

*Convergence and Diversity in the  
Governance of Higher Education*  
Comparative Perspectives

For several decades, higher education systems have undergone continuous waves of reform, driven by a combination of concerns about the changing labour needs of the economy, competition within the global-knowledge economy, and nationally competitive positioning strategies to enhance the performance of higher education systems. Yet, despite far-ranging international pressures – including the emergence of an international higher education market, enormous growth in cross-border student mobility, and pressures to achieve universities of world-class standing, boost research productivity and impact, and compete in global league tables – the suites of policy, policy designs, and sector outcomes continue to be marked as much by hybridity as they are by similarity or convergence. This volume explores these complex governance outcomes from a theoretical and empirical comparative perspective, addressing those vectors precipitating change in the modalities and instruments of governance, and how they interface at the systemic and institutional levels and across geographic regions.

GILIBERTO CAPANO is Professor of Political Science and Public Policy at the University of Bologna. He has been member of the Executive Committee of the International Political Science Association, the co-founder of the International Public Policy Association, and a member of the Executive Committee of the European Consortium of Political Research. He has extensively written on public policy, policy change, administrative reforms, policy design and instruments, and comparative governance in higher education. His recent publications include *Making Policies Work* (with M. Howlett, M. Ramesh, and A. Virani, 2019) and *Changing Governance in Universities: Italian Higher Education in Comparative Perspective* (with M. Regini and M. Turri, 2016).

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48396-4 — Convergence and Diversity in the Governance of Higher Education  
Edited by Giliberto Capano, Darryl S. L. Jarvis  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

DARRYL S. L. JARVIS is Professor in the Department of Asian and Policy Studies, Faculty of Liberal Arts and Social Sciences, at the Education University of Hong Kong. His recent publications include *Transformations in Higher Education Governance in Asia: Policy, Politics and Progress* (with J. Ka-ho Mok; 2019); *Institutional Entrepreneurship and Policy Change: Theoretical and Empirical Explorations* (with C. Bakir, 2018); *Asia After the Developmental State: Disembedding Autonomy* (with T. Carroll, 2017); *Markets and Development: Civil Society, Citizens and the Politics of Neoliberalism* (with T. Carroll, 2018); *Financialisation and Development in Asia* (with T. Carroll, 2018); and *The Politics of Marketizing Asia* (with T. Carroll, 2014).

## *Cambridge Studies in Comparative Public Policy*

The **Cambridge Studies in Comparative Public Policy** series was established to promote and disseminate comparative research in public policy. The objective of the series is to advance the understanding of public policies through the publication of the results of comparative research into the nature, dynamics and contexts of major policy challenges and responses to them. Works in the series will draw critical insights that enhance policy learning and are generalizable beyond specific policy contexts, sectors and time periods. Such works will also compare the development and application of public policy theory across institutional and cultural settings and examine how policy ideas, institutions and practices shape policies and their outcomes. Manuscripts comparing public policies in two or more cases as well as theoretically informed critical case studies which test more general theories are encouraged. Studies comparing policy development over time are also welcomed.

**General Editors** M. Ramesh, *National University of Singapore*; Xun Wu, *Hong Kong University of Science and Technology*; Michael Howlett, *Simon Fraser University, British Columbia and National University of Singapore*

*In Defense of Pluralism: Policy Disagreement and Its Media Coverage* By  
Éric Montpetit

*Asia after the Developmental State: Disembedding Autonomy* Edited by  
Toby Carroll and Darryl S. L. Jarvis

*The Politics of Shale Gas in Eastern Europe: Energy Security, Contested  
Technologies and the Social Licence to Frack* By Andreas Goldthau  
*Healthy or Sick? Coevolution of Health Care and Public Health in  
a Comparative Perspective 2018* By Philipp Trein

*Policy Accumulation and the Democratic Responsiveness Trap* By  
Christian Adam, Steffen Hurka, Christoph Knill and Yves Steinebach

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48396-4 — *Convergence and Diversity in the Governance of Higher Education*  
Edited by Giliberto Capano, Darryl S. L. Jarvis  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*Hyper-Active Governance: How Governments Manage the Politics of Expertise* By Matthew Wood

*Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective: Patterns, Nuances and Implications of the Contractor State* By Caspar van den Berg, Michael Howlett, Andrea Migone, Michael Howard, Frida Perner and Helen M. Gunter

*A Matter of Style? Organizational Agency in Global Public Policy* By Louisa Bayerlein, Christoph Knill and Yves Steinebach

*Policy Controversies and Political Blame Games* By Markus Hinterleitner  
*Government Statistical Agencies and the Politics of Credibility* By Cosmo Howard

*Convergence and Diversity in the Governance of Higher Education* Edited by Giliberto Capano and Darryl S. L. Jarvis

# Convergence and Diversity in the Governance of Higher Education

Comparative Perspectives

Edited by

GILIBERTO CAPANO

*University of Bologna*

DARRYL S. L. JARVIS

*The Education University of Hong Kong*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48396-4 — Convergence and Diversity in the Governance of Higher Education  
Edited by Giliberto Capano, Darryl S. L. Jarvis  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India  
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108483964](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108483964)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108669429

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Capano, Giliberto, 1960– author. | Jarvis, D. S. L. (Darryl S. L.), 1963– author.

Title: Convergence and diversity in the governance of higher education : comparative perspectives / edited by Giliberto Capano, Darryl S.L. Jarvis.

Description: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2020. |

Series: Cambridge studies in comparative public policy | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2020011087 (print) | LCCN 2020011088 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108483964 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108669429 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Higher education and state. | Education, Higher – Administration. | Universities and colleges – Administration. | Transnational education – Government policy. | Education and globalization.

