

CHINA'S GILDED AGE

Why has China grown so fast for so long despite vast corruption? In *China's Gilded Age*, Yuen Yuen Ang maintains that all corruption is harmful, but not all types of corruption hurt growth. Ang unbundles corruption into four varieties: petty theft, grand theft, speed money, and access money. While the first three types impede growth, access money – elite exchanges of power and profit – cuts both ways: it stimulates investment and growth but produces serious risks for the economy and political system. Since market opening, corruption in China has evolved toward access money. Using a range of data sources, the author explains the evolution of Chinese corruption, how it differs from the West and other developing countries, and how Xi's anti-corruption campaign could affect growth and governance. In this formidable yet accessible book, Ang challenges one-dimensional measures of corruption. By unbundling the problem and adopting a comparative-historical lens, she reveals that the rise of capitalism was not accompanied by the eradication of corruption, but rather by its evolution from thuggery and theft to access money. In doing so, she changes the way we think about corruption and capitalism, not only in China but around the world. This title is also available as open access on Cambridge Core.

Yuen Yuen Ang is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Michigan. Her book *How China Escaped the Poverty Trap* (2016) received the Peter Katzenstein Book Prize in Political Economy and the Viviana Zelizer Book Award in Economic Sociology. She has been named an Andrew Carnegie Fellow for “high-caliber scholarship [on] some of the most pressing issues of our times.” In addition, she has received grants, fellowships, and an essay prize from the American Council of Learned Societies, Andrew W. Mellon Foundation, Chiang Ching Kuo Foundation, and Gates Foundation. Her commentaries and interviews have appeared on the BBC and CGTN, and in *Foreign Affairs*, *The New York Times*, *Project Syndicate*, *The Wall Street Journal*, and media outlets around the world.

CHINA'S GILDED AGE

The Paradox of Economic Boom and Vast Corruption

Yuen Yuen Ang

University of Michigan, Ann Arbor



Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-108-47860-1 — China's Gilded Age: The Paradox of Economic Boom and Vast Corruption

Yuen Yuen Ang

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108478601

DOI: 10.1017/9781108778350

© Yuen Yuen Ang 2020

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781108778350 under a Creative Commons Open Access licence CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this licence, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0>

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781108778350

First published 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-47860-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-74595-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-108-47860-1 — China's Gilded Age: The Paradox of Economic Boom and Vast Corruption

Yuen Yuen Ang

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

To mentors, friends, and acquaintances in need

Contents

List of Figures *page* viii
List of Tables xi
Acknowledgments xiii

1 Introduction: China’s Gilded Age 1
2 Unbundling Corruption across Countries 23
3 Unbundling Corruption over Time 52
4 Profit-Sharing, Chinese Style 85
5 Corrupt and Competent 119
6 All the King’s Men 153
7 Rethinking Nine Big Questions 180

Appendix 213
References 232
Index 249

Figures

1.1	Corruption and GDP per capita.	page 3
1.2	China as a “gigantic outlier” <i>vis-à-vis</i> the United States.	4
1.3	Unbundling corruption into four types.	9
2.1	Total and unbundled UCI scores in one visual.	33
2.2	UCI scores and ranks by country.	33
2.3	Comparing the UCI and CPI ranks.	34
2.4	Comparing the UCI and overall perception scores.	36
2.5	China vs. Russia’s UCI scores.	39
2.6	China vs. India’s UCI scores.	41
2.7	China vs. the United States’ UCI scores.	44
2.8	UCI scores and income levels are negatively correlated.	47
2.9	All rich countries are low in speed money but not in access money.	48
3.1	Banner in Shenzhen, showing Deng Xiaoping and the words “Stick firmly to the Party’s fundamental path for 100 years.”	58
3.2	President Bill Clinton listens as Chinese Premier Zhu Rongji makes a statement on the South Lawn of the White House in 1999.	60
3.3	Land proceeds financed an infrastructure boom in the 2000s, including high-speed rail, as seen here in Hangzhou.	63
3.4	Chinese President Xi Jinping and other top leaders. On the far right is Wang Qishan.	66
3.5	Corruption cases involved larger sums over time.	70
3.6	Corruption with exchange exploded but corruption with theft shrank.	72
3.7	Bribery rose while embezzlement and misuse of funds declined.	73
3.8	Bribery took up a growing share of corruption over time.	74

