

## Music and Victorian Liberalism

The discourse of Victorian liberalism has long been explored by scholars of literature, with reference to politics, ethics and aesthetics. Yet little attention has been paid to music's role in the context of these debates, leaving a rich collection of historical and archival detail on the periphery of our understanding. From the impact of the National Sunday League to the reception of Wagner in London, this collection of essays aims to nuance current approaches to the aesthetic facets of liberalism, examining the interaction between music and liberal ideas in a variety of social contexts. The significance of music for modern conceptions of self-hood and community is uncovered, revealing a new dimension of Victorian liberalism.

SARAH COLLINS is a senior lecturer in musicology at the University of Western Australia, Perth. In 2017, she was a visiting fellow at Harvard University and a Marie Skłodowska-Curie Research Fellow at Durham University. Collins is the author of *Lateness and Modernism* (Cambridge, forthcoming) and *The Aesthetic Life of Cyril Scott* (2013). Her work has appeared in journals including the *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, *Twentieth-Century Music*, *Music & Letters* and *Musical Quarterly*.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48005-5 — Music and Victorian Liberalism  
Edited by Sarah Collins  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# Music and Victorian Liberalism

## Composing the Liberal Subject

---

*Edited by* SARAH COLLINS

University of Western Australia



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48005-5 — Music and Victorian Liberalism  
Edited by Sarah Collins  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108480055](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108480055)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108628778

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Collins, Sarah, 1984–

Title: Music and Victorian liberalism : composing the liberal subject / edited by Sarah Collins.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY :

Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018050899 | ISBN 9781108480055 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781108703161 (pbk.)

Subjects: LCSH: Music–Social aspects–Great Britain–History–19th century. |

Music–Great Britain–19th century–History and criticism. |

Liberalism–Great Britain–History–19th century.

Classification: LCC ML3917.G7 M88 2019 | DDC 780.941/09034vdc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018050899>

ISBN 978-1-108-48005-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

*List of Figures* [page vii]  
*List of Music Examples* [viii]  
*List of Tables* [ix]  
*Notes on Contributors* [x]  
*Acknowledgements* [xiii]

1 Aesthetic Liberalism [1]  
SARAH COLLINS

PART I CULTIVATION AND/AS CONTROL [13]

2 Musical Discipline and Victorian Liberal Reform [15]  
ERIN JOHNSON-WILLIAMS

3 ‘Brightening the Lives of the People on Sunday’: The National  
Sunday League and Liberal Attitudes towards Concert Promotion  
in Victorian Britain [37]  
SIMON McVEIGH

4 Music and Mass Education: Cultivation or Control? [60]  
ROSEMARY GOLDING

PART II DISSENT, INDIVIDUALISM AND AGENCY [81]

5 A Musical Presence among Liberal Thinkers: Eliza Flower and  
Her Circle, 1832–1845 [83]  
KATE BOWAN

6 ‘That More Liberal Mode of Life’: Rosa Newmarch, Aestheticism  
and Queer Listening in Victorian and Edwardian Britain [108]  
PHILIP ROSS BULLOCK

PART III CHARACTER AND EMOTION [127]

7 Style, Character and Revelation in Parry’s Fourth  
Symphony [129]  
MATTHEW RILEY

8	The Parrys and <i>Prometheus Unbound</i> : Actualising Liberalism [151]
	PHYLLIS WELIVER
9	Liberalism and Victorian Musical Sympathy [180]
	BENNETT ZON
10	Music and Character in the London Reception of Wagner: Conducting the Philharmonic, ca. 1855 [201]
	KATHERINE FRY
11	Afterword: Liberalism in the Round [220]
	PETER MANDLER
	<i>Selected Bibliography</i> [229]
	<i>Index</i> [251]

## Figures

- 2.1 ‘Exercise IV’, from C. Oxley, *A Manual of Drill and Physical Exercise for Use in Schools* (London: Blackie & Son, 1895), 36–7. Copyright from The British Library Board (Shelfmark: General Reference Collection 7907.e.32). [page 24]
- 2.2 *Boys with Dumbbells, Leamington Spa, 1903*. Copyright from The Warwickshire County Record Office, Reference PH352/111/82. [34]
- 3.1 ‘Sunday Music as Cant Would Have It’, *Punch*, vol. 30, 31 May 1856, p. [219], from the Internet Archive: <https://archive.org/stream/punch30a31lemouoft#page/218/mode/2up/search/sunday+music+as+cant>. This image comes from a copy of *Punch* held at the University of Toronto, Robarts Library. [43]
- 3.2 Clapham Common Bandstand, c. 1910, courtesy of The Clapham Society. [48]
- 5.1 Lithograph of Eliza Flower by Eliza Bridell Fox, British Library, Music Collections H.1917. [87]
- 5.2 Opening page of ‘January’, from the *Songs of the Months*, in *Monthly Repository*, 8.85 (1834), 893. [89]
- 8.1 Herbert Gladstone unveiling the memorial tablet to C. Hubert H. Parry, Gloucester Cathedral, 6 September 1922. Photograph, Shulbrede Priory. [152]
- 8.2 Herbert Gladstone and Dorothy Ponsonby conversing in the cloisters of Gloucester Cathedral. Photograph, Shulbrede Priory. [153]
- 8.3 Flyleaf, poems in Maude Parry’s hand, in her copy of *The Poetical Works of John Keats*, with a memoir by Lord Houghton, new edn (London: Moxon, 1864), Shulbrede Priory. [164]