Classification: LCC LC171 .C37 2020 (print) | LCC LC171 (ebook) | DDC 379–dc23  
LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020011087>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020011088>

ISBN 978-1-108-48396-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48396-4 — Convergence and Diversity in the Governance of Higher Education  
Edited by Giliberto Capano , Darryl S. L. Jarvis  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*For mum, Jean Jarvis*  
DSLJ  
*For my mamma, Melina*  
Giliberto

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48396-4 — Convergence and Diversity in the Governance of Higher Education  
Edited by Giliberto Capano , Darryl S. L. Jarvis  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---



## Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page xii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>Notes on Contributors</i>	xiv
<i>Preface</i>	xxvii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxxiii

### Part I Theorizing Governance in Higher Education

- |   |   |   |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Theorizing the Governance of Higher Education: Beyond the ‘Republic of Scholars’ Ontology | 3 |
|   | GILIBERTO CAPANO AND DARRYL S. L. JARVIS  |   |

### Part II Systems, Processes, and Dynamics of Governance in Higher Education

- |   |   |     |
|---|---|-----|
| 2 | The Regulatory State and the Labour Process   | 43  |
|   | KANISHKA JAYASURIYA, GREG MCCARTHY,<br>AND XIANLIN SONG   |     |
| 3 | Systemic Governance: Convergence or Hybridization?  | 68  |
|   | GILIBERTO CAPANO  |     |
| 4 | Institutional Governance: Factors, Actors,<br>and Consequences of Attempting to Converge<br>on the Anglo–American Model                         | 103 |
|   | MARINO REGINI   |     |
| 5 | Capture and Drift in Emerging International Governance<br>Arrangements: The Role of Meta-organizations in Higher<br>Education Quality Assurance | 138 |
|   | ÅSE GORNITZKA, PETER MAASSEN, AND BJØRN<br>STENSAKER  |     |

6	Understanding Convergence and Divergence in the Internationalization of Higher Education from a World Society Perspective	156
	RENZE KOLSTER AND DON F. WESTERHEIJDEN	
7	Convergence through Research Performance Measurement? Comparing Talk and Practices in Australia, Canada, and the United Kingdom	184
	JENNY M. LEWIS	
8	Accountability and Governance in European Higher Education	208
	MICHAEL DOBBINS AND JENS JUNGBLUT	
9	Towards New Models of Decision Making within University Governance in Anglophone Nations	246
	JULIE ROWLANDS	
10	Governance in Public and Private Higher Education in Europe: Patterns, Divergences, and Convergences	268
	PEDRO N. TEIXEIRA AND ROBIN MIDDLEHURST	
<b>Part III Geographies of Governance</b>		
11	Higher Education Governance in North America	301
	GILIBERTO CAPANO AND JUN JIE WOO	
12	Governance Trends in European Higher Education	333
	HARRY F. DE BOER AND JEROEN HUISMAN	
13	Governance and Corruption in East and Southeast Asian Higher Education: Close Cousins, Close Encounters	355
	ANTHONY WELCH	
14	Fixing the System? Trends in African Higher Education Governance	396
	ROSE AMAZAN AND KASSAHUN KEBEDE DAWO	

<i>Contents</i>	xi
15 Neoliberals versus Post-Neoliberals in the Formation of Governance Regimes in Latin America's Higher Education	426
MIGUEL ALEJANDRO GONZÁLEZ-LEDESMA AND GERMÁN ÁLVAREZ-MENDIOLA	
<i>Index</i>	455

## *Figures*

1.1 Triangle of coordination model: higher education systems	<i>page 6</i>
1.2 Research schema of scholarship on higher education	9
1.3 Spending on tertiary education: private/public percentage of education spending 2016	14
1.4 Global and national markets for higher education	18
1.5 International higher education markets	19
3.1 Clark's triangle of systemic coordination	74
3.2 Types of systemic governance modes in higher education policy	78
13.1 Number of Chinese journal articles on academic integrity and academic misconduct (1999–2013)	372
15.1 Systems of higher education in Latin America: privatization and enrolment after neoliberal shifts (1998)	433
15.2 Systems of higher education in Latin America: privatization and enrolment after post-neoliberal shifts (2016)	440

## *Tables*

1.1 Spending on tertiary education: private/public percentage of education spending, 2000–2016	<i>page</i> 13
3.1 Classification of policy instruments and their shapes	92
3.2 Types of hybrid systemic governance modes in higher education	94
7.1 Three nations in comparison	191
7.2 Performance measurement talk in Australia	195
7.3 Performance measurement talk in Canada	197
7.4 Performance measurement talk in the United Kingdom	198
8.1 Overview of Romzek’s four types of accountability	214
8.2 Overview of the different accountability instruments	216
8.3 Overview of accountability mechanisms in four European higher education systems	234
10.1 Relative importance of the private HE sector in Europe as percentage of total enrolments	272
11.1 Varieties of federalism according to formal framework and federal relations	305
11.2 Distribution of US institutions and enrolment by classification type (2017)	311
11.3 Provincial distribution of public universities in Canada	313

## Notes on Contributors

### Editors

**Giliberto Capano** is Professor of Public Policy at the University of Bologna, Italy. He is the director of the Italian Centre for Research on Universities and Higher Education Systems and co-editor of the journals *Policy & Society* and the *Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis*. He specializes in public administration, public policy analysis, and comparative higher education. His research focuses on governance dynamics and performance in higher education and education, policy design and policy change, policy instruments' impact, the social role of political science, and leadership as an embedded function of policy making.

His works on higher education have been published in various international journals, including *Higher Education*, *Higher Education Policy*, *South European Society & Politics*, *Journal of Legislative Studies*, *Public Administration*, *Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis*, *Journal of European Public Policy*, *Comparative Education Review*, *European Political Science*, *Policy Sciences*, *Policy and Society*, *European Policy Analysis*, *Journal of Public Policy*, and *Regulation & Governance*. He has recently published *Varieties of Governance* (co-edited with M. Howlett and M. Ramesh; Palgrave, 2015) and *Changing Governance in Universities: Italian Higher Education in Comparative Perspective* (co-authored with M. Regini and M. Turri; Palgrave, 2016).

