CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

Making Young Voters

In 2016, 90 percent of young Americans showed an interest in politics and 80 percent intended to vote. Yet, only 43 percent of people between the ages of 18 and 29 ended up actually casting a ballot. *Making Young Voters* investigates what lies at the core of this gap.

The authors' in-depth, interdisciplinary approach reveals that political apathy is not the reason for low levels of youth turnout. Rather, young people too often fail to follow through on their political interests and intentions. Those with "noncognitive" skills related to self-regulation are more likely to overcome internal and external barriers to participation. This book combines theory from psychology, economics, child development, and more to explore possible solutions rooted in civic education and electoral reform.

This potentially paradigm-shifting contribution to the literature of American politics serves to influence not only our understanding of voter turnout, but also the fundamental connections between the education system, electoral institutions, and individual civic behavior in a democracy. How young people vote affects not only each individual future, but that of the United States, and of us all.

John B. Holbein is Assistant Professor of Public Policy at the University of Virginia.

D. Sunshine Hillygus is Professor of Political Science and Public Policy at Duke University.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

Making Young Voters

Converting Civic Attitudes into Civic Action

JOHN B. HOLBEIN
University of Virginia

D. SUNSHINE HILLYGUS
Duke University

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108488426
DOI: 10.1017/9781108770446

© John B. Holbein and D. Sunshine Hillygus 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-48842-6 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-108-72633-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

Contents

List of Figures *page* ix
List of Tables xi
Acknowledgments xiii

1 The Puzzle of Low Youth Turnout 1
1.1 The Problem: Low Youth Turnout 2
1.2 Why Low Youth Turnout Matters 4
1.3 The Puzzle: It's Not for Lack of Political Motivation 7
1.4 Considering Follow-Through The Role of Noncognitive Skills 14
1.5 Theoretical and Policy Implications 16
1.6 Overview of the Book 19

PART I NONCOGNITIVE SKILLS AND YOUTH TURNOUT

2 Rethinking What Makes Voters 25
2.1 Classic Theories of Voter Turnout 27
2.2 The Resource Model 29
2.3 Revising the Classic Theories 33
2.3.1 Revisiting the Costs of Voting 33
2.4 Noncognitive Skills and Voting: Promoting Follow-Through 38
2.5 Building on Previous Literature 40
2.6 The Challenge of Evaluating the Role of Noncognitive Skills 45

3 What Are Noncognitive Skills? 46
3.1 Defining Noncognitive Skills 46
3.1.1 The Malleability of Noncognitive Skills 50
3.2 Operationalizing Noncognitive Skills 54
3.2.1 Data about Noncognitive Skills 57

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

3.3 What Noncognitive Skills Are Not 60
3.3.1 Comparison to Cognitive Ability and Socioeconomic Status 60
3.3.2 Comparison to Personality 63
3.4 Measuring and Testing the Effect of Noncognitive Skills 65
3.5 The Big Picture 70
4 Evidence Noncognitive Skills Increase Voting 71
4.1 Methodological Approach 72
4.1.1 Observational Methods 72
4.2 Observational Results 75
4.2.1 Results from All Available Data Sources 79
4.2.2 Robustness Checks 83
4.3 Exploring the Mechanisms 87
4.3.1 Heterogenous Effects in the Observational Samples 90
4.4 Experimental Methods 95
4.4.1 Short-Term Activation of Noncognitive Skills 96
4.4.2 Short-Term Activation of Noncognitive Skills: Findings 99
4.4.3 Long-Term Improvements in Noncognitive Abilities 101
4.4.4 Long-Term Improvements in Noncognitive Abilities: Findings 103
4.4.5 Fast Track's Heterogeneities 105
4.4.6 Fast Track's Potential Mechanisms 106
4.4.7 Evidence from Other Large-Scale Experimental Designs 109
4.5 The Big Picture 111

PART II PUBLIC POLICIES AND YOUTH TURNOUT

5 Rethinking Civic Education 118
5.1 Civic Education in the United States 120
5.1.1 The Decline of Civic Education in an Accountability Era 123
5.2 Are Facts and Knowledge Enough? 125
5.3 Assessing Civic Education Effects 129
5.4 Empirical Results 131
5.5 Where Does Civics Go from Here? 141
5.6 What Schools Can Do: Rethinking Civic Education 142
5.6.1 What Schools Can Do, #1: Focus on Applied Learning 143
5.6.2 What Schools Can Do, #2: Timing Matters 152
5.6.3 What Schools Can Do, #3: Integrating Civics 153
5.7 The Big Picture 154

