

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48105-2 — High Crimes and Misdemeanors  
Frank O. Bowman III  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## HIGH CRIMES AND MISDEMEANORS

For the third time in forty-five years, America is talking about impeaching a president, but the impeachment provisions of the American constitution are widely misunderstood. In *High Crimes and Misdemeanors*, constitutional scholar Frank Bowman offers unprecedented clarity to the question of impeachment, tracing its roots to medieval England through its adoption in the Constitution and 250 years of American experience. By examining the human and political history of those who have faced impeachment, Bowman demonstrates that the framers intended impeachment to be a flexible tool, adaptable to the needs of any age. Written in a lively, engaging style, the book combines a deep historical and constitutional analysis of the impeachment clauses, a coherent theory of when impeachment should be used to protect constitutional order against presidential misconduct, and a comprehensive presentation of the case for and against impeachment of President Trump. It is an indispensable work for the present moment.

Frank O. Bowman III, the Floyd R. Gibson Missouri Endowed Professor of Law at the University of Missouri, is a nationally recognized authority on criminal law, a legal historian, and a former federal and state prosecutor. He has written extensively on impeachment in legal journals and the popular press, including the *New York Times*, *Politico*, and *Slate*, where he is a regular contributor. He has provided testimony to both Houses of Congress on multiple subjects including the meaning of “high crimes and misdemeanors” during the Clinton impeachment crisis.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48105-2 — High Crimes and Misdemeanors  
Frank O. Bowman III  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# High Crimes and Misdemeanors

A HISTORY OF IMPEACHMENT FOR  
THE AGE OF TRUMP

FRANK O. BOWMAN III



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-108-48105-2 — High Crimes and Misdemeanors  
 Frank O. Bowman III  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
 New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108481052](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108481052)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108646239

© Frank O. Bowman III 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

### *Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

NAMES: Bowman, Frank O., 1955– author.

TITLE: High crimes and misdemeanors : a history of impeachment for the age of Trump / Frank O. Bowman III, University of Missouri School of Law.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, [2019] | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018059111 | ISBN 9781108481052 (alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Impeachments – United States – History. | Impeachments – Great Britain – History. | Presidents – United States – Discipline. | Johnson, Andrew, 1808–1875 – Impeachment. | Nixon, Richard M. (Richard Milhous), 1913–1994 – Impeachment. | Clinton, Bill, 1946 – Impeachment. | Trump, Donald, 1946 – Impeachment.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KF5075 .B69 2019 | DDC 342.73/062–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018059111>

ISBN 978-1-108-48105-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-70376-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48105-2 — High Crimes and Misdemeanors  
Frank O. Bowman III  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*To my wife Robin, helpmeet, sweetheart, and best friend,  
without whose patience and support this book  
could not have been written.*

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48105-2 — High Crimes and Misdemeanors  
Frank O. Bowman III  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

Contents

|                                                                                      |                  |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------|
| <i>List of Tables</i>                                                                | <i>page</i> xiii |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>                                                               | xiv              |
| <b>Introduction</b>                                                                  | 1                |
| <b>1 How to Interpret the Constitution’s Impeachment Clauses</b>                     | 7                |
| Constitutional Interpretation and the Judiciary                                      | 7                |
| Sources of Constitutional Meaning                                                    | 11               |
| <b>2 British Impeachments, 1376–1787</b>                                             | 22               |
| The Origins of Impeachment                                                           | 23               |
| The First British Impeachments                                                       | 26               |
| Bills of Attainder                                                                   | 29               |
| Impeachment in the Era of the Stuart Kings                                           | 30               |
| The Glorious Revolution of 1688 and the Last Flurry of British Impeachments, 1715–16 | 39               |
| The Impeachment of Warren Hastings                                                   | 39               |
| Lessons of British Impeachments for American Practice                                | 42               |
| Impeachment, Crime, Treason, and Retrospective Punishment                            | 42               |
| The Meaning of “High Crimes and Misdemeanors” in British Practice                    | 45               |
| The Scope of Impeachable Conduct in Great Britain                                    | 46               |
| Non-Political Impeachments: Armed Rebellion and Ordinary Criminality                 | 46               |
| Corruption                                                                           | 46               |
| Incompetence, Neglect of Duty, or Maladministration in Office                        | 47               |
| Abuse of Power                                                                       | 47               |
| Betrayal of the Nation’s Foreign Policy                                              | 48               |
| Subversion of the Constitution and Laws of the Realm                                 | 48               |
| <b>3 American Impeachments before 1787</b>                                           | 50               |
| Colonial Impeachments, 1607–1776                                                     | 50               |

