

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48703-0 — The Redress of Law
Emilios Christodoulidis
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

'By which strategies will we reclaim "our" constitutions from the demands of global capitalist markets and turn them into the political warrant of the freedom they were meant to serve: the freedom of dignity and solidarity? A masterfully orchestrated plethora of arguments, pairing admirable philosophical depth and practical legal design. Critical constitutional theory at its best.'

Bert van Roermund, Professor (Emeritus), Tilburg Law School

'This is the most profound critical theory of constitutionality I know of. The enormous range of social and political theories Christodoulidis is engaging with is breathtaking. He discusses them in depth, not from the cool distant standpoint of neutral scholarship but from the perspective of a political constitutionalism that seeks to synthesise Karl Marx's heritage with Niklas Luhmann's ultra-modern systems theory. His devastating critique of emerging transnational constitutions has one main target – the imperialism of total market thinking. However, what makes his analyses even more fascinating, is that Christodoulidis does not restrict himself to the usual exercises in critical theory, which suffer from their lack of credible alternatives. He develops strategies for a renewed constitutionality which break the monopoly of nation-state constitutions and search for a political constitutionalisation of society, particularly continuing the tradition of "autogestionnaire" labour constitutionalism. He follows a double strategy. While the reformist strategy of "militant formalisms" seeks to protect the integrity of law against the intrusions of economic rationality, the strategy of "rupture" and the strategy of "immanent critique" follow a more radical agenda.'

Gunther Teubner, Professor of Private Law and Legal Sociology,
Goethe Universität Frankfurt

'No-one has captured the distinction between market constitutionalism and political constitutionalism more vividly or more insightfully than Christodoulidis. And no-one has framed the choice between them more profoundly. This is a book that captures contemporary law's critical condition, but also its continuing critical contribution, with great subtlety and imagination.'

Neil Walker, Regius Professor of Public Law and the Law of Nature and Nations, University of Edinburgh Law School

'Since Aristotle, jurists and philosophers have studied how human societies are constituted. In a fascinating and poetic fresco, Emilios Christodoulidis also shows how they are today dislocated by market constitutionalism. In a thoughtful dialogue with an impressive variety of authors, he also sheds light on the resources that the law offers to escape the grip of the "total market".'

Alain Supiot, Professor of Law, Collège de France

THE REDRESS OF LAW

From a legal-philosophical point of view, *The Redress of Law* presents a critical analysis of a number of related doctrinal fields: constitutional, labour and EU Law. Focusing on the organisation and protection of work, this book asks what it means to protect work as an essential aspect of human (individual and collective) flourishing. This is an ambitious and highly sophisticated intervention in contemporary academic and political debates around a set of critically important questions connected to processes of globalisation and market integration. The author redefines the nature of legal and political thought in an age in which market rationality has exceeded its classic domain and has come to pervade the organization of social and political life. This restatement of critical legal theory is intended to defend the concept of constitutionalism and suggest new ways to deploy the law strategically.

EMILIOS CHRISTODOULIDIS holds the Chair of Jurisprudence at the University of Glasgow. He is the author of the award-winning *Law and Reflexive Politics* (1996), edits the book series *Critical Studies in Jurisprudence*, and serves as managing editor of *Law & Critique*.

GLOBAL LAW SERIES

The series provides unique perspectives on the way globalization is radically altering the study, discipline and practice of law. Featuring innovative books in this growing field, the series explores those bodies of law which are becoming global in their application, and the newly emerging interdependency and interaction of different legal systems. It covers all major branches of the law and includes work on legal theory, history, and the methodology of legal practice and jurisprudence under conditions of globalization. Offering a major platform on global law, these books provide essential reading for students and scholars of comparative, international, and transnational law.

Series Editors

M. E. A. Goodwin

Tilburg University

Randall Lesaffer

Tilburg University

David Nelken

King's College London

Han Somsen

Tilburg University

Books in the Series

Intimations of Global Law Neil Walker

Legalized Families in the Era of Bordered Globalization Daphna Hacker

Transnational Sustainability Laws Phillip Paiement

The Sociology of Law and the Global Transformation of Democracy

Chris Thornhill

Authority and the Globalisation of Inclusion and Exclusion Hans Lindahl

The Law of the List: UN Counterterrorism Sanctions and the Politics of Global Security Law Gavin Sullivan

Democratic Crisis and Global Constitutional Law Christopher Thornhill

THE REDRESS OF LAW

Globalisation, Constitutionalism and Market Capture

EMILIOS CHRISTODOULIDIS

University of Glasgow



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48703-0 — The Redress of Law
Emilios Christodoulidis
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108487030
DOI: 10.1017/9781108765329