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

6 Promoting Follow-Through by Reducing the Cost of Voting 155
6.1 Why Explore the Effect of Electoral Rules on Youth Turnout 157
6.2 Data and Methods for This Chapter 159
6.2.1 Methodological Approach 162
6.3 Results: The Effect of Electoral Rules on Youth Voting 164
6.3.1 Why Do Some Electoral Reforms Work, but Others Fall Short? 170
6.3.2 Who Do Electoral Reforms Help the Most? 171
6.3.3 Considering the Effect of Easing Registering/Voting Overall 171
6.4 Electoral Reforms on the Horizon 173
6.5 The Political Dynamics of Electoral Laws 176
6.6 Considerations in Designing Tomorrow's Electoral Reforms 177
6.7 The Big Picture 178
7 Looking Ahead 179
7.1 Theoretical Implications 182
7.2 Policy Implications 184
7.3 What Electoral Reformers Can Do 184
7.4 What Schools Can Do 185
7.5 What Campaigns and Youth Advocacy Groups Can Do 186
7.6 Directions for Future Research 187
7.7 The Big Picture: Making Young Voters 189
Appendix 190
A.1 Chapter 1 Appendix 190
A.2 Chapter 2 Appendix 192
A.2.1 Interview Guide for Qualitative Interviews with Civics Teachers 192
A.2.2 Interview Guide for Qualitative Interviews with Young People 195
A.3 Chapter 3 Appendix 196
A.3.1 WLS 197
A.3.2 NLSY79 200
A.3.3 NELS:88 201
A.3.4 Fast Track 203
A.3.5 Add Health 204
A.3.6 NLSY97 206
A.3.7 ELS:2002 207
A.3.8 CCES Module, 2014 209
A.3.9 WCPSS 210
A.3.10 Who Has Noncognitive Skills? 216

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

A.4 Chapter 4 Appendix 218
A.5 Chapter 5 Appendix 223
A.6 Chapter 6 Appendix 224

Bibliography 229
Index 251

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

Figures

1.1	Age gap in voter turnout in the United States	*page* 3
1.2	The age gap in voter turnout by country	4
1.3	Political interest among young people	9
1.4	The difference between turnout intentions and actual turnout by age	12
3.1	Distribution of the Add Health Noncognitive Skill Scale	60
3.2	Correlations with other individual characteristics	61
4.1	Bivariate relationship between noncognitive ability and turnout (Add Health)	76
4.2	Noncognitive ability and voter turnout (Add Health, models with controls)	78
4.3	Noncognitive skills and voter turnout	80
4.4	School fixed effects vs. controls (Add Health)	86
4.5	Noncognitive skill development and turnout (sibling, twin, individual FE)	87
4.6	Noncognitive skills and vote intentions, by political motivation	92
4.7	Noncognitive skills and voting, by intention to vote	93
4.8	Noncognitive skills, registration, and voting	94
4.9	Effect of Fast Track on cognitive ability	103
4.10	Effect of Fast Track noncognitive skills intervention on voter turnout	104
4.11	Fast Track's impact on party registration	106
4.12	Potential mechanisms of the Fast Track program	108
5.1	Civics exposure and youth voting	132
5.2	Civics course requirements across states and time	135

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

5.3 Civics course exposure and youth voting (CPS) 138
5.4 Civics course exposure and college student validated voting (NSLVE) 139
5.5 Civics course exposure and validated youth voting (Data Trust) 140
5.6 Effect of First-Time Voter Program on youth voter turnout 145
5.7 Effect of Democracy Prep admittance on youth voter turnout 147
5.8 Effect of Social Action Programs on students' noncognitive skill development 150
5.9 Effect of Social Action Programs on students' volunteering in future 151
6.1 Mapping youth turnout by state 158
6.2 Ease of voting scale across states and time 161
6.3 Effect of election laws on youth turnout 165
6.4 Effect of Ease of Voting Scale (EOVS) on youth turnout 172
6.5 Who implements electoral reforms? 177
A.1 Voter turnout in the United States relative to other countries 191
A.2 Voter turnout by age and generation 191
A.3 Inequality in voter turnout among young people 192
A.4 Noncognitive skill distributions 197
A.5 Noncognitive skills by school context (WCPSS) 217
A.6 Inequalities in noncognitive skill development 218
A.7 Noncognitive ability and voter turnout (Add Health, models with controls: local elections) 220
A.8 Family fixed effect vs. controls (local elections, Add Health) 221
A.9 School fixed effects vs. controls (local elections, Add Health) 222
A.10 Family fixed effect vs. controls (Add Health) 222

