

Why Democracy Failed

In this distinctive new history of the origins of the Spanish Civil War, James Simpson and Juan Carmona tackle the highly debated issue of why it was that Spain's democratic Second Republic failed. They explore the interconnections between economic growth, state capacity, rural social mobility, and the creation of mass competitive political parties, and how these limited the effectiveness of the new republican governments, and especially their attempts to tackle economic and social problems within the agricultural sector. They show how political change during the Republic had a major economic impact on the different groups in village society, leading to social conflicts that turned to polarization and finally, with the civil war, to violence and brutality. The democratic Republic failed not so much because of the opposition from the landed elites but rather because small farmers had been unable to exploit more effectively their newly found political voice.

James Simpson is Professor at the Universidad Carlos III in Madrid. Among his many publications are *Spanish Agriculture: The Long Siesta, 1765–1965* (1995) and *Creating Wine: The Emergence of a World Industry, 1840–1914* (2011).

Juan Carmona is Associate Professor at the Universidad Carlos III in Madrid. He has published widely on rural institutions, organizations, and conflicts, including, with James Simpson, the book *El laberinto de la agricultura Española* (2003).

Cambridge Studies in Economic History

Editorial Board

GARETH AUSTIN: *University of Cambridge*

STEPHEN BROADBERRY: *University of Oxford*

SHEILAGH OGILVIE: *University of Cambridge*

ŞEVKET PAMUK: *Bogaziçi University*

GAVIN WRIGHT: *Stanford University*

Cambridge Studies in Economic History comprises stimulating and accessible economic history which actively builds bridges to other disciplines. Books in the series will illuminate why the issues they address are important and interesting, place their findings in a comparative context, and relate their research to wider debates and controversies. The series will combine innovative and exciting new research by younger researchers with new approaches to major issues by senior scholars. It will publish distinguished work regardless of chronological period or geographical location.

A complete list of titles in the series can be found at:
www.cambridge.org/economichistory

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48748-1 — Why Democracy Failed
James Simpson, Juan Carmona
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Why Democracy Failed

The Agrarian Origins of the Spanish Civil War

James Simpson

Universidad Carlos III de Madrid

Juan Carmona

Universidad Carlos III de Madrid



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48748-1 — Why Democracy Failed
James Simpson, Juan Carmona
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108487481

DOI: 10.1017/9781108766999

© James Simpson and Juan Carmona 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Simpson, James, 1953– author. | Carmona, Juan (Carmona Pidal), author.

Title: Why democracy failed : the agrarian origins of the Spanish Civil War /

James Simpson, Universidad Carlos III de Madrid, Juan Carmona, Universidad Carlos III de Madrid.

Description: Cambridge, UK; New York : Cambridge University Press, [2020] |

Series: Cambridge studies in economic history | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019059910 (print) | LCCN 2019059911 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108487481 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108766999 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Spain – History – Civil War, 1936–1939 – Causes. | Spain – Politics and government – 1931–1939. | Spain – Rural conditions – 20th century. | Agriculture – Economic aspects – Spain – History. | Land reform – Spain – History – 20th century. | Democratization – Spain – History.

Classification: LCC DP257 .S48 2020 (print) | LCC DP257 (ebook) | DDC 946.081/1–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2019059910>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2019059911>

ISBN 978-1-108-48748-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-72038-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48748-1 — Why Democracy Failed
James Simpson, Juan Carmona
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

A todos los que sufrieron durante la Guerra Civil
Española

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page ix
<i>List of Maps</i>	x
<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
<i>Notes on the Regional Division of Spain</i>	xvi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xviii
Introduction	1
Part I The European Experience: Economic and Political Development, 1870–1939	13
1 The Modernization of European Societies	17
2 European Agriculture in an Age of Economic Instability	35
Part II Spanish Agriculture, Economic Development, and Democracy	57
3 The Limits to Spanish Modernization, 1850–1936	59
4 Agricultural Growth, Regional Diversity, and Land-Tenure Regimes	78
Part III Explaining the Weakness of the Family Farm	103
5 The Family Farm and the Limits to Village-Level Cooperation	107
6 The Persistence of the Landed Elites and the Nature of Farm Lobbies	128
	vii

viii Contents

Part IV Rural Elites, Poverty, and the Attempts at Land Reform	153
7 Landownership, Economic Development, and Poverty in Andalusia and Southern Spain	157
8 The Limits to Land Reform	179
Part V Rural Conflicts and the Polarization of Village Society	199
9 Creating Parties, Political Alliances, and Interest Groups: Rural Politics in the 1930s	203
10 The Growing Polarization of Rural Society during the Second Republic	226
Conclusion	247
<i>Appendix 1 Agricultural Statistics in Spain, France, and Italy in the Early 1930s</i>	254
<i>Appendix 2 Dry-Farming and the Economics of the Family Farm</i>	259
<i>Glossary</i>	266
<i>Bibliography</i>	268
<i>Index</i>	294