**Darryl S. L. Jarvis** is Professor in the Department of Asian and Policy Studies, Faculty of Liberal Arts and Social Sciences at The Education University of Hong Kong (formally the Hong Kong Institute of Education). He previously held positions at the National University of Singapore and the University of Sydney, Australia. He has published widely in the areas of comparative political economy and comparative public policy. His publications include *Asia After the Developmental*

*State: Disembedding Autonomy* (with Toby Carroll; Cambridge University Press, 2017), *Transformations in Higher Education Governance in Asia: Policy, Politics and Progress* (with Joshua Ka Ho Mok; Springer, 2019), *Institutional Entrepreneurship and Policy Change: Theoretical and Empirical Explorations* (with Caner Bakir; Macmillan, 2018), *Markets and Development: Civil Society, Citizens and the Politics of Neoliberalism* (with Toby Carroll; Routledge, 2015), *Financialisation and Development in Asia* (with Toby Carroll; Routledge, 2015), *The Politics of Marketizing Asia* (with Toby Carroll; Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), *ASEAN Industries and the Challenge from China* (with Anthony Welch; Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), *Infrastructure Regulation: What Works, Why, and How Do We Know? Lessons from Asia and Beyond* (with Ed Araral, M. Ramesh, and Wu Xun; World Scientific, 2011), *International Business Risk: A Handbook of the Asia-Pacific Region* (Cambridge University Press, 2011), *International Relations and the Challenge of Postmodernism: Defending the Discipline* (University of South Carolina Press, 2000), *International Relations. Still an American Social Science? Toward Diversity in International Thought* (with R. M. Crawford; State University of New York Press, 2001), and *Post-modernism and Its Critics: International Relations and the Third Debate* (Praeger, 2002).

### Contributors

**Germán Álvarez-Mendiola** received his undergraduate diploma in Sociology from the National Autonomous University of Mexico, and Master's and Doctoral Degrees in Educational Research from the Centre for Advanced Research and Studies in Mexico. From 2002 to 2004 he was a Postdoctoral Fellow at the University of British Columbia. Since 1993, he has worked for the Department of Educational Research at the Centre for Advanced Research UNAM, and is currently Head of the Department. He has extensive experience as a teacher at secondary and high school levels, and as a professor at undergraduate and graduate levels. His research interests focus on public policies and organizational change in higher education, private higher education, life-long learning policies and institutions, and adult learners in higher education. He coordinates the book series *Higher Education Library* of the National Association of Universities and Higher Education Institutions (the Rector's association in Mexico).

He is a member of the International Committee of the International Workshops on Higher Education annual series.

**Rose Amazan** is a lecturer in the School of Education, University of New England, Australia. Rose's research and teaching is in the area of international and developmental education. She has extensive experience in many countries and has contributed to numerous analyses of issues such as female skilled migration, diaspora mobility, and gender and higher education in Africa and African university partnerships. Her current research project explores the issues surrounding the position of women in Ethiopian society, particularly in relation to their increased participation as students and teachers in higher education. She is also examining the outcomes of Australian scholarships for Africans, including re-integration, development of networks of practice among returnees, and gender implications.

**Kassahun Kebede Dawo** is Director of the Quality Audit and Enhancement Directorate in the Ethiopian Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency. He has participated in various national and international trainings on higher education quality assurance. He has served in the Ethiopian education system in various capacities, including teaching English in two high schools, leading the Department of Professional Science, and lecturing on education courses in Hosanna College of Teacher Education from 2001–2005. He also briefly lectured in Dilla University, one of the new universities in Ethiopia. Kassahun received his PhD in International and Comparative Education.

**Harry F. de Boer** is a senior research associate at the Center for Higher Education Policy Studies, University of Twente, the Netherlands. Within the field of higher education studies, he specializes in government–university relationships, steering models, policy analysis, institutional governance, leadership and management, and strategic planning. In his field of expertise, he participated in many national and international studies and research-based consultancy projects, and has published many edited books, book chapters, journal articles, and reports on the aforementioned topics. He has lectured several higher education and public administration courses at the University of Twente, as well as international programmes. He is on the editorial



board of *Higher Education Quarterly*. In 2015, he was one of the editors of and contributors to *The Palgrave International Handbook of Higher Education Policy and Governance* and to the book *Policy Analysis of Structural Reforms in Higher Education* (Springer).

**Michael Dobbins** studied political science and Slavic studies at the Universities of Konstanz, Warsaw, and Rutgers. He completed his doctoral dissertation in Konstanz, which dealt with comparative higher education policies in post-communist Central and Eastern Europe. In 2013 Michael was appointed Assistant Professor for policy analysis at Goethe University Frankfurt. His main areas of research are higher education policy, secondary education policy, policy making in the EU, policy making in the USA, and transformation processes in Central and Eastern Europe as well as the Caucasus countries.

His education research deals specifically with issues of governance, the impact of internationalization, and partisan politics. Most recently, he has focused on issues of school autonomy and educational decentralization and the influence of teachers' unions on educational governance. He is also highly involved in teacher training as part of the new educational science study programmes in Germany.

**Miguel Alejandro González-Ledesma** holds a PhD in Political Science from the Scuola Normale Superior de Pisa, Italy. Since 2016 he has held a postdoctoral position at the Research Institute on University and Education of the National Autonomous University in Mexico. He is also a lecturer on Geopolitics at the School of Philosophy and Literature. His research interests lie in the area of Higher Education studies, particularly governance, funding, quality assurance, and student movements.

