

## Index

---

- Aaronson, Scott, 229–230  
 ABC conjecture, 219–220  
 abductive reasoning, 29  
 Abelard, Peter, 138–139  
 Achourioti, Theodora, 172, 173  
 Adler, Jonathan, 169  
 adversarial collaboration, 173–174  
 adversariality, 54–59  
   in Ancient Greek dialectic, 104–106  
   cognitive gadgets and, 201–202  
   deductive reasoning and, analogy  
     between, 174  
   in dialogical logic, 54–55  
   feminist critique of, 58–59  
   in Game-Theoretical Semantics, 54–55  
   logical pluralism and, 83  
   necessary truth-preservation and, 62–63  
   ontogeny of deductive reasoning and,  
     171–174  
     collaboration between, 173–174  
 agonist origins, of logic, 39  
 Akṣapāda Gautama, 124  
 Albert the Great, 133  
 Alibert, Daniel, 182–183  
 analogy  
   between adversariality and deductive  
     reasoning, 174  
   in Ancient Greek dialectic, 129  
 Ancient Greece. *See also* Athenian democracy  
   period  
   mathematics in, 93–98  
     axiomatic-deductive method, 4, 90, 94  
     certainty as feature of, 94  
     Euclidean turn in, 95  
     generality as feature of, 94  
     proofs as element of, 94  
     in Prover–Skeptic dialogues, 97  
     sociopolitical contexts for, 94, 95–97  
 Ancient Greek dialectic, 42–43, 98–106  
   adversariality in, 104–106  
   analogy in, 129  
   Aristotle and, 98–100. *See also* *sylogismos*  
   Chinese classical thought compared to, 128  
   classical Indian thought compared to,  
     125, 126  
   cooperation in, 104–106  
   *elenchus* in, 101–104, 110–111  
     reductio ad absurdum arguments  
       compared to, 103  
   general background for, 98–101  
   Plato and, 98–100  
   reductio ad absurdum arguments, 103  
 Andersen, Line, 208, 211  
 antilogic, 100  
 Apollonius, 94  
*Apology* (Plato), 92, 99  
 Aquinas. *See* Thomas Aquinas  
 Arabic medieval logic, 140–143  
   during Abbasid Caliphate, 140  
   assent in, conception compared to, 141–142  
   Avicenna and, 139, 141–143  
   conception in, assent compared to, 141–142  
   disputations in, 143  
   *falsafa* tradition and, 140–143  
   al-Kindī and, 140  
   Peripatetics and, 140–141  
 Archimedes, 94  
 arguments. *See also* deductive argumentation;  
   reductio ad absurdum arguments  
   definitional scope of, 3  
   inferences as distinct from, 3  
 Aristotle, 131. *See also* *sylogismos*  
   *Organon*, 140–141  
   *Posterior Analytics*, 4, 8, 19, 109–118  
   *Prior Analytics*, 68, 109–118  
   scientific method theory, 19  
   *Sophistical Refutations*, 99, 100  
   syllogistic, 3  
   theory of demonstration, 67  
   *Topics*, 30–31, 99, 100, 106  
 associative learning, 197–198, 199  
 Athenian democracy period, 30  
   golden age of, 92  
   main political bodies during, 91–92

