

DIAGNOSING FROM A DISTANCE

Ever since the rise of Adolf Hitler, mental health professionals have sought to use their knowledge of human psychology to understand – and to intervene in – political developments. Psychiatrists have commented, sometimes brashly, on the mental health of public figures from Barry Goldwater to Donald Trump. But is the practice ethical? While the American Psychiatric Association prohibits psychiatric comment on public figures under its “Goldwater Rule,” others disagree.

Diagnosing from a Distance is the first in-depth exploration of this controversy. Making extensive use of archival sources and original interviews, John Martin-Joy reconstructs the historical debates between psychiatrists, journalists, and politicians in an era when libel law and professional standards have undergone dramatic change. Charting the Goldwater Rule’s crucial role in the current furor over Trump’s fitness for office, Martin-Joy assesses the Rule’s impact and offers a more liberal alternative. This remarkable book will change the way we think about psychiatric ethics and public life.

John Martin-Joy, MD, is a psychiatrist in Cambridge, Massachusetts, and a part-time instructor in psychiatry at Harvard Medical School.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48658-3 — Diagnosing from a Distance
John Martin-Joy
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

DIAGNOSING FROM A DISTANCE

*Debates over Libel Law, Media, and Psychiatric Ethics
from Barry Goldwater to Donald Trump*

John Martin-Joy, MD

Harvard Medical School



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-48658-3 — Diagnosing from a Distance
 John Martin-Joy
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108486583
 DOI: 10.1017/9781108761222

© John Martin-Joy 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Martin-Joy, John, author.

Title: Diagnosing from a distance : debates over libel law, media, and psychiatric ethics from Barry Goldwater to Donald Trump / John Martin-Joy.

Description: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019049174 (print) | LCCN 2019049175 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108486583 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108707985 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108761222 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Goldwater, Barry M. (Barry Morris), 1909–1998 – Mental health. | Trump, Donald, 1946 – Mental health. | Mental illness – Diagnosis – Moral and ethical aspects. | Mental illness – Diagnosis – Political aspects. | Psychiatric ethics.

Classification: LCC RC469 .M368 2020 (print) | LCC RC469 (ebook) | DDC 616.89/075–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019049174>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019049175>

ISBN 978-1-108-48658-3 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-70798-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48658-3 — Diagnosing from a Distance
John Martin-Joy
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

to
Robert Coles

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48658-3 — Diagnosing from a Distance
John Martin-Joy
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

About the Author ix
Acknowledgments x
List of Abbreviations xiii

Introduction: An Ethical Dilemma 1

1 Psychoanalysis, Media, and Politics from the
Rise of Hitler to the 1950s 16

PART I DIAGNOSIS FROM A DISTANCE AND LIBEL LAW
IN THE 1960s: *GOLDWATER V. GINZBURG*

2 Ralph Ginzburg: Provocateur 47

3 “To Remove This Precedent”: Barry Goldwater
Sues for Libel 86

4 Ginzburg, Goldwater, and the Supreme Court 122

PART II PROFESSIONALIZATION AND THE RISE OF THE
GOLDWATER RULE

5 “To Protect Public Figures”: The APA and
the Goldwater Rule 137

6 The CIA and the White House: Adventures
in Assessment 172

7 Furor: The Debate over Donald Trump 192

Conclusion: On History, Ethics, and Pluralism 224

Appendix: The Goldwater Rule in 1973 and Today 249

CONTENTS

Photographs of Key People and Events 251
Notes 261
Works Cited 295
Index 325

About the Author

John Martin-Joy, MD, is a psychiatrist in Cambridge, Massachusetts. A part-time instructor in psychiatry at Harvard Medical School, he teaches at the BIDMC Harvard Psychiatry Residency Training Program in Boston and at Mt. Auburn Hospital in Cambridge. He is also a candidate at the Boston Psychoanalytic Society and Institute. Dr. Martin-Joy has worked in both inpatient and outpatient settings and has testified extensively as an expert psychiatric witness in court. He has written about activism in psychiatry, has published scholarly articles on the Goldwater Rule, and has published empirical research documenting the maturation of defense (coping) mechanisms over the adult life span. A former book editor in history and sociology, he is the coeditor of *Conversations with Donald Hall* (forthcoming from University Press of Mississippi).