## Music Examples

- 7.1 Parry and Brahms comparison (1).
  - (a) Parry, Symphony No. 4/i, bars 1–11.
  - (b) Brahms, Piano Concerto No. 1/i, bars 1–10. [134]
- 7.2 Parry and Brahms comparison (2).
  - (a) Parry, Symphony No. 4/i, bars 16–19.
  - (b) Brahms, Symphony No. 1/i, bars 42–46<sup>1</sup>. [135]
- 7.3 Parry, Symphony No. 4/i, letter B, bars 4<sup>2</sup>–10, ‘The Questions’ and ‘Destiny’. [135]
- 7.4 Parry and Brahms comparison (3).
  - (a) Parry, Symphony No. 4/i, letter E, bars 1–9.
  - (b) Brahms, Symphony No. 2/i, bars 48–52.
  - (c) Brahms, Symphony No. 3/i, bars 36–37. [135]
- 7.5 Parry, Symphony No. 4/i, letter F, bars 10–12, ‘answer’. [136]
- 7.6 Parry and Brahms comparison (4).
  - (a) Parry, Symphony No. 4/iii, letter C, bars 3–9.
  - (b) Brahms, Symphony No. 3/i, bars 3–6. [136]
- 7.7 Parry, Handel and Mendelssohn comparison.
  - (a) Parry, Symphony No. 4/iv, bars 1–4, ‘the girding’.
  - (b) Handel, *Messiah*, ‘Glory to God in the Highest’, bars 1–4.
  - (c) Handel, *Messiah*, ‘Lift Up Your Heads, O ye Gates’, bars 5–6.
  - (d) Mendelssohn, *Elijah*, ‘Thanks Be to God’, bars 6–9<sup>2</sup>. [141]
- 7.8 Parry, Bach and Schumann comparison.
  - (a) Parry, Symphony No. 4/iv, letter H, bars 12–20, ‘Dedication’.
  - (b) Bach, Mass in B minor, ‘Dona nobis pacem’, bars 1–4.
  - (c) Schumann, Symphony No. 2/iv, bars 280–287.
  - (d) Parry, *Blest Pair of Sirens*, letter B, bars 3–5<sup>1</sup>. [142]



Tables

- 3.1 Programme of National Sunday League Regent’s Park Sunday Band concert, [11] July [1875]. [48]
- 3.2 Programme of National Sunday League Sunday Evenings for the People, South Place Institute, 3 December 1876. [50]
- 3.3 Programme of first South Place Sunday concert, 20 February 1887. [54]
- 3.4 Programme of National Sunday League evening concert, Shoreditch Town Hall, 21 November 1897. [56]
- 3.5a Programme of National Sunday League afternoon concert, Palladium, 9 February 1913. [56]
- 3.5b Programme of National Sunday League evening concert, Palladium, 9 February 1913. [56]
- 3.5c Programme of National Sunday League evening concert, Alhambra, 9 February 1913. [57]

## Notes on Contributors

KATE BOWAN is a lecturer in the Centre for Heritage and Museum Studies at the Australian National University. Her recent publications include the co-authored book with Paul Pickering, *Sounds of Liberty: Music, Radicalism and Reform in the Anglophone World, 1790–1914* (2017) and the book chapter on ‘Friendship, cosmopolitan connections and late Victorian socialist songbook culture’ in *Cheap Print and Popular Song in the Nineteenth Century: A Cultural History of the Songster* (2017), edited by Derek B. Scott, Patrick Spedding and Paul Watt.

PHILIP ROSS BULLOCK is a professor of Russian literature and music at the University of Oxford. His publications include *Rosa Newmarch and Russian Music in Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth-Century England* (2009), *The Correspondence of Jean Sibelius and Rosa Newmarch, 1906–1939* (2011), and most recently, *Pyotr Tchaikovsky* (2016).

SARAH COLLINS is a senior lecturer in musicology at the University of Western Australia, Perth. In 2017, she was a visiting fellow at Harvard University and a Marie Skłodowska-Curie Research Fellow at Durham University. Sarah is the author of *Lateness and Modernism* (forthcoming) and *The Aesthetic Life of Cyril Scott* (2013), and has had articles published in the *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, *Twentieth-Century Music*, *Music & Letters*, *Musical Quarterly* and elsewhere. She is a co-editor, with Paul Watt and Michael Allis, of the *Oxford Handbook of Music and Intellectual Culture in the Nineteenth Century* (forthcoming), and is currently the reviews editor of the *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* and the *RMA Research Chronicle*.