## 262 Index

- Athenian democracy period (cont.)  
Peloponnesian Wars and, 92, 93  
political background during, 92  
roots of deduction and, 90  
social background during, 92  
sophists during, 92  
writing during, as means of  
communication, 93
- Auslander, Paul, 223, 224
- Averroes, 142
- Avicenna, 139, 141–143
- axiomatic-deductive method, 4, 90, 94
- Bacon, Roger, 133
- Balacheff, Nicolas, 182–183
- Beall, J. C., 82
- belief bias, 8, 156  
in human deductive reasoning, 153–156  
dual-process theories and, 157–158
- belief-bracketing  
in deductive argumentation, 7–9  
belief bias effect in, 8  
dialogical notion and, 67–69  
counterfactual reasoning, 67–68  
hypothetical reasoning, 67–68  
reductio ad absurdum reasoning, 68–69  
ontogeny of deductive reasoning and,  
174–180  
in reductio ad absurdum arguments, 178
- belief projection, 153–157, 160–163  
in group deductive reasoning, 166  
logical intuition, 162  
ontogeny and, 171, 177–178
- belief-based reasoning, 156
- biàn* practice, in classical Chinese thought,  
127–129
- bias. *See also* belief bias; computational bias  
in evolution of reasoning, 193–194
- Boethius, 131, 132–133, 135
- Boole, George, 146–148
- Bourbaki group, 213
- Buridan, John, 134, 137, 139
- Burley, Walter, 134
- Cantor, Georg, 207
- Carnap, Rudolf, 31
- Castelnérac, Benoît, 100, 103, 109–110
- certainty feature, in mathematics, 94
- Chater, Nick, 162
- Chemla, Karine, 94
- Chinese thought, classical  
Ancient Greek dialectic compared to, 128  
*biàn* practice in, 127–129  
disputations in, 127–128  
logic in, 127–129  
Mohist dialectic, 128–129  
political context for, 127
- Christian morality, genealogy of, 91
- Chwistek, Leon, 217
- classical Chinese thought. *See* Chinese thought
- classical Indian thought. *See* Indian thought
- classical rule, in dialogical logic, 41–42
- clutter-avoidance, principle of, 20
- cognitive basis, of deduction, 26–27, 188,  
199–200
- cognitive gadgets, 188, 195–202  
adversariality and, 201–202  
for associative learning, 197–198, 199  
as cultural learning mechanisms, 196  
deductive argumentation and, 199  
for executive functions, 199  
for language, 199–200  
literacy, 196  
for mind reading, 200–201  
for selective social learning, 200
- cognitive technology, in roots approach to  
deduction, 26–27
- Cole, Michael, 176
- collaboration, 173–174  
in mathematics, 213–216  
as adversarial, 214–215
- community checking, 34
- computational bias, 153
- computational proofs, 228–232
- conception, assent compared to, 141–142
- concepts, philosophical  
continuity in, 28  
discontinuity in, 28  
functionalist conception of, 28  
historicist conception of, 28
- conceptual genealogy methodology, for  
deduction, 28, 87, 88–91  
concept drift, 88  
continuity in, 88, 89  
superimposition of layers in, 89  
transformational elements in, 88
- conclusions, in deductive arguments, premises  
and, 8
- conjunctive pluralism, 74
- consequence. *See* logical consequence
- contraction rule, 79, 81
- conversation, theory of, 55
- cooperation  
in Ancient Greek dialectic, 104–106  
in game theory, 54–59  
abuses of, 57–58  
in dialogical logic, 54–55  
in Game-Theoretical Semantics, 54–55  
logical pluralism and, 83
- correctness, logical pluralism and, 82

- counterfactual reasoning, 67–68  
*Critique of Pure Reason* (Kant), 19–20  
 cultural evolution, 201  
 cultural learning mechanisms, 196  
 cultural recapitulation, 24–25
- Dawkins, Richard, 45–46  
 De Strycker, Emile, 104, 111  
 ‘death of deduction,’ 10  
 debating practices, 100  
   in Indian classical thought, 123–124  
 deduction, 10–21. *See also* roots approach  
   in the brain, 202–204  
   ‘death of deduction,’ 10  
   etymology of, 132–134  
   functions and purpose of, 17–21  
   goal and purpose of, 4  
   historical development of, 236  
   human cognition and, 10  
   justification of, 18  
   natural, 15  
   scandal of, 19  
   social constructivist account of, 234–235  
   usefulness of, 18  
 deduction paradigm, in psychology of  
   reasoning, 152–153  
 deductive argumentation  
   bracketing belief requirement in, 7–9  
   belief bias effect in, 8  
   cognitive gadgets and, 199  
   definition and scope of, 4–9  
   historical role in intellectual inquiry, 4  
   logical form doctrine and, validity of  
   argument and, 9  
   mathematical proofs and, 4–5  
   necessary truth-preservation in, 5–6  
   counterexamples and, 6  
   monotonicity and, 5–6  
   perspicuity in, 6–7  
   epistemic function of, 6–7  
   Fermat’s last theorem and, 6  
   Peano Arithmetic and, 6–7  
   premises in, 3  
   conclusions and, 8  
   transitive powers in, 7  
 deductive consistency, in normativity of  
   logic, 77  
 deductive inferences, 3  
 deductive logic, feminist critique of, 59  
 deductive method. *See* axiomatic-deductive  
   method  
 deductive necessity, 12–17  
   deductive validity and, 13–14  
   epistemic, 13–14  
   formal, 13–14  
   linguistic, 13–14  
   logical consequences and, 12–14  
   meaning-preserving rules, 16  
   metaphysical, 13–14  
   model theory and, 14  
   proof theory and, 14  
   rules of inference, 16  
   semantic models and, 16  
   syntactic rules and, 16  
   worlds semantics and, 14–15  
 deductive reasoning. *See also* deductive  
   necessity; mathematical practice;  
   mathematical proofs; ontogeny;  
   phylogeny  
   adversariality and, analogy between, 174  
   ampliativeness of, 20  
   applicability of, 4  
   defeasibility in, 3, 11  
   as dialogical notion, 29–35  
   cognitive perspective on, 33–34  
   historical perspective on, 30–31  
   levels of granularity in, 35  
   in mathematical practices, 34–35  
   philosophical perspective on,  
   31–33  
   rational reconstruction methodology, 31  
   reductio ad absurdum arguments, 33  
   explicitiveness of, 20  
   fantasy and, 177  
   in humans. *See* humans  
   indefeasibility in, 3, 11  
   inferences in, 3  
   deductive, 3  
   inductive, 3  
   reliability of, 4  
   rule-based, 156  
   Skeptic criticism of, 4  
 deductive-nomological model, of scientific  
   inquiry, 4  
 defeasible reasoning, 3  
   definition of, 11  
 democracy. *See* Athenian democracy period  
 demonstration, theory of, 67  
 derivational utility, 117  
 Descartes, René, 18, 51–52, 144–145  
 Detlefsen, Michael, 230  
 Devlin, Keith, 222  
 dialectic, as concept, 30–31. *See also* Ancient  
   Greek dialectic  
   as antilogic, 100  
   Plato on, 99–100, 103  
   Socrates on, 99–100  
 dialectical proofs, in Prover–Skeptic games,  
   47–48  
 formulation of, 52

