

#### WAR ECONOMIES AND INTERNATIONAL LAW

What rules apply when US troops occupy Syrian oil fields? Who is responsible when multinational companies use minerals extracted by child labourers in war zones? This book examines how international law regulates the war economies that are at the heart of strategic competition between great powers and help sustain the irregular warfare in today's war zones. Drawing on advances in our understanding of the social and economic dynamics in war zones, this book identifies predation, a combination of violence and economic opportunity, as the core pathology of war economies. The author presents a framework for understanding the regulation of war economies based on the history of international law and existing norms of international humanitarian law, international criminal law, international human rights law, and the law of international peace and security. War Economies and International Law concludes that the pathologies of predation in war demand answers based on an international regulatory strategy.

Mark B. Taylor is a senior researcher at the Fafo Institute for Labour and Social Research in Oslo. His research focuses on law and capitalism with a focus on legal frameworks for responsible business, sustainability, and the economic dimensions of violent conflict.





#### GLOBALIZATION AND HUMAN RIGHTS

The series provides unique and multi-disciplinary perspectives on the interface of the global economy and human rights. It offers space for exploring the challenges of globalization, the role of human rights in framing and shaping regulation and politics and, more critically, whether human rights are a mere product or legitimation of globalization.

#### Series Editors

Malcolm Langford César Rodríguez-Garavito

Books in the Series

At the Margins of Globalization: Indigenous Peoples and International Economic Law Sergio Puig

The Future of Economic and Social Rights Edited by Katharine G. Young

Business and Human Rights: Beyond the End of the Beginning Edited by César Rodríguez-Garavito

Contesting World Order?: Socioeconomic Rights and Global Justice Movements Joe Wills

Forthcoming Books in the Series

Jeremy Perelman, The Rights-ification of Development: Global Poverty, Human Rights, and Globalization in the Post-Washington Consensus





# War Economies and International Law

# REGULATING THE ECONOMIC ACTIVITIES OF VIOLENT CONFLICT

MARK B. TAYLOR

Fafo Institute for Labour and Social Research, Oslo





#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108483704 DOI: 10.1017/9781108652124

© Mark B. Taylor 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Taylor, Mark B., author.

TITLE: War economics and international law: regulating the economic activities of violent conflict / Mark B. Taylor, Fafo Institute for Labour and Social Research, Oslo.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2021.

| Series: Globalization and human rights | Includes bibliographical references and index.

| IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020053213 (print) | LCCN 202005321 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108483704 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108718011 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108652124 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: War (International law). | War–Economic aspects. | War, Cost of. |

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KZ6385 .T39 2021 (print) | LCC KZ6385 (ebook) | DDC 341.6–dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020053213 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020053214

ISBN 978-1-108-48370-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### Contents

List of Tables	<i>page</i> xi
Preface	xiii
List of Abbreviations	xvii
Introduction	1
The War–Economy Nexus	4
Two Kinds of War Economies	10
War Economies and Law	14
Outline of the Argument	21
PART I INTERNATIONAL RULES FOR WAR ECONOMIES	
1 A Brief History of Norms I	27
From Predation to Protection	27
The Repression of Private Predation	32
The Permissibility of Economic Warfare	36
The Colonial Exception	41
Conclusion	46
2 International Rules for War Zones	48
The Charter Framework	51
State Duties for Proxy Support	55
Occupiers' Duties	59
Illegal Exploitation	65
Duties to Disrupt and Exclude	71
Conclusion	80



viii Contents

3	Money: Regulating Conflict Finance	83
	Sanctioning War Economies	84
	Freezing the Assets of Terrorists Commodity Sanctions as Regulation	93
	Policing Resources in the War Zone	97
	Regulating Commodity Chains from Conflict	103
	Conclusion	107
	Conclusion	110
4	Weapons: Regulating the Arms Trade	113
	Weapons Export Controls	116
	Clusters of Arms Control	120
	The Limits of Arms Embargoes	125
	Norms and the Arms Trade Treaty	127
	Conclusion	131
5	Fighters: Regulating Mobilization	134
,	Disarmament and Demobilization	137
	The Crime of Forced Conscription	141
	Child Soldier Recruitment	145
	Bringing Private Violence Back In	149
	Criminalizing Foreign Fighters	155
	Conclusion	158
PAR	T II WAR CRIMES OF AN ECONOMIC NATURE	
6	A Brief History of Norms II	163
	Origins	163
	Protecting Property against Appropriation	166
	Protecting Labour against Exploitation	171
	The Norms Applicable	176
7	Taking Property in War	179
	The Crime of Pillage: Unlawful Appropriation	180
	Crime Definition	182
	Private and Personal Use	185
	Pillage as a Transaction	187
	When Pillage Is a Crime in Irregular Warfare	189
	Responsibility for Pillage	196
	Modes of Responsibility	196
	Commercial Responsibility for Pillage	201
	Conclusion	203



