

### The Cambridge Companion to Montesquieu

Montesquieu was among the most influential writers of the eighteenth century, and the study of his thought enriches and complicates our understanding of the Enlightenment. Following renewed interest in his writings over the last three decades, the *Cambridge Companion to Montesquieu* brings together the variety of disciplinary and interpretive approaches that have shaped the scholarship on his work and legacy. This *Companion* offers an integrated volume on Montesquieu as philosopher, novelist, historian, economic thinker, political scientist, and political theorist. It introduces readers to key themes and ongoing debates, reflects developments in the field, breaks fresh ground, indicates avenues for future research, and provides multiple perspectives on the relevance of Montesquieu's thought to contemporary problems in political theory.

KEEGAN CALLANAN is Associate Professor of Political Science at Middlebury College and Visiting Fellow with the James Madison Program at Princeton University. He is author of *Montesquieu's Liberalism and the Problem of Universal Politics* (Cambridge, 2018).

SHARON R. KRAUSE is the William R. Kenan, Jr. University Professor of Political Science at Brown University. She is the author of numerous articles on Montesquieu and other topics in political theory, as well as several books, including *Liberalism with Honor* (Harvard, 2002), *Civil Passions* (Princeton, 2008), and *Freedom Beyond Sovereignty* (Chicago, 2015).



# OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS

ABELARD Edited by Jeffrey E. Brower and Kevin Guilfoy

ADORNO Edited by Thomas Huhn

ANCIENT ETHICS Edited by Christopher Bobonich

ANCIENT GREEK AND ROMAN SCIENCE Edited by LIBA TAUB

ANCIENT LOGIC Edited by Luca Castagnoli and Paolo Fait

ANCIENT SCEPTICISM Edited by RICHARD BETT

ANSELM Edited by Brian Davies and Brian Leftow

AQUINAS Edited by Norman Kretzmann and Eleonore Stump

AQUINAS Edited by Eleonore Stump and Thomas Joseph white

ARABIC PHILOSOPHY Edited by Peter Adamson and Richard C. Taylor

HANNAH ARENDT Edited by DANA VILLA

ARISTOTLE Edited by Jonathan Barnes

ARISTOTLE'S 'POLITICS' Edited by marguerite deslauriers and paul destrée

ATHEISM Edited by MICHAEL MARTIN

AUGUSTINE 2nd edition Edited by DAVID MECONI and ELEONORE STUMP

BACON Edited by Markku Peltonen

BERKELEY Edited by Kenneth P. Winkler

BOETHIUS Edited by John Marenbon

BRENTANO Edited by DALE JACQUETTE

CARNAP Edited by Michael Friedman and Richard Creath

CICERO'S PHILOSOPHY Edited by JED W. ATKINS and THOMAS BÉNATOUÏL

CIVIL DISOBEDIENCE Edited by WILLIAM E. SCHEUERMAN

COMMON-SENSE PHILOSOPHY Edited by RIK PEELS and RENÉ VAN WOUDENBERG

THE COMMUNIST MANIFESTO Edited by Terrell Carver and James Farr

CONSTANT Edited by Helena Rosenblatt

CRITICAL THEORY Edited by FRED RUSH

DARWIN 2nd edition Edited by Jonathan Hodge and Gregory Radick

SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR Edited by Claudia Card

DELEUZE Edited by Daniel W. Smith and Henry Somers-Hall

DEMOCRACY IN AMERICA Edited by Richard Boyd

DESCARTES Edited by John Cottingham

DESCARTES' 'MEDITATIONS' Edited by David Cunning

DEWEY Edited by Molly Cochran

Continued at the back of the book



# The Cambridge Companion to Montesquieu

Edited by **KEEGAN CALLANAN** *Middlebury College* 

SHARON R. KRAUSE

Brown University







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108478557

DOI: 10.1017/9781108778923

© Cambridge University Press 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