## 264 Index

- dialogical logic, 37–46. *See also* dialogical origins  
 Dawkins question, 45–46  
 game theory and, 37–38  
 Hintikka and, 42–45  
   Game-Theoretical Semantics, 32, 42, 45  
   through language games, 42–43, 44–45  
 Lorenzen and, 37–38  
   adversariality in, 54–55  
   agonist origins of logic, 39  
   classical rule, 41–42  
   competitive component of, 39  
   cooperation in, 54–55  
   intuitionistic rule, 41–42, 46  
   multi-agent component of, 39  
   prelogical speech in, 39  
 dialogical notion, deductive reasoning as,  
   29–35. *See also* Hintikka, Jaakko;  
   Lakatos, Imre; Lorenzen, Paul; Prover;  
   Skeptic  
   belief-bracketing, 67–69  
   counterfactual reasoning, 67–68  
   hypothetical reasoning, 67–68  
   reductio ad absurdum reasoning, 68–69  
   cognitive perspective on, 33–34  
   Game-Theoretical Semantics, 69  
   historical perspective on, 30–31  
   levels of granularity in, 35  
   logical consequence and, 73–74  
     conjunctive pluralism, 74  
     disjunctive pluralism, 74  
     model theory and, 73–74  
     proof theory and, 73–74  
   logical pluralism, 82–84  
     adversariality and, 83  
     cooperation and, 83  
     correctness and, 82  
     group deductive reasoning and, 163  
     local logical monism and, 82–83  
 in mathematical practices, 34–35  
 necessary truth-preservation, 61–64  
   adversariality and, 62–63  
   in argumentative situations, 62  
   goal-oriented components, 63–64  
   indefeasible properties in, 61–62  
 normativity of logic, 74–78  
   deductive consistency and, 77  
   epistemic communism and, 78  
   mind-clutter objection in, 77  
 paradoxes of, 78–82  
   Liar paradox, 78–79  
 perspicuity, 64–67  
   non-dialogical explanations for, 66–67  
   proof of, 64  
   properties of, 64, 65  
   philosophical perspective on, 31–33  
   rational reconstruction methodology, 31  
   reductio ad absurdum arguments, 33  
   structural rules of, 78–82  
     contraction rule, 79, 81  
     Left Weakening rule, 79–80, 81  
     modification/restriction of, 79  
     reflexivity rule, 81  
     transitivity rule, 79, 80–81  
 dialogical origins, of logic, 143–148  
   during early modern period, 143–146  
   during Renaissance, 143–146  
 dialogues  
   definition of, 70  
   in Prover–Skeptic games, 55–56, 59  
   dialogue tree, 54  
 Dignāga, 126–127  
 disjunctive pluralism, 74  
 disputations  
   in Arabic medieval logic, 143  
   in classical Chinese thought, 127–128  
   scholastic, 137–140  
 Dogramaci, Sinan, 78  
 dual-process theories, 157–160  
   belief bias and, 157–158  
 Dummett, Michael, 18  
 Duncombe, Matthew, 30–31, 109, 116  
  
 Easwaran, Kenny, 35, 59, 212, 218, 221, 231  
 Einarson, Benedict, 109–110, 119  
*Elements* (Euclid), 4, 7, 68, 93, 97  
*elenchus* (refutation), 101–104, 110–111  
   reductio ad absurdum arguments compared  
     to, 103  
 enculturation, 202  
 epistemic communism, 78  
 epistemic deductive necessity, 13–14  
 Erdős, Paul, 206, 229–230  
 Ernest, Paul, 72  
 Etchemendy, John, 14, 15  
 Euclid, 4, 7, 68, 93, 97. *See also* mathematical  
   practice; mathematical proofs  
   on Pythagorean Theorem, 97  
 Evans, Jonathan, 10  
 evolution of reasoning, 192–195  
   adaptation in, 192–193  
   bias in, 193–194  
   failures of reasoning, 193  
   group-level selection in, 194  
   human laziness and, 193–194  
   in non-human animals, 191  
   social functions in, 192  
  