	Contents	ix
8	Labour Exploitation in War	206
	The Crimes of Slavery and Forced Labour	207
	Gaps in the Statutes?	210
	Crime Definition	214
	When Slavery Is a Crime in Irregular Warfare	220
	Responsibility for Labour Exploitation	227
	Militarized Forced Labour	240
	Conclusion	244
9	Commercial Crime in War	246
	The 'Turn' to Corporate Criminal Liability	<del>24</del> 7
	Commerce as Crime in Irregular Warfare:	
	Corporate Perpetrators	255
	Support to Terrorism	259
	Commercial Crime	263
	Commerce as Crime in Irregular Warfare:	
	Corporate Accomplices	267
	Conclusion	271
10	Conclusion: Regulating the Global Value Chains of War	273
	Regulating the War Economy System	275
	A 'Jus in Bello' of War Economies	279
	A Strategic Approach	282
Ref	erences	287
	Authorities	294
	Cases	297
	Global Administrative Law	299
	Grey Literature	301
	Media	303
	Online Resources	305
Ind	ex	307





## Tables

3.1	UNSC Sanctions in Situations of Irregular Warfare,	
	1991–2013	page 89
9.1	National Criminal Investigations of Commercial Actors	
	in the Context of Conflict, 2002–19	265





#### Preface

This book is concerned with an aspect of war that is hidden in plain sight. The economic aspects of war are blindingly obvious: they are there in the salaries and upkeep of the fighters deployed, in the weapons used, and in the survival strategies of people caught in the war zone. Yet, the economic dimensions of conflict have been largely neglected by the jurists, diplomats, and others who are usually concerned about how war is regulated.

This book is an attempt to correct this neglect. Drawing on the social science investigating violence in conflict, and on the history of various regimes of public international law, the book makes a simple claim (or two): the economic dimensions of armed conflict should be brought out of obscurity and they should be regulated. To this end, the chapters that follow make visible the ways in which public international law regulates war economies, what norms are deployed, what obligations the law creates, and to what purposes.

The book is an attempt at scholarship, and it is by no means intended as the last word on the topic. By mapping the core elements of the public international laws and institutions that govern contemporary war economies my objective is to highlight an aspect of contemporary conflicts that needs further study and debate. In doing so I hope that the masters of different disciplines touched on here will take issue with my argument and my evidence or how I present it and will critique and correct me.

Beyond my scholarly purpose, this book is also an attempt to encourage policymakers, legal practitioners, and activists to think strategically about the dilemmas posed by economic activity in conflict. Whether you live in a war zone or not, the moral and political challenges posed by war economies are present wherever the value chains that transect the global economy touch down. Political violence and war cannot be understood in isolation from their



xiv Preface

economic dimensions, and their economic dimensions cannot be understood in isolation from the law.

Acknowledging these facts is not the same as asserting that economic activity causes wars, or the reverse – that economics alone can secure the peace. Rather, it is simply to acknowledge that power matters to conflict, that economic activity is a key source of power, and that law regulates best when we have a clear idea of where the power lies. If we hope to have a progressive impact on how we might respond to the challenges posed by war economies, I assume it would help to have some idea about the legal norms that govern them. That assumption has guided me in this journey to better understand the relevant law.

The journey started with two meetings. The first, in the spring of 2001, was a surprise invitation to lunch with an ambassador of Norway. I was a researcher at the Fafo Institute for Labour and Social Research in Oslo. Norway had just been elected to the Security Council and over lunch it quickly became apparent that the ambassador was at that moment preoccupied with the attempts by the Council to wrestle with sanctions busters and the amazing ability of certain civil wars to finance themselves. 'That is something you should look into!' said the ambassador, in the way that ambassadors do.

