

THE PASTS OF ROMAN ANATOLIA

In this volume, Felipe Rojas examines how the inhabitants of Roman Anatolia interacted with the physical traces of earlier civilizations in their midst. Combining material and textual evidence, he shows that interest in and knowledge about pre-classical remains was deep and widespread. Indeed, ancient interaction with the remnants of even more ancient pasts was a vital part of life for many and diverse people in Roman Anatolia. Such interaction ranged from the purported translation of Bronze and Iron Age inscriptions to the physical manipulation of monuments and objects, including prehistoric earthen mounds and archaic statues. Occasionally, it even involved the production of fake antiquities. Offering new insights into both the archaeology and history of the Roman Mediterranean, Rojas's book is also an innovative contribution to the archaeology and anthropology of memory.

Felipe Rojas is Associate Professor of Archaeology at Brown University. He is the recipient of grants and fellowships from the National Endowment for the Humanities, the Institute for Advanced Study, the Getty Research Institute, the Loeb Classical Library Foundation, Koç University's Research Center for Anatolian Civilizations, and the Turkish Cultural Foundation. He has been working on archaeological projects in Turkey, at Aphrodisias, Sardis, Labraunda, and Notion, since 2001.

THE PASTS OF ROMAN ANATOLIA

INTERPRETERS, TRACES, HORIZONS

FELIPE ROJAS

Brown University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108484886

DOI: 10.1017/9781108676809

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-48488-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

*To the memory of
Crawford H. Greenewalt Jr.
(1937–2012)*

CONTENTS

<i>List of Figures</i>	page ix
<i>List of Maps</i>	xii
<i>Note on Cover Illustration</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
1 INTRODUCTION	1
Two Examples: the Mace-Head and the Goddess	2
Geographic and Chronological Scope	5
Archaeology, Antiquarianism, and Archaeophilia	6
Why Roman Anatolia?	8
Evidence	11
Chapter Breakdown	15
2 INTERPRETERS	18
Caesar and the “Phrygian” Peasant at Troy	19
C. Licinius Mucianus, Pliny the Elder, and the Temple-Wardens of Asia	23
Pausanias, the Lydian Guides, and the Plowmen in Temenothyrae	30
Collectors of <i>Lydiaka</i> in Sardis	35
Priests of the Storm God in Cilicia	43
Athletes by a Hittite Giant in Pisidia	50
Imperial Archaeophilia in the Troad	56
Conclusions	59
3 TRACES	61
The Limits of İvriz	64
“Signs” of the Tantalids on Mount Sipylus	67
Dancing on the “Throne” in Lycaonia	71
Dragon Spoor in Western Anatolia	80
The Exploding Cucumber of Immortality along the Hermus River	82
Respiratory History in Hierapolis	88
Living Traces: Anatolian Mountain-People	93
Tmolus, Mountain-Person	96
Conclusions	102

4 HORIZONS	104
Carp in Urfa: Abraham, Abgaris, Atargatis	106
Asianics in Aphrodisias	110
Persianism in Pontus	115
The Layered Mound at Zela	116
Dancing History	119
Jewish Leontomania in Sardis	122
Dragon Spoor in Christian Anatolia	127
Philip the Dragon-Slayer in Hierapolis	128
Pionius in the Katakekaumene	130
The Chapel of Saint Mary in the Corycian Cave	131
Jonah and the <i>Vishap</i> in Lake Van	135
A Christian Mountain–Person: Saint Ariadne of Prynnessus and her Anatolian Predecessors	137
Conclusions	140
5 BEYOND ANATOLIA	144
Entangled Discourses	146
Cicero and the Tomb of Archimedes in Sicily	146
Arrian and the Anchors of the Argo in Colchis	150
An Egyptian Merchant and the “Traces” of Alexander’s Generals in Gujarat	153
Expert Senses	157
Julia Balbilla, the Egyptian Priests, and the Sound of an Ancient King in Egyptian Thebes	157
Connoisseurs of Necrocorinthia in Greece and Rome	162
Other Pasts	166
An Aristocratic Collector of Antiquities in Iberia	166
The Records of the Turdetani	169
A Centurion among Petroglyphs by the Caspian Sea	173
Coda: A Modern Archaeophile in the Borluk Valley	176
6 THE PAST IN THINGS: ANCIENT ARCHAEOPHILIA AND MODERN ARCHAEOLOGY	180
<i>Notes</i>	187
<i>Bibliography</i>	217
<i>Index of Ancient Sources</i>	241
<i>General Index</i>	244