**Åse Gornitzka** holds a doctoral degree from the Faculty of Public Administration, University of Twente, the Netherlands. She was previously a senior researcher at the Norwegian Institute for Studies in Research and Higher Education and at the Center for Higher Education Policy Studies at the University of Twente. Gornitzka's main fields of academic interest are the transformation and sustainability of the European political order in the area of education and research policy, the dynamics of European-level governance sites,

the role of expertise in EU policy making, and the domestic impact of the EU's soft modes of governance.

**Jeroen Huisman** is Professor of Higher Education at the Centre for Higher Education Governance of Ghent University, Belgium. He was a researcher at the Center for Higher Education Policy Studies at the University of Twente, the Netherlands (1991–2005) and Professor of Higher Education Management at the University of Bath (2005–2013). He is editor of the journal *Higher Education Policy*, co-editor of the SRHE/Routledge book series, and co-editor of the Emerald series *Theory and Method in Higher Education Research*. He is also a member of editorial boards of various higher education journals and a member of the Executive Committee of EAIR, a European society for linking policy, research, and practice in higher education.

**Kanishka Jayasuriya** is Professor of Politics and International Studies, Discipline Leader of the politics group, and Fellow of the Asia Research Centre at Murdoch University, Western Australia. Prior to his current appointment, in 2016 he was Professor of International Politics, Director of the Indo-Pacific Governance Research Centre, and Professor of International Politics at the University of Adelaide. He obtained his PhD from the Australian National University and served as a postdoctoral fellow at Griffith University. He has held teaching and research appointments in several Australian and overseas universities, including the Australian National University, the University of Sydney, Murdoch University, the National University of Singapore, and City University of Hong Kong, China.

His research interests lie mainly in the areas of international and comparative political economy. He has worked extensively on issues of regulation, rule of law, and regional governance with reference to Asia. His research focuses on the relationship between globalization and the transformation of state structures, including in the areas of social policy and higher education. He is also working on the dynamics of capitalist crisis and democracy with particular reference to Asia.

**Jens Jungblut** is Associate Professor of Public Policy and Public Administration at the Department of Political Science at the University of Oslo. Prior to this he held postdoctoral positions at the Scandinavian Consortium for Organizational Research at Stanford University and the International Centre for Higher Education

Research at the University of Kassel. He received his PhD from the University of Oslo. Jens serves as a member of the steering committee of the Standing Group on 'Politics of Higher Education, Research, and Innovation' at the European Consortium for Political Research. His main research interests include comparative higher education policy, policy making and governance in higher education, and healthcare, political parties and party politics, and organizational change of higher education institutions. He has published several peer-reviewed articles on topics relating to higher education policy, governance in higher education, institutional change of higher education institutions, and the role of student unions.

**Renze Kolster** is a research associate at the Center for Higher Education Policy Studies of the University of Twente, the Netherlands, where he mainly researches topics related to the internationalization of higher education, higher education relevance, excellence in higher education, and graduate employability. Recent publications include 'Introducing Excellence in Higher Education. Honours Programmes in the Netherlands and Students' Preferences' (with R. L. Dijk and B. Jongbloed; *Journal of the European Higher Education Area*, 2016), 'Study Success in Higher Education' (with F. Kaiser; *Global Challenges, National Initiatives, and Institutional Responses*, Sense Publishers, 2016), and 'Academic Attractiveness of Countries: A Possible Benchmark Strategy Applied to the Netherlands' (*European Journal of Higher Education*, 2014).

**Jenny M. Lewis** is Professor of Public Policy in the School of Social and Political Sciences, and Associate Dean of Research for the Faculty of Arts at The University of Melbourne. She is also the founding Director of the Policy Lab. Jenny is a public policy expert, with particular interests in governance, the policy-making process, policy influence, public sector innovation, and networks. She has published widely in a range of international journals, is the author of six books (including *Academic Governance: Disciplines and Policy*; Routledge, 2013), and has been awarded American, European, and Australian research prizes. Jenny spent nearly three years as a professor in Denmark before returning to Australia as an Australian Research Council Future Fellow in 2013. She is the President of the International Research Society for Public Management, and a past President of the Australian Political Studies Association.

**Peter Maassen** is a professor of Higher Education Studies and deputy head/research coordinator at the Department for Educational Research, Faculty of Education, University of Oslo, Norway, where he is also the academic coordinator of an Erasmus Mundus joint master's degree programme. Previously, he was the director of the Center for Higher Education Policy Studies, University of Twente, the Netherlands (1997–2000). His areas of academic specialization include public governance (including policy reform and institutional change) of higher education, university leadership and management, organizational change in higher education, and the economic role of higher education institutions in OECD countries as well as in Sub-Saharan Africa. He is a member of the Executive Board of the University College Oslo (Høyskole i Oslo), and of the Board of the Centrum für Hochschulentwicklung. He was a member of the international panel evaluating the Danish university reforms (2009), and of the Norwegian governmental commission on higher education (Stjernø Commission – 2007/08), as well as of the OECD review teams for Japan and Finland.

**Greg McCarthy** is Professor and BHP Chair of Australian Politics at Peking University, China. He also holds the Chair of Australian Politics at the University of Western Australia. His main research interests and extensive publications are on Australian politics and political culture. His long-standing research focuses on transitional change within and between nations. Recently, he has written on the internationalization of Australian higher education governance, and the political implications of the conversion of Australian higher education from an elite to a mass and internationalized education system. In addition, he has investigated the international relationship between Australia and China as read through the policies of contemporary Australian governments.

**Robin Middlehurst** is Professor of Higher Education and External Policy Adviser in the Vice Chancellor's Office, Kingston University, London. She also serves as a policy adviser to the Higher Education Academy, is a trustee of the British Accreditation Council, and is an Advisory Board member of the Observatory on Borderless Higher Education. Robin's research includes borderless education and internationalization, governance and leadership, and quality assurance and enhancement in higher education. Her abiding interest

is in ‘higher education futures’. Her previous roles include Director of Strategy, Research and International at the Leadership Foundation, United Kingdom, co-designing and co-directing the UK’s Top Management Programme for Higher Education; Director of the Quality Enhancement Group of the Higher Education Quality Council (and Director of Development at QAA), United Kingdom; and academic posts at the University of Surrey and the Institute of Education, London, England. Professor Middlehurst has published extensively on higher education policy, leadership, and governance, both nationally and internationally, and acts as a consultant for governments and higher education agencies in the United Kingdom and overseas.