In a previous life as a UN analyst in the Middle East, I had encountered the black markets that circulated commodities of all kinds, transcending some of the most difficult borders and cease-fire lines known to modern conflict. War, it seemed, had certain demands and enabled certain supplies. That, it seemed, was the inevitable way of the world. Was this about to change?

A year later, I would find myself at a seminar in a village outside Geneva with a small group of activists. Each was working on changing aspects of global governance in relation to conflict or had been involved in his or her own way in getting governments to agree on collective efforts to improve human security. On that day, there were people in the room who had contributed to realizing the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, the International Convention to Ban Landmines, the Programme of Action on small arms transfers, the Kimberly Process on conflict diamonds, and efforts to get the then UN Human Rights Commission to take up the issue of corporate impacts on human rights. They had been brought together by a Canadian diplomat, Don Hubert, who wanted to take stock of where these waves of humanitarian diplomacy were leading. At one point, Charmian Gooch, a cofounder of the international investigatory nongovernmental organization Global Witness, was explaining how their investigations had turned up evidence of collusion between murderous warlords and their corporate allies, not least from Europe and North America. In mid-sentence she interrupted



Preface xv

herself and let a fist fall firmly to the table, "There must be a way to put these people behind bars!"

Yes, I thought to myself, there must be.

The journey launched by those conversations has, in practice, been made up of a series of projects focused on discrete aspects of the larger problem I came to identify as 'war economies'. Those projects included research into the UN's responses to economies of conflict; surveying the domestic law incorporation of the Rome Statute in sixteen different countries and the implications of this state practice for liabilities for business linked to armed conflict; learning from investigators and prosecutors working on economic crimes, international crimes, and sanctions busting; facilitating a dialogue among member states on the topic of state responses to business in conflict zones; conducting comparative law research into the regulation of business due diligence; developing guidance for supply chain due diligence by businesses sourcing from conflict-affected regions; and the investigation and prosecution of corporate crimes related to human rights abuse. I am grateful for support and collaboration on specific projects over the years from the governments and officials from Canada, Norway, Switzerland; the Ford Foundation; and Noref (the Norwegian Peacebuilding Resource Centre). I owe special thanks to the excellent lawyers and investigators at Global Witness, Amnesty International, and the Clooney Foundation for Justice, as well as Professor John Ruggie and his team at the office of the Special Representative of the Secretary-General on Human Rights Transnational Corporations and other Business Enterprises. Although none of the foregoing supported this monograph, nor were always concerned with war economies as such, the research and discussions conducted through my association with these projects made a significant contribution to what follows.

Throughout, I am privileged to have been able to collaborate with an ever widening cast of colleagues, both scholars and practitioners. Certain people have been long-time co-conspirators; others have made brief but vital contributions at important moments. You are all deserving of my deepest thanks for the insights you have given me over the years. You are, in no particular order: Maja van der Velden, Christian Ruge, Anita Ramasastry, Seema Joshi, Don Hubert, Mora Johnson, Gerald Pachoud, Robert Thompson, Salil Tripathi, Rachel Davis, Simon Taylor, Charmian Gooch, Patrick Alley, William Bourdon, Charles Arthur, Richard Meeran, Egbert Wesselink, Marya Farah, Sandra Cossart, Claire O'Brien, Beate Sjâfjell, Paloma Muñoz Quick, Erik Hagen, Willy Egset, Arvind Ganesan, John Karlsrud, Amol Mehra, Filip Gregor, Marie-Laure Guislain, Miriam Saage-Maasz, Ian Smiley, Dom Renfrey, Mariano Aguirre, Malcolm Langford, James G. Stewart, Gunhild



xvi Preface

Ørstavik, Hege Røttingen, John Ruggie, Maria Prandi, Anya Neistat, Leiv Lunde, Benedetta Lacey, Jonathan Kaufman, Olga Martin-Ortega, Luc Zandvliet, Tricia Feeney, Larissa van den Herik, Weger Strømmen, Therese Jebsen, John Morrison, Hélène Helbig de Balzac, Mike Davis, Morten Bøås, Annie Dunnebacke, Sophia Pickles, Andie Lambe, Brad Brooks-Rubin, Martin Witteveen, Bruce Broomhall, Kamil Zabielski, Beate Ekeløve-Slydal, Krishnendu Mukharjee, Yasmine Chubin, Ken Hurwitz, Hélène Helzig de Balzac, and many more. Karen Ballentine and Siri Frigård in particular are both greatly missed. It impossible to name all of you or to thank you all enough.