FIGURES

	Crawford H. Greenewalt Jr., watercolor of a hypothetical Roman mosaic illustrating the musical contest between Pan and Apollo, 2010	<i>page</i> xiv
1.1	Bronze Age mace head from Wadi B temple, Sardis	3
1.2	Engraving of “Niobe” on Mount Sipylus	4
1.3	Protesters at the Hittite Sun Course monument, Ankara	11
2.1	Trojan landscape	20
2.2	The “throne” in Kızıldağ	31
2.3	Nannas Bakivalis monument, Sardis	34
2.4	Visual “restoration” of Nannas Bakivalis monument, Sardis	35
2.5	Statues of lions and eagle from Nannas Bakivalis monument, Sardis	36
2.6	Statue base with bilingual Lydian–Greek inscription, Sardis	37
2.7	Plan of the sanctuary of Artemis, Sardis	38
2.8	Stela with Lydian inscription from near the “Lydian” altar, Sardis	40
2.9	Relief of Shalmaneser III, Uzunoğlan Tepe	45
2.10	Second-century AD Roman temple, Uzunoğlan Tepe	46
2.11	Neo-Assyrian relief at Karabur	47
2.12	Stela of Jupiter Dolichenus, Dülük Baba Tepesi	49
2.13	Colossal Hittite monolithic statue, Fasıllar	51
2.14	Replica of Fasıllar statue, Ankara	52
2.15	Plan of Fasıllar	53
2.16	Shrine of Lucianus and inscription, Fasıllar	54
2.17	Tumulus of Festus, Troy	57
3.1	Relief of Tarhunzas and Warpalawas near İvriz	64
3.2	Postcard of “Niobe” on Mount Sipylus	69
3.3	“Tomb of Tantalus” on Mount Sipylus	70
3.4	Volcanic mounds on the Konya plain	72
3.5	Map of Karadağ, Kızıldağ, and Lake Hotamış	73
3.6	The “throne” on Kızıldağ with dry Lake Hotamış	74
3.7	Luwian inscription of Hartapus and relief of seated ruler	75
3.8	Map of carved features on the “throne” on Kızıldağ	76
3.9	Greek inscription of Craterus and footprints on the “throne” in Kızıldağ	76

3.10	View of Karadağ from Kızıldağ	77
3.11	Map showing archaeological remains on Kızıldağ	78
3.12	The “throne” on Kızıldağ with seasonal Lake Hotamuş in the background	79
3.13	Relief of gods battling giant snake from Aslantepe	81
3.14	Coin of Alexander Severus	83
3.15	Coin of Gordian	83
3.16	Lava flows and volcano in the Katakekaumene	85
3.17	Exploding cucumber from Naples Dioscorides	86
3.18	Exploding cucumber (<i>Ecballium elaterium</i>)	87
3.19	Natural travertine pools in Hierapolis	89
3.20	Plutonium complex in Hierapolis	90
3.21	Coin of Magnesia	91
3.22	Coin of Nysa	91
3.23	“Tomb of Lydian king” at the head of the Cayster River	98
3.24	Altar of the tribe Tmolis from Sardis	99
3.25	Tumuli in Bin Tepe, north of Sardis	100
4.1	Bronze Age Anatolian hieroglyphic inscription from Al-Qaiqan mosque, Aleppo	105
4.2	Urfa, view to town from citadel	107
4.3	Urfa, Callihroe Spring, Pool of Abraham, filled with sacred carp	108
4.4	Sacred carp, Urfa, 1982	109
4.5	Archive wall, Aphrodisias	111
4.6	Relief of Ninus from Civil Basilica, Aphrodisias	112
4.7	Relief of Gordis and Semiramis from Civil Basilica, Aphrodisias	112
4.8	View of ruins of the fortress called Gordiouteichos (or Wall of Gordis) near Aphrodisias	115
4.9	Coin of Zela (Pontus)	118
4.10	Coin of Zela (Pontus)	118
4.11	Aerial view of synagogue, Sardis	124
4.12	Archaic Lydian lion at entrance to synagogue, Sardis	125
4.13	Back-to-back Lydian lions, Sardis	125
4.14	“Graffito” of Daniel and the lions from synagogue, Sardis	126
4.15	Martyrium of Saint Philip, Hierapolis	129
4.16	Lava flow and volcano in the Katakekaumene	130
4.17	Section of sinkhole showing location of Chapel of Saint Mary, Corycus	132
4.18	Chapel of Saint Mary, Corycus	133
4.19	Jonah reliefs, church of the Holy Cross, Akdamar	136
4.20	Mountification of Saint Ariadne	138
5.1	“Cicero Discovering the Tomb of Archimedes”	148
5.2	Drachma of Apollodotus II	157

5.3	“Colossi of Memnon” at Thebes, Egypt	158
5.4	Poem of Julia Balbilla on the “Colossi of Memnon,” Thebes, Egypt	159
5.5	Attic red-figure craters, Piquía, Spain	168
5.6	Late Bronze Age stelae from Chillón and Ibahernando, Spain	170
5.7	Latin inscription, Beyukdash, Azerbaijan	173
5.8	Petroglyphs, Beyukdash, Azerbaijan	175
5.9	Mr. Ç. explaining prehistoric petroglyphs in the Borluk Valley	178

MAPS

1	Map of Roman Anatolia	<i>page</i> xix
2	Map of Hermus River Valley region	xx
3	Map of greater Roman world and neighboring regions	xxi