Figures

2.1 Levels of GDP per capita and share of labour force in agriculture in Western Europe, 1929	<i>page</i> 38
2.2 Prices of major foodstuffs on world markets (1927/29 = 100)	52
3.1 The <i>turno pacífico</i> of the dynastic parties in the Congress of Deputies	65
3.2 Changes in Spanish GDP per capita and real wages, 1850–1935 (1913/17 = 100)	67
6.1 Wheat prices in select countries during the late nineteenth century, 1869/73 = 100	144
6.2 Wheat prices in select countries during the Great Depression	148
8.1 Frequency of the words ‘la Reforma Agraria’ in Spanish literature	181
9.1 Long-run changes in wages and wine prices in Barcelona (1822–30 = 100)	223
10.1 Hypothetical evolution of collective action in France	229

Maps

4.1 Area held by large owners in possession of a minimum of 250 hectares	85
4.2 Gross provincial emigration rates per thousand inhabitants, 1911–13	87
4.3 Percentage changes in numbers employed in agriculture, 1910–30	87
4.4 Index of aridity	91
5.1 Area of common lands as a percentage of the total area in 1926	111
5.2 Percentage of farmers who were members of a cooperative in 1933	113
5.3 Geographical distribution of capital lent by <i>pósitos</i> in 1923 (% of Spanish total)	116
7.1 Day wages for male farm workers, 1930	168
7.2 Day wages for unskilled urban male workers, 1930	169
9.1 Estimated share of landless labourers affiliated to the FNTT, June 1932	214
10.1 Day workers as a share of farm labourers in 1956	232

Tables

1.1 Socio-economic variables in Western Europe, <i>c.</i> 1920	<i>page</i> 21
1.2 Economic growth and structural change in selected European countries, 1870–1930	26
1.3 World production and prices between 1929 and 1932	28
1.4 Changes in social expenditures as percentage of GDP, 1930 and 1933	29
2.1 Characteristics of European farming, <i>c.</i> 1930	39
2.2 Relative importance of family farms in European agriculture between the 1880s and 1950s	50
3.1 Spain at war, 1808–1939	61
3.2 <i>Pronunciamientos</i> and military uprisings	61
3.3 Indicators of European living standards, <i>c.</i> 1930	69
3.4 Tax revenue and expenditure in Spain, 1860–1930	72
3.5 Index of GDP and its major components, at 1929 prices	75
3.6 Prices of farm commodities and factor inputs	75
3.7 Changes in labour demand and supply for major crops during the 1930s	76
4.1 Agricultural change in Spain, 1891/5 to 1929/33	83
4.2 Landownership in 1930s	85
4.3 Numbers of male landowners, tenants, and workers in Spain (in thousands)	88
4.4 The nature of Spanish regional farming in 1929/33	92
4.5 Changes in regional agriculture between 1910 and 1930	97
4.6 Major land and labour conflicts in the half-century prior to the Second Republic	99
5.1 Three waves of creating farm organizations before the Second Republic	122
5.2 Rural associations and cooperatives in 1920	125
6.1 Estimates of cooperatives and CNCA membership, 1907–37	135
6.2 Regional distribution of cooperatives and rural <i>cajas</i> in 1933	136
6.3 Explanations for regional cooperative success	141

xii List of Tables

6.4	Domestic wheat production and consumption of basic foods in various countries, <i>c.</i> 1930	145
6.5	Rent reductions demanded and amounts achieved in Cáceres in the early 1930s	149
7.1	Structure of male employment in Andalucía, 1860–1930	161
7.2	Farm population and major crops in Southern Spain, <i>c.</i> 1930	162
7.3	Mechanization and seasonal demand for labour in Southern Spain	165
7.4	Social indicators in Andalucía, <i>c.</i> 1890– <i>c.</i> 1930	170
8.1	Selected indicators of countries that carried out land reforms during the interwar period, <i>c.</i> 1930	182
8.2	The impact of land reform on farm structure and work incentives	189
9.1	The fragmentation of Spanish political parties and election results	206
9.2	Agriculture and parliamentary representation during the Second Republic	206
9.3	Major agrarian reforms during the Second Republic	212
9.4	Membership of farm associations and the FNTT in the latifundio provinces, 1932–4	213
10.1	Forms of collective action and the response of the authorities, 1931–6	231
10.2	Indicators of conflicts and collective action, Córdoba, 1931–6	236
10.3	Changes in official farm prices and wage costs in Southern Spain, 1931–6	237
A1.1	Summary of statistics available in Spain, France, and Italy in the early 1930s	255
A2.1	Estimates of family income, 1930 (in pesetas)	260
A2.2	Basic diet, Badajoz, 1930	260
A2.3	Estimates of production costs for family cereal farms in the early 1930s	262
A2.4	Land reform estimates of production costs and farm income, 1932–4	263

