwealth, Ecclesiastical and Civil, EW III