

RAYMOND ARON AND LIBERAL THOUGHT IN THE TWENTIETH CENTURY

Raymond Aron is widely regarded as the most important figure in the history of twentieth-century French liberalism. Yet his status within the history of liberal thought has been more often proclaimed than explained. Though he is frequently lauded as the inheritor of France's liberal tradition, Aron's formative influences were mostly non-French and often radically anti-liberal thinkers. This book explains how, why, and with what consequences he belatedly defined and aligned himself with a French liberal tradition. It also situates Aron within the larger histories of Cold War liberalism and decolonisation, re-evaluating his contribution to debates over totalitarianism, the end of ideology, and the Algerian War. By exposing the enduring importance of Aron's student political engagements for the development of his thought, Iain Stewart challenges the prevailing view of Aron's early intellectual trajectory as a journey from naïve socialist idealism to mature liberal realism, offering a new critical perspective on one of the twentieth century's most influential intellectuals.

IAIN STEWART is Lecturer in Modern European History at University College London and a former fellow of the Institut d'études avancées de Paris. He is coeditor of *In Search of the Liberal Moment: Democracy, Anti-totalitarianism and Intellectual Politics in France since 1950* (2016) with Stephen W. Sawyer.

IDEAS IN CONTEXT

Edited by David Armitage, Richard Bourke, Jennifer Pitts
and John Robertson

The books in this series will discuss the emergence of intellectual traditions and of related new disciplines. The procedures, aims and vocabularies that were generated will be set in the context of the alternatives available within the contemporary frameworks of ideas and institutions. Through detailed studies of the evolution of such traditions, and their modification by different audiences, it is hoped that a new picture will form of the development of ideas in their concrete contexts. By this means, artificial distinctions between the history of philosophy, of the various sciences, of society and politics, and of literature may be seen to dissolve.

The series is published with the support of the Exxon Foundation.

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of the volume.

RAYMOND ARON AND
LIBERAL THOUGHT IN THE
TWENTIETH CENTURY

IAIN STEWART

University College London



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48444-2 — Raymond Aron and Liberal Thought in the Twentieth Century
Iain Stewart
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108484442
DOI: 10.1017/9781108695879

© Iain Stewart 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-48444-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy
of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48444-2 — Raymond Aron and Liberal Thought in the Twentieth Century
Iain Stewart
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For my mother, Carol, with love

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>A Note on Translations and References</i>	xiii
Introduction	I
1 Intellectual Politics and the Crisis of Democracy	21
Philosophy and Politics in the Late Third Republic	26
Aron's Early Political Development	29
Critiquing the Intellectual Politics of the 1930s	38
Conclusion	46
2 History and Politics	49
Dilthey, Heidegger, and the Phenomenology of Self-Knowledge	53
Towards an Historical Sociology	61
Politics and the Historical Condition	66
Conclusion	73
3 Antitotalitarianism	77
Élie Halévy and the Origins of Aron's Theory of Totalitarianism	79
Democratic States and Totalitarian States	84
Secular Religion	96
Emergence of a Cold Warrior	103
The Limitations of Antitotalitarianism	109
Conclusion	117
4 The End of Ideology	120
Aron at the Margins of Neo-socialism and Neo-liberalism	122
Planning for Postwar Democratic Renewal	132
The End of Ideology and the Congress for Cultural Freedom	136
A Liberal Retreat from Empire?	141
Political Theory at the End of Ideology	151
Conclusion	162

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
5	Raymond Aron and the French Liberal Tradition	167
	Deconstructing the 'French School of Political Sociology'	171
	The Effacement of Célestin Bouglé	178
	The Sociological Reception of Montesquieu from Comte to the Durkheimians	184
	Aron's Interpretation of Montesquieu	190
	Aron's Interpretation of Tocqueville	199
	Conclusion	204
6	Raymond Aron and the Liberal Moment in Late Twentieth-Century French Thought	207
	Antitotalitarianism and the Return of 'the Political'	209
	<i>Contrepoint, Commentaire</i> , and Anti-68 Liberalism	217
	Anti-68 Liberal Revivalism in Comparative Perspective	222
	Conclusion	229
	Conclusion	235
	<i>Select Bibliography</i>	246
	<i>Index</i>	286