Acknowledgements

This book has been many years in the making, and we have accumulated numerous academic debts. We have been fortunate enough to benefit from several Spanish government grants (ECO2012-36213 and ECO2015-66196-P), which allowed us to prepare a number of papers, most of which have now been published. These were previously presented at meetings, including at the Agriculometrics in Zaragoza (2015); Asociación Española de Historia Económica in Madrid (2014); Asociación de Historia Contemporánea in Albacete (2016); Economic History Society in York (2013), Wolverhampton (2015), Cambridge (2016) and London (2017); European Rural History Organisation in Girona (2015) and Leuven (2017); European Social Science History Conference in Valencia (2016); GEHCEX, ‘Congreso Extremadura durante la II República’, Cáceres (2014); and SEHA in Lleida (2011), Badajoz (2013), Lisbon (2016), Santiago de Compostela (2018), and Madrid (2018). In addition, helpful comments were made on papers given at the departments of economic history in Pablo de Olavide, Santiago de Compostela (HISTAGRA), Sevilla, and Valencia, as well as during workshops on ‘The state and agriculture in Spain (1920–1960): Continuity and change’, at the Universidad Carlos III de Madrid (November 2014), and the ‘Rabassa Morta and rabassaires (Siglos XVIII-XX)’, at the Universitat de Barcelona (January 2017), organized by Josep Colomé and Francesc Valls-Junyent.

Special thanks need to be given to Francisco Albaladejo, Francisco Beltrán, Antonio Miguel Bernal, Elisa Botella Rodríguez, Paul Brassley, Salvador Calatayud, Thomas Christiansen, Francisco Cobo, Jean-Philippe Colin, Pep Colomé, Deborah Fitzgerald, Antonio Florencio Puntas, Domingo Gallego, Lina Gálvez, Juan García Pérez, Samuel Garrido, Luis Germán, Yadira González de Lara, Manuel González de Molina, Antonio Herrera, José Hinojosa Durán, Richard Hoyle, Iñaki Iriarte, José Ignacio Jiménez Blanco,

xiv Acknowledgements

Mikeas Lana Berasain, David Lanero, Eric Léonard, Antonio López Estudillo, Antonio López Martínez, Socrates Petmezas, Vicente Pinilla, Jordi Planas, Pep Pujol, Ramón Ramón Muñoz, Tim Rees, Jaime Reis, Fernando del Rey, Francisco Sánchez Marroyo, Nigel Townson, Elizabeth Williams, and Alp Yucel Kaya for their comments. We have benefitted in particular from the long and enjoyable debates we have had with Ricardo Robledo over many questions discussed in this book.

Special thanks is also due to our joint authors, Eva Fernandez, Joan Rosés, and Enrique Montañés. Leandro Prados de la Escosura, as always, provided helpful comments and encouragement. Jordi Domenech was always highly supportive and made valuable criticisms.

James in particular wishes to thank his students who took the course *Casos de Historia Económica* between 2012/13 and 2018/19. They constantly made me rethink and rewrite the text. I hope they learnt as much as I did.

Juan presented four chapters at the CRH (EHESS) in the winter of 2017 and thanks Fabrice Bouadjaa, Nadine Vivier, Alain Chatriot, Pablo Luna, Laurent Herment, Niccolo Mignemi, and Bernard Vincent for their comments. Gérard Béaur was especially generous with his time and interest.

James is grateful to the Spanish Ministry of Education for financing a six-month sabbatical at the London School of Economics, where much of the final writing up has been done.

Finally, an earlier version of the manuscript was presented at a day-long workshop in November 2018 in the Universidad Carlos III de Madrid. Those who attended, Jordi Domenech, José Fernández Albertos, Lourenzo Fernández Prieto, Robert Fishman, Stefan Houpt, Markus Lampe, Pablo Martinelli, Juan Pan-Montojo, Sergio Riesco, Ignacio Sánchez Cuenca, and Antonio Tena, were not only kind enough to read the text in detail but provided many useful and suggestive comments.

Pilar Bravo Lledó and Pedro Jiménez Clemente greatly facilitated our work in the *Archivo de la Reforma Agraria* in San Fernando de Henares, and we also thank archivists at the *Archivo Histórico Provincial de Cáceres*. María Fernández kindly helped with the maps.

