In accessible and impassioned discussions of literature and philosophy, this book reveals a surprising approach to the intractable problem of human contact. Nathaniel Hawthorne, Frederick Douglass, Harriet Beecher Stowe, and Emily Dickinson rethought the nature of human contact, turning away from transcendentalist approaches and toward sympathetic ones. Their second and third works portray social masks as insufficient, not deceptive, and thus human contact requires not violent striking through the mask but benevolent skepticism toward persons. They imagine that people feel real in a real world with real others when they care for others for the others’ sake and when they make caring relationships the cornerstone of their own being. Grounded in philosophies of sympathy – including Adam Smith and J.G. Herder – and relational psychology – Winnicott and Benjamin – Rethinking Sympathy and Human Contact in Nineteenth-Century American Literature shows that antebellum literature rejects individualist definitions of the human and locates the antidote to human disconnection in sympathy.

MARIANNE NOBLE is the author of *The Masochistic Pleasures of Sentimental Literature* (2000), which won a Choice Outstanding Book Award. She also coedited *Emily Dickinson and Philosophy* (Cambridge, 2013) and has published essays in *Studies in American Fiction*, *The Yale Journal of Criticism*, *New England Quarterly*, and *The Emily Dickinson Journal*. She has served on the boards of *American Literature*, the Emily Dickinson International Society, *Legacy*, and the *Nathaniel Hawthorne Review*. In 2016, she was a Fulbright Scholar in Korea. She is Associate Professor of Literature at American University and received her PhD from Columbia University.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN AMERICAN LITERATURE AND CULTURE

Editor
Leonard Cassuto, Fordham University

Founding Editor
Albert Gelpi, Stanford University

Advisory Board
Robert Levine, University of Maryland
Ross Posnock, Columbia University
Wai Chee Dimock, Yale University
Tim Armstrong, Royal Holloway, University of London
Walter Benn Michaels, University of Illinois, Chicago
Kenneth Warren, University of Chicago

Recent Books in This Series

182. MARIANNE NOBLE
Rethinking Sympathy and Human Contact in Nineteenth-Century American Literature

181. ROB TURNER
Counterfeit Culture

180. KATE STANLEY
Practices of Surprise in American Literature after Emerson

179. JOHANNES VOELZ
The Poetics of Insecurity

178. JOHN HAY
Postapocalyptic Fantasies in Antebellum American Literature

177. PAUL JAUSSEN
Writing in Real Time

176. CINDY WEINSTEIN
Time, Tense, and American Literature

175. CODY MARRS
Nineteenth-Century American Literature and the Long Civil War

(Continued after the Index)
RETHINKING SYMPATHY AND HUMAN CONTACT IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY AMERICAN LITERATURE

Hawthorne, Douglass, Stowe, Dickinson

MARIANNE NOBLE
American University
Contents

Acknowledgments

Introduction

Contact and Truth 1
Sympathy and Epistemology 4
Sympathy and Relatedness 12
Defining Human Contact 16
Defining Sympathy and Empathy 19
Philosophies of Sympathy and Human Contact 24
Overview of the Book 35

1 Transcendental Approaches to Human Contact 38
    Emerson 39
    Thoreau's Transcendental Approach to Human Contact 59
     Louisa May Alcott, Behind a Mask 65
     Whitman 68

2 "Some True Relation": The Evolution of Hawthorne's Understanding of Human Contact 86
    Puritan Conceptions of Truth and Contact 89
    The Scarlet Letter: Be True! Be True! Show Your Worst! 93
    The House of the Seven Gables, "The Thing Itself," and How to "Take It" 108
    Hawthorne's Critique of Sentimental Forms of Sympathy 114

3 "The Sentiment of Justice Must Revolt in Every Heart": White Empathy with the Humanity of Black Autobiography 123
    Sympathy and the Problem of Black Individuality 123
    The Humanity of Autobiography 132
    Aural and Visual Perception in The Heroic Slave 155