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

Tables

3.1	Overview of data sources measuring noncognitive ability and voting	*page* 66
4.1	Potential mechanisms: Add Health	89
4.2	Results of short-term experiment	99
4.3	Fast Track's effect on noncognitive skills	102
6.1	Overview of electoral reforms (2000–2012)	160
A.1	Correlates of Add Health Noncognitive Skill Scale	205
A.2	Noncognitive skill scales used in this book	211
A.3	Noncognitive skills and turnout	219

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

Acknowledgments

We have many people to thank for help with this project – perhaps none more so than Republican Senator Tom Coburn (R-OK). Senator Coburn does not like political science. For more than a decade, Coburn has criticized the field for being irrelevant, even calling for the defunding of the political science program of the National Science Foundation. In 2013, Coburn proposed an amendment to the government funding bill that would have blocked federal funding of political science research. While many offered a vocal defense of the profession and the broader value and relevance of our scholarship, the criticisms also helped to spark conversations between Sunshine and John, then a PhD student in public policy at Duke, about research topics that clearly married scholarly interest, methodological rigor, and broad policy relevance.

As we brainstormed ideas, the North Carolina legislature passed a repeal of preregistration for sixteen- and seventeen-year-olds: a law that had been passed with large bipartisan support just four years earlier. We realized that for all of the media coverage and controversy about the legislation, no empirical research existed evaluating whether or not preregistration laws were actually effective. That first inquiry sparked a journal publication, engagement in a federal lawsuit, and a broader research agenda focused on understanding youth civic engagement–a topic we believe has both intellectual importance and public relevance.

We are relieved that Sen. Tom Coburn was not successful in killing National Science Foundation (NSF) funding of political science research as we subsequently became grateful recipients of two NSF grants to study the topic of youth turnout (NSF SES-141681, NSF SES-1657821). We are deeply grateful to Dr. Brian Humes, Political Science Program Director,

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

for his enthusiastic and continued support of our research, including plucking one of our proposals from the reject bin of another program. The NSF's financial support has funded a fruitful collaboration with the Wake County Public School System, which has been central to this project. We thank Matthew Lenard, Dr. Darryl Hill, and Dr. Sonya Stephens for making that partnership possible. For providing access to the Fast Track Data, we thank Karen Bierman, John Coie, Kenneth Dodge, Mark Greenberg, John Lochman, Robert McMahon, Ellen Pinderhughes, Jennifer Goodwin, and Jeff Quinn. We thank Jim Moody for coordinating access to the restricted-use Add Health data and Inger Bergrom, Peter Levine, and Nancy Thomas for providing access to the NSLVE data.

At Duke, we want to recognize the Social Science Research Institute (SSRI) and its director, Tom Nechyba, for numerous invaluable contributions to this project. At SSRI, Dr. Alexandra Cooper identified grant opportunities and always helped with the mad dash to pull together grant applications. Our qualitative interviews of civics teachers were conducted by SSRI post-docs, Dr. Noelle Roth and Dr. Jack Zhou. Dr. Steven Snell and Dr. Kyle Endres, post-docs with the Duke Initiative on Survey Methodology (DISM) at SSRI, did the heavy lifting on our original survey data collections. SSRI also helped to fund Duke's modules on the 2014 CCES and provided secure data storage for the restricted-use data from WCPSS, Add Health, and Catalist. Finally, the project received funding through the Education and Human Development Bass Connections Program at SSRI. A big thanks to our Bass Connections teams and undergraduate research assistants: Emily Ahlers, Sarah Ali, Hannah Bartlebaugh, Lindsay Campbell, Eddy Cook, Christian Covington, Noah Eckberg, Ryan Geitner, Carlee Goldberg, Ketan Gupta, Donghun Lee, Matthew Mizota, Sakiko Nishida, Anshul Shah, Kyle Shofi, James Wang, and Eli Weed.

