

# Health Policy in Asia

The book assesses the policy actions of select Asian governments (China, India, Hong Kong, South Korea, Singapore and Thailand) to address critical health system functions from a policy design perspective. The findings show that all governments in the region have made tremendous strides in focusing their attention on the core issues and, especially, the interactions among them. However, there is still insufficient appreciation of the usefulness of public hospitals and their efficient management. Similarly, some governments have not made sufficient efforts to establish an effective regulatory framework which is especially vital in systems with a large share of private providers and payers. A well-run public hospital system and an effective framework for regulating private providers are essential tools to support the governance, financing, and payment reforms underway in the six health systems studied in this book.

M RAMESH is UNESCO Chair on Social Policy Design in Asia at the National University of Singapore. Previously, he was the Founding Head of the Department of Asian and Policy Studies at the Hong Kong Institute of Education and Chair of the Department of Government and International Relations at the University of Sydney. Specialising in public policy and governance in Asia with a particular focus on social policy, Ramesh has authored and edited many books. His widely used textbook Studying Public Policy has been translated into several languages. He is the Editor of the journals Policy and Society and Policy Design and Practice.

AZAD S. BALI in Senior Lecturer in Public Policy and holds a joint appointment with the School of Politics & International Relations and the Crawford School of Public Policy at the Australian National University (ANU). His research interests straddle comparative public policy and health policy in Asia. Some of this research research has been published in leading journals including Policy Sciences, Policy & Society, Public Policy and Administration, Social Policy & Administration among others. Prior to the ANU, Bali held a Melbourne Early Career Fellowship at the University of Melbourne and was Research Fellow at Murdoch University.



#### CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN COMPARATIVE PUBLIC POLICY

The Cambridge Studies in Comparative Public Policy series was established to promote and disseminate comparative research in public policy. The objective of the series is to advance the understanding of public policies through the publication of the results of comparative research into the nature, dynamics and contexts of major policy challenges and responses to them. Works in the series will draw critical insights that enhance policy learning and are generalizable beyond specific policy contexts, sectors and time periods. Such works will also compare the development and application of public policy theory across institutional and cultural settings and examine how policy ideas, institutions and practices shape policies and their outcomes. Manuscripts comparing public policies in two or more cases as well as theoretically informed critical case studies which test more general theories are encouraged. Studies comparing policy development over time are also welcomed.

General Editors: M. Ramesh, National University of Singapore; Xun Wu, Hong Kong University of Science and Technology; Michael Howlett, Simon Fraser University, British Columbia and National University of Singapore

In Defense of Pluralism: Policy Disagreement and its Media Coverage By Éric Montpetit

Asia after the Developmental State: Disembedding Autonomy Edited by Toby Carroll and Darryl S. L. Jarvis

The Politics of Shale Gas in Eastern Europe: Energy Security, Contested Technologies and the Social Licence to Frack

By Andreas Goldthau

Healthy or Sick? Coevolution of Health Care and Public Health in a Comparative Perspective 2018 By Philipp Trein

Policy Accumulation and the Democratic Responsiveness Trap By Christian Adam, Steffen Hurka, Christoph Knill and Yves Steinebach

Hyper-Active Governance: How Governments Manage the Politics of Expertise By Matthew Wood

Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective: Patterns, Nuances and Implications of the Contractor State

By Caspar van den Berg, Michael Howlett, Andrea Migone, Michael Howard, Frida Pemer and Helen M. Gunter

A Matter of Style? Organizational Agency in Global Public Policy By Louisa Bayerlein, Christoph Knill and Yves Steinebach

Policy Controversies and Political Blame Games

By Markus Hinterleitner

Government Statistical Agencies and the Politics of Credibility By Cosmo Howard

Convergence and Diversity in the Governance of Higher Education By Giliberto Capano and Darryl S.L. Jarvis

Public Governance as Co-creation: A Strategy for Revitalizing the Public Sector and Rejuvenating Democracy By Christopher Ansell and Jacob Torfing



## Health Policy in Asia

A Policy Design Approach

M RAMESH National University of Singapore

AZAD S. BALI
The Australian National University





## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108483537

DOI: 10.1017/9781108692656

© M. Ramesh and Azad S. Bali 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Ramesh, M., 1960- author. | Bali, Azad, author.

Title: Health policy in Asia: a policy design approach / M. Ramesh, National University of Singapore, Azad S. Bali, The Australian National University.