4 "All the Vivacities of Life Lie in Differences": Abrasive Sympathy after Uncle Tom's Cabin 166
    Abrasive Contact in The Minister's Wooing 174
    Conclusion 197
Contents

5 “Sweet Skepticism of the Heart”: Dickinson’s Sympathetic Phenomenology 198
   Spirit Letters 200
   Kernels and Husks: Beyond Interiority 206
   Sympathy and Social Recognition 218
   Dickinson’s Phenomenology 228
   Conclusion 236

6 Conclusion 239

Bibliography 246
Notes 266
Index 286
Acknowledgments

In a book which argues that selves exist most fully in relationships with others, it is fitting and a true pleasure to acknowledge the thoughtful contributions of the many people who helped usher the book into being. Their alterity has created all of the vivacities that the book may possess. My experience of their disinterested benevolence epitomizes what I understand human contact to be.

I am enormously grateful to Jonathan Loesberg for reading and re-reading and re-re-reading the whole book, for asking crucial questions and clarifying key issues, for workshopping sticky parts, and above all for threading Gilbert and Sullivan quotations into his feedback.

I have also been fortunate beyond all possible merit to receive expert feedback and encouragement from enthusiastic and knowledgeable colleagues and friends who generously read the entire manuscript and helped me think it through: Renée Bergland, Erik Dussere, Laura Korobkin, Robert Levine, Susan Ryan, Cindy Weinstein, and Robert Weisbuch. Their insights and inspiration are woven into every page of this book.

I also want to express my deep appreciation to the many colleagues who generously read chapters and shared their wisdom and discernment: Eric Athénot, Buddy Cassidy, Thomas Constantinesco, Jed Deppman, Elizabeth Duquette, Monika Elbert, Jane Flax, Jean Pfaelzer, Kerry Larson, Dan Malachuk, Dan Manheim, Cristanne Miller, Kylie Musolf, Seth Perlow, Linda Rhoads, Cécile Roudeau, Richard Sha, Anita Sherman, Gillian Silverman, Sartaz Singh, and Gary Lee Stonum.

I am also grateful to Justine Murison, Magdalena Zapedowska, Asun Lopez Varela, Marion Rust, Mary Lou Kete, Chris Castiglia, Hiroko Uno, Youngjoo Kim, and Ilana Larkin for inviting me to share this work at their respective institutions.
Acknowledgments

For various kinds of intellectual and moral support, I also thank Paula Bennett, Kristin Boudreau, Suzanne Juhasz, David Keplinger, Keith Leonard, Jeff Middents, Roberta Rubenstein, Russell Sbrigia, Peter Starr, Priscilla Wald, and the members of the Emotion Theory Reading Group.

I am grateful to Leonard Cassuto for acquiring the book and Cambridge University Press for publishing and promoting it. Finally, I want to single out for respectful gratitude the numerous anonymous readers whose suggestions and criticisms considerably improved the book.

I am happy to acknowledge the considerable financial support for this book from the Department of Literature and the College of Arts and Sciences of American University, as well as the Fulbright Foundation.

I am also grateful to MIT Press for permission to reproduce material in sections of Chapter 4, which were adapted from “The Courage to Speak and Hear the Truth: Sympathy and Genuine Human Contact in Harriet Beecher Stowe’s The Minister’s Wooing,” The New England Quarterly, 81:4 (December, 2008), pp. 676–702. © 2008 by The New England Quarterly, Inc., published by the MIT Press.


I appreciate more than I can say the support of my family, my friends, my colleagues, and my Dumbarton community. Geoff and Arden enrich my life with affectionate human contact every hour of every day, and my love and delight are infinite.

Michael Manson emboldened me to pursue this project and helped invent it along the way with his widely ranging knowledge and his boundless faith and encouragement. Michael models the generosity of spirit that is the essence of human contact, and the book is dedicated to him with love and more love.