

## The Production of Knowledge

---

Whilst a great deal of progress has been made in recent decades, concerns persist about the course of the social sciences. Progress in these disciplines is hard to assess and core scientific goals such as discovery, transparency, reproducibility and cumulation remain frustratingly out of reach. Despite having technical acumen and an array of tools at their disposal, today's social scientists may be only slightly better equipped to vanquish error and construct an edifice of truth than their forbears – who conducted analyses with slide rules and wrote up results with typewriters. This volume considers the challenges facing the social sciences, as well as possible solutions. In doing so, we adopt a systemic view of the subject matter. What are the rules and norms governing behavior in the social sciences? What kinds of research, and which sorts of researcher, succeed and fail under the current system? In what ways does this incentive structure serve, or subvert, the goal of scientific progress?

**Colin Elman** is Professor of Political Science and Director of the Center for Qualitative and Multi-Method Inquiry in the Maxwell School, Syracuse University. He co-founded (with Diana Kapiszewski, Georgetown University) the Qualitative Data Repository.

**John Gerring** is Professor of Government at University of Texas at Austin. He serves as co-PI of *Varieties of Democracy* and the *Global Leadership Project*.

**James Mahoney** is the Gordon Fulcher Professor in Decision-Making at Northwestern University, where he holds appointments in Political Science and Sociology. He is Founding Director of the Comparative-Historical Social Science program at Northwestern.

## Strategies for Social Inquiry

### The Production of Knowledge

#### Editors

Colin Elman, *Maxwell School of Syracuse University*

John Gerring, *University of Texas at Austin*

James Mahoney, *Northwestern University*

#### Editorial Board

Bear Braumoeller, David Collier, Francesco Guala, Peter Hedström, Theodore Hopf, Uskali Maki, Rose McDermott, Charles Ragin, Theda Skocpol, Peter Spiegler, David Waldner, Lisa Wedeen, Christopher Winship

This book series presents texts on a wide range of issues bearing upon the practice of social inquiry. Strategies are construed broadly to embrace the full spectrum of approaches to analysis, as well as relevant issues in philosophy of social science.

#### Published Titles

John Boswell, Jack Corbett and R. A. W. Rhodes, *The Art and Craft of Comparison*

John Gerring, *Social Science Methodology: A Unified Framework, 2nd edition*

Michael Coppedge, *Democratization and Research Methods*

Thad Dunning, *Natural Experiments in the Social Sciences: A Design-Based Approach*

Carsten Q. Schneider and Claudius Wagemann, *Set-Theoretic Methods for the Social Sciences: A Guide to Qualitative Comparative Analysis*

Nicholas Weller and Jeb Barnes, *Finding Pathways: Mixed-Method Research for Studying Causal Mechanisms*

Andrew Bennett and Jeffrey T. Checkel, *Process Tracing: From Metaphor to Analytic Tool*

Diana Kapiszewski, Lauren M. MacLean and Benjamin L. Read, *Field Research in Political Science: Practices and Principles*

Peter Spiegler, *Behind the Model: A Constructive Critique of Economic Modeling*

James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen, *Advances in Comparative-Historical Analysis*

Jason Seawright, *Multi-Method Social Science: Combining Qualitative and Quantitative Tools*

John Gerring, *Case Study Research: Principles and Practices, 2nd edition*

# The Production of Knowledge

---

Enhancing Progress in Social Science

Edited by

**Colin Elman**

Maxwell School of Syracuse University

**John Gerring**

University of Texas at Austin

**James Mahoney**

Northwestern University



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48677-4 — The Production of Knowledge  
Edited by Colin Elman , John Gerring , James Mahoney  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108486774](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108486774)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108762519

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

ISBN 978-1-108-48677-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-70828-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

	<i>Detailed Contents</i>	page ix
	<i>List of Figures</i>	xiii
	<i>List of Tables</i>	xiv
	<i>List of Contributors</i>	xv
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
1	Introduction John Gerring, James Mahoney and Colin Elman	1
<hr/>		
	<b>Part I Discovery</b>	15
2	Exploratory Research Richard Swedberg	17
3	Research Cycles Evan Lieberman	42
<hr/>		
	<b>Part II Publishing</b>	71
4	Peer Review Tim F. Liao	73
5	Length Limits John Gerring and Lee Cojocarú	98
<hr/>		
	<b>Part III Transparency and Reproducibility</b>	127
6	Transparency and Reproducibility: Conceptualizing the Problem Garret Christensen and Edward Miguel	129

