

Hidden Histories of the Dead

In this discipline-redefining book, Elizabeth T. Hurren maps the post-mortem journeys of bodies, body parts, organs and brains, inside the secretive culture of modern British medical research after WWII as the bodies of the deceased were harvested as bio-commons. Often the human stories behind these bodies were dissected, discarded or destroyed in death. *Hidden Histories of the Dead* recovers human faces and supply-lines in the archives that medical science neglected to acknowledge. It investigates the medical ethics of organ donation, the legal ambiguities of a lack of fully informed consent and the shifting boundaries of life and re-defining of medical death in a biotechnological era. Hurren reveals the implicit, explicit and missed body disputes that took second place to the economics of the national and international commodification of human material in global medical sciences of the Genome era. This title is also available as open access.

ELIZABETH T. HURREN is Professor of History at the University of Leicester.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48409-1 — Hidden Histories of the Dead
Elizabeth T. Hurren
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Hidden Histories of the Dead

Disputed Bodies in Modern British Medical Research

Elizabeth T. Hurren

University of Leicester



Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48409-1 — Hidden Histories of the Dead
Elizabeth T. Hurren
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108484091

DOI: 10.1017/9781108633154

© Elizabeth T. Hurren 2021

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781108633154 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0>

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly. When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781108633154

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-48409-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Dedicated with love
To my uncle and godparent
John Joseph Patterson Esq
(1945–2019)
and
To my hairdresser
Sharron Elizabeth Tomlin
(1973–2019)
and
In memory of a shared friendship for history
Lin Ross of Nevill Holt Hall

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48409-1 — Hidden Histories of the Dead
Elizabeth T. Hurren
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	page viii
<i>List of Figures</i>	x
<i>List of Tables</i>	xii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvi
<i>Ethical Note</i>	xviii
Part I Relocating the Dead-End	1
Introduction: A Consignment for the Cul-de-Sac of History?	3
1 Disputed Bodies and Their Hidden Histories	20
2 <i>Res Nullius</i> – Nobody’s Thing	49
3 <i>The Ministry of Offal</i>	71
Part II Disputing Deadlines	101
4 Implicit Disputes: Mapping Systems of Implied Consent	103
5 Explicit Disputes: ‘The Balance of Probability’ in Colonial Cases	150
6 Missed Disputes: Brainstorming Neuroscience	205
Part III Death Sentences Delayed	251
7 Conclusion: Flesh Is a Dead Format? – Remapping the ‘Human Atlas’	253
<i>Bibliography</i>	274
<i>Index</i>	295

Illustrations

- 3.1 Photograph of ‘Mrs Craigie’ for an article by Margaret Maison, ‘The Brilliant Mrs Craigie’, *The Listener Magazine*, 28 August 1969, Issue 2109, p. 272, copyright cleared under creative commons Attribution Non-Commercial Share Alike 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-SA, 4.0), authorised here for open access, and non-profit making for academic purposes only. page 74
- 3.2 Publicity photograph of ‘Students Dissecting at the New Medical Centre’ ©University of Leicester – see, <https://www2.le.ac.uk/departments/medicine/resources-for-staff/clinical-teaching/images/students-in-dissecting-room/view>, accessed 10 January 2017, authorised for open access, and non-profit making, reproduced here under (CC BY-NC-SA, 4.0), for academic purposes only. Authorised by the University of Leicester where the author works. 90
- 3.3 ©Wellcome Image, L0014980, ‘Photograph of Newcastle Dissection Room 1897’, by J. B. Walters, copyright cleared under creative commons Attribution Non-Commercial Share Alike 4.0, reproduced here under (CC BY-NC-SA, 4.0), authorised for open access, and non-profit making for academic purposes only. 90
- 3.4 ©St Bartholomew’s Hospital Archives, Photographic Collection, ‘Dissection Room, 1915’, copyright cleared under creative commons Attribution Non-Commercial Share Alike 4.0, reproduced here under (CC BY-NC-SA, 4.0), authorised for open access, and non-profit making for academic purposes only 91
- 3.5 ©Wellcome Images, s3_L0018000_L0018253, ‘The New Operating Theatre at St Bartholomew’s Hospital around 1910’, looking recognisably modern with its stacked lecture theatre seats, Wellcome Trust Collection, digital download image reference, <https://wellcomecollection.org/works/mtgyyb5w>, reproduced under (CC BY-NC-SA, 4.0), authorised for open access, and non-profit making for academic purposes only. 92