|   |                                                                                                                      |     |
|---|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
|   | The First Colonial Impeachments: Maryland, 1669–83                                                                   | 53  |
|   | Colonial Impeachments in Pennsylvania                                                                                | 55  |
|   | The Impeachment of Nicholas Moore, 1685                                                                              | 55  |
|   | The Impeachment of James Logan, 1707                                                                                 | 56  |
|   | The Impeachment of William Moore, 1757–59                                                                            | 57  |
|   | Colonial Impeachments in Massachusetts                                                                               | 61  |
|   | The Impeachment of Samuel Vetch                                                                                      | 61  |
|   | Impeachment of Chief Justice Peter Oliver, 1774                                                                      | 61  |
|   | Impeachment in the Newly Independent States, 1776–1888                                                               | 65  |
|   | Procedural Structure of State Impeachments                                                                           | 67  |
|   | Persons Subject to Impeachment and Available Penalties                                                               | 69  |
|   | The Definition of Impeachable Conduct                                                                                | 70  |
|   | Impeachment Practice in the States, 1776–87                                                                          | 72  |
|   | The Influence of Early American Impeachments on the American<br>Constitutional Founders                              | 73  |
|   | Appendix A: Impeachment Provisions of State Constitutions, 1776–87                                                   | 75  |
| 4 | <b>The Founders’ Impeachment</b>                                                                                     | 80  |
|   | Constitutional Architecture                                                                                          | 83  |
|   | The Convention’s Impeachment Debates                                                                                 | 89  |
|   | Shall the President be Impeachable?                                                                                  | 89  |
|   | By Whom Should the President be Impeached and Tried?                                                                 | 90  |
|   | What Shall be the Procedures in an Impeachment?                                                                      | 91  |
|   | What Shall be the Consequence of Impeachment?                                                                        | 92  |
|   | “High Crimes and Misdemeanors”: What Shall Constitute<br>Impeachable Conduct?                                        | 94  |
|   | The Influence of British and American Precedents on the Founders’<br>Understanding of “High Crimes and Misdemeanors” | 99  |
|   | Armed Rebellion and Treason                                                                                          | 103 |
|   | Crime                                                                                                                | 103 |
|   | Corruption                                                                                                           | 105 |
|   | Betrayal of the Country’s Foreign Policy Interests                                                                   | 106 |
|   | Incompetence, Neglect of Duty, or Maladministration in Office                                                        | 107 |
|   | Subversion of the Constitution                                                                                       | 109 |
| 5 | <b>Impeaching Legislators and Lesser Executive Branch Officials</b>                                                  | 112 |
|   | Impeaching Congress: Constitutional Text and What the Founders<br>Thought                                            | 112 |
|   | The Impeachment of Senator William Blount, 1797–98                                                                   | 114 |
|   | Additional Lessons from the Blount Affair                                                                            | 120 |
|   | Interpretive Authority                                                                                               | 120 |
|   | Foreign Affairs                                                                                                      | 121 |
|   | The Impeachment of Secretary of War Belknap                                                                          | 122 |
|   | The Loneliness of Secretary Belknap                                                                                  | 124 |