© Emilios Christodoulidis 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-48703-0 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-108-73210-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To Jane

CONTENTS

	<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xii
	Introduction	1
	PART I Political Phenomenology	15
1.1	Hannah Arendt and the Theory of the Bourgeois Public Sphere	17
	The Phenomenology of the Political	17
	Arendt's Arrested 'Worldliness'	29
	'World-Making' in the 'Material' Dimension	30
	'World-Making' in the 'Temporal' Dimension	33
	'World-Making' in the 'Social' Dimension	35
	The Spectre of Antagonism	40
1.2	Simone Weil: Necessity and Courage	43
	Weil's Materialism	43
	Weil's Hellenism	51
	The Poem of Force	51
	Tragedy, Necessity, Rationality Undone	55
	Weil's Wager	63
1.3	The Phenomenology of Work	72
	The Promise of Social Labour	72
	The Hegelian-Marxian Heritage	72
	Post-Fordist Mutations	78
	The Forgetting of Labour	86
	The Ethical Deficit: Unnecessary Suffering	86
	The Political Deficit: Unworldly Labour	93
	The Philosophical Deficit: Phenomenological Blockage	102
	Semantics and Structures I: The Movement of Concepts and Structures	111

1.4	Towards a Critical Phenomenology	119
	Improbable Disclosures	119
	The Phenomenological Method	129
	Elements of a Critical Phenomenology	138
	PART II Political Constitutionalism	149
2.1	Constituent Power and the Constitutional Distinction	151
	The Constitutional Distinction	151
	Theorising ‘Constituent Power’: A Short History in Four Chapters	158
	Rousseau’s Radical Proposition	158
	The Jacobin Constituent Moment	163
	Hegel and the French Revolution	168
	Marx on Constituent Power	171
	Theorising ‘Constituted Power’: Eclipsing the Constituent	180
2.2	Constitutionality	193
	Prolegomena	193
	Self-Reference	200
	The Dimensions of Constitutional Meaning	209
	The Material Dimension	211
	The Social Dimension	216
	The Temporal Dimension	224
2.3	Labour, Solidarity and the Social Constitution	229
	Constitutional Value and the Dogmatic Question	229
	<i>Homo Juridicus, Laborans</i>	242
	Social Rights Constitutionalism	247
	The Radical Marshall	247
	Semantics and Structures II	255
2.4	Constitutionalism Adrift	259
	Constitutionalisation and Pluralism	259
	Semantics and Structures III	277
	PART III Market Constitutionalism	295
3.1	Market Trajectories	297
	From Differentiation to Fragmentation	297
	The Generalisation of Economic Reason: Hayek’s Legacy	308
3.2	Total Market Thinking	327
	The New Worlds of Governance	329
	The Democratic Co-Option	335

CONTENTS

xi

The Epistemological Co-option	343	
The Logic of Equivalence: Substitution and Unaddressability		343
The Hidden Normativity of Indicators	348	
The Eclipse of the Political Constitution	354	
3.3 Europe's 'Social Market' and the Disembedding of Labour Protection	365	
Europe's Social Constitution: 'Moments' and Milestones		367
The Ordoliberal Synthesis	377	
New European Governance and the Social Constitution		384
3.4 The Deep Commodification of Labour	395	
<i>Laval/Viking</i> Jurisprudence	395	
The New Functionalism	403	
Proportionality as Market Exposure	407	
Market Access as Social Dumping	419	
PART IV Strategies of Redress	431	
4.1 The Constitutional Situation	433	
Taking Stock	433	
Communicative and Strategic Constitutional Action		443
Strategy, Critique, Redress: Opportunities and Limitations		455
4.2 Militant Formalisms	461	
Formalism as Strategy	461	
'Societal Constitutionalism': Meta-Level Deployments		467
4.3 Constitution, Autogestion, Rupture	480	
The Scandal of Democracy	480	
Poland's Short Summer of Anarchy	480	
Democracy as Enactment: The Legacy of Athens		487
The Mass Strike: Luxemburg, Sorel, Benjamin		494
The Meaning of Negation	507	
4.4 Constitutionalising Contradiction: Towards an Open Constitutional Dialectic	524	
Materialism and the 'Adventure' of the Dialectic	524	
Phenomenology, Contradiction and the Open Dialectic		532
Semantics and Structures IV: The Constitutional 'Dispositif'		541
Epilogue	556	
<i>References</i>	558	
<i>Index</i>	584	

