

ek , Jaap Hage , Nicole Vincent
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

LAW AND MIND

Are the cognitive sciences relevant for law? How do they influence legal theory and practice? Should lawyers become part-time cognitive scientists? The recent advances in the cognitive sciences have reshaped our conceptions of human decision making and behavior. Many claim, for instance, that we can no longer view ourselves as purely rational agents equipped with free will. This change is vitally important for lawyers, who are forced to rethink the foundations of their theories and the framework of legal practice. Featuring multidisciplinary scholars from around the world, this book offers a comprehensive overview of the emerging field of law and the cognitive sciences. It develops new theories and provides often-provocative insights into the relationship between the cognitive sciences and various dimensions of the law, including legal philosophy and methodology, doctrinal issues, and evidence.

Bartosz Brożek is Professor at the Faculty of Law and Administration and the director of the Copernicus Center for Interdisciplinary Studies at the Jagiellonian University in Kraków. He holds PhDs in law and philosophy, and specializes in legal philosophy, epistemology, and theories of argumentation, as well as moral and mathematical cognition. He is the author of twenty book monographs and more than 100 research papers, and the editor of twenty-four volumes. Brożek has received numerous scholarships and awards, including the Humboldt Fellowship.

Jaap Hage holds the chair for Jurisprudence at Maastricht University. His research has focused on the ontology and logic of law, basic legal concepts, the methods of legal science, and – most recently – law and the cognitive sciences. His scientific publications include *Reasoning with Rules*, *Studies in Legal Logic*, and *Foundations and Building Blocks of Law*.

Nicole A Vincent is Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Transdisciplinary Innovation at the University of Technology Sydney. An analytic philosopher, she focuses on the social, legal, policy, and ethical implications, applications, challenges, and opportunities of advances in science and emerging technologies. Her publications have been cited in the Supreme Court of the United States and by the Presidential Commission for the Study of Bioethical Issues. She also spearheaded the development of the Australian Neurolaw Database. Her edited volumes, *Neuroscience and Criminal Responsibility* (2013) and *Neurointerventions and the Law: Regulating Human Mental Capacity* (2020) are core neurolaw reference texts.

LAW AND THE COGNITIVE SCIENCES

ek, Jaap Hage, Nicole Vincent

Frontmatter

[More Information](#) *Cognitive Sciences* publishes book monographs exploring connections between law and the cognitive sciences. The books will be of interest to academics, students, and practitioners, and in particular to the scholars in the fields of legal theory, philosophy of law, psychology of law, the theory of law and artificial intelligence, general theory of private and criminal law, and evidence.

*General Editors*Bartosz Brożek, *Jagiellonian University*Jaap Hage, *University of Maastricht*Francis X. Shen, *University of Minnesota Law School*Nicole A Vincent, *University of Technology Sydney*

ek , Jaap Hage , Nicole Vincent
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Law and Mind

A SURVEY OF LAW AND THE COGNITIVE SCIENCES

Edited by

BARTOSZ BROŻEK

Jagiellonian University

JAAP HAGE

Maastricht University Faculty of Law

NICOLE A VINCENT

University of Technology, Sydney



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48600-2 — Law and Mind
Edited by Bartosz

Broz

ek, Jaap Hage, **CAMBRIDGE**
Frontmatter UNIVERSITY PRESS

[More Information](#)

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108486002

DOI: 10.1017/9781108623056

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Brożek, Bartosz, editor. | Hage, J. C. (Jacob Cornelis), editor. | Vincent, Nicole A., editor.

TITLE: Law and mind : a survey of law and the cognitive sciences / edited by Bartosz Brożek, Jagiellonian University (Poland) Department of Philosophy and Law; Jaap Hage, Maastricht University Faculty of Law; Nicole A Vincent, University of Technology, Sydney.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Series: Law and the cognitive sciences | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020046962 (print) | LCCN 2020046963 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108486002 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108623056 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Law – Psychological aspects. | Cognitive science.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC K346 .L375 2021 (print) | LCC K346 (ebook) | DDC 340/.19–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020046962>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020046963>

ISBN 978-1-108-48600-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

ek , Jaap Hage , Nicole Vincent
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiv
1 Introduction: Between Law and the Cognitive Sciences – A Manifesto	1
Bartosz Brożek and Jaap Hage	
 I METATHEORY AND METHODOLOGY	
2 Are the Cognitive Sciences Relevant for Law?	17
Jaap Hage	
3 Social and Normative Facts	50
Carsten Heidemann	
4 Law, Folk Psychology and Cognitive Science	55
Łukasz Kurek	
5 Law and the Cognitive Science of Ordinary Concepts	86
Kevin Tobia	
 II ONTOLOGY AND EPISTEMOLOGY	
6 Cognitive Science and the Nature of Law	99
Corrado Roversi	
7 The Architecture of the Legal Mind	138
Bartosz Brożek	
8 The Psychology of the Trial Judge	165
Morris B. Hoffman	