Acknowledgments

I am grateful to the many people who assisted in the completion of this book. First and foremost, I would like to thank the participants in the events recounted here, as well as their families, for granting me interviews that helped clarify and expand my understanding of my topic. Thanks go to Lark Ginzburg Kuhta and Bonnie Ginzburg Erbe, who were cooperative and provided beneficial insights into their father, publisher Ralph Ginzburg; to psychiatrist Gail Barton, whose interview shed light on her father, Walter Barton, the medical director of the American Psychiatric Association (APA) in the 1960s and early 1970s; to psychiatrists Judith Herman, Bandy Lee, and Leonard Glass for speaking with me about their concerns about President Donald Trump and the APA's Goldwater Rule; to current APA medical director Saul Levin and Ethics Committee chair Rebecca Brendel, who spoke with me about the APA's point of view; and to two former APA presidents, Anita Everett and Jeffrey Lieberman, who shared their perspectives on their involvement in the debate over the Goldwater Rule.

Staff members at several libraries and archival collections generously helped me to locate and understand archival material. Grateful acknowledgments go to the staff of the Harvard University Libraries, including at Widener Library and at Houghton Library, home of Walter Langer's annotated copy of his report on Adolf Hitler to the Office of Strategic Services. In Laramie, Wyoming, John Waggoner, archivist at the University of Wyoming's American Heritage Collection, provided access to and permission to quote from the Ralph Ginzburg papers; at Arizona State University, Rob Spindler and Renee D. James of the special collections staff made the Barry Goldwater Papers accessible; at the LBJ Library

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

in Austin, Texas, Liza Talbot and Chris Banks provided useful material on Lyndon Johnson's response to Ralph Ginzburg. At the Melvin Sabshin Library of the American Psychiatric Association in Washington, DC, archivist Deena Gorland and APA general counsel Colleen Coyle welcomed me and graciously granted me access to and perspective on the organization's extensive archives. At the Oscar Diethelm Library of Weill Cornell Medicine in New York City, special collections archivist Marisa Shaari located and sent material on the *Fact* episode from the archives of the American Psychoanalytic Association.

At the Boston Psychoanalytic Society and Institute (BPSI), executive director Catherine Kimble graciously reviewed portions of the manuscript and provided helpful comments, as did analyst Julia Matthews, fellow candidates Chris Leich and Jane Keat, and historian Elizabeth Lunbeck. Archivist Olga Umansky provided valuable assistance in locating material on psychoanalytic history as well as information on Walter Langer in particular, including permission to reproduce a photograph of Langer from the BPSI archives. Boston Psychoanalytic Institute teachers and supervisors Anna Ornstein, Jane Hanenberg, Steve Bernstein, Tony Kris, Steven Cooper, my fellow third-year classmates, and many others showed timely interest in the project, for which I am most grateful.

I learned much over several years from former APA president Paul Appelbaum, who commented on drafts of my early articles on the Goldwater Rule. Former APA president Alan Stone provided a brief comment that I much appreciated.

Lifelong friend Jon Carey and expert on journalistic ethics Meredith Levine helped me think through my early work. Former presidential candidate Michael Dukakis agreed to share his thoughts about the Goldwater Rule from the point of view of the public figure; Jon Carey and Sagar Vijapura helped to conduct an interview with Governor Dukakis. Research assistant Barbara Bogart helped me find my way in the Ralph Ginzburg papers, especially in the enormous transcript of *Goldwater v. Ginzburg*, and helpfully commented on the manuscript.

I owe a special debt to historian Larry Friedman of Harvard University, who over an extended period of time provided me with a role model for historically and psychologically sensitive biography. Larry enlivened many a lunch with his perceptive comments and guidance. For in-

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

depth comments, very special thanks go to Jay Hamilton of Stanford University's Communications Department; to attorney Elmer Ward of the Sauk-Suiattle Indian tribe in Washington State; to historian Matt Linton, then at Brandeis University; to the anonymous reviewers at Cambridge University Press; and to Susan Martin-Joy. At Cambridge University Press, editor Janka Romera understood early the vision I held for the book, shared her enthusiasm, and turned it into a reality; Emily Watton, Ilaria Tassistro, Chloe Bradley, Bethany Johnson, Sunantha Ramamoorthy, Ami Naramor, and Eric Anderson attended to copyediting, indexing, and the myriad other professional tasks that allowed the book take shape. Chris and Jeff Hyde, Carole and Tom Pauls, Janet Lowe, Kevin Hill, Kevin and Kathy Sheehan, Martin LaRoche, and many others provided much encouragement and support. Jeremy and Susan Martin-Joy deserve special thanks for their interest and their support.