 fallacy. *See* genetic fallacy  
 Fallis, Don, 65, 208, 231

- falsafa* tradition, in Arabic medieval logic, 140–143
- fantasy, deductive reasoning and, 177
- feminism, adversariality and, 58–59
- Fermat's Last Theorem (FLT), 6, 34
- fictive interaction, 34, 72
- figures, syllogistic theory of, 118–120, 137
- FLT. *See* Fermat's Last Theorem
- formal deductive necessity, 13–14
- Forms, theory of, 100
- Fraser, Chris, 128–129
- Frege, Gottlob, 15, 19–20, 21, 147–148
- French, Rohan, 79
- Galen, 142
- game theory. *See also* Game-Theoretical Semantics; Prover–Skeptic games
- adversariality in, 54–59
  - feminist critique of, 58–59
  - cooperation in, 54–59
    - abuses of, 57–58
  - dialogical logic and, 37–38
  - language games, 42–43, 44–45
  - partial-conflict-of-interest games, 56
- Game-Theoretical Semantics (GTS), 32, 42–45
- adversariality in, 54–55
  - cooperation in, 54–55
  - dialogical notion and, 69
  - quantifiers in, 45
- Ganeri, Jonardon, 124, 125–126
- generality feature, in mathematics, 94
- genetic biology, in roots approach to deduction, 26
- genetic fallacy, 29
- genetic reasoning, 28–29
- Gentzen, Gerhard, 14, 15–16
- Gödel, Kurt, 216–218
- Gorgias* (Plato), 98–99, 105
- Gould, Stephen Jay, 23–24
- Grice, Paul, 55, 169
- group deductive reasoning, 163–167
- alternative model of, 167
  - belief projection in, 166
  - cognitive effects of, 167
  - epistemic effects of, 167
  - logical pluralism and, 163
  - normative conception of rationality and, 163
  - poor performance in, 165
- GTS. *See* Game-Theoretical Semantics
- Hahn, Ulrike, 163
- Halmos, Paul, 207–208
- Hardy, G. H., 210
- Harman, Gilbert, 20
- on clutter-avoidance principle, 20
- Harris, Paul, 176–177
- Heath, Thomas, 98
- Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich, 88
- Henkin, Leon, 38
- Heyes, Cecilia, 188, 195–202. *See also* cognitive gadgets
- Hilbert, David, 15
- Hintikka, Jaakko, 19
- Game-Theoretical Semantics, 32, 42–45
    - adversariality in, 54–55
    - cooperation in, 54–55
    - dialogical notion and, 69
    - quantifiers in, 45
    - language games for, 42–43, 44–45
  - history, of deduction, 132–134
- Hodges, Wilfrid, 141
- homotopy type theory, 229
- Horgan, John, 229
- Huele, Marijin, 229
- humans, deductive reasoning in, 152–163. *See also* group deductive reasoning
- belief bias, 153–156
    - dual-process theories and, 157–158
  - belief projection, 153–157, 160–163
    - logical intuition, 162
  - computational bias, 153
  - deduction paradigm in psychology of reasoning, 152–153
  - dual-process theories and, 157–160
    - belief bias and, 157–158
    - individual differences in, 157–160
- Hutchins, Edwin, 188, 202
- hypothetical reasoning, 67–68
- indefeasible reasoning, 3
- definition of, 11
  - in necessary truth-preservation, 61–62
- Indian thought, classical
- Ancient Greek dialectical tradition
    - compared to, 125, 126
  - debating practices in, 123–124
  - Dignāga and, 126–127
  - linguistics influenced by, 126
  - logic in, 123–127
    - philosophical legacy of, 126
  - Nyaya-sutra*, 125, 126–127
  - schools of, 124
- inductive inferences, 3
- inferences, 3
- arguments as distinct from, 3
  - deductive, 3
  - definitional scope of, 3
  - inductive, 3
  - rules of, in deductive necessity, 16
- Inglis, Matthew, 224–225