#### First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Callanan, Keegan, 1981– editor. | Krause, Sharon R., editor. TITLE: The Cambridge companion to Montesquieu / edited by Keegan Callanan, Sharon R. Krause.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Series: Cambridge companions | Includes bibliographical references.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2022023451 (print) | LCCN 2022023452 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108478557 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108745925 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108778923 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Montesquieu, Charles de Secondat, baron de, 1689-1755. | Political science–Philosophy–History–18th century.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC JC179.M8 .C24 2021 (print) | LCC JC179.M8 (ebook) | DDC 320.01dc23/eng/20220729

> LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022023451 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022023452 ISBN 978-1-108-47855-7 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-74592-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## **Contents**

| Lis | t of Contributors  | page vii |
|-----|--|----------|
| Ack | knowledgments  | ix       |
| Chi | ronology   | xi       |
| Lis | t of Abbreviations   | xiii     |
| Ι   | Montesquieu: Life and Letters Paul A. Rahe                           | I        |
| 2   | Persian Letters<br>Catherine Volpilhac-Auger                         | 20       |
| 3   | Considerations on the Romans<br>Thomas L. Pangle                     | 35       |
| 4   | The Spirit of the Laws<br>Keegan Callanan                            | 54       |
| 5   | Montesquieu and the Classical World<br>Catherine Larrère             | 76       |
| 6   | Montesquieu's Guiding Principles and Foundations C. P. Courtney      | 94       |
| 7   | Montesquieu on Virtue<br>David W. Carrithers                         | 113      |
| 8   | Internationalism, Cosmopolitanism, and Empires <i>Michael Mosher</i> | 130      |
| 9   | Liberty in Montesquieu Céline Spector                                | 147      |
| 10  | Political Sovereignty in Montesquieu Sharon R. Krause                | 162      |



| vi           | Contents  |     |
|--------------|---|-----|
| ΙΙ           | Montesquieu on Slavery<br>Vickie B. Sullivan          | 182 |
| 12           | Montesquieu and the Liberty of Women Diana J. Schaub  | 198 |
| 13           | Political Economy Paul Cheney                         | 216 |
| 14           | Religion and Politics  Annelien de Dijn               | 232 |
| 15           | Constitutional History  Jacob T. Levy                 | 248 |
| 16           | Montesquieu and the Enlightenment<br>Jonathan Israel  | 266 |
| 17           | Montesquieu's Liberal Legacies<br>Rebecca E. Kingston | 289 |
| Bibliography |   | 307 |
| Index        |   | 329 |



# **Contributors**

**Keegan Callanan** is Associate Professor of Political Science at Middlebury College.

**David W. Carrithers** is Adolph Ochs Professor of Government Emeritus of Political Science at the University of Tennessee at Chattanooga.

Paul Cheney is Professor of European History at the University of Chicago.

**C. P. Courtney** is Emeritus Reader in French Intellectual History and Bibliography at Christ's College, the University of Cambridge.

**Annelien De Dijn** is Professor of Modern Political History at Utrecht University.

**Jonathan Israel** is the Andrew W. Mellon Professor in the School of Historical Studies at the Institute for Advanced Study.

**Rebecca E. Kingston** is Professor of Political Science at the University of Toronto.

**Sharon R. Krause** is the William R. Kenan, Jr. University Professor of Political Science at Brown University.

Catherine Larrère is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy at the University Paris I Panthéon-Sorbonne.

Jacob T. Levy is Professor of Political Science at McGill University.

Michael Mosher is Professor of Political Science at the University of Tulsa.



viii

#### List of Contributors

**Thomas L. Pangle** is the Joe R. Long Chair in Democratic Studies at the University of Texas at Austin.

**Paul A. Rahe** is Professor of History and the Charles O. Lee and Louise K. Lee Chair at Hillsdale College.

**Diana J. Schaub** is Professor of Political Science at Loyola University Maryland.

Céline Spector is Professor of Philosophy at the Sorbonne University.

**Vickie B. Sullivan** is the Cornelia M. Jackson Professor of Political Science at Tufts University.

Catherine Volpilhac-Auger is Emeritus Professor of Modern and Contemporary French Literature at the École Normale Supérieure de Lyon.