<b>vi</b>	<b>Table of Contents</b>	
7	Transparency and Reproducibility: Potential Solutions Garret Christensen and Edward Miguel	165
8	Making Research Data Accessible Diana Kapiszewski and Sebastian Karcher	197
9	Pre-registration and Results-Free Review in Observational and Qualitative Research Alan M. Jacobs	221
<b>Part IV Appraisal</b>		265
10	Replication for Quantitative Research Jeremy Freese and David Peterson	267
11	Measurement Replication in Qualitative and Quantitative Studies Dan Reiter	284
12	Reliability of Inference: Analogs of Replication in Qualitative Research Tasha Fairfield and Andrew Charman	301
13	Coordinating Reappraisals John Gerring	334
14	Comprehensive Appraisal John Gerring	354
15	Impact Metrics John Gerring, Sebastian Karcher and Brendan Apfeld	371
<b>Part V Diversity</b>		401
16	What's Wrong with Replicating the Old Boys' Networks? Dawn Langan Teele	403
17	Ideological Diversity Neil Gross and Christopher Robertson	432

**vii** **Table of Contents**

---

<b>Part VI</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	457
18	Proposals John Gerring, James Mahoney and Colin Elman	459
	<i>References</i>	487
	<i>Index</i>	543

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48677-4 — The Production of Knowledge  
Edited by Colin Elman , John Gerring , James Mahoney  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---



## Detailed Contents

	<i>List of Figures</i>	page xiii
	<i>List of Tables</i>	xiv
	<i>List of Contributors</i>	xv
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
1	Introduction	1
	A Systemic Approach	3
	Social Science as a Field of Endeavor	6
	Outline	8
	Conclusion	12
<hr/>		
	<b>Part I   Discovery</b>	15
2	Exploratory Research	17
	The History of Exploratory Studies	19
	What, Exactly, is an Exploratory Study?	23
	The Informal Exploratory Study (Pre-Study)	32
	Afterthoughts on Exploratory Research	37
3	Research Cycles	42
	The Biomedical Research Cycle	45
	The (Near-)Absence of a Research Cycle in Contemporary Political Science	52
	Costs: The Crowding-Out of Discovery – Premature Experimentation	54
	Toward a Framework for a Research Cycle	59
	What Role for Registration/Pre-Analysis Plans?	65
	Conclusions and Recommendations	68

x	<b>Detailed Contents</b>	
<hr/>		
	<b>Part II Publishing</b>	71
<hr/>		
4	Peer Review	73
	The Standard Practice	75
	An Evaluation of the Standard Peer Review Practice	81
	The Proposed Alternatives	87
	Conclusion	95
5	Length Limits	98
	Survey	99
	Proposal 1: Clarity and Consistency	105
	Proposal 2: No (Tight) Limits	107
	Conclusions	124
<hr/>		
	<b>Part III Transparency and Reproducibility</b>	127
<hr/>		
6	Transparency and Reproducibility: Conceptualizing the Problem	129
	A Model for Understanding the Issues	130
	Publication Bias	134
	Specification Searching	143
	Inability to Replicate Results	146
	Conclusion	164
7	Transparency and Reproducibility: Potential Solutions	165
	Improved Analytical Methods: Research Designs and Meta-Analysis	165
	Study Registration	172
	Pre-Analysis Plans	174
	Disclosure and Reporting Standards	184
	Open Data and Materials, and Their Use for Replication	189
	Future Directions and Conclusion	194
8	Making Research Data Accessible	197
	What are “Data”?	199
	Making Data <i>Meaningfully</i> Accessible	201
	Evolving Infrastructure for Data Accessibility	205
	Catalyzing Access to Research Data	213
	Conclusion	219
9	Pre-registration and Results-Free Review in Observational and Qualitative Research	221
	Skewed Social Knowledge	225
	Two Institutional Responses	236

	Criteria for Blind Selection	242
	Can Studies without Results be Evaluated?	257
	Conclusion	262
<hr/>		
	<b>Part IV Appraisal</b>	265
10	Replication for Quantitative Research	267
	The Meanings of Replication	269
	Is there a Replication Problem?	272
	How Do Replication Crises Happen?	274
	Can We Reduce False Positives? Should We?	277
	How Do We Promote More and Better Replication Work?	279
	Conclusion	282
11	Measurement Replication in Qualitative and Quantitative Studies	284
	Measurement Replication in Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches	286
	Measurement Errors Exposed by Replication Efforts	289
	Going Forward	299
12	Reliability of Inference: Analogs of Replication in Qualitative Research	301
	Analogs of Replication in Qualitative Research	303
	Same-Data Assessments of Inference in Qualitative Bayesianism	318
	Suggestions for Moving Forward	331
13	Coordinating Reappraisals	334
	Reappraisal Institute	335
	Reappraisal Directory	336
	Reappraisal Scorecard	337
	Support Infrastructure	346
	Recruitment and Bias	348
	Incentives to Replicate	351
	Anticipated Impact	352
14	Comprehensive Appraisal	354
	A Different Kind of Appraisal	355
	Individualized Appraisal versus Comprehensive Appraisal	362
	Conclusions	368
15	Impact Metrics	371
	Databases	373
	Objections	379