LIST OF FIGURES

3.9 Comparison of bribery and embezzlement trends by monetary value. 74

3.10 Comparison of bribery and embezzlement by rank of officials involved. 75

3.11 Media mentions of transactional corruption, by year and term, 1988–2012. 79

3.12 Media mentions of non-transactional corruption, by year and term, 1988–2012. 81

4.1 Zouping, one of the 136 counties in Shandong province where I did research. 99

4.2 Fringe components made up 76 percent of compensation. 100

4.3 Fringe compensation varied far more widely than formal wages. . . . 101

4.4 Growth of fringe compensation outpaced formal wages. 103

4.5 Total bureaucratic income exceeded average urban wages. 103

4.6 Increasing agency collections was more rewarding in the short term. 108

4.7 Expanding the tax base was more rewarding in the long term. . . . 108

5.1 Media coverage of Bo Xilai before and after his fall. 122

5.2 Media coverage of Ji Jianye before and after his fall. 124

5.3 Bo Xilai is surrounded by reporters when arriving at the 11th National People’s Congress in Beijing in 2010. 125

5.4 Chongqing’s economy surpassed the national average under Bo. . . 128

5.5 During Bo’s tenure, Chongqing saw a rapid construction boom. . . . 129

5.6 Chongqing’s economic boom was heavily driven by investment. . . . 131

5.7 Chongqing’s debt-to-GDP ratio kept rising. 132

5.8 In this screenshot, Ji Jianye stands trial at a court for taking bribes. . 136

5.9 Ji Jianye strategically branded Yangzhou as a blend of ancient city and modern civilization. 138

6.1 An anti-corruption exhibition in Zhejiang, featuring videos of Xi Jinping, artwork, and posters. 155

6.2 Poster on the “eight-point regulations,” including restrictions against gambling, Internet surfing, banqueting, and drinking at work. 158

6.3 Wave-like hazard rate of fall among city Party secretaries. 166

6.4 Effects of patron’s fall on city leaders’ likelihood of fall. 172

6.5 Falls of national and local officials since 2013. 174

LIST OF FIGURES

6.6 Screenshot from the website of the Chinese central government,
warning against “lazy governance.” 178

7.1 Comparing corruption in China’s and America’s Gilded Ages. 187

7.2 Corruption reports in China from 1990 to 2016. 189

A1.1 Updated replication of the WSJ’s scatterplot on corruption
and growth rate. 216

Tables

1.1 Analogously to drugs, different types of corruption harm
in different ways *page* 12

2.1 Unbundling four corruption categories into sub-categories 28

2.2 Advantages of the UCI over standard perception measures 31

2.3 China vs. Russia on speed money 40

2.4 China vs. India on speed money and access money 42

2.5 China vs. the United States on access money 45

3.1 Official statistics capture only two of four corruption categories
in my theory 71

4.1 Three layers of China’s bureaucracy 89

4.2 Linkages between revenue sources and compensation 105

5.1 Top 10 words describing Bo Xilai before and after his fall 122

5.2 Top 10 words describing Ji Jianye before and after his fall 124

5.3 Milestones in Bo Xilai’s career path 126

5.4 Bo’s deliverables across five areas of social welfare 130

5.5 Milestones in Ji Jianye’s career path 137

6.1 High turnover rate among city Party secretaries 167

6.2 Geographic distribution of falls by region and province 168

6.3 Determinants of downfall among city Party secretaries 171

7.1 China and the United States at equivalent levels of income 185

A2.1 UCI scores and ranking for 15 countries 218

A3.1 Bribery by small vs. large cases and low vs. high rank 220

A3.2 Embezzlement by small vs. large cases and low vs. high rank 220

A4.1 Deconstruction of budgets 223

A4.2 Breakdown of compensation and associated line items 223

A4.3 Descriptive statistics of independent and dependent variables 223

LIST OF TABLES

A5.1 Corrupt, competent, both, or neither? 226
A6.1 Definition and sources of variables 229
A6.2 Descriptive statistics 229

Acknowledgments

Producing a book is like producing a film. For every hour of action on a film, thousands of hours of footage were produced and discarded. Not one but many sponsors and individuals work behind the scenes to create a brief sequence of shots. It is the same way with a book, even though it may appear still on paper.

All production requires, first and foremost, financial support. For this, I thank a private foundation that wishes to remain anonymous, whose generous funding enabled my research and valuable time off for writing. I also thank the Chiang Ching Kuo Foundation for a supplemental grant, as well as the University of Michigan's Lieberthal-Rogel Center for Chinese Studies and the Office of Research for their generous research and subvention grants.

One of the greatest joys of writing this book has been working with a talented team of professionals and research assistants: Nathan Baylis, Amy Cesal, Siddharth Chaudhari, Peixu Fang, Michael Thompson, Jiang Zhentao, and Simeng Zeng. Jane Menton skilfully assisted with this project over the course of its evolution and offered helpful comments on my drafts.