|          |                                                                                  |            |
|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>6</b> | <b>Impeachment of Judges</b>                                                     | <b>126</b> |
|          | The Constitutional Text and the Founders' Understanding                          | 126        |
|          | The Constitutional Standard for Judicial Impeachment                             | 127        |
|          | The Case of Justice Samuel Chase                                                 | 128        |
|          | Impeachable Judicial Conduct                                                     | 136        |
|          | Treason                                                                          | 136        |
|          | Corruption in Office                                                             | 136        |
|          | Incapacity, Neglect of Duty, or Maladministration in Office                      | 137        |
|          | Incapacity                                                                       | 137        |
|          | Abusive Behavior                                                                 | 140        |
|          | Legal Errors                                                                     | 141        |
|          | Ordinary Crimes                                                                  | 141        |
|          | Perjury and False Statements                                                     | 142        |
|          | Conclusions from Judicial Impeachment Cases                                      | 143        |
| <br>     |                                                                                  |            |
| <b>7</b> | <b>The Impeachment of Andrew Johnson</b>                                         | <b>146</b> |
|          | The Improbable Rise of Andrew Johnson                                            | 147        |
|          | The End of the Civil War and the Challenge of Reconstruction                     | 150        |
|          | The Failure of "Presidential Reconstruction"                                     | 155        |
|          | "Radical Reconstruction"                                                         | 157        |
|          | Impeachment in the House of Representatives                                      | 164        |
|          | The Senate Trial of Andrew Johnson                                               | 166        |
|          | The Tenure of Office Act                                                         | 167        |
|          | Johnson's Attacks on Congress                                                    | 170        |
|          | The Senate's Verdict and its Reasons                                             | 172        |
|          | The Impeachment Case that Might Have Been                                        | 174        |
|          | Lessons from the Johnson Impeachment                                             | 178        |
| <br>     |                                                                                  |            |
| <b>8</b> | <b>The Fall of President Richard Nixon</b>                                       | <b>180</b> |
|          | Richard Nixon and the Prelude to Watergate                                       | 181        |
|          | The Watergate Break-in and its Aftermath                                         | 185        |
|          | The Judiciary Committee's Articles of Impeachment                                | 190        |
|          | The Prime Purpose of Presidential Impeachment Is to Protect Constitutional Order | 193        |
|          | Article 1: Obstruction of the Watergate Investigation                            | 194        |
|          | Article 2: Abuse of Power                                                        | 196        |
|          | Article 3: Defiance of Judiciary Committee Subpoenas                             | 199        |
|          | Articles of Impeachment Proposed, but Not Approved                               | 200        |
|          | The Cambodian Bombing                                                            | 201        |
|          | Emoluments and Tax Evasion                                                       | 202        |
|          | Lessons from the Nixon Impeachment Investigations                                | 202        |
|          | The Central Role of Federal Prosecutors                                          | 203        |
|          | The Federal Grand Jury                                                           | 204        |

|           |                                                                                    |            |
|-----------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
|           | The Judiciary and “Executive Privilege”                                            | 205        |
|           | The House and Senate Committees                                                    | 207        |
|           | The Press                                                                          | 207        |
| <b>9</b>  | <b>The Strange Case of William Jefferson Clinton</b>                               | <b>210</b> |
|           | The President and the Intern                                                       | 213        |
|           | The Independent Counsel Investigation: From Whitewater to Lies about Sex           | 216        |
|           | Proceedings in the House and Senate                                                | 222        |
|           | Criminal Offenses for Which Presidents Ought and Ought Not to be Impeached         | 224        |
|           | Towards a Working Definition of an Impeachable Crime                               | 227        |
|           | The Independent Counsel and Congress                                               | 231        |
| <b>10</b> | <b>The Scope of Impeachable Presidential Conduct: General Principles</b>           | <b>235</b> |
|           | The Importance of Constitutional Structure                                         | 235        |
|           | The Importance of Congress as Finder of Fact and Arbiter of Constitutional Meaning | 236        |
|           | The Scope of Impeachable Presidential Conduct                                      | 242        |
|           | Treason and Bribery                                                                | 242        |
|           | High Crimes and Misdemeanors                                                       | 244        |
|           | Crime is Not Necessary for Impeachment                                             | 244        |
|           | Crime May Not be Sufficient for Impeachment                                        | 245        |
|           | Defining an Oxymoron: Non-Criminal “High Crimes and Misdemeanors”                  | 245        |
|           | Presidential “High Crimes and Misdemeanors”: A Typology                            | 250        |
| <b>11</b> | <b>Impeachment for Obstruction of Justice</b>                                      | <b>253</b> |
|           | Federal Criminal Obstruction of Justice                                            | 255        |
|           | Section 1503 Obstruction                                                           | 256        |
|           | Section 1512 Obstruction                                                           | 256        |
|           | “Corruptly”: The Culpable Mental State for Obstruction of Justice                  | 257        |
|           | Corrupt Purpose and Presidential Power                                             | 258        |
|           | Obstruction of Justice as Subversion of the Justice System                         | 260        |
| <b>12</b> | <b>Impeachment for Abuse of the Pardon Power</b>                                   | <b>263</b> |
| <b>13</b> | <b>Impeachment for Lying</b>                                                       | <b>267</b> |
|           | Indictable Falsehoods                                                              | 267        |
|           | Official Lies to the Courts and Congress                                           | 268        |
|           | Lies to Congress by the President in a Formal, Official Communication              | 269        |