## 266 Index

- inquiry. *See* scientific inquiry  
 internalization, 33–34  
   ontology of deductive reasoning and, 183–186  
   Plato on, 183–184  
   process of, 184  
   of Skeptic, 70–72, 185–186  
     perspicuity from, 71  
     universal Skeptic and, 71–72  
   Skeptics and, 185–186  
   Vygotsky on, 184–185  
 intuitionistic rule, of dialogical logic, 41–42, 46  
 irreflexivity, in *syllogismos*, 115–116
- judgment, concept of, 146
- Kahneman, Daniel, 173–174  
 Kant, Immanuel, 19–20, 145–146  
   on judgment, as concept, 146  
 Kapp, Ernst, 109  
 Katz, Nick, 215  
 Kepler conjecture, 229  
 Kilwardby, Robert, 136  
 al-Kindī, 140  
 Kitcher, Philip, 228  
 Kouri Kissel, Teresa, 82–83  
 Krabbe, Erik, 51
- Lakatos, Imre, 27–28, 34, 46, 48–49, 181, 214  
   Prover–Skeptic games and, 50–52  
 language, cognitive gadgets for, 199–200  
 language games, 42–43, 44–45  
 Latin medieval tradition. *See also* medieval  
   Aristotelian logical traditions  
   deduction in, etymological history of, 132–134  
   mental languages in, 137–140  
   scholastic disputations in, 137–140  
   *syllogismos* in, changing definitions of, 135–137
- Laughlin, Patrick, 163  
 learning. *See* associative learning; cultural  
   learning mechanisms; selective social  
   learning
- Left Weakening rule, 79–80, 81  
 Leibniz, Gottfried Wilhelm, 146–147  
 Leron, Uri, 68  
 Levesque, Hector, 166  
 Liar paradox, 78–79  
 linguistic deductive necessity, 13–14  
 linguistics  
   Indian classical thought as influence  
   on, 126  
   mental languages, 137–140  
 literacy, cognitive gadgets for, 196
- Lloyd, G. E. R., 90, 108, 127–129. *See also*  
   Chinese thought  
   on axiomatic-deductive method, 4, 90, 94  
 local logical monism, 82–83  
 logic. *See also* dialogical logic; philosophy of  
   logic  
   agonist origins of, 39  
   antilogic, 100  
   Arabic medieval. *See* Arabic medieval logic  
   in Asian traditions, 123–129. *See also*  
   Chinese thought; Indian thought  
   theoretical approach to, 123  
   in classical Chinese thought, 127–129  
   in classical Indian thought, 123–127  
   philosophical legacy of, 126  
   in concrete dialogical situations, 87  
   dialogical origins of. *See* dialogical origins  
   epistemological conception of, 142  
   mathematical, 146–148. *See also* mathemat-  
   ical practice  
   normativity of, 19–21  
 logical consequence  
   deductive necessity and, 12–14  
   dialogical notion and, 73–74  
   conjunctive pluralism, 74  
   disjunctive pluralism, 74  
   model theory and, 73–74  
   proof theory and, 73–74  
 logical deduction  
   formalization of, 15  
   in mathematical proofs, 15  
 logical form doctrine, validity of deductive  
   argument, 9  
 logical paradoxes. *See* paradoxes  
 logical pluralism, 82–84  
   adversariality and, 83  
   cooperation and, 83  
   correctness and, 82  
   group deductive reasoning and, 163  
   local logical monism and, 82–83  
 Lorenzen, Paul, 32  
   Ancient dialectic as influence on, 42–43  
   dialogical logic and. *See* dialogical logic  
   on game-theoretical concepts, 38  
 Luria, Alexander, 8, 175, 176
- MacFarlane, John, 75–76  
 Malink, Marko, 112–113  
 Mancosu, Paolo, 217, 226  
 Marion, Mathieu, 100, 103  
*Mathematical Analysis of Logic* (Boole), 146  
 mathematical cognition, 27–28  
 mathematical logic, 146–148  
 mathematical practice  
   community checking in, 34