# Acknowledgments

In completing this volume, we have incurred a number of debts. I (Keegan) would like to thank my research assistants, Noah Rosenfield, Delia Lander, Danielle Brown, and Joseph Lyons. Much of my work on the *Companion* was completed during my time as a visiting fellow with the James Madison Program at Princeton University, and I thank Robert P. George and Bradford Wilson for hosting me. Middlebury College and the Institute for Humane Studies generously provided funding for research assistance, indexing, and editorial support. I thank my coeditor, Sharon Krause, for her wisdom and care at every stage of our collaboration. My deep gratitude extends, as ever, to my wife, Rachel, and my children, Fiona, Claire, William, Elise, and Jack, for their love and support in this and all my work. I dedicate the volume to my mother, Michelle, my first and best teacher.

I (Sharon) acknowledge with great appreciation Keegan's initiative, energy, and expertise in bringing this project to fruition. The idea for the volume was his, and he has consistently taken the lead in seeing it through, demonstrating remarkable skill and grace in the process. I am grateful to Brown University for funding support and to our research assistants and indexer for their excellent work. Finally, I thank my mother, Barbara (in memoriam), who cheered on this project as she cheered on everything I ever set out to do; and Tayhas, whose love makes everything possible.

We would both like to thank our editor at Cambridge University Press, Robert Dreesen. Robert showed early enthusiasm at the possibility of



X

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-108-47855-7 — The Cambridge Companion to Montesquieu Edited by Keegan Callanan , Sharon R. Krause Frontmatter

More Information

Acknowledgments

a *Cambridge Companion to Montesquieu*; he provided expert guidance at the proposal stage; and he patiently supported our project through to publication. We are also grateful to the contributors for their professionalism and commitment to the project. Particular thanks are due to David Carrithers for an especially close partnership in our work on this volume.



# Chronology

Born at La Brède, near Bordeaux.

| 1689    | Born at La Brède, near Bordeaux.  |
|---------|---|
| 1700-05 | Receives his formal education at the Collège de Juilly, near Paris.   |
| 1705-08 | Studies law in Bordeaux, where he receives a Bachelor of Law degree from the University of Bordeaux.  |
| 1709-14 | Resides in Paris.   |
| 1713    | Returns to Bordeaux following the death of his father (November 15).  |
| 1714    | Becomes a counselor in the Parlement of Bordeaux.   |
| 1715    | Marries Jeanne de Lartigue, a Protestant. Composes<br>Memorandum on the Debts of State.   |
| 1716    | Birth of his son, Jean-Baptiste de Secondat (February 10).  Upon the death of his uncle, he becomes <i>président à mortie</i> of the Parlement of Bordeaux (April 24). Elected to the Academy of Bordeaux (April 3). Reads his <i>Dissertation on the Policy of the Romans Regarding Religion</i> to the Academy (June 18). |
| 1717    | Birth of his daughter Marie de Montesquieu (January 22).  Drafts his <i>Discourse on Cicero</i> . Begins work on <i>Persian Letters</i> .   |
| 1718    | Serves first term as Director of the Academy of Bordeaux.   |
| 1721    | Publication of Persian Letters in Holland.  |
| 1724    | Writes Dialogue between Sulla and Eucrates and Letters from Xenocrates to Pheres.   |
| 1725    | Publication of The Temple of Gnidus in Holland.   |
|         |   |