**xii** **Detailed Contents**

---

Clarifications	386
The Impact of Impact Metrics	388
Conclusions	396

**Part V Diversity** 401

---

16	What's Wrong with Replicating the Old Boys' Networks?	403
	Women in the Academic Pipeline	405
	The Normative Construction of Disciplinary Centrality	412
	Market-Driven Compensation Structures	418
	Remedies for Gender Domination	423
17	Ideological Diversity	432
	The Politics of American Social Scientists	433
	Calls for Political Diversification	434
	Evaluating the Claims	442
	Toward a Sociology of Politics and Ideas	446
	Conclusion	455

**Part VI Conclusions** 457

---

18	Proposals	459
	Conflicting Imperatives: True versus New	459
	Principles	463
	Recommendations, Exhortations, Suggestions	465
	Metrics of Reform	480
	Challenges and Opportunities	483
	<i>References</i>	487
	<i>Index</i>	543

## Figures

3.1	A research cycle heuristic	<i>page</i> 44
5.1	Impact, marginal effects	120
6.1	AER papers with data exempt from the data-sharing requirement	153
7.1	Studies in the AEA trial registry, May 2013 to October 2018	173
9.1	Expected learning conditional on $p(H)$ , $p(E H)$ , and $p(E \sim H)$	261
10.1	Publishing barriers and replication frequency	275
12.1	Reliability of inference	304
16.1	Women's representation among faculty and doctoral recipients, 1870–2015	406
16.2	Women's representation among undergraduates and doctoral recipients in the social sciences	408
16.3	Gender and authorships in various social science disciplines, 1950–2000	413
17.1	Party identification and education	445

## Tables

2.1	Mentions of methods in top sociology journals (1895–2016)	<i>page</i> 21
2.2	Mentions of methods in all sociology journals (1895–2016)	21
2.3	The goals and methods of different types of exploratory studies	40
3.1	A criterial framework for assessing contributions in a political science research cycle	60
4.1	A summary of the six proposals	96
5.1	Political science journals	100
5.2	Sociology journals	103
5.3	Economics journals	116
5.4	Impact, marginal effects	120
6.1	Predictive value of research findings	133
6.2	Examples of recent meta-analyses in economics	141
6.3	Transparency policies at selected top economics and finance journals	149
7.1	Erroneous interpretations under “cherry-picking”	176
9.1	Use of qualitative evidence in 94 articles in 8 highly ranked political science journals (2015 and 2016)	230
9.2	Patterns of results in 94 qualitative and mixed-method articles in 8 highly ranked political science journals (2015–2016)	233
9.3	Potential prior unobservability in all observational empirical articles published in nine leading journals in 2015	246
13.1	Reappraisals	341
13.2	Corroboration	342
13.3	Validation Types	344
13.4	Validity of Original Hypothesis	345
13.5	Reappraisal Scorecard	347

## Contributors

**Brendan Apfeld** Department of Government, University of Texas at Austin

**Andrew Charman** Department of Physics, University of California at Berkeley

**Garret Christensen** US Census Bureau

**Lee Cojocar** Department of Political Science, Boston University

**Colin Elman** Department of Political Science, Syracuse University

**Tasha Fairfield** Department of International Development, London School of Economics

**Jeremy Freese** Department of Sociology, Stanford University

**John Gerring** Department of Government, University of Texas at Austin

**Neil Gross** Department of Sociology, Colby College

**Alan M. Jacobs** Department of Political Science, University of British Columbia

**Diana Kapiszewski** Department of Government, Georgetown University

**Sebastian Karcher** Qualitative Data Repository, Syracuse University

**Tim F. Liao** Department of Sociology, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

**Evan Lieberman** Department of Political Science, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

**James Mahoney** Departments of Political Science and Sociology, Northwestern University

**Edward Miguel** Department of Economics, University of California at Berkeley

**David Peterson** Institute for Society and Genetics, University of California,  
Los Angeles

**Dan Reiter** Department of Political Science, Emory University

**Christopher Robertson** Department of Sociology, Northwestern University

**Richard Swedberg** Department of Sociology, Cornell University

**Dawn Langan Teele** Department of Political Science, University of  
Pennsylvania



## Acknowledgments

Portions of this book were presented at the annual IQMR workshop in 2017 and 2018. For feedback we are grateful to Jamie Druckman, Kendra Koivu, Markus Kreuzer, Jay Seawright, Hillel Soifer, and Steven Wilson. For skilled research assistance, we thank Isabel Castillo and Rahardhika Utama.

Several chapters evolved from previously published articles: Chapter 3 (Lieberman 2016), Chapter 5 (Gerring and Cojocar 2016) and Chapters 6–7 (Christensen and Miguel 2018).

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48677-4 — The Production of Knowledge  
Edited by Colin Elman , John Gerring , James Mahoney  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---