Data collection, whether qualitative or quantitative, requires the generosity of many people. This book draws on fieldwork and interviews I've conducted in China over the years. Again, I wish to thank my research hosts and assistants, who welcomed me into their country and helped me learn about it, as well as the hundreds of bureaucrats and businesspeople who shared their memories and experience. Their stories form the "footage" with which I made this "film."

For the Unbundled Corruption Index (UCI), which appears in Chapter 1, I thank all the expert respondents from around the world

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

who took time from their busy schedule to complete the survey. Several colleagues offered comments early on that helped improve the survey design, including Omolade Adunbi, John Ciociari, Rick Hall, Linda Lim, Ann Lin, Erin McDonnell, and Anne Pitcher, among others. Getting busy people to respond is perhaps the biggest challenge in conducting expert surveys. Thus I extend my sincere appreciation to Linda Lim, Global Integrity (especially Alan Hudson and Johannes Tonn), Ross Business School, and the Wallace Program for connecting me with respondents.

Next, I want to thank many colleagues for feedback at various stages of writing. I thank Anna Grzymala-Busse, Ho-Fung Hung, Diana Kim, and Dan Slater for their formative comments at a book workshop at the Social Science Historical Association just as the book was taking shape. The Center for Global Development, based in Washington, DC, graciously hosted a subsequent book workshop, where I benefited from comments from Masood Ahmed, Charles Kenny, Amanda Glassman, Scott Guggenheim, Scott Morris, Michael Moses, Vijaya Ramachandran, William Savedoff, and Michael Woolcock.

Atul Kohli kindly invited me to present an early chapter from this book some years ago at the Princeton State Building Workshop in New Delhi. His comments propelled me to temporarily set aside that project for a larger book on economic and institutional coevolution, which became *How China Escaped the Poverty Trap*, and to return to the problem of corruption now, through a comparative-historical lens. Michael Woolcock carefully read the manuscript and offered constructive feedback; in particular, his combination of expertise as a social scientist and development practitioner pushed me to speak to both theoretical and practical concerns. Conversations with Scott Guggenheim and Mark Pyman yielded valuable insights on fighting corruption in the most difficult settings. Alan Hudson lent much needed encouragement for pressing ahead with the task of “unbundling corruption.” Comments from Alice Evans and Duncan Green, both excellent writers, not only improved the substance of my arguments but taught me how to write better. Jean Oi, Mark Pyman, Andrew Walder, Michael Walton, and Yifan Wei provided timely feedback on my final draft.

Over the years, I also benefited from valuable suggestions from Pranab Bardhan, Daniel Berkowitz, Pamela Brandwein, Yongshun Cai, Allen Hicken, Pauline Jones, James Kung, Xiaojun Li, Kenneth Lieberthal,

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Melanie Manion, Jim Morrow, Jia Nan, Elizabeth Perry, Yumin Sheng, Matthew Stephenson, Mark Tessler, Daniel Treisman, Andrew Wedeman, Martin Williams, Mariah Zeisberg, the editors and reviewers at Cambridge and Oxford University Presses, and participants at various events: the University of Southern California's China Conference on Institutions and Markets, organized by Jia Nan and T. J. Wong, along with discussant Peter Lorentzen; the University of Chicago's East Asia Workshop, particularly John Padgett; Princeton University's State-Building Workshops, organized by Miguel Centeno, Atul Kohli, and Deborah Yashar; and the Governance Workshop at Stanford University's Center on Democracy, Development and the Rule of Law, organized by Francis Fukuyama. I thank two anonymous grant reviewers at the private foundation who funded my research for their useful, encouraging feedback; they saved this book from being hijacked by Reviewer 3's demands, which, if imposed, would ensure that the book could not be published or would become eminently worthless.

At Cambridge University Press, it is an extraordinary privilege to work with Robert Dreesen. I thank him for his trust, which gave me precious space to create and even be quirky. I also thank the production team at the Press, including Steven Holt, Robert Judkins, and Erika Walsh.

My special gratitude goes to Pamela Brandwein, Nancy Burns, Nicholas Howson, Pauline Jones, Peter Katzenstein, Michael Woolcock, and Mariah Zeisberg, for wisdom and lifeboats, and as always, to my family, especially my husband Chia-Yu Tang, who is my first and still toughest teacher on thinking outside the box. Along the way, many others have lent a kind word, a lesson, a helping hand, and guidance. To these individuals and the readers of my first book, whose support allowed me to keep writing, I thank you.

Years ago, I attended a talk by playwright David Henry Hwang, who said, "The reward of creation lies in the process itself." At the time, I couldn't appreciate his statement, but now I do.