9	Institutional Design and the Psychology of the Trial Judge	193
ek, Jaap Hage, Nicole Vincent	Adi Leibovitch	
Frontmatter		
More Information		
10	Bias at the Surface or the Core? A Comment on the Psychology of the Trial Judge	207
	Eyal Aharoni	
III LEGAL DOCTRINE AND COGNITIVE SCIENCES		
11	Private Law and Cognitive Science	217
	Przemysław Pałka	
12	Private Law and Cognitive Science: A Methodological Commentary	249
	Bartosz Brożek and Marek Jakubiec	
13	Responsibility, Liability, and Retribution	255
	Jaap Hage and Antonia Waltermann	
14	Guilt in Criminal Law: Guilt in Us or in the Stars?	289
	Mikołaj Małecki and Marek Sławiński	
15	The Insanity Defense	317
	Gerben Meynen	
16	Thoughts on the Insanity Defence	342
	Lisa Claydon and Paul Catley	
IV EVIDENCE		
17	Implications of Neurotechnology: Brain Recording and Intervention	353
	Pim Haselager	
18	Neuroimaging Evidence in US Courts	370
	Jane Campbell Moriarty	
19	Neuroscientific Evidence in Context	412
	Deborah W. Denno	
20	Some Issues in Interpreting Neuroscientific Evidence	421
	Bartłomiej Kucharzyk	
21	Explanation-Based Approaches to Reasoning about Evidence and Proof in Criminal Trials	431
	Anne Ruth Mackor, Hylke Jellema and Peter J. van Koppen	

	<i>Contents</i>	vii
V DISSENTING OPINIONS		
ek , Jaap Hage , Nicole Vincent		
Frontmatter	A Non-Naturalist Account of Law’s Place in Reality	473
More Information	George Pavlakos	
23	The Law and Cognitive Sciences Enterprise: A Few Analytic Notes	490
	Pierluigi Chiassoni	
24	The Cognitive Approach in Legal Science and Practice: A History of Four Revolutions	507
	Jerzy Stelmach	

Broz

ek , Jaap Hage , Nicole Vincent
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Figures

6.1a	Sociality	<i>page</i> 126
6.1b	Legality	127
13.1	Determinism	261
13.2	Fatalism	264
13.3	Libet’s experiment	267
13.4	Identity of mind (M) and brain (B)	268
13.5	Epiphenomenalism	269

ek, Jaap Hage, Nicole Vincent
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contributors

Eyal Aharoni is an associate professor of Psychology, Philosophy and Neuroscience at Georgia State University, USA. His research investigates risk factors for anti-social behaviour and the impact of cognitive bias on legal decision-making. He has a specific interest in the formation of punishment attitudes as a result of conflicts between moralistic and consequentialist reasoning processes.

Bartosz Brożek is a full professor at the Faculty of Law and Administration and the director of the Copernicus Center for Interdisciplinary Studies at the Jagiellonian University in Kraków. He holds PhDs in law and philosophy. He specializes in legal philosophy, epistemology and theories of argumentation, as well as moral and mathematical cognition. He is the author of numerous monographs and research papers and editor of many volumes. He has received numerous scholarships and awards, including a Humboldt Fellowship. He is the co-creator of the Copernicus Festival in Kraków as well as the MOOC platform Copernicus College.

Paul Catley is Head of the Open University Law School. With over 9,000 undergraduate students studying law modules, the Open University is the largest law school in the United Kingdom. Paul's research focuses on the use and potential use by legal systems of developments in the cognitive sciences.

Pierluigi Chiassoni is Professor of Jurisprudence at Genoa University. His research has focused on the law and economics movement (from a juristic perspective), legal interpretation and argumentation, judicial precedent, legal positivism and the history of analytical jurisprudence. His most recent publications include the monographs *El discreto placer del positivismo jurídico* (The Subtle Pleasure of Legal Positivism), *Da Bentham a Kelsen. Sei capitoli per una storia della filosofia analitica del diritto* (From Bentham to Kelsen. Six Chapters for a History of Analytical Jurisprudence), and *Interpretation without Truth: A Realistic Enquiry*.

Lisa Claydon is Senior Lecturer in Law and Head of the Centre for Life, Law and the Brain Sciences at The Open University Law School. Her research interests lie in the relationship between the cognitive sciences and the criminal law.
[More Information](#)

Deborah Denno is the Arthur A. McGivney Professor of Law and Founding Director of the Neuroscience and Law Center at Fordham University School of Law.