- dialogical notion in, 34–35  
 peer review in, 210–213  
 Provers in, 209–221  
 Skeptics in, 70, 209–221  
 mathematical proofs, 4–5, 206–209  
 ABC conjecture, 219–220  
 in Ancient Greece, 94  
 deductive reasoning and, 11–12  
 features of, 207  
 functions of, 222–228  
   for certification, 224–225  
   for communication, 225–226  
   as driver of innovation, 227–228  
   for explanation, 226–227  
   for persuasion, 225–226  
   systematization as, 228  
   for verification, 223–224  
 of incompleteness theorems, 216–217  
 Kepler conjecture, 229  
 logical deduction in, 15  
 in monological form, 72  
 as multifaceted phenomenon, 221–228  
 origins of, 52  
 Peano Arithmetic, inconsistency of,  
   217–219  
 phenomenology of, 33  
 in Prover–Skeptic games, 52–53  
 transferability property in, 35, 215–216  
 mathematics  
   in Ancient Greece. *See* Ancient Greece  
   collaboration in, 213–216  
   adversarial, 214–215  
   Plato on, 95  
   Pythagorean Theorem, 97  
 Matilal, Bimal Krishna, 123, 124, 125, 126  
 Mazur, Eric, 182  
 meaning-preserving rules, 16  
 medieval Aristotelian logical traditions,  
   132–143  
   deduction in, etymological history of,  
   132–134  
   mental languages in, 137–140  
   scholastic disputations in, 137–140  
   *syllogismos* in, 135–137  
 Menary, Richard, 202  
*Meno* (Plato), 30, 96, 97  
 mental languages, 137–140  
 Merton, Robert, 50  
 Mercier, Hugo, 165–166, 167, 188. *See also*  
   evolution of reasoning  
 metaphysical deductive necessity, 13–14  
 methods of inquiry, 235  
 Middle Ages. *See* medieval Aristotelian logical  
   traditions  
 Miller, Gary, 231  
 mind-clutter objection, 77  
 mind reading, cognitive gadgets for, 200–201  
 Mochizuki, Shinichi, 35, 219–220, 221  
 model theory  
   in deductive necessity, 14  
   logical consequence and, 73–74  
 Mohist dialectic, 128–129  
 monism. *See* local logical monism  
 monotonicity, 5–6  
   Left Weakening rule and, 79–80  
 Moore, Robert Lee, 181–182  
 Moore method, 181–182  
 morality. *See* Christian morality  
 natural deduction, 15  
 necessary truth-preservation, 5–6  
   counterexamples and, 6  
   dialogical notion and, 61–64  
   adversariality and, 62–63  
   in argumentative situations, 62  
   goal-oriented components, 63–64  
   indefeasible properties in, 61–62  
   monotonicity and, 5–6  
   ontogeny of deductive reasoning and,  
   171–174  
   Prover and, 32  
   Skeptic and, 32  
   *syllogismos* and, 116  
 Nelson, Edward, 210, 216, 217–219  
 Netz, Reviel, 30, 71–72, 92, 94–96, 108  
 Nietzsche, Friedrich, 88–89  
   on Christian morality, genealogy of, 91  
   conceptual genealogy methodology  
   influenced by, 28, 87, 88–91  
 non-human animals, reasoning in, 189–191  
   evolution of, 191  
 normativity of logic, 19–21  
   dialogical notion and, 74–78  
   deductive consistency and, 77  
   epistemic communism and, 78  
   mind-clutter objection in, 77  
*Nyaya-sutra*, 125, 126–127  
 Nye, Andrea, 58, 87  
 Oaksford, Mike, 162  
*On the Genealogy of Morality* (Nietzsche),  
   88–89  
 ontogeny, of deductive reasoning  
   adversariality and, 171–174  
   collaboration in, 173–174  
   belief-bracketing and, 174–180  
   in reductio ad absurdum arguments, 178  
   belief projection and, 171, 177–178  
   classical approach to, 170  
   contextualization of, 170

## 268 Index

- ontogeny, of deductive reasoning (cont.)  
 internalization and, 183–186  
 necessary truth-preservation and, 171–174  
 perspicuity and, 180–183  
   Moore method and, 181–182  
   peer instruction and, 182  
 in roots approach, 22–27  
   cultural recapitulation and, 24–25  
   definition of, 23–24  
   historical development and, convergence with, 27  
   phylogenetic development and, convergence with, 27  
   theory of recapitulation and, 23–24  
   theoretical approach to, 169–170  
 Opponent, 74. *See also* Skeptic  
   in Rigorous Personal Dialogue, 40–41  
 organized skepticism, 50  
*Organon* (Aristotle), 140–141  
*Outlines of Pyrrhonism* (Sextus Empiricus), 18
- paradox of inference, 18  
 paradoxes, 78–82  
   Liar paradox, 78–79  
 partial-conflict-of-interest games, 56  
 Pascual, Esther, 34, 72  
 Paul of Venice, 134  
 Peano Arithmetic, 6–7  
   inconsistency of, 217–219  
 peer review, in mathematical practice, 210–213  
 Peloponnesian Wars, 92, 93  
 Perelman, Chaim, 72, 113  
 Pericles, 92  
 Peripatetics, 140–141  
 perspective-taking, 179  
 perspicuity, 6–7  
   dialogical notion and, 64–67  
     non-dialogical explanations for, 66–67  
     proof of, 64  
     properties of, 64, 65  
   epistemic function of, 6–7  
   Fermat's last theorem and, 6  
   from internalization of Skeptic, 71  
   ontogeny of deductive reasoning and, 180–183  
     Moore method and, 181–182  
     peer instruction and, 182  
   Peano Arithmetic and, 6–7  
   of Prover, in deductive reasoning, 32  
   of Skeptic, in deductive reasoning, 32  
 Peter of Spain, 133  
 philosophy of logic, 10, 12, 66, 73, 74–75, 82  
 phylogeny, of deductive reasoning  
   in roots approach, 22–27  
     cultural recapitulation and, 24–25  
     definition of, 23–24  
     historical development and, convergence with, 27  
     ontogenetic development and, convergence with, 27  
     theory of recapitulation and, 23–24  
   theoretical approach to, 187–189
- Plato  
*Apology*, 92, 99  
 on dialectic concept, 99–100, 103  
*Gorgias*, 98–99, 105  
 on internalization of thought, 183–184  
 mathematics analyses by, 95  
*Meno*, 30, 96, 97
- pluralism. *See also* logical pluralism  
 conjunctive, 74  
 disjunctive, 74
- Pollock, John, 3  
*Port-Royal Logic*, 145  
*Posterior Analytics* (Aristotle), 4, 8, 19, 109–118. *See also* *sylogismos*
- prelogical speech, 39  
 premises, in deductive arguments, 3  
 conclusions and, 8  
 for Prover, 31–32  
   acceptance of premises, 32–33  
 for Skeptic, 31–32  
   acceptance of premises, 32–33  
*sylogismos* and, 114  
 multiple premises, 114–115  
   necessity of, 116–117  
   sufficiency of, 116–117
- Priest, Graham, 82  
 principle of publicity, 216  
*Principles of Philosophy* (Descartes), 51–52  
 Prior, Arthur Norman, 16  
*Prior Analytics* (Aristotle), 68, 109–118. *See also* *sylogismos*  
 reductio ad absurdum arguments and, 120–122  
 schematic letters in, 119  
 theory of figures in, 118–120, 137
- probabilistic proofs, 228–232  
 proof theory  
   deductive necessity and, 14  
   logical consequence and, 73–74
- proofs. *See also* mathematical proofs  
 computational, 228–232  
 dialectical, in Prover–Skeptic games, 47–48, 52  
 functions of, 206–208  
 probabilistic, 228–232  
 surveyability of, 7
- Proofs and Refutations* (Lakatos), 27–28, 46–47, 48–49, 214