**Marino Regini** is Professor Emeritus of Economic Sociology at the University of Milan, Italy, where he has served as Dean and Vice-Rector. He has been a visiting professor at several universities, including Harvard, MIT, Johns Hopkins, and Duke. He has also served as the President of the Society for the Advancement of Socio-Economics, of which he is an honorary fellow; as President of the Research Committee 44 of the International Sociological Association; and as a member of the editorial boards of several journals, including *Socio-Economic Review*, *European Sociological Review*, and *European Journal of Industrial Relations*. Among his major books are *Uncertain Boundaries: The Social and Political Construction of European Economies* (Cambridge University Press, 1995), *From Tellers to Sellers: Changing Employment Relations in Banks* (with J. Kitay and M. Baethge; MIT Press, 1999), *Why Deregulate Labour Markets?* (with G. Esping-Andersen; Oxford University Press, 2000), *European Universities and the Challenge of the Market. A Comparative Analysis* (Elgar, 2011), and *Changing Governance in Universities* (with Giliberto Capano and M. Turri; Palgrave Macmillan, 2016).

**Julie Rowlands** is a senior lecturer in education leadership within the School of Education at Deakin University, Australia, and a member of the strategic research centre, Research for Education Impact. Julie researches in the areas of governance, higher education systems, academic quality assurance, leadership, academic work, and organizational change, taking a feminist, critical sociology of education perspective. She is passionately interested in the role and place of universities within social relations, and in the creation and

maintenance of power within and by universities, and at what cost. Julie's work has led to governance reform at a number of universities in Australia and abroad. Her writing has been published in international journals, including the *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, *Critical Studies in Education*, *Studies in Higher Education*, *Higher Education Research*, and *Development and Discourse*. Julie's monograph *Academic Governance in Contemporary Universities: Perspectives from Anglophone Nations* was published by Springer in 2017, and she co-edited and contributed to the edited volume *Practice Theory and Education: Diffractive Readings in Professional Practice* (Routledge, 2017).

**Xianlin Song** is Associate Professor in the Department of Asian Studies at the University of Western Australia. Her research focuses on the current cultural transition and gender issues in contemporary China, and more recently on international higher education. Her recent publications include *Women Writers in Post Socialist China* (co-authored with Kay Schaffer; Routledge, 2014), *Bridging Transcultural Divides: Teaching Asian Languages and Cultures in a Globalising Academy* (co-edited with Kate Cadman; University of Adelaide Press, 2012), and *Transcultural Encounters in Knowledge Production and Consumption* (co-edited with Youzhong Sun; Springer and Higher Education Press, 2018).

**Bjørn Stensaker** is Professor of Higher Education at the University of Oslo, and a research professor at the Nordic Institute for Studies in Innovation, Research and Education in Oslo, Norway. He has a special interest in studies of governance and change in higher education, including studies of how external and internal quality assurance impacts the higher education sector. He has published widely on these issues in a range of international journals and books. Professor Stensaker holds a master's degree in Political Science from the University of Oslo and a PhD from the Center for Higher Education Policy Studies at the University of Twente, the Netherlands. He is currently a member of the Danish Accreditation Council, and a member of the International Advisory Board of A3ES (the Portuguese Quality Assurance Agency). He is also the current President of EAIR (the European Higher Education Society). His latest book is *Strengthening Teaching and Learning in Research Universities. Strategies and*

*Initiatives for Institutional Change* (co-edited with G. T. Bilbow, L. Breslow, and R. Van der Vaart; Palgrave MacMillan, 2017).

**Pedro N. Teixeira** is Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs and Associate Professor of the Faculty of Economics at the University of Porto, Portugal. He is also Director of CIPES (the Center for Research in Higher Education Policies). He has been a member of Portugal's National Council of Education since 2014, and has served as an adviser on higher education to the President of Portugal since April 2016. He has also served on the evaluation panels for the European University Association and the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education, on the Board of the BIAL Foundation since 2015, and as a member of the Education Advisory Board of the Foundation Francisco Manuel dos Santos, Lisbon.

He has published widely on higher education policy in a broad range of scientific journals, and is the editor of *Human Capital: Critical Concepts in Economics*, 4 vols. (with Christine Musselin; Routledge, 2014), *Policy Design and Implementation in Higher Education* (Springer, 2013), and *Public Vices, Private Virtues? Assessing the Effects of Marketization in Higher Education* (with David Dill; Sense Publishers, 2011). He is also the editor of *The Changing Public–Private Mix in Higher Education – Patterns, Rationales and Challenges* (Sense, 2017) and *The International Encyclopedia of Higher Education* (4 vols, with Jung Sheol Chin; Springer, 2018). He is a member of the Editorial Boards of *Higher Education*, the *European Journal of Higher Education*, the *Journal of the European Higher Education Area*, and of *OEconomia: History/Methodology/Philosophy*. He is also a member of the Board of Governors and Secretary General of the Consortium of Higher Education Researchers, a Research Fellow at the Institute for the Study of Labor, and a member of the Scientific Committee of the Réseau d'Etudes sur l'Enseignement Supérieur and the European Network of Higher Education Doctoral Students.

**Anthony Welch** is Professor of Education at the University of Sydney, Australia. His numerous publications address education reforms, principally within Australia, and the Asia-Pacific. He has advised state, national, and international agencies, and governments, institutions, and foundations, in Australia, Asia, and the USA. Project experience includes East and South-East Asia, particularly in higher



education. His work has been translated into numerous languages, and he has been Visiting Professor in the USA, the United Kingdom, Germany, France, Japan, Malaysia, and Hong Kong (China).