|    |                                                                                                                |     |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
|    | Lies to Congress by Administration Agencies or Officials with the President’s Knowledge                        | 271 |
|    | Chronic or Pervasive Presidential Falsehoods                                                                   | 271 |
| 14 | <b>Impeachment for Corruption: Schemes of Peculation, the Emoluments Clauses, and the Avaricious President</b> | 277 |
|    | The Emoluments Clauses                                                                                         | 278 |
|    | “Scheme of Peculation”                                                                                         | 283 |
| 15 | <b>The Twenty-fifth Amendment as an Alternative to Impeachment</b>                                             | 286 |
|    | The Constitution of 1788 and the Problem of Presidential Incapacity                                            | 287 |
|    | Historical Examples of Presidential Disability                                                                 | 288 |
|    | Twenty-fifth Amendment                                                                                         | 289 |
|    | Beyond the Politics of Trump                                                                                   | 293 |
| 16 | <b>Impeaching Donald Trump</b>                                                                                 | 296 |
|    | The Case for Impeachment                                                                                       | 296 |
|    | What if Donald Trump Has Been Compromised by Russia?                                                           | 297 |
|    | A Bill of Particulars                                                                                          | 300 |
|    | Obstruction of Justice                                                                                         | 300 |
|    | Subversion of Justice System                                                                                   | 301 |
|    | Abuse of the Pardon Power                                                                                      | 303 |
|    | Electoral Misconduct                                                                                           | 303 |
|    | Corruption                                                                                                     | 306 |
|    | Gross Maladministration, Abuse of Power, Injury to Foreign Policy Interests                                    | 307 |
|    | Attacks on the Press and Norms of Civil Discourse                                                              | 309 |
|    | Dishonesty                                                                                                     | 310 |
|    | Counting to Sixty-seven in a Tribal Age, or Why Impeachment is Unlikely                                        | 311 |
|    | <b>Appendix: United States Impeachments, 1789 to Present</b>                                                   | 316 |
|    | William Blount                                                                                                 | 316 |
|    | John Pickering                                                                                                 | 317 |
|    | Samuel Chase                                                                                                   | 318 |
|    | James H. Peck                                                                                                  | 319 |
|    | West H. Humphreys                                                                                              | 320 |
|    | Andrew Johnson                                                                                                 | 321 |
|    | William W. Belknap                                                                                             | 323 |
|    | Charles H. Swaine                                                                                              | 324 |
|    | Robert W. Archbald                                                                                             | 326 |
|    | George English                                                                                                 | 328 |

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48105-2 — High Crimes and Misdemeanors  
Frank O. Bowman III  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

|     |                         |     |
|-----|-------------------------|-----|
| xii | <i>Contents</i>         |     |
|     | Harold Louderback       | 329 |
|     | Halstead L. Ritter      | 331 |
|     | Harry Claiborne         | 332 |
|     | Alcee L. Hastings       | 333 |
|     | Walter L. Nixon         | 335 |
|     | William J. Clinton      | 336 |
|     | Samuel B. Kent          | 337 |
|     | G. Thomas Porteous, Jr. | 338 |
|     | <i>Notes</i>            | 342 |
|     | <i>Index</i>            | 455 |

Tables

|     |                                                                      |                |
|-----|----------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|
| 3.1 | Bodies Responsible for Initiating and Trying Impeachment Proceedings | <i>page</i> 67 |
| 3.2 | Classes of Person Impeachable and Available Penalties                | 68             |
| 3.3 | Scope of Impeachable Conduct                                         | 70             |

## Acknowledgments

No book of this scope could be written without the active help or patient forbearance of a supportive clutch of friends, family, and colleagues.

I am particularly grateful for much help from many people at the University of Missouri School of Law. First, thanks go to Dean Lyrissa Lidsky and the Law School itself for granting me research leave to finish the book. Throughout the project, I was constantly thankful for the professionalism, insight, and speed of the Law School's library staff. Special thanks go to crackerjack reference librarian Cynthia Shearrer, who found stuff I was looking for faster than I would have thought possible, and suggested sources of whose existence I had no clue, as well as to Randy Diamond, the head of our library, who put all his resources at my disposal.

Thanks to my brilliant law school colleague Paul Litton, and to my brothers, Herbert Bowman and Robert Bowman, lawyers, gentlemen, and scholars both, for reading and giving me invaluable feedback on some of the work. Joel Goldstein provided helpful clarification on the Twenty-fifth Amendment.

The book could not have been written or completed in anything like a timely fashion without the help of my terrific research assistants, Sam Crosby and Taylor Payne. Shawna Quast also did first-rate work on the footnotes.

My editor, Matt Gallaway, and all the rest of the folks at Cambridge University Press have been uniformly splendid in guiding me through the many stages of this project.

Finally, my wife Robin has tolerated long stretches of mental or physical absence with remarkable grace, and encouraged me when I thought the job would never be done. In this, as in all things, I am eternally in her debt.

*Frank Bowman*