- Proponent, 40–41, 50, 74. *See also* Prover
- Protagoras, 92
- Prover, in deductive reasoning, 31–33. *See also* dialogical logic; Prover–Skeptic games  
 in mathematical practice, 209–221  
 necessary truth-preservation and, 32  
 perspicuity and, 32  
 premises for, 31–32  
 acceptance of, 32–33
- Prover–Refuter games, 50
- Prover–Skeptic dialogues. *See also* dialogical notion  
 dynamics of, 35  
 mathematics and, 214  
 in Ancient Greece, 97  
 Skeptic role in, 71
- Prover–Skeptic games, 46–53  
 dialectical proofs in, 47–48  
 formulation of, 52  
 dialogues in, 55–56, 59  
 dialogue tree, 54  
 Lakatos and, 50–52  
 mathematical proofs in, 52–53  
 process of, 47  
 Rigorous Persuasion Dialogue in, 51
- Prover–Skeptic model. *See* mathematical practice; mathematical proofs
- psychology of reasoning, 151–152, 153–154, 162, 236
- publicity. *See* principle of publicity
- Pythagorean Theorem, 97
- quantifiers, in Game-Theoretical Semantics, 45
- Quine, Willard Van Orman, 22–23
- Rabin, Michael, 231
- Rahman, Shahid, 42
- rational reconstruction methodology, 31
- rationality, normative conception of, 163
- Read, Stephen, 9, 15, 82, 117, 137–138
- reasoning. *See also* deductive reasoning; group deductive reasoning  
 belief-based, 156  
 counterfactual, 67–68  
 evolution of. *See* evolution of reasoning  
 genetic, 28–29  
 hypothetical, 67–68  
 in non-human animals, 189–191  
 psychology of, 151–152, 153–154, 162, 236  
 reductio ad absurdum, 68–69  
 rule-based, 156  
 suppression tasks and, 191
- recapitulation  
 cultural, 24–25  
 mathematical cognition and, 27–28
- theory of, for ontogenetic and phylogenetic development, 23–24
- reductio ad absurdum arguments, 33, 68–69  
 Ancient Greek dialectic and, 103  
 belief-bracketing and, 178  
*elenchus* compared to, 103  
 in *Prior Analytics*, 120–122  
 reflexivity rule, 81
- refutation. *See elenchus*
- Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics* (Wittgenstein), 13
- Republic* (Plato), 93
- Restall, Greg, 82
- Rigorous Persuasion Dialogue (RPD), 51
- roots approach, to deduction. *See also* Ancient Greece  
 Athenian democracy period, 90  
 cognitive technology in, 26–27  
 conceptual genealogy methodology in, 28, 87  
 evolutionary elements in, 25  
 cultural perspectives in, 26  
 genetic biology, 26  
 genetic fallacy in, 29  
 genetic reasoning in, 28–29  
 history in, 23–27  
 integrative methodology for, 22  
 ontogeny, 22–27  
 cultural recapitulation and, 24–25  
 definition of, 23–24  
 historical development and, convergence with, 27  
 phylogenetic development and, convergence with, 27  
 theory of recapitulation and, 23–24
- phylogeny, 22–27  
 cultural recapitulation and, 24–25  
 definition of, 23–24  
 historical development and, convergence with, 27  
 ontogenetic development and, convergence with, 27  
 theory of recapitulation and, 23–24
- purpose of, 28–29
- recapitulation in  
 cultural, 24–25  
 mathematical cognition and, 27–28  
 theory of, for ontogenetic and phylogenetic development, 23–24  
 as theoretical development, 28
- Roots of Reference* (Quine), 22–23
- Royen, Thomas, 209
- RPD. *See* Rigorous Persuasion Dialogue
- rule-based reasoning, 156