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Series: Cambridge studies in comparative public policy | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021037804 (print) | LCCN 2021037805 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108483537 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108728775 (paperback) |

ISBN 9/8110848353/ (hardback) | ISBN 9/81108/28//3 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108692656 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Medical policy–Asia | BISAC: POLITICAL SCIENCE / General Classification: LCC RA395.A52 R36 2021 (print) | LCC RA395.A52 (ebook) | DDC 362.1095–dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021037804

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021037805

ISBN 978-1-108-48353-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



#### Contents

Lis	st of Figures	page vi
Lis	st of Tables	vii
Ac	knowledgements	viii
List of Abbreviations		ix
1	Introduction: Health Policy Design	1
2	The Economic and Social Context of Health Care in Asia	38
3	China: Rebuilding the Health Care System	61
4	India: Reforming a Private and Fragmented Health Care System	83
5	South Korea: Universal Health Care in the Context of Private Provision	107
6	Thailand: Universal Health Care under Government Stewardship	130
7	Hong Kong: Keeping Health Care Simple	149
8	Singapore: Synergizing the State and Market in Health Car	re 169
9	Conclusion: Health Policy Design in Asia	192
References		223
Index		253

V



### **Figures**

2.1	GDP, annual average growth rate	page 39
2.2	Income inequality, Gini coefficient	44
2.3	Social policy expenditure, as a percentage of	
	GDP	47
4.1	Key government agencies involved in health care	
	in India	93
4.2	Governance relationships in India's health system	96
6.1	Governance relationships between patients, providers,	
	and payers in Thailand	137

vi



#### **Tables**

1.1	Health system functions, policy tools, and	
	principal resources	page 10
1.2	Healthcare system performance	34
2.1	Human development index	39
2.2	GDP per capita, PPP (current international \$)	40
2.3	Self-employed, as a percentage of total employed	40
2.4	Poverty headcount ratio, as a percentage	
	of population	41
2.5	Distribution of income and wealth, by	
	income groups	44
2.6	Public finance, as a percentage of GDP,	
	annual averages	46
2.7	Current account balance, as a percentage of GDP	48
2.8	Foreign direct investment, net inflows, as a percentage	
	of GDP	49
2.9	Exports and trade as a percentage of GDP	50
2.10	Population trends	51
2.11	Old-age dependency ratio, estimate 2000–2050	52
2.12	Health expenditure	54
2.13	Supply of hospital beds, doctors, and nurses, per	
	10,000 persons, 2019	55
2.14	Hospital length of stay, days	56
2.15	Health status indicators, 2015	57
2.16	UHC service coverage index, 2017	58
2.17	Bloomberg healthcare efficiency, 2018	59
4.1	India's health indicators in a	
	comparative perspective	88
4.2	Regional disparities in health indicators in India	89
4.3	Key programme features of RSBY and PM-JAY	100
6.1	Key health programmes in Thailand	133
9.1	Sources of total health expenditures, Precent	205

vii



#### Acknowledgements

Many people have contributed to this book. We are grateful to government officials and colleagues who took the time to speak with us across the six countries studied in this book.

We would like to especially thank Ake Blomqvist, Alex He, Altaf Virani, Elizabeth Quah, Assa Doron, Daya Maurya, Donald Low, Indrani Gupta, John Langenbrunner, John Murphy, Kwan Chang Yee, Mohnish Kedia, Mukul Asher, Phua Kai Hong, Qian Jiwei, Sarah Bales, Tim Tenbensel, and Wu Xun for thoughtful conversations on health policy over the years.

Chapters from this book were presented at conferences and workshops and we thank the following discussants and panellists for their comments and suggestions: Al Stark, Brian Head, Claire Dunlop, Eva Heidbreder, Giliberto Capano, Guy Peters, Isabelle Engeli, Ishani Mukherjee, Jenny Lewis, Jeremey Rayner, Mark Considine, Matthew Kerby, Olivia Jensen, and Paul Fawcett.

We have benefitted tremendously from recent collaborations with Michael Howlett, Giliberto Capano, Guy Peters, Jenny Lewis, Adam Hannah, Daniel Beland, Ben Cashore, and Ishani Mukherjee. Thank you.

We would be remiss to not acknowledge colleagues who have helped in facilitating the completion of this book in different ways: Kenneth Tan, Kanti Bajpai, Alfred Wu, Namrata Chindarkar, Janine O'Flynn, and Darren Halpin.

We are also grateful to three anonymous reviewers for their constructive and critical comments. We thank Helen Sullivan, Helen Dickinson, Anne Mills, Guy Peters, and Peter Berman for taking the time to read through the manuscript and offering generous endorsement.

