For the third time in forty-five years, America is talking about impeaching a president, but the impeachment provisions of the American constitution are widely misunderstood. In *High Crimes and Misdemeanors*, constitutional scholar Frank Bowman offers unprecedented clarity to the question of impeachment, tracing its roots to medieval England through its adoption in the Constitution and 250 years of American experience. By examining the human and political history of those who have faced impeachment, Bowman demonstrates that the framers intended impeachment to be a flexible tool, adaptable to the needs of any age. Written in a lively, engaging style, the book combines a deep historical and constitutional analysis of the impeachment clauses, a coherent theory of when impeachment should be used to protect constitutional order against presidential misconduct, and a comprehensive presentation of the case for and against impeachment of President Trump. It is an indispensable work for the present moment.

Frank O. Bowman III, the Floyd R. Gibson Missouri Endowed Professor of Law at the University of Missouri, is a nationally recognized authority on criminal law, a legal historian, and a former federal and state prosecutor. He has written extensively on impeachment in legal journals and the popular press, including the *New York Times*, *Politico*, and *Slate*, where he is a regular contributor. He has provided testimony to both Houses of Congress on multiple subjects including the meaning of “high crimes and misdemeanors” during the Clinton impeachment crisis.
High Crimes and Misdemeanors

A HISTORY OF IMPEACHMENT FOR
THE AGE OF TRUMP

FRANK O. BOWMAN III
To my wife Robin, helpmeet, sweetheart, and best friend, without whose patience and support this book could not have been written.
Contents

List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Introduction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>How to Interpret the Constitution’s Impeachment Clauses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutional Interpretation and the Judiciary</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sources of Constitutional Meaning</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>British Impeachments, 1376–1787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Origins of Impeachment</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The First British Impeachments</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bills of Attainder</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impeachment in the Era of the Stuart Kings</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Glorious Revolution of 1688 and the Last Flurry of British Impeachments, 1715–16</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Impeachment of Warren Hastings</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lessons of British Impeachments for American Practice</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impeachment, Crime, Treason, and Retrospective Punishment</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Meaning of “High Crimes and Misdemeanors” in British Practice</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Scope of Impeachable Conduct in Great Britain</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Political Impeachments: Armed Rebellion and Ordinary Criminality</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corruption</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incompetence, Neglect of Duty, or Maladministration in Office</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abuse of Power</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Betrayal of the Nation’s Foreign Policy</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subversion of the Constitution and Laws of the Realm</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>American Impeachments before 1787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colonial Impeachments, 1607–1776</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contents

The First Colonial Impeachments: Maryland, 1669–83 | 53
---
Colonial Impeachments in Pennsylvania | 55
  - The Impeachment of Nicholas Moore, 1685 | 55
  - The Impeachment of James Logan, 1707 | 56
  - The Impeachment of William Moore, 1757–59 | 57
Colonial Impeachments in Massachusetts | 61
  - The Impeachment of Samuel Vetch | 61
  - Impeachment of Chief Justice Peter Oliver, 1774 | 61
Impeachment in the Newly Independent States, 1776–1888 | 65
  - Procedural Structure of State Impeachments | 67
  - Persons Subject to Impeachment and Available Penalties | 69
  - The Definition of Impeachable Conduct | 70
  - Impeachment Practice in the States, 1776–87 | 72
The Influence of Early American Impeachments on the American Constitutional Founders | 73
Appendix A: Impeachment Provisions of State Constitutions, 1776–87 | 75

### 4 The Founders’ Impeachment

Constitutional Architecture | 83
---
The Convention’s Impeachment Debates | 89
  - Shall the President be Impeachable? | 89
  - By Whom Should the President be Impeached and Tried? | 90
  - What Shall be the Procedures in an Impeachment? | 91
  - What Shall be the Consequence of Impeachment? | 92
"High Crimes and Misdemeanors": What Shall Constitute Impeachable Conduct? | 94
  - The Influence of British and American Precedents on the Founders’ Understanding of “High Crimes and Misdemeanors” | 99
    - Armed Rebellion and Treason | 103
    - Crime | 103
    - Corruption | 105
    - Betrayal of the Country’s Foreign Policy Interests | 106
    - Incompetence, Neglect of Duty, or Maladministration in Office | 107
    - Subversion of the Constitution | 109

