Beyond the Monastery Walls

Our understanding of life in the early Middle Ages is dominated by Christian churches and monasteries. It is their records and libraries which have survived the centuries, to tell us how the clerics, monks, and nuns who lived and worked within their walls experienced the world around them. We thus see the lay inhabitants of that wider world mostly when they are interacting with the clergy. However, a few sources let us explore lay life in this period more broadly. *Beyond the Monastery Walls* exploits perhaps the richest of these: manuscript books containing formulas, or models, for documents that do not otherwise survive. Through these books, Warren C. Brown explores the concerns and behavior of lay men and women in this period on their own terms, and casts fresh light on a part of the medieval world that is usually hidden from view. In the process, he shows how early medievalists are winning fresh information from our sources by looking at them in new ways.

Warren C. Brown is Professor of History at the California Institute of Technology. His previous publications include *Violence in Medieval Europe* (2011) and, as co-editor, *Documentary Culture and the Laity in the Early Middle Ages* (Cambridge, 2012).

Beyond the Monastery Walls

Lay Men and Women in Early Medieval Legal Formularies

Warren C. Brown California Institute of Technology







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108479585

DOI: 10.1017/9781108855426

© Warren C. Brown 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 978-1-108-47958-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Christopher, Peter, and Michael Dulcissimis filiis meis...

Contents

List of Figures	<i>page</i> ix
Acknowledgments	Х
List of Abbreviations	xii

Part I The Gate

1	Introduction	3
	The Laity	14
	What Are – and Why Are – Formulas?	20
	Anchoring the Formulas in the Past	30
	Opening the Gate	34
	A Readers' Guide	35
2	The Manuscript	38
	The Book	39
	Its Contents	41
	The Formulas	47
	Other Formula Collections	64
	How the Formulas Were Used	70
	Conclusions	77
3	Language, Anachronism, and the Laity	80
	The Latin of the Formulas	82
	Roman Law	86
	Roman Citizenship	94
	Roman Legal Procedures	100
	Conclusions	112

Part II The Laity

4	Laypeople and Documents	121
	Keeping Documents	122
	Using Documents	136
	Conclusions	142

vii

viii	Contents	
5	Laypeople and Property Property Transfers Loans <i>Beneficia</i> and <i>Precariae</i> Using a King Conclusions	151 153 159 161 173 175
6	Family Inheritance Family Feeling Old Age Marriage Divorce Women Orphans Conclusions	176 178 185 189 192 200 202 209 214
7	Conflict and Justice Judicial Assemblies Extrajudicial Settlements The Causes of Conflict Conclusions	216 218 231 233 250
8	Power, Personal Relationships, and Letters The Language of Personal Relationships Personal Relationships in Practice The Letters of Einhard Conclusions	252 255 259 270 279
9	Freedom and Unfreedom Unfree as Passive Objects Unfree as Active Agents Conclusions	284 290 302 318
10	Conclusions The Early Medieval Laity What Happened to Our Book? The <i>Collectio Flaviniacensis</i>	321 322 334 346
	Bibliography Manuscript Index Main Index	356 377 378
		510

Figures

1.1	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Latin	
	Manuscript 2123	page 4
1.2	Flavigny-sur-Ozerain	5
1.3	Europe at the death of Charlemagne in 814	6
1.4	Paris, BNF, ms. lat. 2123, ff. 105v-106r	11
1.5	Paris, BNF, ms. lat. 2123, ff. 113v-114r	12
1.6	The geographical distribution of extant	
	formula manuscripts	22
2.1	Paris, BNF, ms. lat. 2123, f. 147r detail	60
2.2	Paris, BNF, ms. lat. 2123, f. 121v, LH column, detail	61
3.1	Munich, BSB, Clm 29585/2, detail	86
3.2	Paris, BNF, ms. lat. 10756, f. 64r	107
10.1	Paris, BNF, ms. lat. 2123, f. 1r, detail	343