Acknowledgements

This book would not have been written without the support and encouragement of the many colleagues, mentors, friends, and family members that it is my pleasure to thank here. First among these is Stuart Jones, my former PhD dissertation supervisor at the University of Manchester. Although this monograph differs substantially from the dissertation on which it is based, it was Stuart who first suggested that I read Aron after I shared with him a few vague ideas concerning the postwar recovery of liberal political thought. His comments and suggestions not only helped me to develop and refine my own ideas but also opened up fruitful new avenues of research that I would not otherwise have pursued. At the University of Manchester Jean-Marc Dreyfus and Bertrand Taithe also gave invaluable support and feedback during the years of my PhD, and I would also like to thank Jeremy Jennings and Kevin Morgan for their comments on the completed dissertation.

I have accumulated still more intellectual debts during the long process of turning the dissertation into a monograph. Emile Chabal invited me to contribute a chapter on the 'French liberal revival' to his book *France since the 1970s*. His close reading and comments on that work were extraordinarily valuable not only for that chapter, which is partially reproduced here, but also for my thinking on the subject of twentieth-century French liberalism more broadly. Emile was also kind enough to participate in a *journée d'études* on 'Rethinking the French liberal renaissance' that I coorganised with Stephen W. Sawyer and Anna-Louise Milne at the University of London Institute in Paris in 2013. I would like to thank Gwendal Châton, Serge Audier, Michael Behrent, Daniel Steinmetz-Jenkins, Jeremy Jennings, Noah Rosenblum, Jean-Fabien Spitz, and Michael Scott Christofferson for taking part in this event, which was a formative experience in terms of my thinking about the wider liberal

moment in late twentieth-century French thought. Collaborating with Steve Sawyer on this project and the book that resulted from it, *In Search of the Liberal Moment*, has been extremely valuable, and if I have anything interesting to say about late twentieth-century French liberalism beyond Raymond Aron then Steve deserves part of the credit for this. Thanks also to Jacob Hamburger for arranging a review forum on this book in *Politics, Religion & Ideology*, and to Helena Rosenblatt, James Chappel, Hugo Drochon, and Julian Bourg for taking part – their insightful comments have informed the final chapter and conclusion of this monograph. I am equally grateful to Colin Gordon, Michelle-Irène Brudny, Céline Spector, and Grey Anderson for comments on some of the chapters. I of course remain solely responsible for any factual or interpretative errors the book may contain.

Since starting work on this project I have been fortunate enough to present my work at various conferences, seminars, and workshops, and the feedback that I have received at these events has contributed significantly to the development of my ideas. I would like to thank Greg Conti for inviting me to join him on a panel on French liberalism with William Selinger and Lisa Disch at the 2016 American Political Science Association Conference in Philadelphia. I am also grateful to Samuel Moyn for his comment on my paper at that event and for his advice and support more generally. In 2014 I presented a paper on the origins of the ‘end of ideology’ at the Cambridge Centre for Political Thought and am grateful to Or Rosenboim and Waseem Yaqoob for the invitation and to Patrick Baert for his comment on my paper. I would also like to thank Iain McDaniel for the opportunity to participate in a symposium on the works of Tony Judt at the University of Sussex in 2014. In 2012 I presented two papers on this project at the Institute of Historical Research and am grateful to Joanne Paul and Alison Carrol for these opportunities. I completed the manuscript during a fellowship at the Institut d’études avancées de Paris and gained much from discussing the project with colleagues there, including Kei Hiruta, who gave some particularly valuable reading suggestions and comments. I am also grateful to Tommaso Milani for his advice in relation to Hendrik de Man.