## 270 Index

- rules of inference, in deductive necessity, 16  
 Russell, Bertrand, 15
- scandal of deduction, 19  
 Schechter, Joshua, 25–26  
 schematic letters, 119  
 scholastic disputations, 137–140  
 Scholze, Peter, 220, 221  
 scientific inquiry. *See also* deduction  
   deductive-nomological model, 4  
 scientific method theory, 19  
 Scribner, Sylvia, 176–177  
 selective social learning, 200  
 semantics. *See also* Game-Theoretical Semantics  
   models of, deductive necessity and, 16  
   worlds, 14–15  
 Sen, Amartya, 123  
 Sextus Empiricus, 18, 189  
 Shapiro, Stewart, 10, 13–14, 82–83  
 Skeptic, in deductive reasoning, 4, 31–33. *See also* dialogical logic; Hintikka, Jaakko; Lakatos, Imre; Lorenzen, Paul; Prover–Skeptic dialogue; Prover–Skeptic games  
   definition of, 50  
   as implicit interlocutor, 70  
   internalization of, 70–72, 185–186  
   perspicuity from, 71  
   universal Skeptic and, 71–72  
   in mathematical practice, 70, 209–221  
   necessary truth-preservation and, 32  
   perspicuity and, 32  
   premises for, 31–32  
   acceptance of, 32–33  
   in Prover–Skeptic dialogues, role in, 71  
   Prover–Skeptic dynamics, 35  
 Smith, Robin, 106, 109, 119–120, 132  
 social cognition, 55  
 social constructivism, deduction and, 234–235  
*Sociology of Science* (Menton), 50  
 Socrates  
   on dialectic concept, 99–100  
   logos, 99  
*Sophistical Refutations* (Aristotle), 99, 100  
 sophists, 92  
 Soto, Domingo de, 138–139, 145  
 Sperber, Dan, 169, 188. *See also* evolution of reasoning  
 Spinoza, Baruch, 4  
 Stanovich, Keith, 153, 158–159, 160, 169  
 Steiner, Mark, 226, 228  
 Stenning, Keith, 62–63, 171–172, 173  
 Sterelny, Kim, 29–30  
 Stix, Jakob, 220, 221
- Stoics, 142  
 Striker, Gisela, 113–114, 115, 116, 121  
 structural rules, of dialogical notion, 78–82  
   contraction rule, 79, 81  
   Left Weakening rule, 79–80, 81  
   modification/restriction of, 79  
   reflexivity rule, 81  
   transitivity rule, 79, 80–81  
*Summa theologica* (Thomas Aquinas), 138  
 suppression tasks, 191  
 syllogism, 3  
   etymology of, 110  
*syllogismos*, 13, 104  
   definitions of, 111, 113–118  
   changes in, 135–137  
   irreflexivity in, 115–116  
   necessary truth-preservation in, 116  
   features of, 114  
   premises and, 114  
   multiple, 114–115  
   necessity of, 116–117  
   sufficiency of, 116–117  
   theory of figures and, 118–120, 137  
 syllogistic, Aristotelian, 3  
   in *Analytics*, 109–113  
   dialectic and, relation between, 109–113  
   theoretical approach to, 108–109  
 syntactic rules, deductive necessity and, 16  
 synthetic philosophy, 29–30
- Tao, Terence, 218  
 Tarski, Alfred, 14, 15  
 Tausk, Daniel, 218  
 Taylor, Richard, 34  
 theory of demonstration. *See* demonstration  
 theory of figures. *See* figures  
 theory of Forms. *See* Forms  
 theory of recapitulation, 23–24  
 Thom, Paul, 117, 135, 136, 137  
 Thomas Aquinas, 138  
 Tomasello, Michael, 55, 169, 202  
*Topics* (Aristotle), 30–31, 99, 100, 106  
 transferability property, in mathematical proofs, 35, 215–216  
 transitive powers, in deductive argumentation, 7  
 transitivity rule, 79, 80–81  
 Tymoczko, Thomas, 229, 230
- universal Skeptic, 71–72
- validity  
   deductive, 13–14  
   of deductive arguments, logical form doctrine and, 9

## Index

271

- Valla, Lorenza, 144  
*Varieties of Logic* (Shapiro), 10  
von Neumann, John, 217  
Vygotsky, Lev, 33–34, 202  
    on internalization, 184–185  
Walton, Douglas, 51  
Wason, Peter, 152, 158–159, 164  
Wiles, Andrew, 6, 34, 213  
William of Ockham, 134, 136–137,  
    139  
William of Sherwood, 133  
Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 7, 13  
    language games, 42–43, 44–45  
    worlds semantics, 14–15  
Wyclif, John, 134