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I have had the good fortune to write this book at the Law School of the University of Glasgow, at both an institution and a city still graced with a democratic sense and a humanist sensibility. I am fortunate to have worked here with exceptional scholars, and many will see clear evidence of their influence in the book. My most profound gratitude goes to my closest colleagues of the Glasgow Legal Theory research group, George Pavlakos, Lilian Moncrieff, Lindsay Farmer, Marco Goldoni and Ruth Dukes, with Anna Chadwick and Toni Marzal having joined it more recently. I thank them for their inspiration and friendship, ongoing collaborations, co-teaching and co-authorship, marked by a sense of intellectual generosity and camaraderie which I hold dear. I owe a profound debt also to five close friends and collaborators, for conversations over many years, in which many of the ideas here developed: Scott Veitch, Johan van der Walt, Chris Thornhill, Andrew Patrizio and Hans Lindahl. During my career in Edinburgh and Glasgow I have had some wonderful doctoral students, many now colleagues, who have opened new vistas for me and challenged my stubborn views. And of course also to those who were my teachers, David Garland, Gunther Teubner, Zenon Bankowski and the late Neil MacCormick. To them all my heartfelt thanks.

I have some other important institutional debts to acknowledge: the manuscript began while I was a fellow at the Institute of Advanced Studies in Nantes (IEA) at an Institution that embodied openness and genuine interdisciplinarity in the tradition of Enlightenment thinking. Under the direction of Alain Supiot it was a rare site of inspiring intellectual exchange. I am grateful for that, as I am to Alain for lending his voice so generously to support the attempt in my own country, Greece, to stem the barbarity visited on its people during the darker years of austerity. I am thankful to him, as I am to Muriel Fabre-Magnan and Samuel Jubé for their friendship and scholarship.

I owe a debt to Valerie Kerruish and Uwe Petersen and the Altona Stiftung (ASFPG). In setting up this forum, Valerie and Uwe gave me and others a wonderful opportunity to come together over the years in intense, critical, sometimes passionate engagement with ideas; for their exceptional generosity, thank you to them both, as well as to Scott Veitch, Stewart Motha and Tarik Kochi for so many discussions under its auspices.

Thank you to my friends at Birkbeck Law School, an institution that has been a second home to me, and especially my closest colleagues and friends Fiona MacMillan and Costas Douzinas with whom I co-edit *Law & Critique*.

Many individuals have contributed in diverse ways to the ideas in the book, a manuscript that has taken nearly ten years to complete, and I am grateful to them all, teachers, colleagues, students and friends: Andy Schaap, Agustin Menendez, Anel Boshoff, Awol Allo, Basak Ertur, Bert van Roermund, Carlo Pinnetti, Carrol Clarkson, Christian Joerges, Christian Tams, Claudio Michelon, Dan Matthews, Daniel Augenstein, Donald Buglass, Emmanuel Melissaris, Fernando Atria, Gregor Clunie, Hanna Lukkari, Illan Wall, Jarna Petman, John Charney, Kaarlo Tuori, Karin van Marle, Katrin Becker, Kerry Rittich, Kevin Walton, Kyle McGee, Luciana Grassano Melo, Marcelo Neves, Marco Dani, Marija Bartl, Martin Krygier, Maurice Glasman, Michelle Everson, Mike Wilkinson, Monica Judith Sanchez-Flores, Neil Walker, Pablo Marshall, Panu Minkkinen, Poul Kjaer, Robert Salais, Samuli Hurri, Stacy Douglas, Stephanie Jones, Stephen Bogle, Su Bian, Thorsten Fuchshuber, Victor Tadros, Vikki Bell and Yiannis Tassopoulos. My brother Nick Christodoulidis' sobering reading helped to rein in some of the book's more extravagant moments. My gratitude to you all.

Morag Goodwin has been a fantastic series editor. I am grateful to her and to Finola O'Sullivan at Cambridge University Press for endorsing the project, and Marianne Nield has been hugely helpful and patient about my many delays.

I conclude with some personal debts to my family. To Jane, to whom this is dedicated, for her unwavering support, her openness to the world and her wonderful attention to what is fragile in it. To our children, Theo, Annie and Andreas, who as young adults are making their own way in the world now, with a profound trust in its humanity and the insistent demand that it will not be diminished. To my father whose commitment to the university taught me – by example not by word – that the university is something greater than our own career choices, alliances and personal objectives; like Alasdair MacIntyre's idea of *practice*, it

holds up its own internal standards of excellence and offers its teachers a privilege and a debt that can never be fully discharged. And finally to my mother, who passed away at the time that I began writing this book, for her gentleness and deep kindness, her faith that everything would be alright in the end, even if she was wrong in that, with the promise that *nothing is lost*, that *all is un-forgotten*.