A *Fulbright New Century Scholar* (2007–2008), *DAAD Scholar*, and *Haiwai Mingshi* awardee, his recent books include *The Professoriate: Profile of a Profession* (Springer, 2005), *Education, Change and Society* (4th ed.; Oxford, 2017), *ASEAN Industries and the Challenge from China* (with Darryl S. L. Jarvis; Palgrave, 2011), and *Higher Education in South East Asia* (Routledge, 2011). He was a consultant to the ADB project *Higher Education in Dynamic Asia*, and directed the ARC project *The Chinese Knowledge Diaspora* (with Rui Yang).

**Don F. Westerheijden** is a senior research associate at the Center for Higher Education Policy Studies at the University of Twente, the Netherlands, where he coordinates research on quality management. Don mostly studies quality assurance and accreditation in higher education in the Netherlands and Europe and its impacts, as well as university rankings. Policy evaluation is another area of research interest. Since 1993 he has co-developed the CRE/EUA Institutional Evaluation Programme. He led the independent assessment of the Bologna Process in 2009/2010. He was a member of the team that developed U-Multirank, the online, multidimensional worldwide university ranking. He is a member of the editorial board of the journal *Quality in Higher Education*, and serves on international boards of quality assurance agencies in Portugal and Hong Kong. His publications include *Policy Analysis of Structural Reforms in Higher Education: Processes and Outcomes* (with H. de Boer, J. File, J. Huisman, M. Seeber, M. Vukasović, and D. F. Westerheijden; Springer, 2017) and ‘Next Generations, Catwalks, Random Walks and Arms Races: Conceptualising the Development of Quality Assurance Schemes’ (with D. F. Westerheijden, B. Stensaker, M. J. Rosa, and A. Corbett; *European Journal of Education*, 2014).

**Jun Jie Woo** is Assistant Professor in the Department of Asian and Policy Studies, Faculty of Liberal Arts and Social Sciences, the Education University of Hong Kong, and was previously Assistant Professor in the School of Humanities and Social Sciences, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. He received his PhD from the Lee



Kuan Yew School of Public Policy, National University of Singapore, and holds a Master of Science in International Political Economy from the S. Rajaratnam School of International Studies, Nanyang Technological University. Prior to his current appointment, Dr Woo was a Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the Lee Kuan Yew Centre for Innovative Cities, Singapore University of Technology and Design. He also serves as assistant editor for *Policy & Society*, an interdisciplinary journal of policy research.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48396-4 — Convergence and Diversity in the Governance of Higher Education  
Edited by Giliberto Capano , Darryl S. L. Jarvis  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## *Preface*

For historians, the rise and fall of civilizations have been relatively contiguous exercises in force projection, colonization, economic aggrandizement, overextension, exhaustion, and collapse, where the competition for territory, markets, and physical and economic resources has defined the ebbs and flows of history, explaining why ‘some parts of the world have grown rich and others have lagged behind’ (Kennedy, 1989; Maddison, 2007, p. 1).

In the twenty-first century, the wealth of nations continues to rest on trade and commerce, to be sure, but much less so on territory, extra-territorial wealth extraction, mercantilist trade practices, or resource competition. Ever-increasing amounts of wealth derive from knowledge, information, and technology – commodities that defy the confines of national borders or their amassing through military acquisition. The rise of the fourth industrial revolution (i.e., the nexus of technologies situated between the physical, digital, and biological spheres and represented by fields such as artificial intelligence, biotechnology, robotics, nanotechnology, and informatics) is largely supplanting industrial and manufacturing-based economic activity as core drivers of growth, employment, and national wealth (Klaus, 2017). While in 1917, for example, the largest economic enterprises (by share value) listed on the New York Stock Exchange were energy, steel, manufacturing, and resource-based firms, by 2017 it was knowledge and technology firms – the likes of Apple Inc., Alphabet Inc. (Google), Amazon, Facebook, Microsoft, financial services, biotechnology, and pharmaceutical firms. Indeed, just 2 firms (AT&T and General Electric) listed in the top 50 firms on the New York bourse in 1917 remain there today, with the rest either delisted, acquired by larger conglomerates, or having ceased trading (Kauflin, 2017).

This transformation from industrial-manufacturing to knowledge-based economic power is no better personified than by Apple and the iPhone. The value-capture in the development, manufacture, and

assembly of the iPhone accrues disproportionately to the knowledge-ownership of the technology rather than the physical production and assembly of the hardware itself. As Gereffi demonstrates, assembled entirely in China (via a Taiwanese firm, Foxconn), with a per unit export value of \$194.41, the value actually captured by China is a mere \$6.54. If the costs per unit of technology imports required to assemble the iPhone are taken into account, then China's share is dwarfed by Korea at \$80.85, Germany at \$16.08, and by the rest of the world at \$62.79 (Gereffi, 2014, pp. 20–21). By far the greatest value per iPhone produced accrues to Apple Inc., which retails the phone for approximately \$700 and uses the platform to generate stream revenues through app and content sales, making Apple the most valuable publically traded company in the world (Carroll and Jarvis, 2017, pp. 27–28; Feiner, 2019; Gereffi, 2014, pp. 20–21). Brains, not industrial brawn, are what drive modern-day economic dynamism.