- List of Illustrations ix
- 5.1 ©Wellcome Images, Reference Number V0010903, *A Juror Protesting that the subject of the Coroner's Inquest is alive; showing the dangers of blind faith in doctors when declaring medical death* – Coloured aquatint by Thomas McLean, 26 The Haymarket, London, c. 1826, copyright cleared under creative commons Attribution Non-Commercial Share Alike 4.0 International, reproduced here under (CC BY-NC-SA, 4.0), authorised for open access, and non-profit making for academic purposes only. 155
- 5.2 ©Wellcome Images, Reference Number L0062513, Watercolour drawing done by Leonard Portal Mark on 7 July 1894, depicting the face and chest of a man (unnamed) to show the appearance caused by rapid post-mortem decomposition. It was made about twelve hours after death, during the hot weather of July 1894 at St Bartholomew's Hospital dissection room, copyright cleared under creative commons Attribution Non-Commercial Share Alike 4.0 International, reproduced here under (CC BY-NC-SA, 4.0), authorised for open access, and non-profit making for academic purposes only. 156
- 5.3 ©Wellcome Images, Reference Number L0029414, 'Royal Liverpool University Hospital: a pathologist cutting open a body in the mortuary', original drawing on site by Julia Midgley, Liverpool, 1998, artwork dimensions 42 x 29.7cm, copyright cleared under creative commons Attribution Non-Commercial Share Alike 4.0 International, reproduced here under (CC BY-NC-SA, 4.0), authorised for open access, and non-profit making for academic purposes only. 157

Figures

1.1	Re-modelling the threshold points in body bequests used for dissection and further research in the medical sciences, c. 1945–2015	<i>page 34</i>
4.1	Remapping the threshold points of the dissected body and body parts of TAB, 5 November 1952–31 March 1954	108
4.2	Time frame and time travels of TAB's body: death, burial and certification	112
4.3	The potential(s) of TAB's threshold point(s) for the medical sciences	116
4.4	Number of bodies supplied for dissection to St Bartholomew's Hospital, c.1930–1965 (where N=1,072)	119
4.5	IGH material travels, 12 September 1952–22 December 1953	129
4.6	Bodies donated and dissected in England, c. 1992–1998 (where N=3,973 [2,505 for the regions and 1,468 for London])	132
4.7	Bodies that were donated and dissected at medical schools in England for teaching and further research purposes, c. 1992–1998	133
4.8	Age range of body bequests dissected in England, c. 1992–1998 (where N=3,973)	135
4.9	Number of dissected bodies analysed by gender and age range, c. 1992–1998 (where N=3,973)	135
5.1	Coronial donated human remains (bodies and body parts, human tissue and organs) supplied to, but not officially signed off on behalf of, UMDS medical school, 1993	186
5.2	The official procedures for donation to a medical school anatomy department under the Human Tissue Act 2004	188
5.3	Number of post-mortems held on behalf of coroners in England and Wales, 1995–2015	194
7.1	New paradigm of medical research threshold points in Britain, c. 1945–2015 (author designed)	259
7.2	Body supply phases in the history of anatomy – mapped onto changing cultural concepts of the body modelled by Yuval Noah	

List of Figures

xi

Harari, as cited in *Homo Deus: A Brief History of Tomorrow*, p. 388, a trend verified in three books by this author: E. T. Hurren, *Dissecting the Criminal Corpse: Staging Post-Execution Punishment in Early Modern England* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016) covering the 1752 to 1834 period, *Dying for Victorian Medicine: English Anatomy and Its Trade in the Dead Poor; c. 1834–1929* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012) and this book detailing the 1945 to 2000 era.

264

Tables

2.1	The official boundaries of bio-security in modern Britain and Europe	<i>page 52</i>
4.1	Epidemiology of dissection cases at St Bartholomew's Hospital, 1945–1965	123
4.2	Undertakers that buried dissections from St Bartholomew's Hospital, 1930–1965 (including those in the employ of Guy's Hospital)	125
4.3	Bodies donated and dissected at medical schools in England, 1992–1998	134
4.4	The disease classifications of dissection bodies nationally, 1990s	139
4.5	Disease classifications of those with cancer nationally, 1990s	140
6.1	Cambridge Brain Bank: an analysis of the brains collected, c.1980 to c. 2001	224
6.2	Cambridge Brain Bank: audit report (2003–2004)	225
6.3	Nature of retentions in pathology stores, which had been accumulated since 1970, and were present at the National Census Point, c. 2001–2003.	230