We dedicate this book to Keya, Nik, and Sandy who got to test the health care systems in their own ways in 2020.

viii



#### **Abbreviations**

ACE Agency for Care Effectiveness AIC Agency for Integrated Care ALOS average length of stay

CDMP Chronic Disease Management Programme
CGHS Central Government Health Scheme
CHAS Community Health Assist Scheme

CHCs community health centres

Covid-19 coronavirus-19

CMS Cooperative Medical System

C-section caesarean delivery

CSMBS Civil Servants Medical Benefit Scheme
CSSA Comprehensive Social Security Allowance

DBP disease-based payment

DH Department of Health (Hong Kong)

DHS district health system

DREC Drug Reimbursement Evaluation Committee

DRG diagnosis-related group EIU Economist Intelligence Unit

ESIC Employees' State Insurance Corporation
ESIS Employees' State Insurance Scheme
FDA Food and Drug Administration
FDI foreign direct investment
FHB Food and Health Bureau

FFS fee for service

GBD Global Burden of Disease study

GDP gross domestic product

GIS Government Insurance Scheme

GP general practitioner / general practice
GPO Government Pharmaceutical Organization

H1N1 influenza A virus subtype H1N1

ix



List of Abbreviations

X

HA Hospital Authority

HAI Healthcare Accreditation Institute
HALE health adjusted life expectancy
HCSA Healthcare Services Act (Singapore)
HIPDC Health Insurance Policy Deliberation

Committee

HIRA Health Insurance Review Agency
HIRA-VIP HIRA-Value Incentive Program
HITAP Health Intervention and Technology

Assessment Program

HK\$ Hong Kong dollar

HLEG High Level Expert Group
HMC Hospital Management Council
HPA Health Protection Account
HPS Health Protection Scheme
HSP Hospital Security Plan

HSRI Health Systems Research Institute HTA Health Technology Assessment

ICU intensive care unit

IHiS Integrated Health Information Systems IHPP International Health Policy Program

IMR infant mortaility rate

INR Indian rupee

IP Integrated Shield Plan

ISO International Organization for

Standardization

KFDA Korea Food and Drug Administration

KRW Korean won LIC Low Income Card

LIS Labour Insurance System

LOS length of stay

MAF Medication Assistance Fund MDEC Medical Device Expert Committee MDGs millennium development goals

Medicaid Medical Aid program

MERS Middle East Respiratory Syndrome
MFAS Medical Financial Assistance Scheme
MFDS Ministry of Food and Drug Safety (Korea)

ML Medishield Life



List of Abbreviations

xi

MoH	Minstry of Health (India)
MOHH	Ministry of Health Holdings Private Limited
MOHW	Ministry of Health and Welfare (Korea)
MOPH	Ministry of Public Health (Thailand)
MRD	Medical Registration Division
MSA	Medical Savings Account
MSF	Ministry of Strategy and Finance (Korea)
NCMS	New Cooperative Medical Scheme
NECA	National Evidence-based Collaborating
	Agency
NEHR	National Electronic Health Record
NHA	National Health Assembly
NHC	National Health Commission
NHCO	National Health Commission Office
NHFPC	National Health and Family Planning
	Commission
NHG	National Healthcare Group
NHI	National Health Insurance
NHIC	National Health Insurance Corporation
NHIS	National Health Insurance Service
NHM	National Health Mission
NHP	National Health Plan
NHS	National Health Service
NHSA	National Healthcare Security Administration
NHSB	National Health Security Board
NHSO	National Health Security Office
NLEM	National List of Essential Medicines
	(Thailand)
NPM	New Public Management
NRCMS	New Rural Cooperative Medical Scheme
NRHM	National Rural Health Mission
NSHC	National Standards for Health Care
NUHS	National University Health System
NUS	National University of Singapore
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and
	Development
OOP	Out of Pocket
P4P	Payment for Performance
	- 1

People's Action Party

PAP



xii

List of Abbreviations

PCC Primary Care Cluster
PCN Primary Care Network
PHC Primary Health Care
PHCs primary health centres

PHMC Private Hospitals and Medical Clinics
PHMCA Private Hospitals and Medical Clinics Act

(Singapore)

PM-JAY Pradhan Mantri Jan Arogya Yojana

PPP Purchasing Power Parity

RBRVS Resource-Based Relative Value Score

RHS Regional Health Systems

RMB renminbi

RSBY Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana SDGs Sustainable Development Goals

SDL Standard Drug List
SHI Social Health Insurance
SingHealth Singapore Health Services
SLA Service-Level Agreement
SOEs State-Owned Enterprises
SOP Standard Operating Procedure

SSO Social Security Office
SSS Social Security Scheme
TRTP Thai Rak Thai Party

TRTP Thai Rak Thai Party
THE Total Health Expenditure

THPF Thai Health Promotion Foundation

UCS Universal Coverage Scheme

UEBMI Urban Employee Basic Medical Insurance

UHC Universal Health Coverage

URBM Urban workers

URBMI Urban Resident Basic Medical Insurance

USD \$US

VHCS Voluntary Health Card Scheme
VHIS Voluntary Health Insurance Scheme
WCS Workman's Compensation Scheme

WHO World Health Organization

YLL Years of Life Lost