We would also like to thank Michael Watson, Emily Sharp, and Gayathri Tamilselvan for their encouragement and support at Cambridge University Press.

Finally, on a personal note, James thanks Pepe, Azucena, Carmen, Kate, Lindy, and Madeleine for their encouragement. He owes a special debt to Ángeles, who not only cheered me up when the going became

Acknowledgements

xv

rough but also made sure that the book was actually finished before the *obra* in Moralina!

Meanwhile, Juan thanks Carmen, Isabel, Merce, Mila, and especially Sergio for their support. In particular, he is indebted to his parents who, as many others, were exiled by the Spanish Civil War.

Notes on the Regional Division of Spain

Mainland Spain is made up of forty-eight provinces. Geographers and historians have divided Spain into regions and subregions in many different ways, depending on the nature of their research. In this work, we have incorporated two distinct approaches. First, the country is divided into two major sections: those provinces that have large areas of big estates (*latifundios*) and the rest of the country. Second, Spain is divided into four major regions, each of which is broken up into a number of subregions. Following Malefakis, thirteen provinces are identified as *latifundio* provinces in central and southern Spain: Albacete, Badajoz, Cáceres, Cádiz, Ciudad Real, Córdoba, Granada, Huelva, Jaén, Málaga, Salamanca, Sevilla, and Toledo.

The four regions are:

1. North: Álava, Coruña, Guipúzcoa, Lugo, Orense, Asturias, Pontevedra, Santander, and Vizcaya
Subregions: Galicia (Coruña, Lugo, Orense, and Pontevedra), Asturias, Basque Country (Álava, Guipúzcoa, and Vizcaya), and Santander.
2. Interior: Albacete, Ávila, Badajoz, Burgos, Cáceres, Ciudad Real, Cuenca, Guadalajara, Huesca, León, Madrid, Navarra, Palencia, Rioja, Salamanca, Segovia, Soria, Teruel, Toledo, Valladolid, Zamora, and Zaragoza
Subregions: Castilla-León (Ávila, Burgos, León, Palencia, Salamanca, Segovia, Soria, Valladolid, and Zamora); Extremadura (Badajoz and Cáceres); Centre (Albacete, Ciudad Real, Cuenca, Guadalajara, Madrid, and Toledo); Upper Ebro (Huesca, Navarra, Rioja, Teruel, and Zaragoza).
3. Mediterranean: Alicante, Barcelona, Baleares, Castellón, Girona, Lleida, Murcia, Tarragona, and Valencia
Subregions: Cataluña (Barcelona, Girona, Lleida, and Tarragona) and Levante (Alicante, Castellón, Murcia, and Valencia).

4. Andalucía: Almería, Cádiz, Córdoba, Granada, Huelva, Jaén, Málaga, and Sevilla

Subregions: Eastern Andalucía (Almería, Granada, Huelva, and Jaén); Western Andalucía (Cádiz, Córdoba, Malaga, and Sevilla)

For the purpose of this book the Canary Islands, Ceuta, and Melilla are not included.

Abbreviations

AAE	<i>Asociación de Agricultores de España/ Association of Spanish Farmers</i>
APFR	<i>Agrupación de Propietarios de Fincas Rústicas/ Association of Landowners</i>
CEDA	<i>Confederación Española de Derechas Autónomas/ Spanish Confederation of Autonomous Rightist</i>
CEPA	<i>Confederación Española Patronal Agrícola/ Spanish Confederation of Farm Employers</i>
CNCA	<i>Confederación Nacional Católica-Agraria/ National Catholic-Agrarian Confederation</i>
CNT	<i>Confederación Nacional del Trabajo/ National Confederation of Labour</i>
ERC	<i>Esquerra Republicana de Catalunya/ Catalan Republican Left Party</i>
FNTT	<i>Federación Nacional de Trabajadores de la Tierra/ National Federation of Land Workers (Socialist)</i>
IACSI	<i>Instituto Agrícola Catalán de San Isidro/ Catalan Agricultural Institute of San Isidro</i>
IRA	<i>Instituto de Reforma Agraria/ Institute of Agrarian Reform</i>
JAP	<i>Juventudes de Acción Popular/ Popular Action Youths</i>
PSOE	<i>Partido Socialista Obrero Español/ Spanish Socialist Worker's Party</i>
UGT	<i>Unión General de Trabajadores/ Socialist trade-union</i>
USAC	<i>Unió de Sindicats Agraris de Catalunya/ Union of Agrarian Syndicates in Catalonia</i>