Crawford H. Greenewalt Jr., watercolor of a hypothetical Roman mosaic illustrating the musical contest between Pan and Apollo, 2010

NOTE ON COVER ILLUSTRATION

The watercolor on the cover of this book illustrates a favorite myth in Ovid's *Metamorphoses* (11.146–194): a musical contest involving the god Apollo (a virtuoso of the lyre) and the satyr Pan (who plays the multi-reeded wind instrument that in English bears his name). The event depicted took place in the vicinity of the city of Sardis in western Anatolia. Strictly speaking, this watercolor is an illustration not of the musical contest itself, but of a hypothetical Roman period depiction of that event. The watercolorist chose to imagine and paint what mosaicists in Roman Sardis would have created if they had illustrated the musical contest.

Standing between Apollo and Pan are their judges: the Phrygian king Midas, with his distinctive donkey ears and oriental garb – notice his colorful tights and pointy Hittite-like shoes – and, above him, the personified mountain-god Tmolus splayed out over the landscape. Local Lydian flora and fauna are sprinkled over the conjectural mosaic's floor: a hoopoe rests on Tmolus's folds, while a hyacinth grows at Apollo's feet. At the top corners of the scene are medallions representing two Lydian settlements closely associated with Tmolus: on the right, the mighty Sardis, once capital of the Lydian Empire, and on the left, "little Hypaepa" (*Metamorphoses* 11.152). Despite its minuscule size compared with Sardis, the village of Hypaepa could claim some mythological importance, as Ovid attests: the skillful weaver Arachne was a native of the village (*Metamorphoses* 6.1–145).

This watercolor was painted by Crawford H. Greenewalt Jr., former director of the Archaeological Exploration of Sardis, over the course of many afternoons and evenings in the field. It was intended to be the stage backdrop for an opera on the mythical musical contest composed by Kamran İnce with a libretto by Miriam Seidel. That opera was premiered on April 13, 2012 at the Milwaukee Opera Theater. Inasmuch as the painting is an answer to the question "How would an inhabitant of Roman Anatolia have envisioned the local past?", it engages in the same sort of exploration that I carry out in this book.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book has been a long time in the making. In the process of writing it, I have received academic and financial support from various institutions in Turkey and the United States: Koç University's Research Center for Anatolian Civilizations (ANAMED), the Getty Research Institute, and the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton, NJ, granted me year-long residential fellowships. The Turkish Cultural Foundation, the Loeb Classical Library Foundation, and Brown University provided research funds. I thank all of them and the many individuals and institutions that gave me permission to publish images in their possession.

I am grateful to the faculty, staff, and students in the Joukowsky Institute for Archaeology and the Ancient World and the Department of Egyptology and Assyriology at Brown. Laurel Bestock, John F. Cherry, Peter van Dommelen, Yannis Hamilakis, and John Steele commented on large portions of the manuscript. Other Brown colleagues including Johanna Hanink, Susan Harvey, Jeffrey Moser, Matthew Rutz, Sarah Thomas, and Felipe Zapata (now at UCLA) read individual chapters or provided advice. Sarah Sharpe has been unstinting in her support since I arrived at Brown in 2012. Friends and colleagues elsewhere, including Benjamin Anderson, Matthew Canepa, Miguel Ángel Cau, Müge Durusu-Tanrıöver, Linda Gosner, Byron Hamann, Anthony Kaldellis, Christian Marek, Tomás Martín, Catalina Mas Florit, Elif Özgen, Peter De Staebler, and Robert Weiner improved the manuscript with their suggestions, as did three anonymous reviewers selected by Cambridge University Press. Scott Redford offered encouragement during a year spent in Istanbul and Angelos Chaniotis did likewise while I was in Princeton. I also thank Nick Cahill, Chris Roosevelt, Olivier Henry, Angela Commito, Jesper Blid, and Baptiste Vergnaud for their help, patience, and generosity in the field and beyond.

With efficiency and good cheer, Ayla Çevik prepared the indices and Dan Plekhov produced the maps. Christopher Ell cross-checked references to Greek and Latin texts and caught several mis-citations. Carol Fellingham Webb's meticulous copy-editing improved the text throughout. Nanán Zambrano produced a mock version of the manuscript with illustrations that allowed me and others to envision the final product. The remote origins of this project can be traced back to my graduate school days at the University of California, Berkeley, where David Goldstein, Alejandro Guarín, Athena Kirk,

xviii ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

and Joel Rygorsky inspired and informed me daily. I am profoundly grateful to Susan Alcock, Sarah Morris, and Christopher Ratté for their trust and guidance at various moments in my academic career.

I thank my parents and siblings, and also Luiza Silva, Valeria Sergueenkova, and Sarah Newman, without whom this book would not exist. Luiza, my research assistant and former student, is a paradigm of exactitude. Valeria, my friend and frequent collaborator, was at once the harshest and most generous of critics. Sarah's humor, kindness, and intelligence have lightened every one of the pages below; my debt to her is immense.