Little wonder that moving 'up the value chain' and positioning economies in knowledge-based activities has become the dominant policy mantra of the contemporary era. It also explains the ever-increasing interest in and emphasis on the 'knowledge factories' of the twenty-first century: higher education systems which collectively produce the human capital and know-how that nurtures creativity, innovation, and technological discovery – the *zeitgeist* of national economic competitive advantage (Marton, 2006; Raunig, 2013). If there are contemporary 'empires' they increasingly nestle around those spaces where the metabolic rate of creativity is most intensive: the 'silicone valleys' and hinterlands of commerce that leverage off higher education systems and the complex, myriad talent networks that arise. Richard Florida labels this the location geographies of creative classes; or, in more formulaic policy terms, it is what Etzkowitz and Leydesdorff term the triple helix paradigm – the interface between universities, government, and industry (Etzkowitz and Leydesdorff, 1995; Etzkowitz and Zhou, 2009; Florida, 2002, 2005). Regardless of the nomenclature employed, the point is clear: universities and higher education systems are the pillars that make possible the knowledge economy of the twenty-first century and the economic rewards that flow from it. They sit at the centre of modern-day economic empires.

This reality has made higher education fertile ground for policy reform as governments the world over seek to create universities of 'world class

standing' and make higher education systems 'fit for purpose' (Gleason, 2018a, 2018b; Slaughter and Rhoades, 2004). Transforming higher education has become de rigueur, with higher education policy 'being "done" in new locations, on different scales, and by new actors and organizations' as never before (Jules and Jefferson, 2017, p. 124). The introduction of new forms of managerialism, regulation, accreditation, sector financing, institutional reporting and accountability regimes, metrics-driven performance assessment of institutional and sector outcomes, national and international rankings and benchmarking practices, and performance-based remuneration are recasting higher educational landscapes and the mechanisms by which they are governed.

But if the policy reform mantra surrounding higher education appears universally singular, it would be wrong to conclude a form of policy convergence, or, indeed, convergent trajectories or sector outcomes. Any rudimentary survey of the landscapes of higher education systems globally reveals contradictory realities – processes of both convergence and divergence. Indeed, despite far-ranging international pressures, the emergence of an international market in higher education and enormous growth in cross-border student mobility, pressures to achieve universities of world-class standing, recruit high-calibre international academic talent, boost research productivity and impact, or compete in global league tables, the suites of policy, policy designs, and sector outcomes are as much marked by hybridity as they are of similarity (King, 2010).

This volume grapples with this conundrum. It focuses on the governance of higher education, exploring those vectors precipitating change in the modalities and instruments of governance, and how they interface at the systemic and institutional levels, and across geographic regions.

By its very nature, however, focusing on governance is a necessarily amorphous activity, composed of both inductive and deductive forms of investigation. There is no settled analytical lens able to stabilize the language of governance or explicate and fix the parameters of its dimensions in a way that cartographers are able to map and reference points in geographic space. As a conceptual rubric, governance remains intellectually incongruent. While it is not the intention of this volume to grapple with these larger meta-theoretical and conceptual issues, the practical orientation of policy studies does require the emplacement of ordering devices, or at least frameworks, that permit the comparative

application of the concept (Brennan, 2007, p. 168). To that end, this volume approaches governance in higher education across two interrelated spectrums, each broken down into their constituent parts. In Part II, governance is treated *analytically* and broken down into sub-categories such as regulation (the tools and instruments of governance, including quality assurance, accountability, and management), system or structural elements of governance (the composition and institutional design of the sector, including the public–private mix), sub-structural elements of governance (organizations and institutional-level decision making), and meta-structural elements (internationalization). In Part III, the governance of higher education is explored *geographically*, addressing regional variations and similarities in the case of Europe, North America, Asia, Africa, and South America. The volume is thus designed to facilitate a thematic analysis of specific elements of governance, but referenced more generally in relation to governance trends globally.

Ultimately, of course, no analysis of the governance of higher education, especially viewed macroscopically and comparatively, can hope to be exhaustive. Despite the increasing prevalence of relatively uniform, meta-structural forces impacting national systems of higher education, the manner in which these articulate and traverse institutional settings and socio-political and economic national contexts makes for a series of empirically rich landscapes. That said, it is also the case that reform and transformations in the governance of higher education have never been so intense and far reaching, impacting not just the competitive dynamics of how higher education systems are positioned, but the treatment of academic labour and the opportunities for participation.

We hope this volume contributes to a deeper understanding of those forces impacting and transforming the governance of higher education.

**Giliberto Capano and Darryl S. L. Jarvis**

## References

- Brennan, J. (2007) On researching ourselves: The difficult case of autonomy in researching higher education. In C. Kayrooz, G. Akerlind, and M. Tight (Eds), *Autonomy in social science university research – The view from the UK and Australian universities*, pp. 167–182. London: Elsevier.

- Carroll, T., and Jarvis, D. S. L. (2017) Disembedding autonomy: Asia after the developmental state. In T. Carroll and D. S. L. Jarvis (Eds), *Asia after the developmental state: Disembedding autonomy*, pp. 3–50. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Etzkowitz, H., and Leydesdorff, L. A. (1995) The triple helix – University-industry-government relations: A laboratory for knowledge based economic development. *EASST Review*, 14(1), 14–19.
- Etzkowitz, H., and Zhou, C. (2009) Evolution of the university’s role in innovation and the new Asian model. In J. A. Douglas, C. J. King, and I. Fekker (Eds), *Globalization’s muse: Universities and higher education systems in a changing world*, pp. 229–247. Berkeley: Berkeley Public Policy Press.
- Feiner, L. (2019) Apple is once again the most valuable public company in the world. [www.cnbc.com/2019/02/06/apple-is-once-again-the-most-valuable-public-company-in-the-world.html](http://www.cnbc.com/2019/02/06/apple-is-once-again-the-most-valuable-public-company-in-the-world.html)
- Florida, R. L. (2002) *The rise of the creative class and how it’s transforming work, leisure, community and everyday life*. New York: Basic Books.
- Florida, R. L. (2005) *Cities and the creative class*. New York; London: Routledge.
- Gereffi, G. (2014) Global value chains in a post-Washington consensus world. *Review of International Political Economy*, 21(1), 9–37. doi:10.1080/09692290.2012.756414
- Gleason, N. W. (2018a). Introduction. In N. W. Gleason (Ed.), *Higher education in the era of the fourth industrial revolution*, pp. 1–12. Singapore: Springer; Palgrave Macmillan.
- Gleason, N. W. (Ed.) (2018b). *Higher education in the era of the fourth industrial revolution*. Singapore: Springer; Palgrave Macmillan.
- Jules, T. D., and Jefferson, S. S. (2017) The next educational bubble – educational brokers and education governance mechanisms: Who governs what! In T. D. Jules (Ed.), *The global educational policy environment in the fourth industrial revolution: Gated, regulated and governed*, pp. 123–147. Bingley: Emerald.
- Kauflin, J. (2017) America’s top 50 companies 1917–2017. *Forbes*. [www.forbes.com/sites/jeffkauflin/2017/09/19/americas-top-50-companies-1917-2017/#37a343b41629](http://www.forbes.com/sites/jeffkauflin/2017/09/19/americas-top-50-companies-1917-2017/#37a343b41629)
- Kennedy, P. M. (1989) *The rise and fall of the great powers: Economic change and military conflict from 1500–2000*. London: Fontana Press.
- King, R. (2010) Policy internationalization, national variety and governance: Global models and network power in higher education states. *Higher Education: The International Journal of Higher Education and Educational Planning*, 60(6), 583–594.