I began working on this book during a lectureship in Modern European History at Queen Mary University of London between 2012 and 2015. Queen Mary’s School of History provided the perfect institutional base from which to carry out this task and I am particularly grateful to Miri Rubin, Colin Jones, Julian Jackson, Richard Bourke, and Georgios

Acknowledgements

xi

Varouxakis for their support and advice. I have been equally fortunate in joining the Department of History at University College London in 2015 and would particularly like to thank Margot Finn for her help with my fellowship application to the Institut d'études avancées de Paris. Earlier financial assistance from the Arts and Humanities Research Council, Royal Historical Society, Society for the Study of French History, and Association for the Study of Modern and Contemporary France supported the researching and writing of this book. I would also like to thank the two anonymous reviewers for their comments on the final manuscript, Tricia Lawrence for copyediting, and Liz Friend-Smith, Lisa Carter, Atifa Jiwa, and Vinithan Sedumadhaven for their work on the publication. I am especially grateful to Dominique Schnapper for her permission to consult Raymond Aron's unpublished papers and to the archivists at the Bibliothèque nationale de France and the Archives nationales in Paris.

Some parts of this monograph originate from chapters and articles first published elsewhere and I am grateful to the publishers for their permission to include revised and expanded versions of them here. Chapter 1 more or less reproduces a section in my article 'From Pétain to Pinochet: Raymond Aron, Henry Kissinger, and the problem of political realism', *The Tocqueville Review / La revue Tocqueville*, 39:2 (2018), 15–33. The discussion of Heidegger in Chapter 2 originates from 'Plurality and universality in the political thought of Raymond Aron' in Joanne Paul et al. (eds.), *Governing Diversities: Democracy, Diversity and Human Nature* (Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2012). A shorter version of Chapter 4's discussion of Aron in relation to early neo-liberalism and neo-socialism was included in 'The origins of the "end of ideology": Raymond Aron and Industrial Civilisation' in José Colen and Elisabeth Dutartre-Michaut (eds.), *A Companion to Raymond Aron* (London: Palgrave, 2015). Finally, Chapter 6 partially reproduces 'France's anti-68 liberal revival' in Emile Chabal (ed.), *France since the 1970s: History, Politics and Memory in an Age of Uncertainty* (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2015).

For all the many intellectual and institutional debts that I have accumulated in the process of researching and writing this book, I am most profoundly indebted to my family for their love and support. It was the example of my inspirational mother, Carol Crompton, that first encouraged my intellectual curiosity and led me to pursue a scholarly vocation. I am very grateful for the help that she, my father Roger Stewart, and my stepfather Neil Crompton have given me over the years that I have worked on this project. Carlie and Graham Campbell have been extraordinarily

Acknowledgements

supportive, the best in-laws that anyone could hope for. Above all I would like to thank my wife Emily Campbell for everything she has given me since we met fifteen years ago, including most recently the birth of our daughter Claudia. This book has taken a long time to complete, but it could not have been finished at all without Emily's patience, generosity, and companionship.

A Note on Translations and References

All translations from French are my own unless stated otherwise. Although footnotes generally refer to the original French publications, in the main body of the text I have used the titles of published translations where these exist. I have made an exception to this rule in instances where the title of the published translation significantly changes the meaning of the original. For example, I refer to Hendrik de Man's book *Au-delà du Marxisme* as *Beyond Marxism* instead of using the published English translation, which is *The Psychology of Socialism*. Where no published English translation exists, I have left titles in French in the main body of the text when I have judged that the meaning will be clear enough to non-French speaking readers without the need for a translation. Otherwise I have provided a translation in brackets after the first mention of the relevant text in each chapter. Here I have translated titles as literally as possible (so *Le grand schisme* is *The Great Schism*) except where exact literal translation obscures meaning (so *Les Français devant la Constitution* becomes *The French People and the Constitutional Referendum*). Where years of publication are given in the main text, these always refer to the original French and I have retained the French names of organisations, journals, and newspapers. For primary sources, dates of original publication are given in square brackets where first editions have not been used. French conventions of capitalisation have been applied when referencing French sources and English conventions have been applied in references to English language sources. In each chapter initial references to works by Raymond Aron give the surname, full title, year, and place of publication. All subsequent references to these works in each chapter omit Aron's name and give an abbreviated version of the title.