Jaap Hage holds the chair for Jurisprudence at Maastricht University. His research has focused on the ontology and logic of law, basic legal concepts, the methods of legal science and – most recently – law and the cognitive sciences. His scientific publications include the monographs *Reasoning with Rules*, *Studies in Legal Logic* and *Foundations and Building Blocks of Law*.

Pim Haselager is an associate professor at the Radboud University and a Principal Investigator at the Donders Institute for Brain, Cognition and Behaviour, in Nijmegen. He focuses on the ethical and societal implications of cognitive neuroscience and AI. He publishes in journals such as *Nature: Biotechnology*, *Science and Engineering Ethics*, the *American Journal of Bioethics*, *Neuroethics*, the *Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience* and the *Journal of Social Robotics*.

Carsten Heidemann wrote his thesis on Hans Kelsen's concept of norm. Since it was published in 1997, he has written diverse papers on topics including the Pure Theory of Law, law's claim to correctness, discourse theory and John Searle's conception of social reality. He is working as a practising lawyer.

Morris B. Hoffman is a District Judge, Second Judicial District, State of Colorado; Member of the John D. and Catherine T. MacArthur Foundation's Research Network on Law and Neuroscience; Research Fellow, Gruter Institute for Law and Behavioral Research; and Adjunct Professor of Law, University of Denver.

Marek Jakubiec holds a PhD in legal philosophy and currently works as an assistant professor at the Department of Philosophy of Law and Legal Ethics at the Jagiellonian University in Kraków. His research interests include law and the cognitive sciences, legal concepts, philosophy of mind and embodied cognition.

Hylke Jellema is a PhD candidate at the University of Groningen, Faculty of Law. His main research topic is the connection between inference to the best explanation and Bayesianism in criminal law. Recent publications include Jellema, 'Case Comment: Responding to the Implausible, Incredible and Highly Improbable Stories Defendants Tell: a Bayesian Interpretation of the Venray Murder Ruling' (in *Law, Probability and Risk* 18(2–3), 2019), and Jellema, 'The Reasonable Doubt Standard as Inference to the Best Explanation' (in *Synthese*, 2020).

Bartłomiej Kucharzyk holds a PhD in law and an MA in psychology. His research interests include empirical legal studies, law of evidence and psychology.

Lukasz Kurek is an assistant professor in the Department of Philosophy of Law and Legal Ethics at the Jagiellonian University. His research has focused on issues at the intersection of legal philosophy and philosophy of mind such as moral and legal responsibility, the role of folk psychology within law and the issue of naturalism in legal philosophy.

ek, Jaap Hage, Nicole Vincent
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Adi Leibovitch is an assistant professor at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Faculty of Law. Her research focuses on the economic analysis of law, behavioural theory and empirical methods, as applied to the study of the institutional design of courts, litigation and legal decision making, with a particular interest in the criminal justice system. She received her JSD and LLM from the University of Chicago Law School, her LLB and MBA, both *magna cum laude*, from the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, and her MA, *summa cum laude*, in public policy, mediation and conflict resolution from Tel Aviv University.

Anne Ruth Mackor is Professor of Professional Ethics, in particular of legal professions, at the University of Groningen. She has published on topics including the nature of legal science, criminal responsibility and free will, and models of rational proof in criminal law, amongst others. A recent publication is van Koppen and Mackor, 'A Scenario Approach to the Simonshaven Case', in Prakken, Bex and Mackor (eds.), *Models of Rational Proof in Criminal Law*, special issue of *TopiCS*, 2020.

Mikołaj Małecki has a PhD in law and is an assistant professor at the Department of Criminal Law at the Jagiellonian University. He is also the President of Krakowski Instytut Prawa Karnego Fundacja (Kraków Institute of Criminal Law Foundation). He is the author of books on preparation as a stage of perpetration of a crime, and on the attribution of guilt in criminal law. His main areas of interest include the principles of criminal liability, theoretical foundations of criminal law and interdisciplinary issues concerning law and philosophy.

Gerben Meynen is Professor of Forensic Psychiatry, Willem Pompe Institute for Criminal Law and Criminology (Utrecht Centre for Accountability and Liability Law, UCALL), Utrecht University, and Professor of Ethics and Psychiatry, Department of Philosophy, Humanities, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam. His research interests include legal insanity and the implications of neuroscience for criminal law and forensic psychiatry.