- Klaus, S. (2017) *The fourth industrial revolution*. New York: Crown Business.
- Maddison, A. (2007) *Contours of the world economy, 1–2030 AD: Essays in macro-economic history*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Marton, S. (2006) Education policy. In B. G. Peters and J. Pierre (Eds), *Handbook of public policy*, pp. 231–248. London; Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Raunig, G. (2013) *Factories of knowledge, industries of creativity*. Los Angeles/Cambridge, MA: Semiotexte.
- Slaughter, S., and Rhoades, G. (2004) *Academic capitalism and the new economy: Markets, state, and higher education*. London/Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.



## *Abbreviations*

AACU	Association of American Colleges and Universities
AAU	Association of American Universities
AASCU	American Association of State Colleges and Universities
ACCT	Association of Community College Trustees
ACU	American Capital University
AERES	Agence de l'évaluation de la recherche et de l'enseignement supérieur
AIU	Asian International University
ARACIS	Agenția Română de Asigurare a Calității în Învățământul Superior
ASEAN	Association of South East Asian Nations
BAN	Badan Akreditasi Nasional
BFUG	Bologna Follow-Up Group
BHMN	Badan Hukum Milik Negera
CAE	Crédito con Aval del Estado
CAP	changing academic profession
CAS	Chinese Academy of Sciences
CCDI	Central Commission for Discipline Inspection
CCP	Chinese Communist Party
CEI	International Campus of Excellence
CEO	chief executive officer
CEQ	Course Experience Questionnaire
CHEA	Council for Higher Education Accreditation
CIC	Council of Independent Colleges
CMEC	Council of Ministers of Education, Canada
CNE	Comité National d'Evaluation
CNRS	Centre national de la recherche scientifique
CPI	Corruption Perception Index
DAAD	Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst
E4	ENQA, EUA, ESU, and EURASHE
EEA	European Economic Area

EMBA	executive master of business administration
ENQA	European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education
EPRDF	Ethiopia Peoples' Revolutionary Democratic Front
ERA	Excellence in Research for Australia
EROD	Education Resource Organizations Directory
ESC	Education Strategy Centre
ESG	European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance
ESIB	now known as ESU
ESU	European Students' Union
ETP	Education and Training Policy
EU	European Union
EUA	European University Association
EURASHE	European Association of Institutions for Higher Education
FARC	Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia
FDRE	Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
FTE	full-time equivalent
GDP	gross domestic product
HE	higher education
HEI	higher education institution
HEP	Higher Education Proclamation
HERQA	Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency
HEs	higher education system
IHE	international higher education
IIEP	International Institute for Educational Planning
ILO	International Labour Organization
IPB	Institut Pertanian Bogor
ISCED	International Standard Classification of Education
ITB	Institut Teknologi Bandung
IUCEA	Inter-University Council for East Africa
KEJN	Komitet Ewaluacji Jednostek Naukowych
KKN	Korupsi, Kolusi, Nepotisme
KNOW	Krajowe Naukowe Ośrodki Wiodące
KRASP	Polish Rectors Conference
LOLF	Loi organique relative aux lois de finance
MBA	master of business administration
MoE	Ministry of Education

*List of Abbreviations*

xxxv

MOET	Ministry of Education and Training
NAICU	National Association of Independent Colleges and Universities
NASULGC	National Association of State Universities and Land-Grant College
NCBR	Narodowe Centrum Badań i Rozwoju
NCCC	National Counter Corruption Commission
NCN	Narodowe Centrum Nauki
NGO	non-governmental organization
NPM	New Public Management
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
ONESQA	Office for National Education Standards and Quality Assessment
PRC	People's Republic of China
PRHEI	private higher education institutions
PTP	Perguruan Tinggi yang Diselenggarakan Pemerintah
QA	quality assurance
REF	Research Excellence Framework
SAP	Structural Adjustment Programme
SHEEO	State Higher Education Executive Officer Network
SSA	Sub-Saharan African
(S)SCI	(Social) Science Citation Index
STEM	Science, Technology, Engineering, and Medicine
TI	Transparency International
TNE	transnational education
TVET	technical and vocational training
UMcedel	Universiti Malaya's Centre for Democracy and Elections
UMNO	United Malays National Organisation
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
VC	Vice Chancellor
VPAR	Academic Vice President
VPN	virtual private network

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48396-4 — Convergence and Diversity in the Governance of Higher Education  
Edited by Giliberto Capano , Darryl S. L. Jarvis  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---