Early versions of material presented in this book appeared as the brief introduction to an invited forum at the annual meeting of the American Psychiatric Association in 2015; in "Images in Psychiatry: *Goldwater v. Ginzburg*" in the *American Journal of Psychiatry* in 2015; in "Introduction to the Special Section on the Goldwater Rule" and "Interpreting the Goldwater Rule" in the *Journal of the American Academy of Psychiatry and the Law (JAAPL)* in 2017; and in a panel presentation on the Goldwater Rule at a meeting of the New York County Psychiatric Society in 2018. I am grateful to the panel organizers for the chance to think through the Goldwater Rule together, as well as to JAAPL for granting permission to use material that originally appeared there.

The late Christopher Bullock, a psychiatrist and candidate at BPSI, enabled me to discover the liberating power of a personal psychoanalysis. Psychiatrist Robert Coles, to whom this book is dedicated, has been an inspiring teacher and mentor. Beginning in 1979, when I first heard him speak, I have been inspired by Dr. Coles's decades-long effort to understand the lives of Americans who are caught up in the midst of historic crises. "He is a doctor," as novelist Walker Percy once wrote, "to the worst of our ills."

Abbreviations

APA: American Psychiatric Association

APA Archives: American Psychiatric Association Archives, Melvin Sabshin, MD Archives and Library, 800 Maine Avenue, SW, Washington, DC

APsaA: American Psychoanalytic Association

APsaA Papers: American Psychoanalytic Association Papers. Record Group 15, Series 7, Literature and Publications, Articles/Theses/Vari-
 ous Publications/APsaA Position Statements, 1964 *Fact* Magazine
 Survey. Oskar Diethelm Library, Dewitt Wallace Institute for the
 History of Psychiatry, Weill Cornell Medicine, New York, NY

BG Papers: Personal and Political Papers of Senator Barry M. Goldwater,
 Arizona Historical Foundation Collection, Arizona State University
 Libraries, Tempe, AZ. Box 52. References in the notes refer to box
 number: folder number (e.g., 52:11 is box 52, folder 11)

GG Transcript: *Goldwater v. Ginzburg* transcript. Copy of official steno-
 grapher's transcript of the district court trial, Southern District of
 New York, May 6–22, 1968. In Ginzburg Papers, boxes 32–34

Ginzburg Papers: Ralph Ginzburg papers, Accession number 7755,
 American Heritage Center, University of Wyoming, Laramie, WY

House Subcommittee on Intelligence Report (1973): *Inquiry into the
 Alleged Involvement of the Central Intelligence Agency in the Watergate and
 Ellsberg Matters: Report of the Special Subcommittee on Intelligence of the
 Committee on Armed Services, House of Representatives, 93rd Congress, First
 Session, October 23, 1973*. Washington, DC: US Government Printing
 Office. Accessed on July 7, 2019, at [https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/
 pt?id=uc1.31210017809086&view=1up&seq=7](https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=uc1.31210017809086&view=1up&seq=7)

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

House Subcommittee on Intelligence Hearings (1975): Inquiry into the Alleged Involvement of the Central Intelligence Agency in the Watergate and Ellsberg Matters: Hearings before the Special Subcommittee on Intelligence of the Committee on Armed Services, House of Representatives, 94th Congress, First Session [Hearings of 1973–4] (1975). Washington, DC: US Government Printing Office. Accessed on July 23, 2019, at <https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=mdp.39015082037170&view=1up&seq=45>

Joint Senate Hearing (1977). Project MKUltra, the CIA's Program of Research in Behavioral Modification. Joint Hearing before the Senate Committee on Intelligence and the Subcommittee on Health and Scientific Research of the Committee on Human Resources, US Senate, 95th Congress, First Session. August 3, 1977. Washington, DC: US Government Printing Office. Accessed on November 9, 2019, at <https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=mdp.39015013739290&view=1up&seq=1>

LBJ Library: LBJ Library [formerly Lyndon Baines Johnson Presidential Library and Museum], Austin, Texas

Senate Foreign Relations Committee (1975): Hearing before the Committee on Foreign Relations, United States Senate, 94th Congress, First Session, on Activities of the Central Intelligence Agency in Foreign Countries and in the United States. January 22, 1975. Washington, DC: US Government Printing Office. Accessed on July 7, 2019, at www.cia.gov/library/readingroom/docs/CIA-RDP91-00901R000500170001-7.pdf