KATHERINE FRY is a lecturer in musicology at King’s College London. She was previously a Postdoctoral Research Associate on the European Research Council-funded project ‘Music in London, 1800–1851’. She has published in journals including *Opera Quarterly*, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* and *19th-Century Music*. Her current work includes an exploration of musical migration and aesthetic theory between Britain and Germany in the mid-nineteenth century.

ROSEMARY GOLDING is a staff tutor and senior lecturer in music at The Open University. Her research addresses the role and meaning of music in a range of contexts within nineteenth-century Britain. She has published widely on music in education and the music profession, and is currently researching Victorian attitudes to music and health.

ERIN JOHNSON-WILLIAMS is an assistant professor in music at Durham University. She received her PhD in historical musicology from Yale University in 2015, for which she received the Walter L. Arnstein Award for Outstanding Scholarship in Interdisciplinary Victorian Studies, presented by the Midwest Victorian Studies Association. Johnson-Williams' ongoing research interests include intersections between music, empire and religion in nineteenth-century Britain; music and visual culture; and social histories of musical education. Future research will comprise a study of the cultures of class, music and discipline in late-Victorian society.

PETER MANDLER is a professor of modern cultural history at the University of Cambridge and Bailey Lecturer in history at Gonville and Caius College. His work on Victorian liberalism includes *Aristocratic Government in the Age of Reform: Whigs and Liberals, 1830–1852* (1990) and (as editor) *Liberty and Authority in Victorian Britain* (2006). From 2012 to 2016 he served as president of the Royal Historical Society.

SIMON McVEIGH is a professor of music at Goldsmiths, University of London. He is the author of *Concert Life in London from Mozart to Haydn* (1993) and *The Italian Solo Concerto 1700–1760*, (2004), while an edition of Thomas Arne's oratorio *Judith* forms the 100th volume in the flagship series *Musica Britannica* (2016). Currently, his research centres on London concert life 1880–1914: a substantial article on the LSO appeared in the *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* in 2013, and a book on London's musical culture during the period is in preparation. He is currently President of the Royal Musical Association.

MATTHEW RILEY is a reader in music at the University of Birmingham. His publications include books on the music of Edward Elgar and on British music and modernism. He is co-author with the late Anthony D. Smith of *Nation and Classical Music: From Handel to Copland* (2016).

PHYLLIS WELIVER is a professor of English at Saint Louis University. She writes on the connections among literature, music and other nineteenth-century discourses, including liberalism, science and gender. Her books include the monograph, *Mary Gladstone and the Victorian Salon: Music,*

*Literature, Liberalism* (2017) and, with Katharine Ellis, the edited collection, *Words and Notes in the Long Nineteenth Century* (2013). Current projects include co-directing two suites of digital resources: *Tennysons Archive* and *Sounding Victorian*.

BENNETT ZON has published *The English Plainchant Revival* (1999); *Music and Metaphor in Nineteenth-Century British Musicology* (2000); *Representing Non-Western Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (2007); and *Evolution and Victorian Music Culture* (2017). He is general editor of the Routledge book series *Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain* and in 1997 founded the biennial conference on that topic. Professor Zon is founder and general editor of the international peer-reviewed journal *Nineteenth-Century Music Review*, and is founding director of the Centre for Nineteenth-Century Studies, Durham University.

## Acknowledgements

This book reflects a range of ongoing discussions between scholars interested in the imbrication of music with intellectual history, and the forms of writing, thinking and living that have emerged historically from this relationship. With the traditions of Victorian liberalism as their focus, contributors to the present volume met together in various formations throughout 2017, principally at a symposium at King's College London in January under the auspices of Roger Parker's ERC-funded 'Music in London, 1800–1851' project, but also at a more broadly-conceived panel at Rochester in November that year, at the annual meeting of the American Musicological Society, the latter co-convened by Sarah Collins and Dana Gooley. In addition to the authors whose work appears in the chapters that follow, there were other discussants and presenters at these events who shaped the intellectual context for the volume, including Robert Adlington, Oskar Cox-Jenson, James Grande, Kate Guthrie, Jonathan Hicks, David Kennerley, Gavin Williams, Michelle Meinhart, Paul Watt, Susan Rutherford, Jane Fulcher, Esteban Buch, William Weber and Celia Applegate. Special thanks are due to Dana Gooley, Roger Parker and Fraser Riddle for extended conversations that helped refine the conceptual framing of the book, and of course to the contributors to the present volume for their willingness to read, discuss and workshop a wide range of ideas in a spirit of 'liberal' sympathy and robust debate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48005-5 — Music and Victorian Liberalism  
Edited by Sarah Collins  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---