Jane Campbell Moriarty is a professor and the Carol Los Mansmann Chair in Faculty Scholarship at Duquesne University School of Law in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. Her research focuses on scientific evidence, neuroscience and law, and legal ethics. Her publications include several law review articles, interdisciplinary chapters, a textbook on scientific and expert evidence and a two-volume treatise on scientific evidence. She is also the co-editor of a book series and is currently

working on a book for NYU Press, entitled *Are You Lying Now? Neurotechnology and Law* (forthcoming 2020–2021).
 Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

Piotr Palka is a Research Scholar at the Jagiellonian University in Cracow (Future Law Lab, the Faculty of Law and Administration), Associate Research Scholar at Yale Law School and a Visiting Fellow at the Information Society Project at Yale. His research interests encompass the intersection of law, science and new technologies, especially property law, contract law, consumer law, personal data protection law, cognitive science, machine learning, data analytics and automation of legal tasks.

George Pavlakos is Professor of Law and Philosophy at the School of Law, University of Glasgow. He has held visiting posts at the Universities of Antwerp, Kiel, Luzern, the European University Institute, the UCLA Law School, the Cornell Law School and the Beihang Law School in Beijing. In recent years his work has focused on understanding the existence of legal obligations outwith the context of state institutions or other particular institutional arrangements. His published work includes the monograph *Our Knowledge of the Law* (Hart Publishing) and two co-edited volumes on moral and legal responsibility published by Cambridge University Press, as well as papers in legal philosophy in journals such as *Legal Theory*, *Ratio Juris* and *The Canadian Journal of Law and Jurisprudence*. He is the general editor of the book series Law and Practical Reason at Hart Publishing and joint general editor of the academic journal *Jurisprudence*, published by Routledge.

Corrado Roversi is Associate Professor at the University of Bologna, where he teaches Philosophy of Law. His research is focused on legal ontology and the phenomenology of institutional concepts. Amongst his publications are ‘On the Artifactual – and Natural – Character of Legal Institutions’, in *Law as an Artefact* (Oxford University Press, 2018), ‘Conceptualizing Institutions’ (*Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences* 13, 2013), and ‘A Marriage is an Artefact and Not a Walk that We Take Together: An Experimental Study on the Categorization of Artefacts’ (with L. Tummolini and A. Borghi, *Review of Philosophy and Psychology* 4(3), 2013).

Marek Sławiński has an MA in Law and a BA in Philosophy. He is currently preparing a PhD thesis in which he adopts Roman Ingarden’s conception of responsibility as a framework to explain the notion of criminal liability. He collaborates with the Department of Criminal Law at the Jagiellonian University, and the Krakowski Instytut Prawa Karnego Fundacja (Kraków Institute of Criminal Law Foundation). His main areas of interest include constitutional principles of criminal law, theory of criminal law, contemporary notions of responsibility and the notion of moral agency in ancient Greek philosophy.

Jerzy Stelmach is the Head of the Department of Philosophy of Law and Legal Ethics at the Jagiellonian University. His research interests include interpretation

within law, legal argumentation, legal negotiations and the methodology of law. He is the author of numerous highly acclaimed books, articles and contributed chapters which have appeared in leading publishing houses and scholarly journals. He holds honorary degrees awarded by Heidelberg University and the University of Augsburg.

ek, Jaap Hage, Nicole Vincent
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Kevin Tobia is an assistant professor of law at Georgetown University. His research focuses on legal interpretation and the cognitive science of legal concepts.

Peter J. van Koppen is a psychologist and emeritus professor of legal psychology at the Faculty of Law at VU University Amsterdam, and Professor of Legal Psychology at Maastricht University. His research encompasses issues concerning evidence in legal cases, especially witness and suspect statements, behaviour of police officers and judges and miscarriages of justice. Van Koppen has served as an expert witness in many cases, advises police teams and has published some 35 books, 125 articles and 100 chapters in edited volumes on various subjects in legal psychology. In 2014 he was awarded the Tom Williamson Award for lifetime achievement by the International Investigative Interviewing Research Group (iIIRG) and in 2016 received the Lifetime Achievement Award of the European Association of Psychology and Law (EAPL).

Antonia Waltermann is Assistant Professor of Legal Theory and Philosophy at Maastricht University. Her research focuses on explicating foundational concepts of (public) law and, more recently, on non-human agency. For the latter research in particular, she draws also from the cognitive sciences. Her scientific publications include the monograph *Reconstructing Sovereignty* and the edited volume *Law, Science, Rationality*.

ek , Jaap Hage , Nicole Vincent
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank all of the contributors to this handbook for their willingness to take part in its creation, as well as for their thoughtful and inspiring contributions. We would also like to thank Aeddán Shaw for proofreading the texts. Finally, we would like to extend our sincere thanks to Matt Galloway from Cambridge University Press for his encouragement and patience.

This volume was supported by research grant no 2017/27/B/HS5/01407, funded by the Polish National Science Center.