Acknowledgments

This book came to be with the help of several institutions and a great many people, whom I would like here to acknowledge and thank. First, the (sadly no longer extant) Max Planck Institute for History in Göttingen, Germany, where over two summers in the early 2000s, with the support and companionship of my host Caspar Ehlers, I started my work with the formulas. Next, my colleagues in the Lay Documentary Culture project of 2000-13, whose individual and collective input, and encouragement, helped me to work out what became a couple of chapters: Jonathan Conant, Marios Costambeys, Nicholas Everett, Hans Hummer, Charles Insley, Adam J. Kosto, Matthew Innes, Peter Sarris, and Antonio Sennis. The University of St. Andrews Institute of Mediaeval Studies honored me with the Donald Bullough Fellowship in 2013 to support a semester in residence. There I found myself probing more deeply into the formulas in a wonderfully stimulating environment, surrounded by a rare concentration of top-flight colleagues - especially Simon MacLean (who may not realize the material impact he had on how the book ends). A semester's membership at the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton in 2019 allowed me to turn it all into prose and profit from the feedback of the community of medievalists gathered there that year - particularly Hans Hummer, Sylvie Joye, Paul Bertrand, Michelle Armstrong-Partida, and Alison Perchuk (and her cat Jezebel).

Several colleagues took it upon themselves in the midst of COVID-19 to read and comment on the entire manuscript: Jonathan Conant, Geoff Koziol, Hans Hummer, and Piotr Górecki. I thank them for their generosity – and Piotr as well for the combination of moral support, praise, and bracing critique that has been the hallmark of our friendship and collaborations over the years. Anything I could say to Patrick J. Geary can only fall short of what I owe him, not only for directing my attention to the formulas in the first place, repeatedly discussing them with me over the years (including in a train compartment on the way south from St. Andrews), and reading the entire manuscript at the end, but also for

Acknowledgments

his ongoing teaching, mentorship, and support, at UCLA, at the IAS in Princeton, and beyond.

I also tip my hat with appreciation to Alice Rio. I have had the privilege of speaking with her only a few times, but her pathbreaking work on the formulas informs my own at many points. As I wrote, Alice's books and articles were always ready to hand.

To the Caltech Division of Humanities and Social Sciences goes my thanks for its ongoing support (and permission for leaves of absences). Likewise to my neighbors in Dabney Hall, Jennifer Jahner and George W. "Mac" Pigman, for reading and commenting on parts of my work – Mac in particular for his repeated willingness to read and offer advice on my Latin translations. I offer warm thoughts to my ever-patient editor at Cambridge University Press, Elizabeth Friend-Smith, who kept encouraging me to do the book and listening to my ideas about it through the many years that it took me to actually produce it. I also thank the two anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press, whose comments helped me to knock the book into its final shape.

To my long-suffering wife, Louise, goes my eternal gratitude for her patience with my tendency to preoccupation, with my long hours in my study with the door closed, with the months spent alone while I was off on sabbatical, and with my occasional need to babble about whatever I was trying to untangle, whether it was comprehensible to anyone else or not. I can only hope that the occasional trips to Europe, and the friendships we have built with colleagues on both sides of the pond, offer some recompense. Finally, to my children, Christopher, Peter, and Michael, who traveled with us in the early stages, but then had the foresight to leave home and get on with their lives: You are a legacy more important than any book I could ever write, and of which I am proud. To you this book is dedicated.

Abbreviations

Libraries	
BAV	Bibliotheca Apostolica Vaticana
BB	Burgerbibliothek
BM	Bibliothèque municipale
BNF	Bibliothèque nationale de France
BRU	Bibliotheek der Rijksuniversiteit
BSB	Bayerische Staatsbibliothek
BU	Biblioteka Univwersyteka
HAB	Herzog August Bibliothek
HStA	Bayerische Hauptstaatsarchiv
KB	Kongelige Bibliothek
LB	Landesbibliothek
ÖNB	Österreichische Nationalbibliothek
SB	Stiftsbibliothek
ZB	Zentralbibliothek
Others	
BB	A. Bernard and A. Bruel (eds.), Recueil des
	chartes de l'abbaye de Cluny, 3 vols. (Paris,
	1876–84)
Capit.	Capitularia regum Francorum
Cart. Sen.	Cartae Senonicae
Cart. Sen. App.	Cartarum Senonicarum Appendix
ChLA	Chartae Latinae Antiquiores
Coll. Flav.	Collectio Flaviniacensis
Coll. Flav. Add.	Additamenta Collectionis Flaviniacensis
Coll. Patav.	Collectio Pataviensis
Coll. Sangall.	Collectio Sangallensis Salomonis III. tempore
5	conscripta
Coll. Sangall. Add.	Additamenta e codicibus Collectionis Sangallensis
CR	A. de Courson (ed.), Cartulaire de l'abbeye de
	Redon (Paris, 1863)