Thanks to Anita Ramasastry, James Stewart, Olga Martin-Ortega, Achim Wennmann, and Malcolm Langford for comments on early drafts. Thanks also to Keven Jon Heller, Ingo Venzke, and their colleagues at the Amsterdam Centre for International Law, University of Amsterdam for their hospitality during the first part of 2019 and for generous comments on my attempts at legal history.

Special thanks Mari Ruge for allowing me a room of one's own – and for peace movement inspiration – at a vital stage in the writing.

I am particularly grateful for the support received in the final phases of this project from my employers, the Fafo Institute for Labour and Social Research in Oslo and our Director, Tone Fløtten. Although the bulk of this book was developed and written on the margins of my day job at Fafo, this support enabled me to complete key sections and pull the final version together into a monograph.

I am indebted to Professor Beate Sjåfjell for her support and excellent collaborations before, during, and after my postdoctoral fellowship at the University of Oslo.

Many colleagues at Fafo, both past and present, have contributed to my thinking and research practice over the years, through debates, discussion, and project work. It is impossible to thank you all individually. I can only thank you collectively for all you have given me. Thanks for making Fafo a great place to 'grow up'. I hope I have been able to return the respect and support you that have shown me over the years.

The analysis presented in this study would not have been possible but for the collaboration, critical input, and intellectual companionship from everyone named here (and no doubt a few I have probably missed. Apologies.). Beyond offering my endless gratitude, the least I can do is absolve you all of responsibility for any errors of fact or analysis in what follows. That is my responsibility.

At home, Maja, Robin, and Max kept me sane, inspired, and always challenged with new ideas. The love, patience, and understanding you showed me seemed endless (I'm sure this project seemed endless to you!). This one is for you.



#### **Abbreviations**

AFRC Armed Forces Revolutionary Council (Sierra Leone)

ALC Armée de libération du Congo AML Anti-Money Laundering

ATS Alien Tort Statute
ATT Arms Trade Treaty
AU African Union

AUC United Self-Defense Forces of Colombia

CAR Central African Republic

CoCom Coordinating Committee of Multilateral Export Controls

CTC Counter Terrorism Committee

CTED Counter Terrorism Executive Directorate
CTITF Counter-Terrorism Implementation Task Force
DDR Disarmament, Demobilization, and Reintegration

DRC Democratic Republic of Congo

ECOMOG Economic Community of West African States

Monitoring Group

ECOWAS Economic Community of West African States

EU European Union

FARC Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia

FATF Financial Action Task Force

FDLR Democratic Forces for the Liberation of Rwanda

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

HRC Human Rights Council ICC International Criminal Court

ICGRL International Conference on the Great Lakes Region

ICJ International Court of Justice ICL International Criminal Law

xvii



xviii List of Abbreviations

ICoC International Code of Conduct

ICRC International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

ICTY International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia

IHL International Humanitarian Law
IHRL International Human Rights Law
ILO International Labour Organization
IMT International Military Tribunal

IS Islamic State

JCE Joint Criminal Enterprise JNA Yugoslav National Army

KPCS Kimberly Process Certification Scheme

KYC Know-Your-Customer

MEJA Military Extraterritorial Jurisdiction Act MLC Mouvement de libération du Congo MONUC United Nations Mission in the DRC NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organisation

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

OAS Organization of American States

OHCHR Office of the Higher Commissioner for Human Rights OSCE Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe

PLO Palestine Liberation Organization

PoA Programme of Action

RUF Revolutionary United Front (Sierra Leone)
SADC South African Development Community

SALW Small Arms and Light Weapons SCSL Special Court for Sierra Leone

SRSG Special Representative of the Secretary-General
UNCLOS United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNCTOC UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime

UNEF United Nations Expeditionary Force

UNGPs United Nations Guiding Principles on Business and Human

Rights

UNITA National Union for the Total Independence of Angola

UNMIL United Nations Mission in Liberia

UNROCA United Nations Register of Conventional Arms

VRS Army of Republika Srpska

VPs Voluntary Principles on Security and Human Rights

WTO World Trade Organization