### 5 Impeaching Legislators and Lesser Executive Branch Officials

Impeaching Congress: Constitutional Text and What the Founders Thought | 112
---
The Impeachment of Senator William Blount, 1797–98 | 114
  - Additional Lessons from the Blount Affair | 120
    - Interpretive Authority | 120
    - Foreign Affairs | 121
The Impeachment of Secretary of War Belknap | 122
  - The Loneliness of Secretary Belknap | 124
Contents

6 Impeachment of Judges
   The Constitutional Text and the Founders’ Understanding 126
   The Constitutional Standard for Judicial Impeachment 126
   The Case of Justice Samuel Chase 127
   Impeachable Judicial Conduct 128
      Treason 128
      Corruption in Office 129
      Incapacity, Neglect of Duty, or Maladministration in Office 129
         Incapacity 130
      Abusive Behavior 131
      Legal Errors 132
      Ordinary Crimes 133
      Perjury and False Statements 133
   Conclusions from Judicial Impeachment Cases 133

7 The Impeachment of Andrew Johnson
   The Improbable Rise of Andrew Johnson 146
   The End of the Civil War and the Challenge of Reconstruction 147
   “Radical Reconstruction” 147
   Impeachment in the House of Representatives 148
   The Senate Trial of Andrew Johnson 149
      The Tenure of Office Act 150
      Johnson’s Attacks on Congress 151
      The Senate’s Verdict and its Reasons 152
   The Impeachment Case that Might Have Been 152
   Lessons from the Johnson Impeachment 153

8 The Fall of President Richard Nixon
   Richard Nixon and the Prelude to Watergate 160
   The Watergate Break-in and its Aftermath 160
   The Judiciary Committee’s Articles of Impeachment 161
      The Prime Purpose of Presidential Impeachment Is to Protect Constitutional Order 161
         Article 1: Obstruction of the Watergate Investigation 162
         Article 2: Abuse of Power 163
         Article 3: Defiance of Judiciary Committee Subpoenas 164
      Articles of Impeachment Proposed, but Not Approved 164
         The Cambodian Bombing 165
         Emoluments and Tax Evasion 165
   Lessons from the Nixon Impeachment Investigations 165
      The Central Role of Federal Prosecutors 166
      The Federal Grand Jury 166
Contents

The Judiciary and “Executive Privilege” 205
The House and Senate Committees 207
The Press 207

9 The Strange Case of William Jefferson Clinton 210
The President and the Intern 213
The Independent Counsel Investigation: From Whitewater to Lies about Sex 216
Proceedings in the House and Senate 222
Criminal Offenses for Which Presidents Ought and Ought Not be Impeached 224
Towards a Working Definition of an Impeachable Crime 227
The Independent Counsel and Congress 231

10 The Scope of Impeachable Presidential Conduct: General Principles 235
The Importance of Constitutional Structure 235
The Importance of Congress as Finder of Fact and Arbiter of Constitutional Meaning 236
The Scope of Impeachable Presidential Conduct 242
Treason and Bribery 242
High Crimes and Misdemeanors 244
Crime is Not Necessary for Impeachment 244
Crime May Not be Sufficient for Impeachment 245
Defining an Oxymoron: Non-Criminal “High Crimes and Misdemeanors” 245
Presidential “High Crimes and Misdemeanors”: A Typology 250