xii

List of Abbreviations

xiii

DD Karol.	Die Urkunden der Karolinger
DD LdF	Die Urkunden Ludwigs des Frommen
DD Lo. I/DD. Lo. II	Die Urkunden Lothars I und Lothars II
DMLBS	R. E. Latham, D. R. Howlett, and R. K.
	Ashdowne (eds.), Dictionary of Medieval Latin
	from British Sources (Oxford, 1975–2013)
Epp.	Epistolae
Fontes iuris	Fontes iuris Germanici antiqui in usum scholarum
	separatim editi
Form. Andecav.	Formulae Andecavenses
Form. Argent.	Formulae Argentinenses
Form. Arvern.	Formulae Arvernenses
Form. Aug.	Formulae Augienses
Form. Bit.	Formulae Bituricenses
Form. cod. Laud.	Formulae codicis Laudunensis
Form. epist. coll. min.	Formularum epistolarium collectiones minores
Form. Extrav.	Formulae Extravagantes
Form. Imp.	Formulae Imperiales e curia Ludovico Pii
Form. Imp. Add.	Formulae Imperiales – Additamentum
Form. Marc. Kar.	Formulae Marculfinae aevi Karolini
Form. Morbac.	Formulae Morbacenses
Form. Pith. frag.	Formularum Pithoei fragmenta
Form. S. Emm. frag.	Formularum codicis S. Emmerami fragmenta
Form. Sal. Bignon.	Formulae Salicae Bignonianae
Form. Sal. Linden.	Formulae Salicae Lindenbrogianae
Form. Sal. Merkel.	Formulae Salicae Merkelianae
Form. Salz.	Formulae Salzburgenses
Form. Sangall. Misc.	Formuale Sangallenses Miscellaneae
Form. Sen. Rec.	Formulae Senonenses recentiores
Form. Tur.	Formulae Turonenses vulgo Sirmondicae dictae
Form. Tur. Add.	Additamenta e codicibus Formularum
	Turonensium
Form. Tur. App.	Formularum Turonensium Appendix
Haenel	G. Haenel (ed.), Lex Romana Visigothorum
	(Leipzig, 1849; reprint Aalen, 1962)
Lewis and Short	C. T. Lewis and C. Short, A Latin Dictionary
	(Oxford, 1991)
LL	Leges
LL nat. Germ.	Leges nationum Germanicarum
LRV	Lex Romana Visigothorum
Marc. Add.	Additamenta e codicibus Marculfi

xiv List of Abbreviations

Marc. Form.	Marculfi Formulae
Marc. Supp.	Supplementum Marculfi
MGH	Monumenta Germaniae Historica
MGH Formulae	K. Zeumer (ed.), Formulae Merowingici et
	Karolini aevi, MGH Leges V (Hanover, 1886)
NCMH	The New Cambridge Medieval History
Niermeyer	J. F. Niermeyer, C. van de Kieft, and J. W.
	J. Burgers (eds.), Mediae Latinitatis Lexicon
	Minus, 2nd ed. (Leiden, 2002)
OED	Oxford English Dictionary online, www.oed.com
Poetae	Poetae Latini medii aevi
PL	J. P. Migne (ed.), Patrologia Latina, 221 vols.
	(Paris, 1844–64)
SSRM	Scriptores rerum Merovingicarum
TF	T. Bitterauf (ed.), Die Traditionen des Hochstifts
	Freising, vol. 1 (Munich, 1905)
TR	J. Widemann (ed.), Die Traditionen des
	Hochstifts Regensburg und des Klosters
	S. Emmeram (Aalen, 1969; reprint of original
	Munich, 1943)
Wartmann	H. Wartmann (ed.), Urkundenbuch der Abtei
	Sanct Gallen, 2 vols. (Zurich, 1863-66)