At BYU, we thank the directors of the Center for the Study of Elections and Democracy (CSED) – Chris Karpowitz and Jeremy Pope – for providing financial support, computing resources, and student research assistants. We are especially grateful to all the CSED faculty fellows and CSED student research fellows who helped on this project: Brittany Bair, Drew Brown, Matthew Baldwin, and Matthew Easton. Without the support of faculty at CSED and BYU, this project would not have come to its full fruition. Our colleagues at BYU provide some of the best feedback in the discipline.

At the University of Virginia, we thank Jen Lawless, Christine Mahoney, Jay Shimshack, Ian Solomon, Allan Stam, and Craig Volden for their

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

generous support of this project. We are grateful to the entire Batten School faculty for their in-depth feedback on an earlier version of our manuscript. The Batten community has been incredibly supportive in helping to see this book to completion

The book benefited tremendously from a manuscript conference at BYU in July 2018. We extend a heartfelt thank you to the discussants who provided thoughtful feedback and useful advice: Andrés Blais, Barry Burden, David Campbell, Cindy Kam, Chris Karpowitz, Jan Leighley, David Magleby, and Laura Stoker. The chapter-by-chapter feedback resulted in a major reorganization of the book's structure and too many improvements to list. Thank you to Sven Wilson and Ben Ogles for funding the conference, Carina Alleman who organized it, Matthew Baldwin who took notes, and the following colleagues (not previously listed) who offered feedback at the conference: Lisa Argyle, Michael Barber, Adam Brown, and Adam Dynes. We are also indebted to Kyle Endres, Susanne Haastert, Amy Cummings, and Nancy Heiss for reading and copy-editing the manuscript in its entirety; we apologize for sharing the too-early manuscript in such rough form.

For valuable conversations and advice along the way, we would like to thank Marisa Abrajano, John Aldrich, Elizabeth Ananat, Elizabeth Bennion, Adam Berinsky, Nick Carnes, Eddy Cook, Michael X. Delli Carpini, Kyle Endres, Bernard Fraga, Anna Gassman-Pines, Brian Guay, Edie Goldberg, Hahrie Han, Hans Hassell, Andrew Heiss, Eitan Hersh, Shanto Iyengar, Chris Johnston, Bradley Jones, Sunny Ladd, Peter Loewen, Jesse Lopez, Tali Mendelberg, Gabe Madson, Quin Monson, David Nickerson, Markus Prior, Marcos Rangel, Jason Roberts, Joshua Robinson, Brad Spahn, Lucy Sorensen, Steven Sexton, Sarah Treul, Nick Valentino, Jake Vigdor, Marty West, Ariel White, Ismail White, and Chris Wlezien. We are especially grateful to Steven Snell, Christina Gibson-Davis, and Matthew Tyler for early contributions to this project. Our discussions and debates with all of these people have helped to sharpen our arguments and improve our analyses. We have received helpful suggestions and feedback from participants at various workshops and presentations at Boston University, Columbia, Indiana University, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Princeton, Reed College, Tufts, University of Chicago, University of North Carolina–Chapel Hill, University of Texas, Fordham University, University of Virginia, and the University of Tennessee. We are especially grateful for the Center for the Study of Democratic Politics (CSDP) at Princeton University for providing John with a fellowship to work on this and other projects. We also would like to thank the

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48842-6 — Making Young Voters
John B. Holbein , D. Sunshine Hillygus
Frontmatter
More Information

anonymous reviewers who rejected work from this project so many times that we felt compelled to write a book in order to answer all of their criticisms and questions. It has also been a great pleasure working with Robert Dreesen, senior editor at Cambridge University Press; he has helped to make the publication process the very easiest part of writing a book.

Last but not least, we want to thank our friends and family for helping to keep us sane during the process of writing a book. Sunshine is grateful to the brilliant and fun L.i.P.S. team, Tasha Philpot, Maggie Penn, and Jessica Trounstine, Marco Polos with Suzanne Turner and Stephanie Gergard, her Chez Nous family, the Forehead Flyers, and especially Jodi Koviach, Katy Bartlett, and Amy Cummings for providing much-needed friendship and distraction. John would like to thank Mr. Scholl for being the kind of civics teacher that every student in America deserves, as well as his parents (Gordon and Geraldine), siblings (Julia, Jane, and William), and extended family members (especially Kate Rademacher, Chris Holbein, and Lynn Holbein) for their unwavering love and support.

We are most grateful to our spouses, Joel Hillygus and Brittney Holbein. We dedicate this book to them and to our children: Jake Hillygus, Carter Holbein, and Emma Holbein.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org