Acknowledgements

This book has been written with the generous support of the Wellcome Trust in London, to whom I am very grateful for the financial funding they awarded to me in the past five years. I hope that the new research it contains is a fitting tribute to the extraordinary legacy and personal vision of Sir Henry Wellcome. He sought during his lifetime to engage the curiosity of the public with the fascinating hidden histories of the body in the twentieth century, and beyond. It thus contains wide-ranging new research material assembled as part of a major transdisciplinary, large Programme Grant: WT RA15G2019 on which I have been a Joint Principal Investigator, exploring ‘Disputed Bodies in Modern Medical Research’. In so many respects, what has been accumulated represents the culmination of over two decades’ archival research. This has meant that in two previous books, I have been able to explore the 1750 to 1830 as well as 1830 to 1930 phases of body supply in human anatomy. Now these are extended in this third monograph by exploring the neglected period of 1930 to 2000. This sort of historical perspective over the *longue durée* has never before been feasible in a history of the body in Britain. I am therefore very appreciative of all the kind assistance given to me by the dedicated staff working in county records offices, university libraries and national medical institutions, across the UK. Although they are too numerous to list here, I did want to pay a short tribute to their collective expertise. It remains remarkably open to enquiry, for it is admirable how they continue to maintain the highest professional standards against the backdrop of exceptional budget cutbacks in local government services and the heritage sectors. It therefore affords me enormous pleasure to be able to place this book once again on open access thanks to a Wellcome Trust publishing subvention. In so doing, I hope its contents will promote around the world the remarkable archival collections that are available to academics in Britain.

This book has also been written against the backdrop of far-reaching changes happening in the academic sector, many of which are undermining the foundation of scholarship. It has been thought-provoking to complete a trilogy of books and to contemplate that beyond REF2020 many fewer

historians will have the same opportunities to publish high-quality outputs in the near future. I am therefore appreciative of those colleagues who have retained a commitment to collegiality in the face of the commercialisation of education, its mushrooming bureaucracies and a fees culture that encourages instrumentality amongst the student body. Having had a former career in finance for ten years and left it to embrace life-enhancing educational values, it is unsettling to find oneself back in such a profit-driven environment awash with management-speak of questionable value. Thankfully, academics continue to care and speak out about these worrying cultural trends. That they do so attests to one of the most engaging aspects of being a historian – the recognition that history is not just in our keeping, but in our making too. If this book, and those like it, can make a contribution to a larger conversation about the importance of high-quality research to shape our medical world for the next generation, then it will have succeeded in its central purpose.

At the same time, I continue to be inspired by the kindness of strangers. The hospitality that has been shared as I journeyed around Britain doing public engagement for this book has been a wonderful experience. I would in particular like to pay a short tribute to those hospices that opened their doors to my research enquiries. Inside I encountered patients, friends and families who spoke so movingly about end-of-life experiences. I unquestionably came away a different person from what I learned from those contemplating death. Hospices not only do remarkable work but have an ethos that is so life-enhancing. On a daily basis they defy clichés about them being either sad or scary places – they are the opposite. In their architecture, staffing and general facilities, I discovered light-filled places where people were making the most of life however limited their prognosis. It has been a privilege to be part of such a constructive, holistic and welcoming community. I discovered consensual medical ethics, practical support and dignified choices. Along the way, I also learnt afresh the central importance of regenerating the legacy of love. Thank you therefore to all those who peopled this book, many of whom are not named to protect patient confidentiality. I hope that in some small way that what is written reflects an extraordinary energy of purpose that was shaped by all those patients who spoke to me.

It is a fact of life that no academic book makes it out of the study without the loving support of friends and family. This book (like the others that precede it) reflects the delicious cooking and generosity of spirit of Professor Steven King. His commitment to the female principle is one, amongst a number, of his special character traits. For this book is ultimately about something he exudes – compassion. It is dedicated therefore to three special people who died in 2019 just as the revisions for this book were being finished. My uncle and godparent John Patterson spoke movingly to me, as

Acknowledgements

xv

did my hairdresser Sharron Tomlin and friend Lin Ross. They shared what compassion meant to them after their respective cancer diagnosis and painful treatments, and the pivotal role that it plays in all our lives wherever we experience medicine and the body in a global community. Thanks to them, *Nunc scio quid sit amor* – Virgil *Eclogues*, VIII.

PROFESSOR ELIZABETH T. HURREN

Lammas, Rutland.