11 Impeachment for Obstruction of Justice 253
Federal Criminal Obstruction of Justice 255
Section 1503 Obstruction 256
Section 1512 Obstruction 256
“Corruptly”: The Culpable Mental State for Obstruction of Justice 257
Corrupt Purpose and Presidential Power 258
Obstruction of Justice as Subversion of the Justice System 260

12 Impeachment for Abuse of the Pardon Power 263

13 Impeachment for Lying 267
Indictable Falsehoods 267
Official Lies to the Courts and Congress 268
Lies to Congress by the President in a Formal, Official Communication 269
Contents

Lies to Congress by Administration Agencies or Officials with the President's Knowledge 271
Chronic or Pervasive Presidential Falsehoods 271

14 Impeachment for Corruption: Schemes of Peculation, the Emoluments Clauses, and the Avaricious President 277
   The Emoluments Clauses 278
   “Scheme of Peculation” 283

15 The Twenty-fifth Amendment as an Alternative to Impeachment 286
   The Constitution of 1788 and the Problem of Presidential Incapacity 287
   Historical Examples of Presidential Disability 288
   Twenty-fifth Amendment 289
   Beyond the Politics of Trump 293

16 Impeaching Donald Trump 296
   The Case for Impeachment 296
   What if Donald Trump Has Been Compromised by Russia? 297
   A Bill of Particulars 300
      Obstruction of Justice 300
      Subversion of Justice System 301
      Abuse of the Pardon Power 303
      Electoral Misconduct 303
      Corruption 306
      Gross Maladministration, Abuse of Power, Injury to Foreign Policy Interests 307
      Attacks on the Press and Norms of Civil Discourse 309
      Dishonesty 310
   Counting to Sixty-seven in a Tribal Age, or Why Impeachment is Unlikely 311

Appendix: United States Impeachments, 1789 to Present 316
   William Blount 316
   John Pickering 317
   Samuel Chase 318
   James H. Peck 319
   West H. Humphreys 320
   Andrew Johnson 321
   William W. Belknap 323
   Charles H. Swayne 324
   Robert W. Archbald 326
   George English 328
Contents

Harold Louderback 329
Halstead L. Ritter 331
Harry Claiborne 332
Alcee L. Hastings 333
Walter L. Nixon 335
William J. Clinton 336
Samuel B. Kent 337
G. Thomas Porteous, Jr. 338

Notes 342

Index 455
Tables

3.1 Bodies Responsible for Initiating and Trying Impeachment Proceedings  page 67
3.2 Classes of Person Impeachable and Available Penalties  68
3.3 Scope of Impeachable Conduct  70
Acknowledgments

No book of this scope could be written without the active help or patient forbearance of a supportive clutch of friends, family, and colleagues.

I am particularly grateful for much help from many people at the University of Missouri School of Law. First, thanks go to Dean Lyrissa Lidsky and the Law School itself for granting me research leave to finish the book. Throughout the project, I was constantly thankful for the professionalism, insight, and speed of the Law School’s library staff. Special thanks go to crackerjack reference librarian Cynthia Shearrer, who found stuff I was looking for faster than I would have thought possible, and suggested sources of whose existence I had no clue, as well as to Randy Diamond, the head of our library, who put all his resources at my disposal.

Thanks to my brilliant law school colleague Paul Litton, and to my brothers, Herbert Bowman and Robert Bowman, lawyers, gentlemen, and scholars both, for reading and giving me invaluable feedback on some of the work. Joel Goldstein provided helpful clarification on the Twenty-fifth Amendment.

The book could not have been written or completed in anything like a timely fashion without the help of my terrific research assistants, Sam Crosby and Taylor Payne. Shawna Quast also did first-rate work on the footnotes.

My editor, Matt Gallaway, and all the rest of the folks at Cambridge University Press have been uniformly splendid in guiding me through the many stages of this project.

Finally, my wife Robin has tolerated long stretches of mental or physical absence with remarkable grace, and encouraged me when I thought the job would never be done. In this, as in all things, I am eternally in her debt.

Frank Bowman