| xii     | Chronology   |
|---------|--|
| 1725    | Reads portions of <i>Treatise on Duties</i> and <i>Discourse on the Motives That Ought to Encourage Us to Undertake the Sciences</i> to the Academy of Bordeaux.   |
| 1726    | Sells his parlementary office (July 7).  |
| 1727    | Birth of his daughter Denise de Montesquieu (January 22).<br>Composes Considerations on the Wealth of Spain.   |
| 1728    | Elected to the French Academy.   |
| 1728-31 | Extensive travels in Austria, Hungary, Italy, Germany, Holland, and England. Arrives in Amsterdam, October 15, 1729. Arrives in London, November 3, 1729. Becomes a member of the Royal Society of London and a Freemason. |
| 1731-33 | Returns to La Brède. Composes Reflections on the Character of Certain Princes, Reflections on Universal Monarchy, and Considerations on the Causes of the Greatness of the Romans and on their Decline.                    |
| 1734    | Publication of Considerations on the Causes of the Greatness of the Romans and Their Decline in Holland.   |
| 1736-38 | Montesquieu composes Essay on the Causes that Can Affect Minds and Characters.   |
| 1748    | Publication of The Spirit of the Laws in Geneva.   |
| 1749    | Censure of <i>The Spirit of Laws</i> in Jansenist journal, <i>Nouvelles ecclésiastiques</i> (October 9 and 16).  |
| 1750    | Publication of Defense of the Spirit of the Laws (February).   |
| 1751    | The Spirit of Laws placed on Papal Index (November 29).  Montesquieu completes Lysimachus, begun in 1731.  |
| 1752    | Faculty of Theology of the University of Paris drafts but does not publish a censure of <i>The Spirit of the Laws</i> .  |
| 1752-54 | Montesquieu drafts Responses and Explanations Given to the Faculty of Theology of the University of Paris.   |
| 1754    | Montesquieu composes Memorandum on the Silence to Impose on the Constitution.  |
| 1753-55 | Montesquieu composes <i>Essay on Taste</i> for Diderot's <i>Encyclopédie</i> .   |
| 1755    | Montesquieu dies in Paris (February 10).   |



# **Abbreviations**

We have used abbreviations for frequently cited primary texts. Unless otherwise noted, references appear in the text as follows:

#### Individual Major Works

- CR Charles-Louis de Secondat, baron de Montesquieu, Considerations on the Causes of the Greatness of the Romans and Their Decline, ed. David Lowenthal (Indianapolis, IN: Hackett Publishing, 1999), cited by chapter number.
- EL Charles-Louis de Secondat, baron de La Brède et de Montesquieu,
   L'esprit des lois in Oeuvres complètes de Montesquieu, ed.
   Roger Caillois (Paris: Bibliothèque de la Pléiade, 1949–51),
   cited by book and chapter number.
- MT Charles-Louis de Secondat, baron de Montesquieu, My Thoughts, ed. Henry C. Clark (Indianapolis, IN: Liberty Fund, 2012), cited by entry number.
- PL Charles-Louis de Secondat, baron de Montesquieu, *Persian*Letters, ed. Andrew Kahn (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), cited by letter number.
- SL Charles-Louis de Secondat, baron de Montesquieu, The Spirit of the Laws, ed. Anne M. Cohler, Basia C. Miller, and Harold
   S. Stone (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), cited by book and chapter number.
- SL-N Charles-Louis de Secondat, baron de La Brède et de Montesquieu, The Spirit of the Laws, trans. Thomas Nugent (London: Nourse and Vaillant, 1750), cited by book and chapter number.

xiii



xiv

#### List of Abbreviations

#### **Collected Works**

Nagel Charles-Louis de Secondat, baron de La Brède et de Montesquieu, Oeuvres complètes de Montesquieu, ed. André Masson (Paris: Les Éditions Nagel, 1950–5), cited by volume and page number.

OC Charles-Louis de Secondat, baron de La Brède et de Montesquieu, Oeuvres complètes de Montesquieu, ed. Jean Ehrard, Catherine Volpilhac-Auger, et al. (Oxford: Voltaire Foundation, 1998–2008; Lyon and Paris: ENS Éditions and Classiques Garnier, 2010-), cited by volume and page number.

Pléiade Charles-Louis de Secondat, baron de La Brède et de Montesquieu, Oeuvres complètes de Montesquieu, ed. Roger Caillois (Paris: Bibliothèque de la Pléiade, 1949–51), cited by volume and page number.