Abbreviations

AA1832	Anatomy Act (2 & 3 Will. 4 c. 75: 1832)
AA1984	Anatomy Act (Eliz. 2 c. 14: 1984); see also HTA1984
ACPO	Association of Chief Police Officers, UK
AHCBD	Ad-Hoc Committee on Brain Death, convened at Harvard University, 1968
ALCOR	Alcor Life Extension Foundation
AMI	Acute Myocardial Infection
ARA1988	Anatomy Act Regulation Act (Eliz. 2 c. 44: 1988)
BD&RA1953	Births, Deaths, and Registrations Act (1 & 2 Eliz. 2 c. 20: 1953)
BLAA1880	Burial Laws Amendment Act (43 & 44 Vict. c. 42: 1880)
BMA	British Medical Association
BMJ	British Medical Journal
CA1952	Cremations Act (15 & 16 Geo. 6 & 1 Eliz. 2 c. 31: 1952)
CAA1926	Coroners Amendment Act (16 & 17 Geo. 5 c. 59: 1926)
CAA1956	Clean Air Act (4 & 5 Eliz. 2 c. 52: 1956)
CCA1888	Councils Act (51 & 52 Vict. ch. 41: 1888)
CCF	Congestive Cardiac Failure
C&FCASS	Children and Family Court Advisory Service, UK
CJA2009	Coroners and Justice Act (Eliz. 2 c. 25: 2009)
CMO	Chief Medical Officer, UK
COAD	Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease
CPA1974	Control of Pollution Act (Eliz. 2 c. 40: 1974)
CPR	Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation
CR1984	Coroners Rules (SI 1984 No. 552)
CSE&W	Coroners Society for England and Wales
CUH	Croydon University Hospital
DofH,UK	Department of Health, UK
DofH	Declaration of Helsinki
DofLS	Deprivation of Liberty Safeguard
DHSS	Department of Health and Social Security
DofG1948	Declaration of Geneva, 1948
DSO	Distinguished Service Order

List of Abbreviations

xvii

EC1979	Medical Research Council Ethics Code, 1979
EPA1990	Environment Protection Act (Eliz. 2 c. 43: 1990)
FAA	Federation of Associations of Anatomists
fMRI	Functional Magnetic Resonance Imaging
GHD	Growth Hormone Deficiency
GMP	Greater Manchester Police Force
HF&EA1990	Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act (Eliz 2 c. 37: 1990)
HOTA1989	Human Organ Transplant Act (Eliz. 2 c. 31: 1989)
HTA	Human Tissue Authority
HTA1961	Human Tissue Act (9 & 10 Eliz. 2 c. 54: 1961)
HTA1984	Human Tissue Act (Eliz. 2 c. 14: 1984); also called AA1984
HTA2004	Human Tissue Act (Eliz. 2 c. 30: 2004)
IHD	Ischemic Heart Disease
LGA1894	Local Government Act (56 & 57 Vict. c. 73: 1894)
LVF	Left Ventricular Failure in the Heart
MA1752	Murder Act (25 Geo. 2 c. 37: 1752)
MA1858	Medical Act (21 & 22 Vict. c. 90: 1858)
MDA1913	Mental Deficiency Act (3 & 4 Geo. 5 c. 28: 1913)
MDDS	Mitochondrial DNA Depletion Syndrome
MID	Mentioned in Despatches
MRC	Medical Research Council
NC1947	Nuremberg Code, 1947
NCEPOD	National Confidential Enquiry into Patient Outcome and Death, 2006
NET	National Ethics Trust
NHS	National Health Service, UK
NGNI	Next Generation Neural Interfaces, Imperial College London
NPL1834	New Poor Law Amendment Act (4 & 5 Will. 4. c. 76: 1834)
NPSA	National Patient Safety Agency
ODR2020	Organ Donation Register, NHS strategy 2020
PGP	Pituitary Gland Programme
P&CEA1996	Police and Criminal Evidence Act (Eliz. 2 c. 25: 1996)
RCP	Royal College of Pathologists
RSM	Royal Society of Medicine
SA1961	Suicide Act (9 & 10 Eliz. 2 c. 60: 1961)
TEPARC	Trans-European Pedagogic Anatomical Research Group
TRA1884	Third Reform Act (48 & 49 Vict. c. 3: 1884)
UCHL	University College Hospital, London
UDDA1981	Uniform Determination of Death Act, USA, 1981
UMDS	United Medical and Dental Schools of Guy's and St. Thomas' hospitals
WMA	World Medical Association

Ethical Note

This book complies with the Data Protection Act (1988) and recent GDPR (2018) in the UK. Anonymous names feature throughout the chapters. Each dissection case was given a unique identifier, known only to the author for ethical reasons. The new data is based on anatomical case material collected in the archives from 1945 to 2000. It is therefore beyond the one-hundred-year rule that historians often work with. All named cases have a unique set of letters. Each alphabetical description does not relate to the original names in the case files. This is to ensure that should there be any living relatives of the dead, their family name is not revealed. Sometimes, aspects of people's personal backgrounds are additionally disguised to ensure privacy is not breached. Those names that are cited in full, as per the original files, have come from primary research material already in the public domain. These are often newspaper reports and media interviews where relatives chose to speak openly. They are set out in the footnotes. At all times, the author has sought to maintain confidentiality. Over a three-year period of research, extensive record linkage work checked each case file's circumstances carefully. Anatomy records have therefore only been summarised and general statistics produced. If a representative case is cited, it has always been de-identified in such a way that it would be difficult to re-identify it. The author has tried to ensure that there are not any discrepancies or errors. If any have inadvertently arisen, then do please contact them on – eh140@le.ac.uk